MONDAY 12TH FEBRUARY 2007

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2.30 p.m

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

P R A Y E R S

* * * *

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

PROCEDURE USED TO SELECT HEADMAN OF RECORD

MR S. TSOGWANE (BOTETI NORTH): asked the Minister of Local Government the procedure used to select Headman of Record and say why Tribal Authorities for different tribal territories follow different procedures and why some are averse to the use of the secret ballot.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Madam Speaker, the procedure used to appoint a Headman of Record is provided for under Section 20 of the Chieftainship Act, CAP. 41:01. This section states that, “A chief may, after consultation with the kgotla in the customary manner, recognise any person as Headman in respect of any area in his tribal territory and may in like manner terminate the recognition”.

I must also point out Madam Speaker, that whereas in some areas the leadership hereditary structure is clear, in other areas it is not. As a result in some areas the Headman would be nominated by members of the royal family and submitted to the kgotla for endorsement by the tribe, while in other areas he/she would be appointed through an election process. Where elections are to be used, it is the kgotla that decides on the method of election, as this is not prescribed in the law.
Monday 12 February 2007

All these notwithstanding Madam Speaker, once a chief has consulted with the kgotla, he/she would recommend the agreed name to my ministry for approval.

Thank you.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION FOR BOBIRWA CONSTITUENCY (2006/2007)

MR S. KGATHI (BOBIRWA): asked the Minister of Minerals, Energy and Water Resources to brief this House on progress achieved regarding project implementation in his Ministry for the 2006/2007 projects earmarked to be undertaken in the Bobirwa Constituency since 1st April 2006 after Parliament approved the funding of these projects.

MINISTER OF MINERALS, ENERGY AND WATER RESOURCES (MR KEDIKILWE): Madam Speaker, the following projects were earmarked to be undertaken in the Bobirwa Constituency during 2006/2007 financial year by the Ministry of Minerals, Energy and Water Resources:

a) Motlhabaneng electrification.

b) Lenyetse, Lepokole and Tshokwe Photovoltaic projects.

c) Bobonong Ground Water Investigation and Resource Assessment.

d) Thune dam.

Madam Speaker, Motlhabaneng is one of the 30 villages that are to be electrified using funds from the just concluded loan agreements with Nordic Banks. The process of securing loans took long to complete.

The pre-electrification processes such as mapping and design for the electricity infrastructure development in Motlhabeng were completed in January 2007. It is anticipated that project implementation will commence in April 2007.
Madam Speaker, my Ministry is also undertaking to electrify 88 villages countrywide with solar energy (Photovoltaic Electrification Programme) in the next five years. Lenyetse, Lepokole and Tshokwe villages in the Bobirwa constituency were selected to be among the 88 villages. The only activities that will be undertaken in the Financial year 2006/2007 are pre-electrification processes such as the updating of market survey, which was completed four years ago. Tender preparations are to be undertaken to update the market survey results. Market Survey in the 88 villages will start in the second quarter of 2007.

Madam Speaker, the third project is the Bobonong Groundwater Investigation and Resource Assessment. The objective of the project is to delineate aquifers around Bobonong village to provide the Land Board with criteria on allocating land around aquifers such that potential pollutants such as fertilisation of fields, rearing of poultry and similar activities are located away from the aquifers. The Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) has been awarded to a company called Aqualogic and it will start work in March 2007. The groundwater investigation aspect is at the tendering stage and the project is expected to start in April 2007.

Madam Speaker, the fourth and last project is the construction of the Thune Dam. Tendering for engineering consultancies is currently in process. It is anticipated that the engineering supervision will be awarded in April 2007. The consultant will take 3 months to audit engineering designs, and then about 4 months to evaluate tenders for construction in liaison with the Department of Water Affairs and the Public Procurement and asset Disposal Board (PPADB). Construction should start by January 2008 for anticipated completion in 2011.
Thank you, Madam Speaker.

PLANS TO AVAIL ARV THERAPY IN TONOTA

MR P. P. P. MOATLHODI (TONOTA SOUTH): asked the Minister of Local Government whether there are any plans to avail ARV Therapy to patients at Tonota Village; if so, when.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, plans are underway for the provision of ARV therapy to Tonota Village. As of now one doctor, seven nurses, one pharmacy technician and one social worker have been trained in ARV management and dispensing, commonly known as Kitso. The plan is that the clinic should be able to start dispensing ARV therapy by the end of April 2007.

I thank you.

REPAIRING LIGHTS AT SHASHE RAILWAY STATION

MR P. P. P. MOATLHODI (TONOTA SOUTH): asked the Minister of Works and Transport: -

a) when the lights at Shashe Railway Station will be repaired as they have been out of order for a long time;

b) what is the estimated cost for the repair and,

c) the measures she intends putting in place in order to avoid future damage to the lights.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT (MR RAMSDEN): Madam Speaker, lights at Shashe Railway station were discovered vandalised in July 2006. The power meter and the lights were broken and the electrical cables were and are
still missing. The damage has been assessed and it will cost about P35,000 to repair the lights. Botswana Railways is in the process of identifying funds to repair the lights.

Thank you, Madam Speaker.

PROGRESSION OF PRIMARY SCHOOL TEACHERS UNDER THE PARALLEL PROGRESSION SCHEME

MS B. M. TSHIRELETSO (MAHALAPYE EAST): asked the Minister of Education if he is aware that under the “Parallel Progression” scheme, primary school teachers who hold diplomas and are on C4 scale do not progress like their counterparts who have been promoted to posts of higher responsibilities; and that the progress of the affected teachers to salary scale C3 is only through promotions; if the Minister is aware, what plan does he have in order to rectify the anomaly.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR SIELE): Madam Speaker, I am aware that primary school teachers with Diploma qualifications can only progress to C3 on promotion as this grade according to the Primary Schools’ Scheme of Service is for a post of responsibility.

This is because when the current Scheme of Service was drawn the minimum requirement for teaching at primary schools was a primary Teacher Certificate. Now that the minimum entry requirement into the primary teacher service is a Diploma in Primary Education, my Ministry has reviewed the salary structure for primary school teachers, which will among others, address the concern raised by the Honourable Member.

Madam Speaker, I plan to communicate the outcome of the review to teachers through the Teaching Service Consultative Committee, the membership of which comprises the leadership of all Teachers Unions and that of the Ministry of Education.
Monday 12 February 2007

I thank you, Madam Speaker.

MR MOATLHODI: How soon does the Minister intend putting the review into effect.

MR SIELE: As soon as the exercise is complete, Madam Speaker.

STATUS OF EMPLOYEES AT ST. JOSEPH'S COLLEGE SINCE
GOVERNMENT TAKE OVER

MR O. M. GABORONE (SOUTH EAST NORTH): asked the Minister of Education what status of all the employees (permanent and pensionable, contract staff and industrial class workers) at St Joseph’s College is with respect to their terms and conditions of service since the take-over of the College by Government; and further say whether the employees and management fully understand their conditions of employment and the employees are treated as Government employees.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MRS MBAAKANYI): Madam Speaker, St Joseph’s College has never been taken over by Government, it is a Government-Aided school. Only the employment and management of teachers was taken over. St. Joseph’s College has two categories of employees, that is the teaching staff and support staff. All members of the teaching staff are employed by government under the Teaching Service Management Terms and Conditions of Service. The support staff, on the other hand is employed by the Mission.

All the employees were fully briefed when the school became Government-Aided. Subsequently, any new employee is informed of the Terms and Conditions of Service first during the interview and thereafter during induction.

Madam Speaker, it is therefore my expectation that all employees at St. Joseph’s College understand their terms and conditions of employment.
Monday 12 February 2007

I thank you.

VALUE OF PROCUREMENT AT THE DEPARTMENT OF WILDLIFE AND NATIONAL PARKS FOR FINANCIAL YEARS 2003/2004

MR L. B. SEBETELE (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Environment, Wildlife and Tourism what the value of procurement was at the Department of Wildlife and National Parks for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

a) office equipment (excluding IT)
b) office stationery
c) IT equipment
d) consultancies/professional services

and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT, WILDLIFE AND TOURISM (MR MOKAILA): Madam Speaker, as I previously indicated in answers to similar questions from the Honourable Member regarding procurement of services for the Department of Tourism and the Department of Waste Management and Pollution Control, the bulk of office equipment and stationery for the Department of Wildlife and National Parks was procured through the Department of Supplies.
However, for procurements directly made by this department on office equipment, office stationery, IT equipment and consultancies for 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 the total values are as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Financial Year</th>
<th>Office Equipment (Excluding IT (Pula))</th>
<th>Office Stationery (Pula)</th>
<th>IT Equipment (Pula)</th>
<th>Consultancies (Pula)</th>
<th>TOTAL (Pula)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2003/2004</td>
<td>332,601.05</td>
<td>118,119.60</td>
<td>375,363.90</td>
<td>1,824,176.00</td>
<td>2,650,260.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004/2005</td>
<td>274,879.70</td>
<td>228,996.40</td>
<td>699,220.00</td>
<td>863,724.00</td>
<td>2,066,820.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>607,480.75</td>
<td>347,116.00</td>
<td>1,074,583.90</td>
<td>2,686,900.00</td>
<td>4,717,080.65</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Madam Speaker, out of a total of P4,717,080.65 for these two financial years, P1,320,782.58 representing 28 per cent of procurement value went to citizen-owned companies. Consultancies were mainly for provision of technical services relating to Game Reserves and National Parks.

I thank you, Madam Speaker.


MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Works and Transport what the value of procurement was at the Department of Roads for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

a) office equipment (excluding IT)
b) office stationery
c) IT equipment
d) consultancies/professional services
e) works (roads, bridges, etc)
f) maintenance (roads, bridges, etc)

and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

MR RAMSDEN: Mr Speaker, the value of procurement of supplies and services by the Department of Roads during the financial years 2003/04 and 2004/05 is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Serial No.</th>
<th>Product and/or Service</th>
<th>Total Value of Procurement During 2003/2004 Financial Year (Pula)</th>
<th>Total Value of Procurement During 2004/2005 Financial Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Office Equipment (excluding IT)</td>
<td>157,093.75</td>
<td>93,751.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
<td>256,432.30</td>
<td>108,269.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>IT equipment</td>
<td>176,978.25</td>
<td>225,882.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Consultancies/Professional services</td>
<td>27,997,950.17</td>
<td>20,492,820.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Works (roads, bridges, etc)</td>
<td>288,496,093.20</td>
<td>213,242,141.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Maintenance (roads, bridges, etc)</td>
<td>80,562,462.90</td>
<td>78,842,627.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 financial years the entire procurement for office equipment, excluding IT, office stationery as well as IT equipment went to 100 per cent citizen owned companies.

In the case of consultancies/professional services 44 per cent (P12,421,416.10) was spent on 100 per cent citizen owned companies in 2003/04 while 56 per cent (P15,576,534.07) was spent on locally registered companies.
Monday 12 February 2007

Madam Speaker, for the financial year 2004/2005, 37 per cent (P7,615,552.50) was spent on citizen consultants while 63 per cent (P12,877,268.30) was spent on locally registered consultants.

Madam Speaker, with regard to development works (roads, bridges etc) 21 per cent (P60,584,179.57) was spent on 100 per cent citizen owned companies while 79 per cent (P227,911,913.63) was spent on locally registered companies in 2003/2004, and 2004/05 19 per cent (P40,516,006.83) was spent on citizen owned companies while 81 per cent (P172,726,134.36) was spent on locally registered companies.

Madam Speaker, during the financial year 2003/2004, 79 per cent (P64,054,150.15) went to 100 per cent citizen contractors and 21 per cent (P16,650,312.75) went to locally registered companies for the maintenance of roads and bridges. For the financial year 2004/2005, 66 per cent (P51,825,977.30) went to 100 per cent citizen owned companies while 34 per cent (P27,016,649.85) went to locally registered companies.

I thank you, Madam Speaker.

VALUE OF PROCUREMENT AT THE DEPARTMENT OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICE MANAGEMENT FOR FINANCIAL YEARS 2003/04 AND 2004/05

MR L. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Local Government what the value of procurement was at the Department of Local Government Service Management for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

a) office equipment (excluding IT)

b) office stationery

c) IT equipment
d) consultancies/professional services (except accounting)
e) accounting/auditing services

and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, the values of procurement at the Department of Local Government Service Management of the 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 financial year are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>a) For the 2003/2004 Financial Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>b) For the 2004/2005 Financial Year:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Items</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The department did not engage any consultants nor sought professional advice or service from private entities for the said period. All these procurement activities were awarded to local citizen contractors.

I thank you


**Second Reading**

**(Resumed Debate)**

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE (GABORONE WEST SOUTH):** Mma ke seka ka dia nako Mokwena. Ke gakologelwa gore e rile fa re kgaogana fa maloba, ka bo ke sa tswa go fetsa go araba potso ya ga Rre Masalila e neng e le tebang le ngongoregro ya me ya gore ke bona o ka re Tona ya tsa Madi ga e a ka ya re fa a lebela dikgwetlho tsa rona, a tsaya tsia thata kgwetlho e ya mathata a tshenyetso-setshaba. Mme ke ne ke feditse le go araba Rre Masalila, ke kgaogana le ene foo, ke a tswelela.

E ntse e le mo go yone kgang yone e, gongwe ke sutelela ka fa mojeng wa ga Rre Masalila, ke nne le e nngwe kgang e gongwe ke batlang gore e re fa Tona a tla a tshwaela, gongwe le bo le kile la re e sedimosetsa. Ke raya ba Lephata la Thuto ka gore yone e ke e tshwereng e le yone fa ke e lebelela, ga ke kgoro mothakola sentle, thulaganyo e se ke buang ka sone fano e dirilweng ka teng. Mme ka bokhutshwane ka ke na le metsotso gongwe e supa, ke bua ka (ke etla ke le thusa ka koo ba Lephata la Thuto, le tseye dipalo tse) *Invoice No. 906-14*. Mme yone *invoice number* e, go buiwa fa e le gore go isiwa madi mangwe, mme a duelwa ka US *Dollars*. Mme madi a otlhe fa o a soboka ka US *Dollars*, ke $756,800, mo go rayang gore ka madi a Botswana e ka nna P4.54 *million*. Jaanong ke re, yone thulaganyo e, madi one a a neng a duelwa Transformation Systems International,
MINISTER OF YOUTH, CULTURE AND SPORT (MAJ. GEN. PHETO): Point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Ke ne ke kopa Motlotlegi Mopalamente Rre Molefhabangwe gore a o ne a ka thalosa gore mme account yone e ke ya ga mang, a ke ya kompone kampo ke ya motho?

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Ga ke itse gore Mokaa o a bo a re ke mo reng. Ka re e re fa re fetsa go bua kgang e, fa go fetolwa, bone ba ke buang ka bone bao ba arabe gore ke ya ga mang, not me. Ke botsa bone, I cannot answer on their behalf. Ke arabile potso, Mokwena.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MS MBAKANYI): On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Ke ne ke kopa gore Motlotlegi ke eng a sa thalosalale fela a botsa potso gore e arabiwe. Ke tsaya gore fa a ne a ka dira jalo, e ne e ka nna botoka ka gore re ne re tlaa kgona gore re e arabe sentle.

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Ke boditse potso, kana go raya gore karabo ya teng, yone e e neng e ka tla…
HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Mabletsa, what is happening?

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Ka re yone potso e Tona a batlang ke e botsa e le Parliamentary Question, kana ga go molato gore karabo eo e o ka nnang nayo o e neele yo o tlileng go araba se ke buang ka sone, ka gore fa ke riana ke a botsa. Fa ke riana ka re, e re Tona a tla go akgela, tsone dilo tse a di sedimose fela ka tsela e o neng o ka araba potso e ka yone. O ka araba potso wa mo neela.

Mme ke a tswelela Rraetsho, ke tsena mo kgannyeng ya gago, gongwe e bile e le yone ya bofelo e ke tlaa bong ke bua ka yone, ke Paragraph 8 ya speech sa gago. Fa ke e bala, go nthaya gore increase in economy e e supiwang ke domestic economic review e o buang ka yone, ga go lebege e tsamaelana le go itepatepanya le seemo sa lehma. Fa ke ntshitse dintlha tse tsothle fela jaaka ke di soboka, ka e bile maloba o ne o seyo rra, di wela mo ngongoregong ya me. Ke ne ke ngongorega gore e re ntswa o kwadile puo ka Sekgoa se se ntle, o kwadile dipalo ka botswere re bontle, fela ke palelwa ke gore sone se o se kwadileng seo ke se tshwantshanye le se e leng gore ke dikgwetlho. Ka bo ke re dikgwetlho tse o di tsereng ke bona o ka re ga di a lebaga ka the Policy Reviews. Sengwe sa dilo tse e leng gore re bua ka tsone gangwe le gape Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo ts Palamente, ke go tswakanya itsholelo, mme bogolo the ka leba ka fa bojanaleng. Mo go yone e Tona, bojanala e re ntswa e le sengwe se se ntle se se tlisang madi, mme Rraetsho matshwenyego a me ke gore o ka re ga re ite baganye le matshosetsi a a bo lebaganang. Gantsi fa re bua ka bojanala ga o ka ke wa utlwa re bua ka dilo tse di
tshwanang le *terrorism*. Ka moso re utlwa go twe bangwe ba tshwerwe ba utswile madi kwa maemelong a difofane tsa rona, ka moso o utlwa go twe mongwe o ne a tshosetsa gore o thopa sefofane sa rona. A dilo tse Tona e ka se ka ya re o tla go araba, wa re bolelela gore wena fela ka namana di go tsaya jang, e bile o bona go ka tshwaraganelwa gore go sirelediwe motswedi o wa itsholelo ya rona ya botlhokwatlhokwa go le kae? Kana re eme pele re bone gore a sengwe se tlaa dirafala ke gone re bo re tsaya kgato? Kana re nne re monele marulana pele re itebaganye le go sireletsa bojanala jwa rona kgatlhanong le matshosetsi a a tshwanang one a borukutlhj hi jo re bo bonang lefatshe ka bophara?

Fa ke buile go le kalo Mma, mma ke sutele yo o tlaa bong a batla go bua ke se ka ka mo jela nako. Ke dumela gore ya me e fedile le fa ke ne ke setse ka metsotsotse e le some, o bo o re ke setse ka e roba bobedi. Mme mma ke leboge, Mokwena.

**MR KGATHI (BOBIRWA):** Ke a go leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke ema fa ke batla go ntsha dintlha tsa botlhokwa le go supa fa ke amogela lenaneo le le beilweng fa pele ga rona la kgaoganyo ya madi.

Mme jaaka re kopiwa ke melao ya tsamaiso ya Palamente gore re itebaganye le mo ka puo ya seeng go tweng ke *general principles*, ke tlaa leka ka bojotlhe gore ke remelele mo dikgannya tsa *general principles*. Ke tla ke fa dikai ka mafelo mangwe mo lefatsheng la Botswana.

Ka pono ya me ka re, kgaoganyo madi e, e ne e akantswe e tsamaile ka tlhamalalo. Dingwe dikai tse di supang gore ke kgaoganyo madi e e itshetletseng, *which is a good and well-thought budget* ke gore, go na le mo re ka reng *what are the features of a budget* ya go nna jaana. Ka temogo ya me *budget* e, re ka bua re re, e itebagantse le batho, ke
gore it is people centred. Gape it is cutting across, ke gore setshaba se sotlhe go tsweng kwa mohumaneging go ya go tsena kwa motho yo re ka reng ke yo o ikgonang.

O ka bona gore le yone kokeletso madi ya six per cent, le fa ke tlaa bua ka yone, e akareditse batlhoki, bagodi, Village Development Committees (VDCs), le Home Based Care. Ke lengwe la mabaka a ke reng, e tsaya setshaba ka kakaretso.

Se sengwe sa bobedi se ke supang gore budget e e nonofile mo tshekatshekong le go e baya pele ga setshaba, e itebagantse le go nonotsha setshaba. Ke gore, focus ya yone is on empowerment.

Sa boraro re ka bua gore, e tswa ka mananeo a go leka go lwantsha lehuma mo lefatsheng le, mo re ka reng ka puo ya seeng, it is a pro-poor budget. Dikai di dintsi tse re ka di supang fa re bua ka seemo sa gore budget e e itebagantse le lenaneo la gore e lwantshe lehuma mo lefatsheng le.

Sa bone, e supa dikai tsa gore e batla go tlhama meberekgo ka ditsela tse dintsi, gore setshaba se kgone go bona ditiro. Sa botlhano e supa fa itsholelo ya lefatshhe le e nonofile e bile e ikaelela go kabakanngwa, economic diversification. E tsamaisiwa sentle ke puso e e busang.

Sa borataro e ikaegile thata mo go reng e sekaseke seemo sa go bona gore botsogo le itshidilo ya setshaba (nonofo) e fiwa madi a a lekanyeng. Le ka tswa le bonye madi a a fetang P800 million a e leng gore a tlie go bewa mo lephateng la botsogo go lwantsha seemo sa malwetse ka go farologana mo lefatsheng le.

Mme le fa go ntse jalo, go supagala fa budget e e ntseng jalo, go na le dingwe dikgwetlho tse e leng gore re tshwanetse gore re di ele tlhoko re le baetedipele. Go na le bokoa fa gare ga tsamaiso ya go ntsha molao, le gore e diragadiwe, ke gore poor implementation.
Monday 12 February 2007

Se ke kgwetlho e tona e e leng gore, re le bogogi le boeteledipele, mapolotiki le makhanselara, re tshwanetse go tshwaraganya diatla re bone gore re thusanya le badiredi ba puso mo diofising, gore se se dumalanweng ke Palamente se a diragadiwa. Re se ka ranna le seemo se e leng gore ka moso re bolelelwa gore se se tlaa dirwa ka moso se fetotswe, ka moso se dirilwe jaana.

Re ne re sa ntse re utlwa Rre Kedikilwe yo e leng Tona wa tsa meepo a a fa karabo ya gore letamo la Thune le tlaa simolola ka *January* 2008. Maloba diofisara tsa gagwe ba ne ba tshwere phuthego kwa dikgotleng tsa Bobirwa di le *four*, ba feta ba bua gore letamo le tlaa simololwa ka *October*. Jaanong o ka bona phetogo ya se e leng gore re bua ka sone go farologana. Re felela re le mo seemong sa gore, ga re itse boammaaruri tota gore, a tota selo se se tlaa lala se dirilwe.

Jaanong ke rotloetsa gore, ka bodiredi bo rutintshitswe ka *Performance Management System (PMS)* le tse dingwe, ke tsaya gore go lebaka, re ka dira gore bogolo re itekanye megopo re tle re kgone go diragatsa se e leng gore re se tshephisitse setshaba.

Nngwe ya *general principles* tse ke batlang go bua ka tsone ke mo re ka reng *globalisation and governance*, ke gore, tobekano le tsamaiso ya tsa madi-madi mo lefatsheng le tsamaiso ya mafatshe.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS: Yone *globalisation?***

**MR KGATHI:** Ke tlhokile lefoko la Setswana le le tlhamaletseng go tlhalosa lefoko le le boteng la Sekgoa la *globalisation*. Jaanong gone fa kgwetlho e re lebaganyeng le yone rona re le babusi kana re le lefatshe ke gore, re tshwanetse gore re fetole ka fa re dirang dilo ka teng. *That one is a requirement*. Re tshwanetse gore re nne le phetogo ka fa re bonang gore re ka dira dilo ka teng. Re tsweng mo seemong sa gore re kile ra bo re dira
jaana re tshwanetse gore re dire jaana. *Globalisation* ga e na go re letla e seng jalo re tlaa fitlhela ba gorogile kwa re batlang go ya teng rona re sa ntse re re *stages* di ntse jaana o tshwanetse gore o ise PMS, e riana e boe e tsene ka motho yole. Re tlaa fetwa ke batho ba felela ba tsere madi mo lefatsheng ka seemo se.

Re tshwanetse go fetola *the mindset, the way we think re react to* dilo tse e leng gore di a runya ka yone nako eo re kgone gore re tseye ditshwetso re le puso. Ke dingwe tsa dikgwetlho tse e leng gore re le lefatshe, re tshwanetse gore re di ele tlhoko ka tsela e e ntseng jaana.

Se sengwe se ke batlang go bua ka sone ke *Modesty*. Ke gore *to plan* mo e leng gore re tlaa dira letamo kana re dira tselo mo e leng gore e tlaa re morago ga dingwaga tse *ten* tselo e ga e sa tlhola e ka kgona go tsamaiwa. Batho ga ka ke ba kgona go tlhola ba tsamaya mo go yone *traffic* e ntsi mo e leng gore fa go tshwanetse gore go okediwe tselo e dirwe *double lane* go nna go ntse go twe madi ga a yo. Golo moo go supa gore ga re akanyetse kwa pele. Re ka fa dikai tse dintsi, jaaka *stadium* se sa rona, re gaufi le *to host games* tse di rileng. Ga re kgone *to qualify to host games* ka gore ga re kgone *to meet the minimum requirements*.

Jaanong fa e le gore re tlile go ikemisetsa *globalisation and governance* re tshwanetse go tshentsha *our mindset right from the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning* go tsena mo *ministries* go bona gore dilo di ka dirwa ka seemo se e leng gore se ka re baya mo *competition*. Fa re ka se ka ra phadisana le mafatshe jaaka re bona seemo sa South Africa ba tlile go re feta ba fetola dilo ka bofefo jo bo rileng.

Se sengwe se ke batlang go se gatelela Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente ke buile ka *project implementation and monitoring*. Selo se nna se a ntshwenya, go tlhoka go
diragatsa dilo tse e leng gore Palamente e dumalanye ka tsone, mo e leng gore poor implementation e tlisa tlhakatlhakanyo mo tsamaisong ya budget. Tlhakatlhakano e re tshwanetseng gore re e emele ka dinao, e seng jalo re tlile go nna le bothata. E na le a bad effect on the economy yone poor implementation ka gore, go nna le mo re reng ke cost overrun, madi a nna mantsi. Project fa e ne e tshwanetse go dirwa ka di million di le tharo e felela e dirwa ka di million di le 16. Madi a, a ka bo a agile clinics kwa mafelong a mangwe kwa di seong teng. Fela ka delay e e rileng, go nna le bothata ja gore ga go agiwe dilo tseo bakeng sa gore, mongwe motho ga a ka a kgona go dira selo ka nako e a tshwanetseng go se dira.

Ke yone kgang e ke e buang gore fa re le boeteledipele, re tshwanetse go bofa dibante re goge dikausu re bone gore dilo tse di ntseng jaana tsa cost overruns re di tlhalosa ka tseka e e ntseng jang. Go nne le motho yo e leng gore re ka botsa project manager who has been assigned tiro go twe o lebaganye le kago ya clinic e, a tlhalosetse setshaba. Fa go na le bothata, a kgone go tla kwa Public Accounts Committee a tle go tlhalosa gore, cost overruns o di tlhalosa ka mabaka afe. O ne a le ko ka e go tshwanetse gore go salwe morago specifications a ba a sa tsenye lentswe la gagwe gore tiro e e wele. Re tshwanetse to account to the nation. Vision 2016 ya re, re tshwanetse gore re bo re le an accountable society.

Tlhoko tiragatso ya projects mo lefatsheng le jaaka o ka bona sekai, close to 60 per cent Madam Speaker ya projects tse re di rweleng gone jaana tsa Mid Term Review, ke carryovers tse di tswang kwa bo National Development Plan Six (NDP 6), NDP 7, NDP 8, NDP 9. Re le Palamente ya the 21st century jaaka re ntse jaana re ipotse gore a re ntse re ya teng kana re a boa. Speech fa se tla, se re re ya go dira letamo kwa bokete mme
letamo le le sale le buiwa ka bo 1989, le letsatsi jeno dates di ntse di ya kwa pele, kgang ke gore are we going kana jang.

Most of the projects ke carryovers tse e leng gore re batla gore re di ele tlhoko. Sekai kwa kgaolong ya me ke healthpost ya Molalatau e tswa kwa District Development Plan Four (DDP 4), go ntse go twe e tlaa tsholediwa seemo. Nako nngwe ga e na dikarata tse balwetse ba kwalelwang mo go tsone go kwalelwa mo dikhatebokosong, nurse a kwala bolwetse ja motho. Go tshubiwa ka dingaingai ga go na dipone…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Sengaingai ke eng?

MR KGATHI: Sengaingai ka Sebirwa ke selonyana se e reng pula fa e nele se tsamaya se re taitai. Jaanong sone seo…

MR MABILETSA: Point of clarification Madam Speaker. Ke kopa go botsa Motlotlegi gore a mme go kopa dilo tse di tshwanang le dikarata tse di kwalelang balwetse, a ke sengwe sa projects ka gore, fa ke leba ke dilo fela tse bodiredi bo ka di kopang. Jaanong gore a e ka re bodiredi bo paletswe ke go ordara, bo bo re jaanong ke gore projects ga di diragadiwe. Ke raya gore ga ke tlhaloganye gore Motlotlegi a reng, gongwe o ka tlhalosa go feta fa.

MR KGATHI: I thank you Madam Speaker. Fa ke ne ke itse gore mokaulengwe o tlile go botsa potso e e senang tswelelopele jaana, ke ka bo ke sa mo neela. Ke illustrata point ya go supa gore projects di ntse jang, fa clinic e upgradiwa go tsenngwa le staff. Tota ke a dumela gore fa o ruta o le mo classing go na le bana ba ba tshwarelang kwa morago. O tlaa intshwarela mokaulengwe tla ke siane ka dikgang tse di botlhokwa Batswana ba batla go nkutlwa.
The Bobonong internal roads, ke sekai sengwe se ke batlang go se supa gore projects di salela kwa morago. From DDP 4, DDP 5, DDP 6 le letsatsi leno go ntse go twe re tlaa dira projects. Kgang e ke e buang ke gore, re le boeteledipele, a re nneng fa fatshe re bone gore bothata ke jo, bothata jo bo dirwa ke eng se re tshwanetseng gore re se ntshe. Fa e le gore go na le sengwe se se sa dirweng sentle, re kgone go se baakanya. Fa e le gore re loader projects tse dintsi, a plan ya rona e nne nnyennyane mo e leng gore re ka kgona go dira. Fa o ka tsaya NDP 7 and NDP 8 o di tshwantshanya le NDP 9 it is exactly a replica, mo e leng gore o ipotsa gore a ke gone mo go bakang…

Sekai se sengwe se ke neng ke batla go se supa ke gore e rile maloba Minister of Finance and Development Planning a supa gore stadium sa Gantsi is a new project. That is not correct because stadium sa Gantsi has always been on plan, se ntse se le mo NDP 8/NDP 9. Jaanong e nna o ka re batho ba Gantsi ba direlwa favour mme ntswa e se boammaaruri. Kgang ya go kopela stadium madi ga e a tshwanela to camouflage ka Gantsi as a new project. That is not correct, it is indicated mo NDP 9 gore le yone it is lined up as a level two or level three project. Jaanong fa e le gore di ka bewa ka tselo e e ntseng jaana, di felela di ka tsenya batho ba tshwana le Rre Swartz matlho a batho, o ka re go nna le favour e o ka reng o a e direlwa. Ntswa e le gore phoso ke ya rona ka fa re tsamaisang ka teng re kwadileng ka teng.

Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente selo se se ntshwenyang go feta go ntshwenya mo tsamaisong yone e ke variation ya projects tse di dumalanweng ke Palamente. Ke na le tumelo ya gore fa Palamente e rile project e ya go dirwa ka 2007 kana ka 2008, tumelo ya me ke gore ke Palamente yone e e ka tlang ya fetola dates endorsing se e leng gore se a
Monday 12 February 2007

diragadiwa. Mme tse re di bonang ke tse e leng gore, ministry o ka tla koo ka bo one mo tumalanong e e neng e dirilwe ke Palamente…

**MR TSOGWANE:** *Point of clarification.* O bua sentle mokaulengwe. Ke batla go go utlwisisa sentle gore kana *projects* tsa maloba go twe di dintsha, ya Gantsi ga e ntsha o bua nnete. Mme le tsone tse dingwe tse go tweng di dintsha, ga go tewe gore di kopelwa madi a go ya go dirwa, di supiwa *Total Estimated Cost* (TEC) ya teng. Gatwe di akarediwe mo *National Development Plan 9*, di tsenngwe mo planeng e seng gore go tewa go twe ke tsone tse di yang go dirwa.

**MR KGATHI:** Mokaulengwe di *project* tseo di ntse di le mo lenaneong. Ke ne ke e fa sekai ka *stadium* sa Ghanzi se se ntseng se le mo lenaneong, *there is no way it can be a new project*, e ntse e le *lined up*. Ke ne ke sa fe sekai ka se sengwe.

Tla ke tswelelele ke bue ka *variation* ya di *agreed projects*. Dikai tse ke di fileng, golo mo go re supa ekete ga re kgone go dira se e leng gore Palamente e a se re roma gore re se dire. Golo mo ga go direle Palamente e bontle. Palamente fa e dumetse gore selo se dirwe ka ngwaga o, go tshwanetswe go boelwe ko go yone e tla e tlhalosediwa gore ga re a ka ra kgona go dira *project* e ka lebaka la go riana le di *priority* tsa yone di fetolwe. Go tshwanetse gore go bonwe gore Palamente e ga e direlwe bontle. Maikaelelo ke gore re tlaa bula matlho re lebelele dikgang tse, re kgone go gakolola gore o ka re jaanong go a tlodisiwa.

Maikaelelo a gore re nonotshe tshekatsheko ya tiragatso ya di *project*, *project monitoring* a a supilweng ke ba *Ministry of Finance* ke a a amogela. Ke maiteko a mantle a e leng gore puso e bone e le gore go na le bokoa jo bo rileng. Mme a re tseneleng ko teng re sekaseke go bona gore tota bothata bo fa kae jo e leng gore go paledisa gore re ko re fetse
half of the plan and the remaining half will be implemented in the three remaining years. Gonejaonga re rile re in the three remaining years re ya go dira di project go di feeleletsa tsa Mid-Term Review, re ntse re kgarametse tse dingwe ko morago. Ke ipotsa gore a ya go na nna space ko June 2008 le 2009 fa re ntse re di kgarametsa ka tsela e e ntseng jaana. What miracle is going to happen? Gonejaonga re eleng tlhoko selo se. Fa e le gore a go pala a re privatiseng jaaka re ka kgona go supa re re go na le dikgang tse e leng gore re ka kgona gore bangwe ba tsamaise ditiro tse di ka dirwang ka bofefo. Ke efa sekai ka ba Sports, projects tse di tshwanang tsa di stadium tse dinyenyane tse di tshwanang tsa bo Ghanzi, Bobonong le Lethaka le ka fiwa ba Sports Council, ba fiwa madi ba bona gore ba a di diragatsa. Ba ministry bone ba bo ba tswelela ka di project tse di tona tse di tshwanang tsa bo Gaborone le Francistown tse e leng gore di ka batla supervision ya bone. Sone se o se e leng gore fa re simolodisa the Public Private Partnership (PPP) concept ke yone e re ka e diragatsang re e lekeletsa ka batho ba e leng gore re ba romile go ka diragatsa jalo.

Ke sone se o se kopang gore go na le gore re suteletse di project ko morago a re lebeng ba re dirang le bone re ba neele di project re ba supervise accordingly ba diragatse di project re tle re kgone go diragatsa maikaelelo a. Re akgole maiteko a a neng a diriwa ke Mothusa Tautona a a neng a tsamaya a tlhola di project. Sebe sa phiri ke gore fa gongwe ba ne ba setse ba mo lemogile ka jalo a fiwa dikgang tse e seng boammaaruri go twe project e simologile, go ntse jaana le jaana dilo tse re di supile.

Gonejaonga re ba Ministry wa Local Government ba simolodise a monitoring and accountability team, e e tlaa tsamayang e audita performance on a three quarterly basis. Go dira jalo re tla bo re ipha seemo sa go bona gore a tota re ntse re mo teng, go na le gore re eme six months. Fa re tla mo budgeteng re bolelela gore plot ga e yo, plot e
nyenyane re santse re ya go oketsa TEC dilo tsa go nna jaana. Re mo pusong re santse re batla go nnela mo pusong e go ya go ileng jaaka re buile. A re direng tiragatso e re e beileng le maikano ka le a bona gore ga go na ope yo e leng gore re ka tshepisa tsamaiso ya puso mo go ene. Jaanong bakaualengwe a re emeng ka dinao re supe seemo sa gore re tlaa tswelela re busa go ya go ileng jaaka sekano sa rona se bua.

**MR MASALILA:** *On a point of elucidation Madam Speaker.* Ke a leboga mokaualengwe go mpha sebaka se. Ke dumelana le mafoko a a buiwang ke mokaualengwe. Kana sengwe se e leng gore ke mathata mo go rona ke gore re mo lebelong la gore *we should empower* Batswana. Re neela dikonteraka ditiro di bo di sa wele. Jaanong ke yone temana e e leng gore bakaualengwe ba ka re thusa mo go yone gore re emeng ka dinao. Kana re bua ka bana ba rona ba e leng gore ba fiwa ditiro tse di bo di sa fele. Kana sekai ke di *hostel* tsa Mmantshwabise, ke *the 7th year* go agiwa di *hostel* fela, di gana go fela.

**MR KGATHI:** Ke a leboga Tona. Kgakololo e ke ka e ntshang mo Lephateng la *Local Government because it is dear to the hearts of the people,* ke gore ko *Central District* go bitswe Mapalamente le Makhanselara otlhe. Go nniwe fa fatshe go tshotlhiwa kgang e ya gore re kgone go bona gore seemo ke eng. *It can be a day or two seminar* e re batlang go bona bothata re ntshe digakololo tse re ka di ntshang. Fa go na le boradikonteraka, bana ba Batswana ba ba teng re ka se ke re tswelele ka gore re ba dire tshipidi ntonto e le gore bone ga ba batle go diragatsa se se diragalang. Ke kgang e e leng gore re tshwanetse gore re tseye ditshwetso tse di tlhamaletseng.

Ke batla go bua ka kgang ya *poverty* mo lefatsheng la Botswana. Seemo sa *poverty* Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente, maikaelelo ame ke gore go tshwanetse go lebalebiwe digang tsa gore seemo sa lehuma sentse jang. Ke na le tumelo ya gore jaaka
definition ya poverty e santse e le teng e santse e lebile dikgang tsa gore a motho o bona dicho, a motho o bona se. Ga go a lekana, a go tsenngwe dikgang tse dingwe gore the Poverty Datum Line (PDL) e kgone go fetoga ka gore batho ba na le access to land and seeds. In that way, it is going to re-define it, re-characterize the definition ya poverty le conditions tsa PDL. Ke dingwe tse di tlogetsweng jaaka access to education, unlimited access to basic health and access to land.

Fa ke tsena mo temo thuog, ke botsa gore jaaka re tlaa bo re amogetse Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP) le seemo sa SLOCA rona ko kgaolong ya Bobirwa Tona wa Agriculture tsamaiso e tsile go nna jang ka gore go na le di restriction tsa motsamao wa leruo? Bothata jo bongwe ke mo re senang balemisi. Sekai ko Semolale le ko Mabolwe with over 3000 people molemisi o mongwe fela o siana fa ga re ga metse e. Kgang ke gore re ya go dira jang Rre Mfa le Rre Swartz, a ko le le thuseng. Ko Molalatau molemisi o sale a transfeerilwe ka April ngwagola, ga gona molemisi, maikaelelo ke gore ratio ya molemisi...

MR GAOLATLHE: On a point of correction Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, it was not my intention to intervene but I thought the statement made by the Honourable Member that I mentioned that Ghanzi was a new project is not correct. There is nothing in my speech about increasing the Total Estimated Cost (TEC) and introducing new projects, I did not mention that Ghanzi was a new project. Ghanzi is one of those whose TEC is no longer adequate. All we are asking was to increase the total estimated cost of that project. We were not saying it is new. It is not one of the new ones. Thank you.

MR KGATHI: Thank you Honourable Minister for the correction. Kgang tse di tshwenyang ke dikgang tsa balemisi. Balemisi ga ba na transport mme bakenti bone ba na
le *transport*. Ra re lebang dikgang tse, a ba pegane fa e le gore go na le dikgang tse go na le gore molemisi go twe a ipatlele *transport*.

Se sengwe se ke batlang go se bua mo kgang ya ALDEP, a bogolo re hire mo re ka reng ke a *National Coordinator* yo o tlaa itebaganyang le ALDEP go dira gore ALDEP e a diragadiwa jaaka re dirile ka NAMPAADD.

Ko thutong go na le mathata Tona a e leng gore a tshwenya barutabana. Seemo sa letlhoko la *accommodation*, seemo sa gore barutabana ba ka fa *Local Government* le ko *Education*, ba bua le mang fa go na le bothata, fa go sena boroko? Re na le *principal* ko Semolale yo o robalang mo *kitchen* a na le bana ba le *five*. *I am not exaggerating*, ga go na boroko. Seemo se se a tshwenya. *How do we expect* gore batho ba ka nna *productive* ka seemo se?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... Inaudible...

**MR KGATHI:** Ka re mo kitcheneng, *in the school kitchen*. O tsentse bolao jwa gagwe teng. Ke ne ka ya koo, ke bua seemo sa boroko bo bo seyong. Jaanong...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** One o ile go dira eng?

**MR KGATHI:** Ke monna *principal* wa teng. *Support staff* ke sone seemo se ke se buang, tla ke fetse ka bonako. Mo temaneng ya di *tax concession* e go neng gotwe fa di *company* di kgona go ka thusa banana mo ditirong... A re oketseng seemo se e leng gore *some of the good causes* e ka nna *health and fitness, sport and recreation, otherwise* re tsile go nna le *talent drain*. Sone seo o ka bona seemo sa gore re ka kgona gore re thuse batho. A re amendeng *Section 51* re kgone go thusa batho ba e leng gore ba tsile go thusa mo go tsa metshameko le tse dingwe tsa botsogo tse e leng gore batho ba ka sologelwa molemo ke tsone.
Salary increase ya 6 per cent e siame, mme mathata a teng ke gore under a free market economy ko re naganang gore the prices will regulate themselves go a pala within a set up of monopolies. Seemo se e leng gore se ntse jaana fa di monopoly de le teng ke bothata jo e leng gore ga bo kake ba kgonega. A re tsenyeng leitlho go bona gore re tlaa oketsa six per cent the next day ba oketsa di price because this is a monopoly. Shopo e le nngwefela e oketsa di price right across, whether you like it or not they will be continuation ya problem ya inflation ka sone seemo se se ntseng jalo. Ka bokhutshwanyane jo bo kalo ke a leboge.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LABOUR AND HOME AFFAIRS (MR G. U. S. MATLHABAPHIRI): Ke a leboga Motlotlegi Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Mma ke leboge thata Motlotlegi Tona wa Madi le Ditogamaano mo mafokong a a abeileng Ntlo e e tlotlegang e pele, a e leng gore ke mafoko a a isang lefatshe leno la Botswana golo gongwe. Kana re solofetse gore mo dingwageng di sekaenyana lefatshe le e bo le bonwa e le lengwe la mafatshe a a nonofileng.

Go na le go tlwaela thata ke bangwe ba nna ba re, Botswana ke lefatshe le le humileng. Mme tota kana Botswana gase lefatshe le le humileng. Botswana ke lefatshe la itsholelo e e potlana mme ka tsamaiso e e leng teng le tsamaisiwa sentle, go bo go dira e kete le botoka. Go nale mafatshe a le mantsi a re bapileng le one a e leng gore itsholelo ya one e nonofile thata go gaisa itsholofelo ya lefatshe la Botswana. Go nale dipharologanyo tse dintsi ka fa yone itsholelo eo jaanong e tsamaisiwang ka teng. Fa one o ka utlwa Batswana maloba bangwe ba bua mo seromamoweng go ntse gotwe, lefatshe le le humileng mo go kana-kana. Ke ka gore bangwe ba rona re le baeteledipele re a ne re re Botswana ke lefatshe le le humileng mme tota re ntse re itse gore ga re bue boammaururi.
Botswana ke lefatšhe le le fatogang, le le santseng le tswelela fela ke gore le farologanye le a mangwe ka gore itsholelo yone e e potlana, kana e e tsamaelang ko go e e fa gare e tshwerwe sentle.

Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente ke ne ke lebeletse maloba mo setshwantshong se sa motshikinyego go buisanngwa ka yone itsholelo e ya rona. Bangwe ba bua gore dilo tse dintsi tse di diragetseng ba re di dirilwe ke bone, motho a re, “gompiero jaana bagodi ba amogela madi ke Botswana National Front (BNF), batho ba ba neng ba ile bosoleng ba amogela madi ke BNF, ma 18 ba a tlhopa ke BNF.” Di ne tsa tlhomagana tsa ba tsa tla go nna six e ntse e le BNF mme ba sa buse. Le bone ba a tle ba bo ba ipolele gore gare buse jaanong se ne e re fa dilo tse dingwe di sa diragale sentle le re ke rona, go bua bone ka gore ga re buse. Jaanong fa e le dilo tse dintle tse di diragalang tsone... 

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of clarification Honourable Speaker. 

MR MATLHABAPHIRI: Nako e khutshwane thata ka gore jaanong malatsi ano re fılwe metsotso e masome mabedi le bothano fela. Jaanong mma ke tle ke bue ke fetse lame o tla bua la gago motlotlegi yo o tlotlegang. Tota e ya re go ntse jaana e re rotlhe re le Batswana ka fa re bonang seemo sa Botswana se ntse ka teng, re itumele rotlhe mme re itumelela tsamaiso e ntle e e neetsweng ba ba e neetsweng gore ba tsamaise lefatšhe gompiero, re thusanya le bone. 

Re kgona gore e re fa re bua re re lefatšhe leno le ntse jaaka le ntse, mme e bile re bua jalo re itse gore kganetso le yone e nnile le seabe. Jaanong motho fa a gagamala fela a re sennanne ke BNF (Botswana National Front), sennanne ke BNF, sennanne ke – kgantele fa a botswa gore ke eng fa dilo di sa nna sentle; ke eng fa go se na dipompo tse di gogang metsi a a leswé kwa Naledi, ke Tomokrag. Jaanong tse di maswe tsothle di
kgoromeletswa kwa go Tomokrag, tse dintle jaanong tsone ba a di ikgagapelela. Jaanong mme ba tshwanetse gore ba itse gore tota tsamaiso e re leng mo go yone gompieno ke yone ee re beileng fano. Ke gone mo o bonang gompieno jaana re ntse sentle e bile e kete – fa o tsena mo Palamenteng ya Botswana ga o ka ke wa fitlhela go na le dipharologanyo tse di kalo-kalo tse di tshwanang le tse di leng mo mafatsheng a mangwe. Ke ka go reng? Ke ka gore re a amogelana. Ba ba busang ba amogela ba ba ganetsang mme ba ba ganetsang ka gore ga ba kgarameletswe kwa ntle kwa, e bo e le gore ba na le tselo e ba tsenang ka yone ka fa tshwanelong. Fa re ne re tsamaya fela jalo re sa ipateletse dilo tse di sa re lebanang go ka bo go siame fela.

Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente, Tona o buile ka ditlhabololo tse di tlaa nnang. Bagaetsho, fa re riana ga re re re sengwe le sengwe se wetse fa re se batlang ka gore re lefatsho le le fatlhogang. Mme fa e le gore go na le ditsela dingwe tse di betliwang, tsa go leka go tokafatsa itsholelo ya rona, tsa go leka gore re nne le difitisa gobeng tse re tlaa nnang di tsenya bana ba Batswana mo ditirong go botoka. Fa gompieno gotwe go tlhatswiwa magala kwa Morupule, e tlaa re mo tirong eo go nne le bana bangwe ba le bantsi ba ba tlaa bonang diphatlha tsaditiro mme selo se se tshwanetse re se amogele. Gompieno jaaka gotwe go ya go tlhatswiwa kopore kwa Tati Nickel, re tshwanetse re amogele selo seo. Re tshwanetse re amogele ka fa Morupule a yang go godisiwa ka teng, e bile re tshwanetse re amogele gore go ya go tlhomiwa moepo wa magala kwa Mmamabula. Re amogele dilo tse e le matshego a itsholelo ya rona a e leng gore le fa e bile e le gore ga a ka ke a tsaya Batswana botlhe ba ba seng mo ditirong mme a tla re fetisa golo gongwe. Re amogele selo seo se ntse jalo. Re tsene mo lefatsheng la Botswana re bua le Batswana re ba tlhalosetsa selo seo re le barongwa ba bone mo Palamenteng. Re
sale re le mo Palamenteng mo e bo e le gore re tlaa re re ntse jaana e bo e le gore mongwe le mongwe o batla gore a bo a bapatsa lekgotla la gagwe la sepolotiki. Nnyaa, ka gore fa re bua ka dilo tse e leng gore ke tsa ditlhabololo tsa lefatshe la rona re tshwanetse go tlhoma megopolo mo go tsone.

Ditiro tse di yang go dirwa tse, madi a a yang go dirisiwa a a e leng gore… Bagaetsho re tshwanetse go tlhaloganya gore jaaka maloba moeteledipele wa kganetso fa a ne a re dilo tse dingwe bone ba tlile go di dira ka go dirisa madi one a go tweng ke foreign reserves.

Kana foreign reserves tse bagaetsho re tshwanetse go tlhaloganya gore ke tsone tse di re letlang gore fa re batla gore itsholelo ya rona e gole jaaka e le gore dithoto tse re godisang itsholelo ya rona ka tsone di tlaa bo di tswa kwa ntle, re bo re na le se re di rekang ka tsone. Fa jaanong re setse re na le mogopolo wa gore re re ya go a fokotsa ka go a tsenya fa e leng gore a tlaa bo a ka seke a re solofela molemo teng ke gone mo e leng gore jaanong ga re lebele kwa pele. Ga se gore goromente yo o leng teng gompieno jaaka foreign reserves di ntse jaaka di ntse jaana re itse gore di dirisiwa go le kae. Ba bangwe kana ba e tle ba latole gore madi ke a le a beilwe fela kwa ga nke a bo a dirisiwa. Motho a lebala gore fa a emelela fa jaaka gompieno ba ne ba ile India maloba fa a tsena mo bankeng o dirisa one madi ao a a beilweng go sele one a. Fela jaaka a ne a tsena mo bankeng a ya go tsaya foreign exchange o dirisa one madi ao, re a dirisa letsatsi le letsatsi.

Ga se gore ga a dirisiwe, fa o tsena mo dibankeng mo o ya go fitlhela mela batho ba batla foreign exchange. Ba bangwe e le gore ke bagwebi, ba bangwe e le borra madirelo, ba bangwe go reka dithoto tse ba tlileng go tsamaisa itsholelo ka tsone tse e leng gore diphatlha tsa ditiro di tlile go okediwa. Ke gore borra madirelo ba kgonne gore ba bone foreign exchange ba reke dithoto ka kwa ntle tse di tlileng go godisa madirelo a bone gore
Batswana ba tswelele ba bona ditiro. Dilo tse ga re a tshwanela gore re bo re itebatsa ampo re tswala matlho fa re di bona kana re tswala ditsebe tsa rona. Mme re tshwanetse gore seemo se se ntseng jaana re se lebogele, re lebogele gore itsholelo ya rona bagaetsho e sampe e leka. Fa gompieno jaana Tona a ne a re boelelela gore mo ngwageng o o fetileng madi a ditlhabololo a ne a fetile dikete tsa di dikadike tse tlhano, a fetile P5 billion. Gompieno a fetile P7 billion, kana fa gotwe ke madi a a tlileng go dirisiwa mo ditlhabololong go tewa gone fa e leng gore ditlhabololo tseo di ya go tsala gore bana bangwe golo gongwe ba bone diphatlha tsa ditiro. Ga re re seemo se se se leng teng re tshwanetse go phutha mabogo ra bo re re nnyaa, jaanong go siame. Mongwe le mongwe oa amega gore re na le bana ba rona ba ba tsamayang mo mebileng mo ba se na ditiro. Mme kana sengwe sa dilo tse re di lebalang bagaetsho ke gone gore bana ba rona re tshwanetse gore re ba pataganele ka go ba ruta.

Gompieno jaana rona ba lephata la tsa selegae – Labour and Home Affairs, re eletsa gore bana ba rona ba ba rutetsweng ditiro ba ba ikwadise mo lephateng la Labour Department. Ka gore gangwe le gape re nna re na le bagwebi kana borra madirelo ba ya kwa Home Affairs ba ya go raya Labour Commissioner, ba ya go raya bo Director of Immigration and Citizenship ba ba raya ba re re eletsa gore le re neele batswakwa ba le kana. Fa jaanong ba Immigrants Selection Board ba sa itse gore go na le Batswana ba le kae ba ba rutetsweng ditiro tseo mme ba sa ikwadise. Re eletsa gore e re re le barongwa ba bone bagaetsho re ba rotloetse thata gore a ba tlwaele gore ba ikwadise kwa Labour Department. O ka fitlhela e kete dilo tse di beetswe batho ba bo Construction fela. Mme go kwadisa moo go batla gore ngwana wa rona mongwe le mongwe yo o seng mo tirong a ikwadise kwa Labour Department ka jaana diphatlha tse di a ne di nne teng. Mme
jaanong ba *Immigrants Selection Board* ba seke ba itse gore a re na le bana *in the market*. Jaanong fa ba le teng a go itsiwe. Bone bo Labour Commissioner le Labour Officers ba nne ba ntse ba tsaya one maina a. Fa ba tsamaya ba ya kwa *Immigrants Selection Board* ba ye gore nnyaa, ga re ka ke ra tsaya batswakwa ka gore re na le Batswana ba le kana ba e leng gore ba rutetswe ditiro tseo. Mme fa ba sa ikwadisa gope ga re ka ke ra itse. Re eletsa gore re thusanye tsamaiso e bagaetsho, ya *Training and Localisation*. Re batla gore Batswana ba tsene mo…

**MR TSOGWANE:** *Point of clarification.*

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI:** Kana ke boletse gore nako e khutshwane. Ka re ke batla go bua se ke batlang go se bua ke bo ke fetsa, o o buang o tlaa bua la gagwe. Jaanong mme ke bue fela ke fetse e…

**MR TSOGWANE:** Ke a kopa ka gore o ntse o re bana ba ikwadise jaanong gongwe re ne re batla go itse. Kana fa bana fa o ba bolelela ka *Labour and Home Affairs* bone ba ithaya ba re go na le dingwaga dingwe tse di rileng. *So,* ke sone se re neng re se kopa fela gore a go ikwadisa ngwana wa digwaga dingwe le dingwe fela.

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI:** Ke thhalosa gore mo diofising tsa *Labour* ra re bana ba rona ba ba seng mo ditirong ba tlwaele go ya go ikwadisa koo. Fela fa a itse gore ke monana ampo ke motha mongwe le mongwe, Motswana mongwe le mongwe yo o santseng a nonofetse go bereka mme a se mo tirong re eletsa gore ba ikwadise ka jaana go…

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Ya go bua kwa Radiong.

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI:** E tlaa re batsaya dikgang fa ba tswa fa ba bolele mo Radiong gore ke ne ke reng. Jaanong re tlaa boa re dira *statement* mme fela bagaetsho ke sengwe sa dilo tse e leng gore di ka re thusa go bona gore ka gore gompieno jaana re a
ngongorega, le rona tota kwa *Labour and Home Affairs* re a ngongorega gore Batswana ga ba mo ditirong. Fa gongwe le fa re tlhamalala re re nnyaa, fa tota re bona go ka tsena Motswana, bone borra kgwebo kana borra madirelo ba re ba kae. Fa ba re ba kae fa re sa kgone gore re ba supe go tlile go pala gore re ba re e re re ke ba mme fa ba le teng, a e ka ne e le ba ba tswang kwa sekolong se se golo kwa mmadikolo, a e ka ne e le ba di *secondary*, a e ka ne e le ba ba rutetsweng di *artisan* le sengwe le sengwe. A e re fa re na le bone jaaka re itse gore re na le bone tota fela re eletsa thata gore ba ikwadise, mme go ka re thusa thata fela. Mme le gone le rona re le barongwa ba batho fa re tsamaya mo dikgaolong tsa rona mo a re ba rotloetseng. Ga re re fa ba kwala re bo re re nnyaa, yang go kwala e tlaa re ka moso le bo le bonye tiro. Ra re re bo re itse gore fa re re go na le bana ba rona ba ka tlatsang diphatlha tse di rileng re bo re ka ba supa ba le teng.

Jaanong ke raya gore ntlha eo ke ne ke eletsa gore ke e gatelele fela thata gore Tona Mme Mma Nasha a e lebogele. Jaanong e nngwe e ke ka fetang ka yone ke e lebogela kana e rile mo malatsinyaneng a a fetileng, ke ne ke ntse ke tlaa bo ke na le mogopolo o jaanong o fedileng. Ke ne ke utlwile botlhoko gore jaanong mogopolo o ke tlaa tlhola ke o tlisa jang mo Palamenteng. Mme jaanong ke kgatlhiwa ke gore mo tsebeng ya bone mo tsetleng ya lesome le bobedi, re bolelelwa teng gore mo lephateng la *Local Government*, go na le lephatana le le bidiwang gotwe ke *Technical Services Unit*...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Ke ne ka go bolelela o bo o tatalala fela.

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI:** Nnyaa, o ne wa nthaya wa re ke tle ka *motion* gore o tle o ntlatse. Jaanong mang ke leboge thata gore lephatanyana le le teng ka jaana bagaetsho re tshwentswe ke seemo se dikolo tsa rona tse dipotlana di leng mo go sone. Ke ne ke tlile gore fa ke ka bo ke ne ka tla mo Palamenteng mo ka bua mogopolo wa me ke ne ke ya go
tlhalosa seemo se se tlhobaetsang se se leng teng mo dikolong tse dipotlana. Se o tla fitlhela fa gongwe *classroom* e ntse fela jaana go se na le fa e le bodilo mme e le gore bana ba nna gone foo. Go se na ditilo tse di lekanetseng, mme selo se so sa tsalwe ke gore lephata la dikgaolo ga le a ntsha madi. Fa gongwe se tsalwa ke gore re na le boitseme kwa dikhanseleng tsa rona bo re tshwanetseng gore re go pataganele ka go ba raya re re bagaetsho tlhe e ne e re madi a le teng re a dirisa. Ka gore gompieno jaana bagaetsho seemo sa dikolo tsa rona tse dipotlana mo lefatsheng la rona la Botswana ka bontsi se a tlhobaetsa. Dingwe kwa Mmadinare gatwe di tsalela bommamathwane, mo gongwe di *classroom* di se na ditilo, bana ba rona ba sampe ba rutelwa mo ditlhareng.

Lephatana le le buiwang le le kana le ya go itebaganya le seemo seo sa gore jaaka madi a ntshiwa gotwe ke *backlog eradication* e bo e le gore o ka kgona gore di *classroom* tse di lekanetseng di agiwe. Go agiwe matlwana a boithomelo a e leng gore mo dikolong tse dingwe o tla fitlhela e le gore jaanong seemo se tlhobaetsa e le gore le bone bana mme e bile e le bana ba bannyennyane ga o itse gore bana ba ba tlaa ya kae fa tse dingwe di sa le di tletse foo di phephetha mme go bo go tewa barutabana gotwe go raya gore jaanong le tle le nna le ba fokoletsa foo. Gotwe sekole jaanong ke sone se senke khansele e tle go goga o sa itse gore fa khansele e le gore e raya sekole e re ke lona le goge, nnyaa, mma.

Le goge one matlwana a boithomelo le a fokotse.

Jaanong go tlhokafala thata lephata le le tshwanang le le Tona a le beileng fa pele ga rona le, ka gore mo dikgaolong ka bontsi bogolo thata kwa Molepolole e e Bokone, fa ke ne ke tsamaya le dikole tseo jaaka e le gore gantsi fa ngwaga o simologa fa ke ise ke tsene mo diphuthegong ke etele dikole tsa rona. Ke fitlhlele di le mo seemong se se tlhobaetsang thata. Re leboga Tona thata gore lephata le bo le le teng mme a ko e re le le teng jalo le
tlhomamise go bona gore dikhanele tsa rona di dira tiro ka gore le fa madi a ka nna teng, tsamaiso e ya nna teng fa e le gore khanele ga e tshwane le e ke e utlwileng e galalediwa thata. Ke utlwile maloba go galalediwa khanele nngwe gotwe e dira tiro ka botlalo ka ba ka ultwa Rra,...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ya South East

MR MATLHABAPHIRI: Ya South East, ke utlwile e galalediwa thata ka ba ka tswa pelo. Ke utlwa ka fa e leng gore khanele ya South East e tsamaisa dilo ka teng ka ba ka utlwa ke tswa pelo.

Gatwe ba ne ba boka. Fa o bona khansele e dira ka botlalo, re tshwanetse gore re e akgole, jaaka fa ba ne ba akgolwa. Mme fa e le gore e dira go le boutsana, re tshwanetse gore re ba rotloetse. Jaanong lephata le le ntseng jaana le tlaa tla le re thusa thata.

Ke batla gore ke fete foo le fa bo Chief Whip ba ntse ba re setse morago.

MADAM SPEAKER: You still have five minutes.

MR MATLHABAPHIRI: Ahaa, nako e ntsi thata.

E nngwe e ke batlang go feta ka yone ke e e buang ka seemo sa rona sa ka fa lefatshe leno le ikaelelang gore le tle le godise ditsamaiso tsa diteemane ka teng. Go utlwala fa e le gore go setse go ikwadisitse dikompone di ka nna lesome le botlhano, tse di batlang go tla go rethefatsa diteemane tse. Dikompone tse di tla bo di dibaya mo seemong se e leng gore di ka dira dikagale, manyena le direng. Mme ke seemo se re tshwanetseng gore re se amogele.

Re tshwanetse re amogele BTC Botswana ka diatla tsoo-pedi. Bogolo re ka re ee, e ne ya diega, mme kana e ne e sa diege fela. Ke mongwe wa batho ba e leng gore mo dingwageng tse ke neng ke ntse ke le Mopalamente, ke ne ke bua thata ka sone seemo se
gore o kare re le lefatshe la Botswana ga re batle go gola. Re godisa madirelo a rona a diteemane, re sa kgale, re gakolola. Go na le go kgala go na le go gakolola. Mme seemo se Tona a boletseng gore se tsile go nna teng se, re a se lebogela. Ke a le mantlo a a gola gaufi le mabala a difofane, a e leng gore mo go one diteemane tse di tswang mo mafatshefatsheng di tsile go felela di rekela mono. Ka tsela e e ntseng jalo bagaetsho, di tlaa bo di rekela mono, go tlaa bo go ka kgonafala gore jaanong boramadirelo ba ikgethele diteemane. Kana selo se re tshwanetseng gore re se lemoge ke gore, ga se teemanee nngwe le nngwe e ramadirelo a e batlang. Madirelo a bone a dirisa diteemane tse di rileng. Diteemane tse di tla bo di le dintsi ka di tlaa bo di tlhakana le tse di tswang kwa mafatshe a mangwe. Seo se tlaa oka boramadirelo ka bontsi gore seemo sa diteemane tse ba tlaa bong ba di batla ba bo ba ka di bona motlohofo. Ba di reka kwano, ba sa ye go di reka kwa Enyelane jaaka ba ntse ba di reka. Golo mo re tshwanetseng re go lebogele re bo re go rotloetse. E seka ya re jaaka go tsena jaana re bo re simolola re kgala gore, hee gompieno jaana diteemane tsa rona hee, mme e le gore re kgala ka nako e jaanong madirelo ao a leng teng. Fa gotwe dikhamphani di neetswe di *license* di le 15 jaana, ga se thaka ya motho.

Gompieno re ntse re na le dikompone tsa go nna jalo di sa fete *five* le fa e le *four*. Mme fa e le gore jaanong go setse go neetswe di *license* ba ka tshwara 15, seemo se re tshwanetse re se lebogele. Re itse gore mo dingwageng tse di tlang, bana ba rona ba Botswana ba ya go bona diphatlha tsa ditiro ka bontsi gone mo madirelong a a ntseng jalo. Mme ga go a wa fela, go tsile ka thulaganyo e e dirilweng ke goromente. E tsile gore ka moso ka gore motho o kile a ema mo Palamenteng a kgala a bo a re, le a bona madirelo a diteemane a matonatona, ke BNF. Ka moso ba tlaa bo ba rialo, mme e le gore
dithulaganyo tse di tswang kgakala di ntse di baakanyediwa. Le gone ga ba nke ba re ke BCP, fa ba tswa fa ba re ke BNF, mme ba ne ba ntse ba na le ma-BCP. Jaanong dilo tse re tshwanetse gore e re jaaka di tla jaana bagaetsho, re di amogele mme re rotloetse bana ba rona.

Mme gape re bue thata ka security sa diteemane tse, gore fa e ka re go ntse jaana go bo go simolola jaanong di sa tshwarwe sentle, o a ne o utlwa gotwe diteemane di bonwe kwa bokete, go tsile go dira gore batho ba tshabe lefatshe la rona. E ko e re go riana re ko re di tlhokomeleng. Ke eng fa bangwe ba rona re ne re kgona gore o tshware diteemane tse di kana fela, o di direla fa o di direlang teng, go tswa fa o di tseny a mo diboxeng o bo o ya go di tswalela? Mme letlapa leo le ka seka la go kgatlha mo e ka reng o tswa fa o bo o le iteela ka kgetse. Gompieno bana ba rona o ka fithlha e le gore fa motho a di lebile di ntse jalo o bona khumo fela e e seng kana ka sepe. Mme rona fa re ne re di dira, sa rona e ne e le gore re lebile lefatshe la Botswana, re le baya fa pele ga rona. Jaanong ba gompieno fa motho a di bona di le kalo a re, banna, motho o ka tabola tsone tse a ya go dira se a ka se dirang ka tsone. Security ke sengwe sa dilo tse di tsileng go thusa gore fa go buiwa ka Diamond Trading Company Botswana, go tsile go gogela le one mafatshe ao gore diteemane tsa bone di tle kwano. Gape ga ba kake ba dumela gore diteemane tsa bone di ye kwa lefatsheng le e leng gore ga go ye go nna le tlhokomelo ya diteemane.

Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke tlatsa Tona mo go se a se kopileng.

**MR F. K. NAGAFELA (LETLHAKENG WEST):** Ke a go leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Pele gongwe motho o ka simolola ka gore, tota gatwe kabo madi e, e raya eng. Kana ke tshwanetse ke nne le ditlhaloso. Batho ba ke ba emetseng ba
itse gore ke tsile kabong ya madi, mme ke tshwanetse ke bo ke na le se ke ka reng ke
tsena kwa ka ba raya ka re e rile go ajwa le lona le bone se. Mme fa e le gore ke tsile go
boa jaaka o kare motho o tswana go fagola ntsa nnyaa, ga ke bone e le gone tota. Gone re a
bona dipalapalo mme batho ba dikgaolo ga ba dumele mo dipalopalong. Fa o ema mo
kgotleng o ba bolelela gore go na le di million di le kana e bile di kgaogantswe go
taboletswe kwa bokana, ga ba utlwe gore wa reng. O tshwanetse o ba bolelela gore, jaaka
re ne re le kwa kabo mading jaana, le tlaa tla go agelwa sepatela kampo sekolo se se tona
kampo se se kae fela. Ke tsone dilo tse ba di tlhaloganyang. Mo ga dipalapalo mo ga go
reye sepe. Jaanong ke ya go ba raya ke reng? Ke re ngwaga o o ba tsholetse eng se e leng
gore ke rile ke a tlhola mo. Kana gompieno jaana le fa e le Motlotlegi Tona Mokaila o
tlaa re a le kwa kgaolong ya gagwe a bo a bolela gore mo kabong madi ngwaga ono, madi
a le a neetsweng ke bokana, go tla go agelwa senior secondary school. Ke yone kabo
madi eo. Ga re kake ra tla go reetsa go tlotlwa ka fa ba bangwe ba neetsweng ka teng,
rona re bo re boa re itlhobogile fela. Ke raya gore boitumelo jwame ga bo kana ka jwa ga
Honourable Mokaila ka ene o na le se a tlaa yang go se bolela.
Mme Tona, le nna ke seka ka ya kwa kgaolong jaaka motho a tswana go dira sone se ke
neng ke se bolela. Ga ke batle go ya go nna kwa ke hutsafetse jaaka o kare motho ga a
tswe moketeng o go neng go jewa. Fa go ne go na le phosegonyana Tona, ke a go kopa,
baakanya. Le fa e le go jewa mothobiso batho ba ne ba bua kgomo, ke a supa ga gona yo
o tleng a tswe foo a sa bona setokinyana sa mothobiso. Nnyaa tlhe bathong! Gatwe nna ke
tlaa bo ke le wa mofuta ofe? Jaanong tsweetswe, baakanya fa go na le phosego golo
gope. Ke a lemoga gore sengwenyana se fosegile. Mme o a nkutlwa, o monna yo o
utlwang, phosego eo e tlaa baakanngwa. Ga ke batle go ya kwa teng ka yone ka gore ke e bone, mme le wena ke a belaela o a e lemoga.

Bagaetshe, go na le sengwe se ke tshwanetseng gore ke fete ka sone. Batswana ba itsiwe ka botho. Ke nngwe ya dikonokono tse Batswana ba tumileng ka tsone. Mme ke batla gore ke fete ka mafoko a makhutshwane ke re, le fa re tsena mo Palamenteng re tshwanetse re lebe dilo tse pedi tse di farologaneng. Selo sa ntlha re tshwanetse re lebe dingwaga tsa motho le maemo a a neetsweng. Re itse gore dilo tse pedi tse di kopantswe, di raya go le go tona. Gompieno jaana Motlotlegi Mopalamente wa Molepolole Bokone e bile e le Mothusa Tona, o ka bona gore jaanon o motlodiwa wa setshaba. Fa Tautona a mo supile ka monwana jalo, o nna motlodiwa wa setshaba, jaanon o tshwanetse a neelwe tlotla e e tshwanelang maemo a gagwe. Le fa e bile dingwaga di ka bo di le kwa tlase, mme fela ka go tlhongwa gone moo ka bogone, go mo neela tlotla e e leng gore o tshwanetse a e neelwe. Ke tlhailwe ke ditlhong maloba, moeteledipele wa Ntlo e, Motlotlegi Lt. Gen. Mompati Merafhe, re mo tlotla ka dingwaga le ka maemo a gagwe a a neetsweng, a bo a sotla moeteledipele wa kganetsi a re o tshwana le monna yo o gogang lethaku mo ngweding. O ka bona gore ga gona tlotlo mo Palamenteng e. Ga go tlotlwe maemo a batho mo go ka buiwang jalo. Fa a ya go tshwantshiwa motho wa maemo a a kalo le setshwantsho se se bonwang mo ngweding se goga lethaku. Nnyaa! Ke a mo tlotla ga ke kake ka bua go feta fa. Mme fela ke gone mo go neng ga nkutlwisa botlhoko.

Bagaetshe, go na le kgang e ya go sa direng ditiro di wela le go sa diriseng madi a a abiwang jaaka fa go ne go solofelwa. Mme go na le mafoko a a neng a buiwa ke Mothusa Tona, Honourable Masalila, gore re le Mapalamente, re nne re ya go itsamaisa fa go nang le di project teng mo dikgaolong tsa rona. Ka gongwe batho ba ba dirang ditiro ba e ka re
Monday 12 February 2007

a bona Mopalamente a ne a iphetisa foo, gongwe a tla a nna le pela le ya gore o tlo a ya go bolela gore tlo ya gore e tselele, gongwe a oketsa mosepele wa gore dirig a tlo. Ga ke gane, re tshwanetse re nne re iphetisa, mme kante ditiro ga di diwe ke gone moo. Kante di ntse di diwa ke gore le ntse le sena technical units. Ke yone e e ntseng e dia, e ne e se Mapalamente. Mo gongwe gape, go tlo a nna le political intrusion. Ke gore jaanong e re batho ba neetswe ditiro ka fa ba di abetsweng ka teng, e bo e le gore jaanong malapotiki le bone ba itsenyatsenya mo teng fela ka gore go tulwe ba nne ba ya go iphetisa foo. Go tloja jaanong e bile go dia ditiro le go fela. Kana e tlaa re ke tla ke le Mapalamente, go a itsiwe gore ke Mopalamente mo Ntlong e, mme go itsiwe gore ke mo-Front, kana ene yo o tshwereng tiro yoo, gongwe e bile ke mo-Domkraga, o ka nna ya re a mpona fela a bo a bifelesega mo moweng. Mme fa go nna jalo go na le tsele nngwe e a ka e dirang gore a die ka bomo gore tlo e e kwa kgaolong yame e diege le go feta go tle go lebege jaaka o kare dilo ga di tsamaye sentle mo kgaolong yame. Ke raya gore political intrusion le yone re seka ra tloja ra iphitlhela e le gore e ya go kgoreletsa tsone ditiro tse re neng re re di dirwe. Ee, go ya mo ofising fela o ya go bona modirelapuso o re ke ne ke batla go itse gore le tsamaya fa kae, mathata a lona e ka bo e le eng...

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Ke kopa go thalosetse mokaulengwe gore kana jaaka a bua jaana, bone boradikonteraka ba, fa a setse a bona a saletse kwa morago khansele e re jaanong a re kgaogangeng, we want to terminate, o sianela kwa Mopalamenteng gore nkisa kwa batho ke ba ba re ba a kgaola. Mme fa o ka iphetisa gone foo, go a thusa. Le batho ba ba tona le ka lemoga gore nnyaa ga ke batle go tsena fa. Mme fa a go bona fela o feta o a thwaafala, o itse gore kana fa a le mo mathateng o itse gore
Monday 12 February 2007

Mopalamente o teng. Ya go nthusa kwa ba re ba a termineita mme ke Motswana ke na le Omang. Omang ga a kake a re thusa ka sepe.

**MR NAGAFELA:** Ke a leboga Tona, ke nngwe ya dikgakololo tse di siameng fela thata. Tota nna ga ke gane mafoko a o neng o a bua, ke ne ke raya gore re seka ra iphitlhela e le gore jaanong re ya go nna le di supervaesara tsa ditiro. Batho ba ba neetswe ditiro go na le yo o ko godimo le yo a mo latelang jalo-jalo. Go tshwanetse go nne le thulaganyo; gongwe le Tona a nne le *schedule* sa gore o briefiwa leng le leng. A itsisewe gore dilo di tsamaya jang a tle a kgone go raya *Permanent Secretary* a re, Rra ke utlwa o ka re dilo ga di tsamaye sentle, leitlho la gago le tsenye fa kae; le ene a reye monnawe jalo. O tlaa fitlhela e le gore fa e le gore ba ntse ba tsentse leitlho ba briefa Tona sentle, kana Tona o tlaa kgalema mme *Permanent Secretary* le ene o tlaa kgalema. Jaanong go tlaa bo go sa tlhoke gore go fete mo Mapalamenteng gore tiro e tle e dirwe ka gore, *chain* yone e e tlaa bo e dira gore tiro e dirwe ka botswerere.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED FOR APPROXIMATELY 25 MINUTES**

**MR NAGAFELA (LETLHAKENG WEST):** Ke a go leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Ke itebaganya le lenaneo la banana le Tona a supang ka fa le yang go tokafatsa itsholelo ya banana ka teng le go ba thusa mo kgwebong ya temo-thuo. Fa le buiwa ka molomo e bile le balwa ka fa le kwadilweng ka teng, ke lenaneo le le ntle thata. Jaanong motho gongwe o ka ipotsa gore pele fa le kwalwa lone lenaneo le, a go ne go lebilwe gore *on the ground* a go a go nna *possible*. Fa e le lenaneo le e leng la balemisi le bakenti fela kampo batho ba ba ithutetseng tsa temo-thuo, temo-thuo e tlhaelelwa ke badiredi ka fa bokenting le ka fa bolemising… Jaanong a go na le *surplus* ya balemisi le bakenti ba e leng gore re solofela gore ba ka ya go tsena mo lenaneong le? Kante jaanong
puso ya re balemisi ba ba ntseng ba thusa balemi-barui, ba ye go tlogela ditiro ba ye go
tsaya madi a gore ba ye go tsweledisa lenaneo le? A ga se gore gape le ya go kgoreletsa
ba ba ntseng ba tsweletse le temo-thuo? A ga se yone puso e, e e rileng Barolong e le
balemi ba ba tlhwatlhwla ya ya go ba gapela diterekere ka ba ne ba kolotile. Puso e ne ya
ba ya ba dira gore e nne batho ba jaanong ba kgobegang marapo mo temo-thuong e ne e le
balemi fela ba ba duleng diatla. A bana ba bone ke bone ba yang go ba gaisa mo jaanong
le ka reng nnyaa, lona bagolo le re tseetse diterekere, re le panne jaanong re naya bana ba
lon; ka bagolo le ba gapetse tse ba neng ba na natso. A bana ba na le tse le yang go di
gapa ka lona le dumela mo go gapesheng batho? Ke gore le ‘bo-mooka ntsa a apere thupa’.
E ne e tle e re fa re sale bannye re batla go tshwara mebutla, re tshela molora o mosweu
jaana fela mo tselaneng, jaanong mmutla o tlaa re o tla o raloga mo tselaneng e, o
itumelela molora o re o tshetseng fa rona re bo re o thaisitse. Bone banana ba e re ntswa
lenaneo le lebega le buiwa le le monate e bile le lebega le balega sentle, mathata ke gore
le ya go ba farologanya jang le batsadi ba bone. Ba ya go rekisa kae thobo ya bone ko
batsadi ba bone ba sa boneng ditlhwatlhwla tse di siameng tsa yone? Kana go tewa gore ba
tle go rekisa ko Marketing Board; ba tseelwe mahala jaaka batsadi ba bone.
Sa bobedi ene monana yo o 18 years a sena setsha, a se ka ke a bewa lefatshe, a la re a ye
go adima tshimo mo go rraagwe yo o ntseng a lema a otl a ene monana yo le bo monnawe
le mmaagwe? A a ye go mo naya tshimo mme jaanong ba ba setseng ba rraabo a ba otle
ka eng ka o ntse a a ne a lema ka ditonki tse le di ba phakisang gore bogolo bana ba tle ba
inne ba riana ba ore mo lelo wa mariga. Gape kana motsadi o ntse a lema ene mme a kgona
go fa bana ba gagwe letlhafula mahala. Kana yo o 18 years yo fa a adlingwa tshimo, o ya
kgwebong, ga go na mmidi yo o tswang mahala. Letlhafula bomonnawe, bommaagwe ba
Monday 12 February 2007

ka le bona ka go le reka fela. Jaanong bona fela gore lenaneo le le ya go dira mathata a a ntseng jang.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR NAGAFELA: Nnyaa, ke tlhalosa ka fa go ntseng ka teng ga ke latlhe ope. Ga ke ka ke ka neela ngwanake yo o 18 years tshimo e ke ntseng ke otla bonnawe ka yone, ene gore a ye go dira kgwebo. Ra re a a bewe tshimo, mme o ka bewa tshimo fa e le gore go ka fetolwa melao e e letlelelang gore motho yo o 18 years a bewe setsha. Ga go ka ke ga twe jaanong a ye go tsaya tshimo e e ntseng e otla bonnawe le mmaagwe. Jaanong ke one mathata mangwe a a leng teng.

MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR SWARTZ): A Motlotlegi o a lemoga gore mo nageng e go lengwang mo go yone (traditional), e seng mo go commercial jaaka ga bo Pandamatenga, masimo one a rona a a a buang a, naga e e ka lengwang e tsamaya fa go bo 300,000 hectares? Mme mo bogompienong ka ngwaga mo nageng yone e, fa go twe go lemilwe ke bo 30 something thousand hectares out of 300,000. Jaanong mme bone ba ba ntseng mo masimong a, a e leng gore gompieno a dule ditlhare tse di godileng, a bone mme ga ba ka ke ba adima bana ba bone ka gore ga ba a dirise gompieno?

MR NAGAFELA: Ke a leboga, Rraetsho. Ke gore gongwe o raya gore ba ba lucky ba ba swetsweng ke batsadi, masimo a bone a bo a sa lengwe, ke bone ba ba tlaa bonang diphatlha tsa go ya go lema. Mme gape motho o ka ipotsa gore fa e le gore go na le di hectare tse di kalo-kalo tse di sa dirisiweng, ke eng fa di sa dirisiwe? A le na le mabaka a gore ke eng di sa dirisiwe? A le tsile ka mangwe masalamose a banana bone ba ka yang go kgona go di dirisa go gaisa jaaka di ne di ntse di sa dirisiwe. E le gore masalamose a teng ke eng? A ke re Botswana ke lefatshe le le senang pula e e ikanyegang. A ga se gore
mangwe a matlhagare a nna jalo ka ntlha ya leuba mo gongwe le le ipuseletsang gompieno jaana. Mme fa e le gore ke mabaka a leuba a banana bone ba lucky mo e leng gore ba a go emisa leuba, mo e leng gore bone nnyaa, dilo tsa bone di a go siama fela?

Gompieno jaana Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente, ke letse ke utlwa batho ba ba segetsweng di plot ko Glen Valley ba lela. Ba lediwa ke ditlhwatlhwa tsa metsi. Ga ke itse gore metsi ao ke a a tswang kae, kante ga twee ke a di toilet, fela ke utlwa go twee ke metsi a e leng gore ke a a dirisitsweng a e leng gore ba nosa ka one. Ba lediwa ke metsi a a dirisitsweng. Bana ka ba tshwanetse ba a go ya le lefatshe lotlhgo a go lema koo, bone metsi a a dirisitsweng ba a go a bona kae teng koo; go nosetsa, ka gore bagolo ke ba ba a lela.

Se sengwe ke gore re sa ntse re na le bothata. Go tswa mo tshimong ya me go ya ko motseng ga go na le la e le tsela e e leng gore e ka re le fa ke ne ke na le thobo ka e isa ko marekisetson. Le ntse le sa re direle ditsela le na le nonofo ya go ya go dira ditsela, le ne le di beetse banana. Mme le itse gore banana le bone jaanong malatsi a, ba ba sa ithutelang temo-thuo ba ithutetse Business Studies ba na le tse le tse dingwe tse di farologanyeng, ba a ipotsa gore jaanong bone goromente wa bone o kae. Ga re re bale ba molato, potso ke gore ka ke banana botlhgo bale bone ba a go bona madi a e bileng a bonwa motlhofo mo go kalo-kalo. Nnyaa tlhe, e bile madi a bone a bonwa motlhofo ruri mme e bile a le mantsi. Jaanong yo o sa ithutelang bolemisi ke gore ene ga a na puso, potso ke gore ene e nne wa ga mang? Lenaneo le fa le ne le le botoka, ke fa nkabo le ne le tsenye banana botlhgo. Mme e re ba tsentswe botlhgo ba ya yang go dira temo-thuo ba ye go e dira go tokafatsa temo-thuo, ga go na bothata. Jaanong le setse le tlogetse ba ba ntsintsiko thoko. Mme gape le gone go ya go ithutela temo-thuo; a o ya go nna mokenti kana
molemisi, fa gongwe o ya fela ka gore go ne go sena ko o ka yang go dira course teng. Fa o tswana fa o ya koo, o ya go dira course yone eo o sena lerato mo temo-thuong, mme e setse e le fela gore at least o tle o nne le certificate.

MR SWARTZ: Rraetsho, mo kgannyeng e o e buang e o reng go tulwe ba ba ithutetseng temo-thuo fela, ga ke itse ka gore mokaulengwe o teng ke itheile ka re fa a bua o rile batho ba ba tlaa nnang le poelo e e botoka, bogolo-jang ba ba setseng ba na le lesedi. Mme lenaneo le ka fa ke le tlhaloganyang ka teng, ka fa nna ke le boleletseng batho ko kgaolong ya me, banana botlhe qualify. Jaanong fela go tulwe mme ba ba nang le kitso eo gongwe bone ba tlaa boelwa botoka go feta ba bangwe. Mme bone ba bangwe ba ga ba idiwe gore ba hire bo manejara ba ba nang le kitso as long as le bone ba le koo ya go tsamaisa kgwebo eo ya bone.

MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE): On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. This particular scheme is intended to assist young people who want to engage in agricultural pursuits. It can be cultivation, motho o ka nna a ruwa dikoko, you can engage in piggery, you can irrigate, it is open. One of the worries of this nation, because I am sure you are one of them, has been that the average age of the farmer currently is above 50, meaning that young people are not going into farming because they do not think it is paying. Some of them who have gone through agricultural training are saying they have no means to make a start. So this scheme was intended to assist such people who may want to engage in agriculture but they have no capital with which to start. We are saying here is the scheme; low interest-rate. There is no pre-security required and why not go in there. As the Honourable colleague here was saying, there is so much land that is lying fallow. Some people have
fenced but they have not even the start. The important thing is that it is open for all young people, for all projects, whether you have been to an agricultural school or not. What is important is your project. When you go to CEDA you have to prove that the project is viable. Thank you.

**MR NAGAFELA:** Ke a leboga. Jaanong le ganetsanya mo go maswe. Ke gone fela fa mathata a leng teng.

Mma ke bale *Paragraph 37*, ka tetla ya gago Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente.

“Another important recent empowerment initiative is the CEDA Young Farmers Fund.”

A ke re o bona gore *is a farmers’ fund*, ga o bue ka tse dingwe gape. “Which is designed to encourage young people wishing to venture into agricultural projects. The youth, particularly those who have studied agriculture, will have improved access to finance at concessional rates.”

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Tlhalosa ka Setswana.

**MR NAGAFELA:** Nnyaa, e ka re le le Makgoa ka le tlhalosetsa ka Setswana *for what reason.* E ka re thapelo ya lona e sa tlhalosiwe ka Setswana la tla la re ke tle go tlhalosa puo ya lona ka Setswana? Jaanong ke ne ke re, le fa e le *the guidelines* go supiwa fa e le gore e bo e le batho ba ba nang le thuto ya temo-thuo.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** …(Inaudible)…

**MR NAGAFELA:** Ga le a tsenya tse dingwe di *profession*. Fa e le gore ga le a kwala sentle, le tlaa tshwanelwa ke gore le ye go baakanya le boele gore le tsenya le ba bangwe le ba ba nang le kitso ya IT, gore ba ka ya go dira dikgwebo tseo, le ye go baakanya mo mokwalong wa lona.
MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR SWARTZ): On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Mma re thusanye, ke tlhalose gone foo.

MR NAGAFELA: Le njela nako, ga ke a tla *too run a seminar* golo fa.

MR SWARTZ: Nnyaa, re tlhalosetsa wena. Madam Speaker, nnete ke gore *like the Honourable Member quoted, this is for farming activities*, foo re a dumalana ga se tse dingwe. Jaanong fa e le gore o na le mathata a gore go ka bo go ne go butswe, tlhamalala fela o rialo mme gompieno e re e buang e *is for farming activities*.

MR NAGAFELA: O dumalana le nna Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente ke sone se ke reng ee, ke ya balemi, ba bangwe ga ba tsene mo teng.

Ka re banana ba e leng gore ga ba a ithutela temo, ga ba na kgatlhego mo temong bone ga o na fa o ba tsenyang teng. Jaanong ra re bone ke ba ga mang? Itseng gore le lositse banana, go na le ba ba ratwang ke puso, le ba ba sa ratweng ke puso, kana ke sone se ke se buang.

Jaanong ya bofelo ke fetsa e bile ke na le *two minutes* ke gore, yone kgang ya banana, re tshwanetse re tlhalosediwe ka botlalo. Fa Tona a ema fa, a tle go tlhalosa ditlhaloso tse dintsha tse ke di utlwang tse, a di thatswe sentle re tle re ye go di thatswetsa batho, ka gore rona re bua e Tona Swartz a e buang. Yone Tona Swartz a e buang e, ke yone e rona re e buang.

Jaanong e tle e thatswiwe re utlwe gore tota la re le tswa fa kae le ema fa kae. Ke raya gore ga ke na bothata nayo. Mme mathata ga le a ka la a lebelela a ditsela, a metlakase, a metsi le a pula. Ga gona se e leng gore banana ba ka se dira botoka go sena pula, go sena ditsela, go sena metlakase, e ba ka yang go e dirisa ko ba yang go direlang dilo tseo teng.

Mme Mmaetsho ke a leboga.
MR NTUANE (SPECIALLY ELECTED): Thank you Madam Speaker. I rise today to acknowledge and pay homage to a great tradition of Botswana’s development model. As Honourable Members would know, this country at independence was dead poor, it was a beggar nation. In the 40 years since independence we have managed to transform into a middle-income country by any measure that is remarkable. It is in fact astonishing.

Madam Speaker, at independence all African countries were led by nationalists of different views and different inclinations. In Zambia you had a one party authoritarian state, which modelled itself as socialist, examples can be cited such as in Kenya, again we had an authoritarian one party state, which espoused free market, policies. If you go up North to the likes of Sudan, you had the brand of Buddhism or Arab National Socialism. If you take Mozambique and Angola, each and every country had its doctrine of governance and at the core of it all really was the issue of national resources and their distribution.

I should not forget a country such as Zaire, now Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) where they had what later came to be known as kleptocracy, essentially a government that exists to loot its own country. The definition came with the exercises that were taking place in Zaire. I have to provide this background Madam Speaker because I believe that as Botswana, perhaps the most profound social contract that we have ever entered into with the people of this nation, is to run the welfare state. The BDP government decision is to run a welfare state.

There is a UNICEF Report that was produced mid last year, it indicated that of the 17 nations in Southern and Eastern Africa that were surveyed, only Botswana was on track to meet the Millennium Development Goals in so far as the half of poverty by 2015 was
Monday 12 February 2007

concerned. Of 17 countries, only Botswana as stated by UNICEF is on track to half poverty by 2015. As you all know poverty in Botswana now is 30 per cent or 27 per cent there about but by halving by 2015 we mean the figure that obtains today to half it by 2015. Only Botswana is on track to do that.

I contend Madam Speaker that it has been possible because Botswana has remained true to a welfare state. My view is that were it not for the welfare state, the BDP government would not be in power today. The BDP has been in power on account of the welfare state and for as long as the BDP retains the welfare state it will remain in power.

Any reversal of the welfare state or any attempt to abandon the welfare state, will have great consequences for our government. And those great consequences obviously are an opposition government, and an opposition government will translate into I suppose some form of catastrophe.

So we are settled with a welfare state and for as long as we maintain that welfare state things will move accordingly. But of course, what is a welfare state? It is only fair that some of these things are defined to put them in a proper perspective. The concept of the welfare state arose from the ashes of the great depression in the early 20th century and of the Second World War. Those two episodes brought a lot of poverty, hunger, want, and deprivation in a lot of countries in Europe and in America. Governments could not just stand idle and allow their citizens to die of hunger. So, they formulated the concept of the welfare state. The first welfare state actually was Germany, early before the Second World War and it moved on to places like New Zealand. But then of course, the more famous ones are in Scandinavia, the likes of Sudan, Norway and the rest.
We also have welfare states in countries like Britain. Most of Western Europe, runs welfare states. So, essentially a welfare state would be the sort of system, a government, which goes out of its way to provide welfare programmes for its citizens. These programmes tend to be of a universal coverage. It is a system of income distribution and resource distribution.

In Botswana all politicians tend to say there is a problem with redistribution of resources and income disparities etcetera. The welfare states at its heart are committed to the redistribution of resources and income. And like I said you were looking at Scandinavia, Britain, Netherlands, Germany and all of those countries where the welfare state out of ethical, humanitarian, and compassionate considerations. But governments have to do something for their people out of such considerations. On those grounds, governments have to run welfare states. But what is so remarkable about Botswana is that we have a developing country that decided to embrace the concept of the welfare state so early in its independence period.

Let me give you a contrast just to place this issue like I say in perspective. The state of the nation in South Africa was presented last week I think it was on Friday or Thursday and one of the issues that has a reasoning in terms of the past are state of the nation debates, is that of the welfare state. In fact some commentators are saying that President Mbeki’s legacy will only be cemented if before he goes, he created a welfare state in South Africa. But their arguments hinge on one thing, what they call the Basic Income Grant (BIG). Some people are saying to address what brought poverty in South Africa, and the disparities in incomes, they must introduce a basic income grant that would simply say, each and every South African irrespective of level of income, will be entitled to a R100
every month. They say that would go a long way in addressing problems of poverty. Specifically President Thabo Mbeki feels differently, his view is that we can give people R100 but what about hospital care, education and so on? The issue that they are debating today are an old hat in Botswana. The lefties are very exited about what is happening in places like Venezuela where Hugo Chavez says he is introducing 21st century socialism. An announcement was made last week when Hugo Chavez came here, actually he has been given another mandate, huge overwhelming mandate. Hugo Chavez introduced supermarkets subsidised by the government, so that poor people can buy goods, commodities at subsidised prices. He has also introduced free education, free health care and the lefties are inferior all over the world that is old hat in Botswana. In fact Hugo Chavez can come to Botswana and draw lessons from this country. The South Africans can come to Botswana and draw lessons from this country in terms of how you run a welfare state. Perhaps the major omission that we have made as a country is that of going out of our way and proclaiming that we are a welfare state.

Let us delve into the issues much deeper. When you have a country that provides free education, free health care, and free essential services such as water, I am not sure if in the villages people pay for water, old age pensions, public works programmes, the much deride public works programmes. In fact Honourable Minister, I need to indicate here that I take great exception to the usage of the term handouts. It would seem that in this country there is a growing tendency towards dismissing government assistance programmes, disparaging them as handouts. Those are not handouts. They are government assistance programmes. Government has an obligation to provide assistance to her people. The reason why we are in power and why we continue to be in power, is because of the
welfare state. Any reversal or retreat from the welfare state will have great consequences. The social contract that we sign with Batswana at every election here is because of two things, prudent management of the economy, people centred polices and of course the welfare state.

I have to put it in those terms for people to understand what we mean, *gatwe atlhama re go jese*. *Atlhama re go jese* again they made disparaging terms. Let us take an example when former President Masire was addressing a lecture at the university the other day, 40\(^{th}\) Universary Lecture. One of the academics, asked him about a dependency culture that is growing in Botswana and of course referred to handouts. The former President simply said to him, you know what? In Malawi somebody who plants one hectare of land can feed their family for an entire year. But in Botswana that is not possible because of climatic conditions and as a government we cannot just fold our arms and say well that is your problem see what you can do and live it to your own devices as a citizen. That is why we have to come up with these schemes. So, they must be seen in that context, when people deride public works projects, *bo Namolo Leuba*, in the alternative what are they proposing should be done? I suppose the most sustainable thing would be to provide jobs, and everybody wants to do that. But in the interim, before you create those jobs, what do you do? Do you leave those people without devices to die or to starve? As a responsible government you cannot. That is why I say this seems to be placed in their proper context. These are not handouts. These are government assistance programmes and government must commit herself to maintaining the welfare state.

I stand on the side of those who say we should not at all ever consider reversing the welfare state.
Monday 12 February 2007

When you look at it, if you are asked to pay only five per cent for your child’s education, surely that is not much if 95 per cent is covered by government. Still you have a situation where you can survive, life can go on. Government could possibly have said, let us go 25 per cent or 30 per cent, but how many Batswana could have been able to afford that? Still, if you are unable to pay five per cent, government will cover the full cost of the tuition of the education of your child. You have what I say is a welfare state.

Let us go to the extreme. Nobody in Botswana will ever starve to death. Nobody in a welfare state starves to death.

MR KGATHI: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Ke a leboga mokaulengwe. Fa motho a reeditse analysis ya gago, e clear fela mo go siameng. Jaanong ka fa o buang ka teng, ba diphati tsa kganetso describe themselves ba le social democratic. Where would you position seemo sa Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) to a point e e leng gore after ascribing a position gone foo, would you then be able to draw a comparison with what the opposition is proposing as an alternative to solve the problems of poverty in this country?

MR NTUANE: Thank you Honourable Member. The opposition is not coming out with anything radically different, it is an issue of nuances of accent. For instance, we have Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA), they would say we would… to improve CEDA in this manner. They do not come out with anything original. It is just to place an accent on certain BDP’s policies. In terms of how you can categorise the BDP, in all fairness the BDP’s policies, particularly the core policy of a welfare state, is a social democratic doctrine. Welfare states are run by social democratic governments. For example, Netherlands, Britain under the Labour Party, Germany and New Zealand, all
these run welfare states and they are social democratic parties. So, if you want to extend it
to categorising the BDP, giving it an ideological badge, the BDP is a social democratic
party in terms of its programmes. Never mind who says the BDP is a conservative party.
Conservative is not an ideology, it is an attitude of mind of how you want to do certain
things. Perhaps we should not be doing this, this is too early in the day. People who
would want to change certain things…
But when we come to ideologies, we are looking at things like socialism, capitalism,
social democracy and so on. In fact, to go further, you can make a distinction between
what they call social democratic parties and democratic socialist parties. Social
democratic parties like the BDP are those who say we accept and embrace capitalism but
we know that it has its imperfections. For instance, the reason why this government
provides this vast array of social services to its citizens, is because of imperfections of
capitalism. It is because the market cannot provide everything, so government has to
come in. Social democracy is a fusion of socialism and capitalism, but with democratic
socialists, their view is that they want a social state through Parliamentary democratic
means. At the end of the day what they want is a proper socialist state. That is a
distinction between social democracy and democratic socialism. So, we are on the side of
social democracy. We are not interested in a socialist state. We want a fusion of the two.
That is where as the BDP we fall. We are looking at provision for the welfare of the
citizenry at a universal level. This means that when we go to Princess Marina Hospital,
irrespective of whether you are a Permanent Secretary (PS) or a Minister, you get your
treatment for free because P2.00 is a token fee. That is universal coverage. That is one of
the important hallmarks of a welfare state.
MR MABILETSA: On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. The scenario that you are painting of everybody going to Princess Marina for P2.00 including a Permanent Secretary, could you ever imagine in your own proper frame of mind a PS leaving his office queuing for six to eight hours for that thing? Do you really say that thing is attainable given the fact that he really has the money to go and pay for a quicker service where at the most he will wait for about five to ten minutes and he is in and out of it? Thank you.

MR NTUANE: Honourable Member, it is an issue of choice. The welfare state allows you choice. If he prefers to go to Princess Marina, he would not be asked to pay P200.00 because he is a PS. That is the concept behind universal coverage. He would not be asked to pay P200.00 or P1,000.00 because he is a PS, he will still pay P2.00. If the President sends his child to Naledi Secondary School, still he is going to contribute five per cent of the child’s fees. Because he is the President, he is not going to pay 100 per cent universal coverage.

I was going to other issues such as destitute rations. People would say, ba tlhola ba a fa batho dijo. If we do not provide those people with those rations, they will starve to death.

With regard to orphan assistance, when you look at provision of antiretroviral therapy, this is the first country in Africa to provide its citizens with free HIV drugs in addition to other free drugs under the health care system. If I were to go even further, this country is Africa’s first welfare state and I am borne out by a woman called Naomi Grobbler.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ke kopa thaloso.

MR NTUANE: I will yield.
Naomi Grobbler in an essay published in the Journal of the Essay Institute of International Affairs, 17th May 2005 referred to Botswana as Africa's first welfare state, but it has been a welfare state for all these years. The point I am coming to Honourable Minister is that, much as we talk about cost sharing, cost reduction, it is important to retain this country's character as a welfare state. That is the reason why we are here, that is the reason why we have made these gigantic strides in terms of people centred development. Physical infrastructure and social infrastructure is on account of the welfare state. Earlier on I mentioned that for instance, when you take the fact that poverty levels in Botswana in 1985/1986, 59 per cent of the citizenry was living under the poverty datum line. In 2002 that had been reduced to 37 per cent and now I believe it is much lower. The projection is that by 2007, it will be down to 23 per cent. This reduction would not have been possible were it not for the welfare state. So, really the thrust of my submission today is that the quality of life of the average Motswana has been changed by the welfare state. There are tangible differences to the quality of life.

When a child who schools in Kumakwane or some remote village does well in school, he/she is sent overseas to study. Thousands of them today are overseas. They are in South Africa and wherever. If you are to ask any of these members who have been overseas or even university how much their parents paid for their fees, none of them would know. Not a single person in this House would know because their parents did not pay anything. We take children from the remotest village, put them on a plane and take them overseas. They come back qualified and all on account of the welfare state. So, my plea is that let us retain the welfare state. Even in the United Kingdom today there was a debate about the welfare, that you have areas of wastage, areas where you can make improvements.
Monday 12 February 2007

That should really be the debate, where we can make improvements, but at the fundamental level, the welfare state must stay in this country. If we are to completely eradicate poverty by 2016, we can only do so through sustained economic growth, and I submit, through the maintenance of the welfare state. I thank you.

**MS TSHIRELETSO (MAHALAPYE EAST):** Ke a leboga Mmaetsho Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Ke emela gore ke dumalane le kopo e e beilweng fano ya kabo ya madi a ngwaga ono wa madi.

Ke simolola ka gore ke leboge pele ba Lephata la *Local Government* ka komiti ya bone e e bidiwang go twee Sectoral Committee on Poverty Reduction, e e leng gore ke *sub-committee* ya Rural Council. Ke dumela gore ka fa ke utlwang e bolelwa ka teng, fa re ka tlhwaafala gore komiti e e bereke, go tlaa siama thata bogolo jang go ntsha batho mo lehumeng. Fa e le gore ga se *technical* fela, ga go buiwe gotwe nnyaa go na le komiti fela, mme e ka lomelwa ya nna le meno, ke dumela gore e ka re ka 2016 Botswana go bo gotwe e *destitute free*. Fa re tsaya mananeo a Services to Livestock Owners in Communal Areas (SLOCA) le Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP), ke mananeo a e leng gore a ya go ntsha batho mo lehumeng. Fa e le gore komiti e e ka bo e lomaganya maphata otlhe jaaka gotwe e tlaa bo e e *multi-sectoral committee*... Re dumela gore gompieno fa re lebelela mo go SLOCA kana ALDEP bogolo jang SLOCA, batho ba e leng gore ga ba na dikgomo, dipodi kana dikoko, ba ya go thusiwa 100 *per cent*. Mme fa motho a ntse jalo a thusiwa e bo e le gore go na le yo o tlhokometseng go bona gore nnyaa mme tota dithuso tse di tlhokomelesegile. Mmaetsho, ke dumela gore *Local Government* e tlaa bo e tlile ka mogopololo o o siameng.
Monday 12 February 2007

Re na le bothata ba gore one madi a, kana diruiwa tsone tse, mo gongwe motho o tsaya dipodi go bo go sa lebelelwe gore a go na le metsi kwa a reng o ya go nna teng le fa a kwadile a re ke tlaa bona metsi fale. Gone foo gape, goromente kana Tona wa Temo-Thuo a re bolelele ka ke lebile bothhoki, mme ke lebile gore gatwe SLOCA e ya go thusa bone. Bogolo jang ba ba phakang mme ba le able-bodied. Ke batho ba ba ka iperekelang mme ka ntata ya gore tota ga gona kwa ba ka tsayang sepe teng, gompieno jaana ba bona dithuso tsa go nna jalo. Fa e le gore komiti e gotweng e tlaa bo e le multi-sectoral le sub-committee ya Rural Council e bo e le gore e tshwaraganela maphata, bathhoki ba fa ba neelwa dikgaka, dikoko tsa Setswana kana dipodi, go bo go itsiwe gore dikoko tse di ya go bona mmakete. Batswana ba rata koko ya Setswana, jaaka go buiwa gore go tlaa nna fa di tlhabelwang teng

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: …(interruptions)…

MS TSHIRELETSO: Batho ba a nthodia ka fa Mmaetsho, ga ke itse gore ke ba reye ke reng ka e bile ke banana.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ba reye o re shut up.

MS TSHIRELETSO: Ee, kana ke re shut up! Ga ke itse. Mme o nthuse mma, fa ba bua ke a itidimalela.

MADAM SPEAKER: Order, Honourable Members. Please listen.

MS TSHIRELETSO: Nnya mme ga ke ka ke ka rialo, ga se lefoko lame, ke la ga Honourable Swartz.

Gone foo, fa go ka itsewe gore jaaka fa di tlhabelwa foo di na le fa di tlhabelwang teng, mme e bile go na le kwa di tlaa yang go bewa teng gore batho ba ba batlang koko ya Setswana ba e reke teng. Gongwe ke tiro ya komiti e ye go lebelela gore di a dira. E ka re
ka 2016 jaaka ke bua, Botswana e bo e se na batho ba go tweng ke batlhoki. Le tsone dipodi, gongwe fa ba di neelwa e le batlhoki fale mme goromente a bo a ba batlela kwa ba ka di nosang teng, batho ba ba tlaa bo ba thusitswe thata. Jaaka go na le didiba tse dingwe tsa *Water Affairs Department* tse di nnang di epiwa go tswana fa di bo di tlogelwa, fa gongwe di ya go tsewa ke batho ba e leng gore ba a kgona. Gongwe gompieno goromente a bo a re ba le tsayang dipodi fa le le mo lefelong le, go na le didiba tse di epiwang ke ba meepo jalo-jalo, le ka dirisa dilo tsa go nna jalo.

Goromente a bo a di ba neela gore ba ye go nosa dipodi di tle di kgone go tsala, di mme palo e e rileng. Ke bona gore komiti e, e ka kgona gore e thusa thata gore batho ba tswe mo lehumeng lone le re ikaelelelang go ba ntsha mo go lone.

Lebaka e le gore re na le mathata a gore mananeo a rona a teng a mantle, mme jaanong o ka re fa a setse a tshwanetse go dirisiwa go nna le mathata a gore a ba a ka tswelela pele. Ke gore fa gongwe go a go tsewa bo ditonki jaana go tswana fa go a phatlalala. Ba ba neng ba tsere dikgomo tse di neng di le mo Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP) gongwe ba tlile go tsaya gape. Ba ba neng ba tsere dikotsekara, gongwe di ntse fa fatshe. Jaanong ke gone mo go batlang gore komiti e ka gore yone e tlaa bo e le *multi-sectoral* e lebelele dintlha tse tsotho gore batho ba ba tswe mo lehumeng. E seka ya re a sena go nna a di tsaya after two years motho yole a bo a boela gape mo go phakeng. Fa a sena go nna a tsaya dipodi di a latlhega, go tswana fa o boela kwa letlhokong. Ke lebeletse ka tsone tsa bo Remote Area Dwellers (RADs) o fitlhela e le gore go fiwa batho ba tennyane teng dikgomo, kwa bofelong di fela ka bonya ka bonya go felela go sa itsiwe gore di tlhokomelwa jang. Ke sone se ke reng ke lebogela gore komiti e e nne teng. Ke lebogela gore fa e ka nna teng e ka re itumedisa thata, bohumanegi jo bo leng teng ka gore
bangwe tota ga ba itire ba rile ba batla mebereko ba e tlhokile mme ra ba thusa gore bo fokotsege. Mme e bile nna ke bona go ka kgonega.

Mme fa ke fetela kwa pele, batho ba buile thata ka project implementation, Mmaetsho. Mme ke boela gape ka fa Palamenteng. Mmaetsho re Palamente e e opelang, e e buang selo se le sengwefela. Palamente ga e a ikemela, nako le nako batho ba bo ba boa ba ya go re ganetsa mo diromamoweng ba sa re utlwe. Palamente e, fa e tshwantshangwa le dipalamente e seng ya Botswana e ikemela e le nosi, e nna Palamente ya mafatshefatshe.

E ya rona ke Palamente e e senang meno. Palamente e go tweng le dira melao, heelang, ga go dirwe melao. Go na le melao kwa e dirwang teng, e Palamente ga e e dire. Fa re ne re dira melao…

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: …inaudible…

MS TSHIRELETSO: Ee, ke buisiwa ke gore fa e ne e le gore re dira melao budget e re ka bo re e itse. Heelang, mo mafatsheng a mangwe a SADC le mafatshe a…

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: …interruptions…

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Members a ko re mo reetseng.

MS TSHIRELETSO: Le mafatshe a bo East Africa…. Mma ke bueng bagaetsho.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Gatwe your time is up.

MS TSHIRELETSO: Le mafatshe a bo East Africa budget fa e ya go tla Mmaetsho… A ke bue ka khansele ya legare. Ke ne ke le modulasetilo wa khansele ya legare. Fa re ya go tsena mo budgeteng pele fa e tsena dikomiti tsa bo Health, Education di dira budget tsa bone ba seka-seka gore ngogola re dirile se ra se ka ra dira se. Go tswana fa e ya kwa komiting ya Finance jaaka re na le Finance and Estimates Committee, ke yone e bo e ya go e rola. Mme kana fa ka re na le Tona, fa re na le dikomiti tse di beilweng tse di mo
Monday 12 February 2007

Palamenteng pele ga *budget*, ke batla go thalosa selo se ka ke mongwe wa ba ke boditsweng. Ke rile nnyaa, ga ke itse sepe. Gompieno jaana mo mafatsheng a ke itseng *budget* tsa one, Tanzania, Uganda le Kenya ba ke neng ka tlhotlhomisa selo se gore ke itse gore bone *budget* fa e ya go tsena ba dira jang. *Minister*, ke fa sekai ka wa *Local Government* o ya kwa komiting e e *relevant* pele ga *budget* e kopanngwa, pele ga *minister* a tla. Jaaka re ntshitse ya ngogola ba ya go nna nae ba mmotsa gore fa o setse o re go e go agiwa *clinic* kwa Mmandunyane jaana e o neng o rile e tlaa agiwa kwa Mokoswana e tsamaya fa kae, madi a teng e setse e le bokae. Ga o tle ngwaga le ngwaga o bo o re *clinic* ya Mokoswana, Setsile ya Mmaphashalala e le gore Mmaetsho wena sa gago ke go tla o nna fa o ntse o re Rre Masalila a re re ya go aga *clinic* kwa Mmaphashalala. Go tswa foo go didimetse ke ya go rakana le a batla ya Mookane kana ya Dovedale. Ga go a tshwanela go nna jalo. Palamente ka fa tshwanelong fa e le Palamente e e ikemetseng e e nang le thata e e reng fa gotwe e dira molao go bo go tewa e…*inaudible*… jaana. E tshwanetse ya re go le pele ya lekodisiwa tsa ngwaga o gore re tsamaya fa kae e bo e re fa e sa kgotsofale e buse Tona. Tona o ya koo, o dirisanya le bone. Fa e mmusa fa a tswa kwa o tla a baakantse a itse gore jaanong ke na le komiti e le ya me. Fa re ya go tsena kwa Palamenteng jalo-jalo ka maphata a tsone kana ke a thuto kana ke a eng mapalamente a komiti ya *health own that budget*. Jaanong ke ya bone ga se ya ga Tona yo o buang ka tsa bo *health* fela. E bo e compilwa ke *Minister wa Finance* a tla a e baya fa mme re e itse. Gompieno jaana ba a mpotsa bomme gore naare bomme Palamente e ya madi gompieno e re tseetse eng. Ga ke itse, ke ja menwana ka gore *Ministry of Home Affairs* ga o ise o tlisise… *committee of supply ga* e ise e tsene. Ke itshopere jaaka kokwana, ga ke itse le
gore gatwe mo *Ministry of Home Affairs* bomme fa ba mpotsa jaaka fa ke ntse ke tsamaya jaana ke ya go ba raya ke re *budget* e le tsoletse eng.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** …inaudible…

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** E inktele pele rraetsho, wena kana o a itse o sale o itse le ngogola le ngwaga ono nna ke gone ke e bonang gompieno jaana. Jaanong dilo tse fa Palamente e ya rona e sa ka ke ya tsoga… Ga re gatwe le ntsu Mmaetsho e kile ya tlhatlhelwa le dikoko. Ntsu e ne ya nna e sa itse gore a ke ntsu, motho mongwe a ba a tla a re wena ntsu ga re ga o koko, wena o a fofa. Ntsu ya sala e gakgametse a ba a e tsaya a e baya fa ntle fa e re e a riana diphuka tsana. A e pega kwa thabeng, e rile fela fa marang a letsatsi a tswa o bona ntsu ke ele e ya kwa godimo ya itse gore le yone e ka fofa. Le rona re le Mapalamente re tshwanetse ra tswa mo hokong ra itse gore re na le dithata re le ba dira molao. Dilo dingwe re tshwanetse ra di bua re ntshitse diphega re sa tlhabiwe ke ditlhong go bua gore re le Palamente re tshwanetse ra itse dilo dingwe pele ga di tla fa, e seng gore morafe fa o go botsa jaaka ke bua ka bomme. Kwa lepheteng la *Local Government* go na le eng ke bo ke ntse ke re ke tlaa tla ke utlwa letsatsi la *Committee of Supply* gore kana Rre Masalila o tshotse eng. Heelang, bagaetsho golo mo ga go re direle sentle. Ke sone se ke reng ba ga rona a re nneng Palamente e e dirang melao ka tlhwaafalo. Go na le dilo tse dingwe tse ke batlang go feta ka tsone ke ntse ke bua ka rona re le Palamente. Ke gore ke batla gore re tswe ka…

**MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE):** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker it is very important that we should remember that we are the oldest continuous democracy. While these new Parliaments *kwa* Uganda and other places perhaps have come forward with
improvements we should indeed be selective in copying what we think will be helpful. Sometimes we get a description only on what they do, but not a description of the outcome. It is very important. The situation was that immediately after independence we had a very small Parliament so instead of having specialised committees as they do in South Africa and these other places, they had a committee of the whole. In other words, they did not think it was for budget purposes, it was not necessary to have separate committees. They sat here as a committee of the whole. There is nothing wrong, as the Parliament grows and the number increases to modify that so that we have specialised committees, which will sit separately. We also are the only country as far as I am aware in Africa that has had continuous planning since independence. There is nothing that is new. I remember the Honourable Leader of the Opposition saying that he did not have information on which to prepare an alternative budget. That is not correct because we work based on the plans and in fact in mid-term review we even had a rule which says that we will be preparing budgets equivalent to 40 per cent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and the GDP can be calculated by anyone. Thank you very much.

**MS TSHIRELETSO:** Kana ke sone se o bonang ke go rata Tona Rre Gaolathe ka gore o dumalana le rona. O nkagatlhile thata. Fa o ne o nkganetsa ke ka bo ke gakgametse. Ke a dumela, diphoso dingwe re di dirisiwa ke go ikgantsha ka gore re na le puso ya batho ka batho ya bogologolo. Fa o tlolela kwa South Africa le *whip* ya khansele go a itsiwe gore ke motho yo o rileng. Mme fa e le mo Botswana mo, o ntsha *position just to throw it to somebody* e se gore o a e *recognise* kana sengwe fela. *For instance* rona le bo Molefhabangwe bo *whip* ba teng fa o ka bo tshwantshanya le mafatshe a mangwe o fitlhela o ka re o ka bo o se *whip because* koo go a itsiwe gore o tshwanetse gore a dire
Monday 12 February 2007

eng a liaise le mang. Gompieno jaana mo gongwe rona ga twe re mo komiting Mmaetsho le wena ke tlaa feta ka wena, re setse re utlwa re fiwa bo 25 minutes. Nna gompieno 25 minutes yo ga ke mo itse mme gatwe ke member wa Business Committee. Rre Molefhhabangwe o mpoditse a re le buetse kae, Rre Mabiletsa le ene a mpotsa. Ga ke re o a bona gore we are not recognised. Gompieno jaana ga twee o reye mapalamente o re ba bue, o tlaa ba raya o re ba bue o sa itse gore dinako di beetswe kae go lebilwe eng. Democracy e re itiileng ka yone re ntse re re puso ya batho ka batho dilo di tlile go pala…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Gatwe o tennwe ke eng?

MS TSHIRELETSO: Ga ke a tenwa ke sepe ke gore dilo dingwe ga di tsamaye sentle. Ke ka feta ka e nngwe. Hee wee, hee wee, batho ba bangwe…

MR LEFHOKO: Elucidation. Ke a leboga ke tlaa bua fela ka bokhutshwane. Mopalamente wa Mahalapye East o bolelela ruri dilo tse dingwe re tlaa itiya ka gore re ne re le bantle maloba re bo re akanya gore le gompieno re ntse re bantle. It is for us to change. Some changes are not required because we are a growing Parliament. They are required because the new systems are amenable to greater transparency and accountability.

MS TSHIRELETSO: Ke a leboga Mmaetsho. Ke bo ke re kana go a re dia gone moo gore go itswe go twee ba ba tshwanang bo Mma Tshireletso le fa a ne a seo mo Business Committee ga a ka ke a re sepe ka gore ga go na meno. Ga go na dithata o tlaa bo a itse fela gore o neetswe that position go tlaa bo go nna go twee ke whip, ya eng, ga o bonale gope. Jaanong ke sone se ke reng democracy e a nosediwa. Rre Seretse, Tautona wa rona wa ntlha a re puso ya batho ka batho o a e nosetse. Fa o e tlogela e oma jaaka e oma jaana mafatshe a a go feta o sala o ntse o re ke nna sekai mo Africa. Go thata gompieno jaana
gore ke le mopalamente wa Mahalapye East ke na le Rre Swartz e le wa Gantsi go phulwe koloi kwa Central Transport Organisation (CTO) ke ye go ntsha morero o Rre Swartz a yang kwa Gantsi e seng e le Tona. A ya e le mopalamente wa Gantsi a ya go ba itsise gore mananeo a puso a reng. Nna le ene re tsamaya, ene o tlaa bo a tsamaya ka BX. Ke sone se o utlwang go twe e rile maloba gotwe reshuffling dipampiri di supa fa batho ba le bantsi ba eletsu go ka tsena mo botoneng. Lebaka e le gore ba a itse gore fa o ya botoneng o ya mafureng ka gore koloi ya gago ga e ye go senyega. O ya go tsamaya ka BX. Re kopa kopo e nnyennyane fela gore ga re re neeleng BX re tsene mo dikgaolong tsa rona re ise morero o o isiwang ke Matona. Yo mongwe a re nnyaa, ke bua nae kwa thoko a re constituency allowance. Ka mmotsa gore ya eng ga ke re re e tsaya rotlhe le ba ba itlhophetsweng ke ka tla ka tewa ga twee ke yone e e ka nkitsang BX. Ke raya gore dilo tse a re nonotsheng puso ya batho ka batho. Re e nonotsheng rotlhe re tle re bone batho ba sa tswele pelo dilo tse dingwe. Morutabana mongwe maloba a bua le nna o rile nna ke le morutabana o o rutang fela ke na le degree, fa ke ka nna ka thatlosiwa ka tswelela pele, ga ke lelele go nna deputy headteacher kana headteacher. Mme le rona fa dilo dingwe re di neelwa ba bantsi ba go tweng ba tlile go aga mono ba re ba batla Botona, ga ba ka ke ba bo lelela fela, ba itse gore dilo dingwe di teng. Jaanong ke ikopele gore bagaetsho re le Palamente e e ntseng jaana a e nonotshiwe. Golo mo go tlaa re diya, a Palamente e fetoge e tsene mo seemong sa dipalamente. Ke itumelela Tona Rre Gaolatile a re ee bogologolo fa re dira dilo re ne re le 15 ra nna 20 ra nna kae gompieno re 61 re ka dira portfolio committees Palamente ya nna le meno, staff sa yone ra se laola. Gone gompieno jaana le go hirwa ga re itse gore batho ba hirwa kae, le gompieno re a bo re utlwa gotwe Rre Matlhaku o a tsamaya batho ba a ipatla. Rona re tlaa bo re setse re bona motho fa re sa

Monday 12 February 2007

Ke sone se o utlwang go twe e rile maloba gotwe reshuffling dipampiri di supa fa batho ba le bantsi ba eletsu go ka tsena mo botoneng. Lebaka e le gore ba a itse gore fa o ya botoneng o ya mafureng ka gore koloi ya gago ga e ye go senyega. O ya go tsamaya ka BX. Re kopa kopo e nnyennyane fela gore ga re re neeleng BX re tsene mo dikgaolong tsa rona re ise morero o o isiwang ke Matona. Yo mongwe a re nnyaa, ke bua nae kwa thoko a re constituency allowance. Ka mmotsa gore ya eng ga ke re re e tsaya rotlhe le ba ba itlhophetsweng ke ka tla ka tewa ga twee ke yone e e ka nkitsang BX. Ke raya gore dilo tse a re nonotsheng puso ya batho ka batho. Re e nonotsheng rotlhe re tle re bone batho ba sa tswele pelo dilo tse dingwe. Morutabana mongwe maloba a bua le nna o rile nna ke le morutabana o o rutang fela ke na le degree, fa ke ka nna ka thatlosiwa ka tswelela pele, ga ke lelele go nna deputy headteacher kana headteacher. Mme le rona fa dilo dingwe re di neelwa ba bantsi ba go tweng ba tlile go agamono ba re ba batla Botona, ga ba ka ke ba bo lelela fela, ba itse gore dilo dingwe di teng. Jaanong ke ikopele gore bagaetsho re le Palamente e e ntseng jaana a e nonotshiwe. Golo mo go tlaa re diya, a Palamente e fetoge e tsene mo seemong sa dipalamente. Ke itumelela Tona Rre Gaolatile a re ee bogologolo fa re dira dilo re ne re le 15 ra nna 20 ra nna kae gompieno re 61 re ka dira portfolio committees Palamente ya nna le meno, staff sa yone ra se laola. Gone gompieno jaana le go hirwa ga re itse gore batho ba hirwa kae, le gompieno re a bo re utlwa gotwe Rre Matlhaku o a tsamaya batho ba a ipatla. Rona re tlaa bo re setse re bona motho fa re sa

65
itse gore o tswa kae. Mme fa re ne re le Palamente e re itirelang re ka bo re itse gore go tsamaya jang. Dilo tse ke tsone tse e leng gore re ne re re fete ka tsone re di bue. Le yone komiti e go ntseng gotwe ke ya \textit{staff} le go hirwa ga e itse kwa ba hirelwang teng. \textit{Promotions} fa o batla go tsholetsatsala ya gago maemo o mo tsholetsatsa maemo fela o tlaa bo a utlwa gotwe o promoutilwe ba sala ba gakgame tse fela mme e le Palamente.

Jaanong bagaetsho mma ke fetele kwa pele. Nngwe e e ntshwenyang ke ise ke bue ka ditlhabelo le bue ka Air Botswana. Mmaetsho re na le mathata. Maloba ke ne ke romilwe ke goromente ka kwano kana le phathi ya me gore ke e go ema kwa phitlhong ya ga Mma Thambo. Ke tsene kwa ke tshogile Mmaetsho. Difofane tsa Air Botswana fa o le mo teng se tsamaya se roroma mo e leng gore fa se landa o opa matsogo. Mme se sengwe e rile maloba sa boa sa kotama ko Oliver Thambo gotwe se na le \textit{technical problem}.

Heelang bagaetsho, batho ba tloga ba tshaba go palama difofane tsa Air Botswana.

Fa re ya kwa se ne se tletse, jaanong fa se ntse se re tshosa jaana re ithiba ditsebe le go ja re sa fiwe dijo go tshabiwa gore di \textit{trolley} di tlaa wa, fa re bowa ke se sena sepe. Ga ke re ba tshogile ba re fa re ka bowa ka sone se sa Air Botswana, ga ke re se ya kwa se a kotama se a boa, ba re a mme re tlaa goroga ko Botswana.

Fela fa ke re ke tsena mono ke tsaya pampiri mmaetsho, ke utlwa pampiri e re sengwe (se builwe ka \textit{number} se rile se a kotama e rile 20 \textit{minutes} se kotame ga twee se boela ko Oliver Tambo se na le mathata. Se sengwe \textit{Honourable} Moyo ga a ka ke a le boelelela gore go ne ga diragala eng, mme yo mongwe motho wa bone one a ya go robatswa mo sepateleng ke letshogo. E le gore se nnile le mathata se tswa Francistown.

Bagaetsho, fa re le Mapalamente re le babusi re le fano ga re itse gore go diragala eng ka Air Botswana jaaka mopalamente Rre Molefhabangwe a ne a bua. Se ka nna sa tlhaselwa
Monday 12 February 2007

ke magodu jaaka se ne sa kotamisiwa gone koo, magodu a le mo teng, gape di sa itekanela. Matshelo a Batswana ba ba di palamang a mo diphatse, mmaetsho. Mme ga re itse rona re utlwa go twee di a ne di nna jaana. Le Honourable Moyo fa a ne a se mo teng, fa a re bolelela a re ke tshaba le go bua kgang ya teng, a re pelo e kile ya ema go se kae.

Rona le wena mmaetsho, re na le bo Mme Mma Mbaakanyi re tsamaile re sa tsoga mma, re ya ko Southern African Development Community Parliamentary Forum (SADC PF). Ke setse ke tsamaile ka tsone ka gore re ntse re romiwa ke puso, se dira the same thing. Jaanong golo mo re tlaa itse jang gore ke eng Air Botswana e wela ko tlase e sa gole. Hei, batho ba tshaba go di palama jaanong ka gore ba itse gore o ka nna wa seka wa goroga. Jaanong re kopa tekodiso ka Mme Tona Motsumi gore a re bolele gore ga twee go diragala eng golo kwa. Fa difofane di na le mathata mme re sa itse sepe re le babusi, di tlhaselwa re sa itse sepe re le babusi. Ga a na go forwa gape go twee dibomo di mo teng ga sefofane, mme re sa itse sepe. A ko letsatsi le lengwe go dirwe statement re utlwe gore ga twee golo kwa gare go tsene eng, ka gore go lebega go na le mathata, mmaetsho.

Jaanong ke feta ka ya project implementation. Mma, re na le mathata. Our boarding schools, ke efa dikai ka Mookane le Dikgatlho bana ba tlhatlagana moo, ga go na boroko jwa bana ba boarding schools fela mo Botswana. Gape barutabana ba ba koo ba tlhatlagana mo mantlong a se kae, barutabana ba le 23 ba na le mantlo a le ten. Re kopa gore a Tona fa a setse a tla go baya kopo ya gagwe fa a ko a sekaseke seemo se se koo, a bo a lebe RASA. Gompieno jaana babereki ba ba ko go bo Makwate, Dovedale le Kudumatse gatwe ba gaufi le Seporo. Fa o tswa Mmaphashalala o ya ko Seporong se se fa Capricorn ga go na le fa e le benkele le fa e le eng teng, ga go ba busetse sepe ke go idiwa
go thusiwa fela. Bo Mokoswane jaana go fa gare Island, le bo Kudumatse ke mafelo a a kgakala. A ba akanyediwe ka RASA re sekaseke RASA gape re seka ra bua ka kilometres tsa seporo ka gore ba bangwe ba tswa foo ba ya seporong go sena sepe.

La bofelo mmaetsho, projects a di dirwe. Tsela ya Kalamare jaaka gompieno re bua re riana, ke e fa sekai, tsone tse re ne re di dumetse, mobilisation ke gone e dirwang, mme re aba madi a mangwe, di ya go tlhatlagana jaaka thotobolo.

Mmaetsho, ke rata ke wele ka gore re fetogeng. Mo Palamenteng e e tlang ke tlaa itlama gore ke ko ke tle ka mogopolre tle re bone gore Palamente e fa e ikemela, bogolo jang Tona ya Madi a dumela gore re tle re nne le meno re tle re kgone go shapa.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: … (Inaudible)…

MS TSHIRELETSO: One o bua maloba o ise o nne ... O kile wa nna motho Matlhabaphiri, o se ka wa lebala botlhoko o bo utlwile, ke gone o tswang gompieno jaana. Ke a go leboga, Mmaetsho.

MR SALESHANDO (GABORONE CENTRAL): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Without shadow of doubt the Appropriation Bill for any country should rank as the most important Bill in the annual calendar of Parliament, because it is about the wealth of a country and how you want to share the resources amongst the competing interests in the country. But Madam Speaker, as a country and as Members of Parliament we obviously want the best for Botswana. We ought to be able to reform certain things that we have been doing the way we have been conducting ourselves ever since independence. The budgeting process is one such function. It has been stated many a times that one of the key roles of Parliament is the oversight function. The oversight function also applies to the process of budgeting, how you construct the Budget, how you select priorities and
how you implement the budget after adoption. But in our case Parliament has almost minimal role in terms of contributing to the formulation of the budget. I appreciate that it is done within the context of the National Development Plan which Parliament participates in. But on an annual basis when we compare notes with members of Parliaments from different countries with regard to what pertains in Botswana, the consensus or the view of the majority seems to be that it appears that the Botswana system is rather outdated. The systems of surprise budgets where the Minister of Finance walks into Parliament and the Members of Parliament do not have an idea of what the contents of the brief case carried by the Minister of Finance are, is outdated. It is no longer relevant.

Accompanied with that it is the fact that a Budget is not a very simple piece of paper. The appropriation Act unlike others is a highly technical piece of legislation and Botswana Parliament has not been sufficiently capacitated to be able to debate and analyse more meaningfully the contents of the budgets. Colleagues, particularly Honourable Tshireletso has given examples of what pertains in other countries. If you take as an example the Parliament of Uganda, they have set up a budget office within Parliament staffed by over 30 trained economists, to assist Members of Parliament to analyse the budget to enrich the level of debate. In Botswana Parliament we do not have such office, even the research division within the Botswana Parliament would not have the capacity to understand the contents of the budget.

**MR LEFHOKO:** On a point of elucidation, Madam Speaker. Thank you, Madam Speaker and thank you colleague. In fact just when you touched on the research unit or whatever nomenclature is ascribed to in Botswana, I am informed reliably that there were
four people manning that particular unit. Those posts have since been dispensed with to other clerical duties within Parliament, there is only one researcher for the 62 Members of Parliament. Thank you.

**MR SALESHANDO:** The Zambian Parliament is such one example that recently undertook major steps to try and enhance the capacity of Parliament with regard to research and a budget office. This was meant to help members analyse the budget and be more relevant to the debates as opposed to what sometimes pertains in this House, the Speaker having to struggle to bring Members back to what the issues before them really are. There is nothing wrong with Members of Parliament trying to bring up certain issues, which are close to the hearts of their electorates. It is the duty of Parliament to be able to assist them with the more technical issues. There is no qualification that you need to be a Member of Parliament and that ought to be complimented by Parliament having the necessary personnel, the trained personnel to assist elected legislatures with issues of research. At the Parliamentary offices, those that we employ, you know because of the salaries they earn it is not possible to get a highly competent person who can help you with matters of academic research, who can help you to sit down and analyse the Budget.

Let me move on to the budget itself. We ought to reflect on this issue of adopting themes for Budgets, State of the Nation Address, National Development Plan and everything, because it is difficult to locate the relevance of these themes. Sometimes of course they are very flashy, attractive and appear quite innovative. But when you try and look at the relevance of a theme to what pertains in the Budget, it is a difficult exercise to get what the connection is and a theme on an annual basis. I doubt if most Members in this House remember what the theme for last year’s Budget was. Today there is a new theme, next
Monday 12 February 2007

year there is a new theme, we never even get an evaluation to say as a result of the theme that we adopted last year which informed most the projects that were undertaken, we have made the following achievements. What then is the relevance of a theme, do we need to continue with these themes? I do not think so.

Madam Speaker, we also need to, (as Members of Parliament, obviously I am referring particularly to those from the ruling party), to try and have a change of mindset in the way we approach issues of the Budget. On an annual basis there has got to be a paragraph in the budget saying 40 years ago we were a poor nation, 40 years ago we did not have this we did not have that. We know it is obvious and it is documented in all documents that have gone through this House. Do we need to recite this poem of ‘40 years ago’? I would understand if we were to do it maybe once every five years or once every ten years. But look, we are going to live in the future, we are not going to live in the Botswana of 40 years ago. There is nothing wrong in making these reminders. But to make them an annual event and at the end of the budget you normally have one of the senior ministers standing up to congratulate the Minister and start explaining how he is managing a Budget that was not there 40 years ago. We have got to set our eyes on the future.

MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE): Madam Speaker, on a point of correction. If you go through the previous speeches you would not see 40 years being repeated. The reason for reminding us about the 40 years is that we have just celebrated 40 years anniversary. That is the main reason why we have it.

MR SALESHANDO: No, it is an annual poem for this House to keep referring to the year of independence. One of the key things that is the highlight of this budget is the
pronouncement by the minister at paragraph 9, that the return to more rapid growth has begun for the Botswana economy. I hope that as the return to more rapid growth has began, we will not make the mistake of assuming that, that in itself is a solution to the problems faced by this country. This is because in the 80s particularly and early 90s we were registering some of the highest growth rates this economy has ever achieved, but at the same time unemployment and poverty were very high during those years.

High growth does not necessarily mean improved lives for all. We have still got to try and formulate strategies of dealing with the problems of the high unemployment rate, the high poverty rate and the high unequal distribution of income in this country. It is an anomaly to have a high growth rate in a country that still has some of the highest levels of unemployment within the region or by international standards. Actually recently one economist characterised Botswana as a middle to high income country or a country with incomes levels of medium to high developed economies and yet with a population exhibiting the characteristics of a third world country. That was an observation made at the recent seminar that was organised for Members of Parliament by one of the economists from the United Nations Development Programme.

Madam Speaker, you should also understand that this rapid growth in terms of this Budget is going to result in more resources for infrastructural development. That is not a bad thing, and actually it is the right thing to do when you can afford to put up extra infrastructure, to do just that. But we have got to be mindful of the fact that this expansion of infrastructure is going to result in low quality jobs. The construction sector in this country, particularly for the ordinary construction workers, cannot deliver a better
life for members of families for as long as we still have this huge pool or huge reserve of unemployed people in this country.

We are going to have workers being abused by employers particularly in industries that do not require skills such as the construction industry. The urgent need for this country is to try and focus on creating better quality jobs that will be sustainable in the long term. That is where the challenge is. So one of the things that Government should do is to use its investment wing; the Botswana Development Corporation (BDC) to pursue that agenda more vigorously. I get worried, I do not understand how the BDC really chooses which projects to invest in and which ones not to. If you look at what is reported in this budget, BDC is going to undertake two major investments. The first one is the tannery and the second one being the can manufacturing company. In the tannery we are going to invest P28 million and we expect to create only a 120 jobs, which is close to quarter of a million per job, for one job. It is worse when you get to the can manufacturing company. We are investing P43 million and we are going to only employ 40 people over P1 million per job.

Compare what the Government of Botswana investment wing in the form of BDC is doing with what private companies in Botswana are doing. There is mention of four companies in the budget speech that are going to invest in Botswana and they have been attracted by BEDIA (Botswana Export Development and Investment Authority). The four companies are investing P64.1 million in Botswana and they are creating 1,735 jobs which means that the cost per job is less than P40,000. Why is it that a company controlled by the Botswana Government is unable to employ investment strategies that will address the key problems that we have in this country? There is something that I
really do not understand about the approach adopted by the Botswana Development Corporation in this regard.

There is mention that BDC is going to go into invoice factoring. Another venture that requires a substantial amount of money but will possibly employ what you can run an invoice factoring company with five to ten people. Five people if you have the right technology and you are pumping millions of Pula into that. Worse still, we already have private companies in Botswana that offer the same service, Madam Speaker. I know of at least two that offer invoice factoring. Why would the Government of Botswana want to compete with Batswana who have risk capital from agencies such as CEDA and then you move in to compete directly with them? I am suspicious of the strategy adopted by BDC.

Diamond beneficiation: Madam Speaker, here the focus ought not to be the number of licenses issued. We are missing the boat. Those of us who have been trying to campaign or trying to present a case for a greater focus on diamond beneficiation mainly based our argument on the need for job creation. It was not a sentimental argument, it was a request geared at creating employment in Botswana and when we evaluate these companies at the top of Government’s objective, it should be the number of potential jobs to be created. A license ought to be issued to companies that promise to employ a certain number of people. When you speak in Parliament or when Ministers present on beneficiation process in Parliament, they ought to be telling us the number of jobs that they hope to create through this initiative, not to keep mentioning numbers that we have now issued 11 more licenses, so what?

We have had some of these companies around here; five companies that were operating in Botswana in diamond cutting and polishing; employing a number of people that are
less than some of the numbers employed by one company in foreign countries. Why can we not have one company that comes like some of the big players in the diamond industry who are known to be employing in excess of 10,000 people in one operation? One of the things that we ought to do Madam Speaker, with regard to diamond beneficiation as we promote it is to address the issue of citizen participation in this particular industry; diamond beneficiation. I asked the question sometime last year and the Minister said of the 11 new licenses issued, not a single one of them has been issued to a majority citizen owned company. Only one of them has minority citizen participation, you see if you go to some of the countries that have a long history of cutting and polishing diamonds, you now have businesses/operations that have become family operations; small scale family operations. Family I am not thinking the size of the Oppenheimer’s but a two, three or five men business specialising in cutting and polishing of diamonds. That did not happen by sheer luck, it was as a result of direct intervention by Government. You plan for it. You work for it and you create policies and laws that will facilitate the establishment of such businesses. For as long as you do not teach Batswana about this industry, they will continue majoring on opening small general dealers, bars and bottle stores on retirement because it is the only thing they know. They have not been taught about the diamond industry and a foreign investor is not going to come from outside Botswana to teach Batswana about this particular industry.

The issue of tourism in the budget refers to the increasing number of citizen participation. Once more Madam Speaker, it is a commendable thing but my worry is this. We are talking about expanding citizen participation in the tourism industry but yet we know that they are actually focusing on low value initiatives; mokoro, camping sites, caravan sites.
There is nothing wrong. It is the right thing to do for Government to reserve those for citizens. But the Ministry of Tourism ought to have a master plan of how you want to get Batswana to participate in your very high value tourism ventures and that is not happening.

There is the famous Young Farmers Fund. Members of Parliament (MPs) were over with competing each other recently on the Radio Programmes. Everyday at least three or four MPs who were addressing some meeting and telling young people; go into farming we have set up a Young Farmers Fund. It is a good initiative because it shows that at long last there is a greater commitment on the part of Government to commit more resources to addressing the problems of youth unemployment. So for that reason it is a welcome development. But let me also hasten to add that I am not particularly satisfied because for a number of reasons; one, not long back the Chief Executive Officer of CEDA was on television saying that agriculture is a high risk investment. We all know; it is a high-risk investment and we now want to throw young people into the highest possible risk. Why do that, why do we not give young people the options of choosing where they want to invest as opposed to only attracting them to the most risky sector of the economy.

We also should understand that agriculture is a passion driven business unlike many other ventures. You ought to have the personal passion for agriculture. What is going to happen because of the high unemployment rates amongst young people? They are going to start rushing into this project not because they have a passion for agriculture; not because they are totally committed to it, but out of desperation, out of lack of alternatives. They think the only thing they can do is to go into agriculture. You will not get the best results by doing that. I would have preferred Government to extend the scope of this particular
window under CEDA to sectors of the economy that have been identified as priority areas for diversification of the Botswana economy and they have been listed. Even in the budget speech when you go to Paragraph No. 45, the Minister makes reference to manufacturing, tourism, and services sectors as Government’s diversification strategy having identified these particular sectors. I also do not like this scheme because it discriminates young people, particularly young people who stay in urban areas. Why should they also not get an opportunity for cheaper finance to promote the projects that they want? Access to land has already been identified as a problem in the rural areas and the explanation is that no, young people can actually use the fields owned by the parents. What about young people who have parents who do not have land, what about young people in urban areas…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You are left with two minutes.

**MR SALESHANDO:** …what about young people whose parents have also been staying throughout their lives in urban areas? A typical example would be someone like me. I have parents who do not have any *masimo*. I do not have any *masimo*. Why then discriminate against young people who want to go into business but are not necessarily attracted to agriculture.

Still on agriculture, the Honourable Leader of the House when he was up here was saying agriculture has not collapsed. It is only that it is dwarfed by mining. True, but not completely true. Not completely true because the percentage contribution of agriculture to Gross Domestic Product did not only decline in the relative terms compared to other sectors but even in absolute terms. Even if mining had not emerged as a major contributor to Gross Domestic Product, the output of agriculture would still have declined.
The issue of the alternative budget Madam Speaker; I am surprised that Members of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) have not responded to the challenge by the Leader of the Opposition when he asked in which country have Members ever heard of an alternative budget been presented. This is because it has been parroted all over for a number of years. The Opposition cannot deliver because they cannot produce an alternative budget. We know that even the BDP itself, the BDP as a political party does not have the capacity to produce a national budget. Tsholetsa House has no role to play in the formulation of the national budget, fact. Even Ministers, when you get to the backbenchers it is worse. None of you can produce an alternative budget even for your constituency. You do not have the skills or the expertise. Why then demand of the Opposition to produce an alternative budget? Is this not hypocrisy of the highest order? Where has it happened in this world? Why should it happen in Botswana when it is not the practice in any other country? I thank you, Madam Speaker.

MR MOLEFHI (SELEBI-PHIKWE EAST): Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo.
Mangwe a mafoko a a buiwang mo Ntlong e ke mafoko a ke eletsang go tshwaela mo go one ka gore mangwe a one ga a mo boammaaruring jo ke solofelang gore a ka bo a buiwa gongwe ka jone.
Ke dumela gore fa re bua ka kabo ya madi, kabo ya madi e dirwe di pedi. Serwe sa ntlha ke ditogamaano tse di mo thulaganyong e e neng ya re mo ngwageng o o neng o feta o, re le Palamente e, ra e nnela fa fatshe ra re re seka-seka kwa re tswang teng mo ditogamaanong tsa boferabongwe le ditogamaano tsa borataro tsa dikgaolo tsa metse ya magae le tsa bobedi tsa dikhansele tsa ditoropo. Ke ditogamaano tse di dumalanweng tse re itseng gore di mo thulaganyong; ke serwe sa ntlha. Serwe sa bobedi ke kabo ya madi e
e itebagantseng le ditshenyegelo tsa letsatsi le letsatsi tsa tsamaiso puso. Mme re lemoga
gore mo serweng se sa bobedi, go na le dithulaganyo tse e rileng fa go ntse go tsweletswe
le Palamente, Palamente ya amogela megopolo e ka yone go neng go twe a re nonotsheng
seabe sa tsamaiso puso le sa ditlhabololo.

Di policy tse ke buang ka tsone tse go raya gore di tla ka ditshenyegelo tsa madi a re
tshwanetseng gore re le Ntlo e e fano re re, a re a e amogela kabo ya madi ao, kana ga re e
amogele re batla paakanyo mo go yone.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: O tlogetse revenue; serwe sa boraro.

MR MOLEFIH: Serwe sa boraro se mokaulengwe a buang ka sone ke sa gore madi a re
a kokoanyang kana a re a bonang a ditlhabololo tseo one, re a bona e le meamuso e e
tswang mo go eng le mo go eng. Ke tsamaiso ya kabo ya madi. Mme fa re lebelela ka fa
bangwe batlotlegi ba ntseng ba tua ka teng, go lebega jaaka e kete re latola gore ga re itse
gore mo thulaganyong e ya kabo ya madi, re tlaa solofela eng ga re na go solofela eng.
Selo se re se utlwisise sentle, gore ke thulaganyo e e leng teng mme re tshwanelwa ke
gore re e utlwisise ka tsela e e ntseng jalo.

E ne ya re maloba fa Motlotlegi Moeteledipele wa Kganetso rraetsho Moupo a akgela mo
mafokong a kabo ya madi, a supa gore madi a go buiwang ka one mo kabong ya madi ke
seabe se se ntsi se se yang go dirisiwa go dira mebereko ya sennlaruri e le palo potlana.
Go boammaaruri ka gore, kgwebo e e tlaa tlisang itsholelo e e nametsang, kana dipelo
tse di nametsang ke ya kepo ya ditswammung. Mme ditswammung tse bagaetsho ka fa ke
lemogang ka teng, gore re iteisanye borathana le mafatshe a a mo kgwebong e, re ka dira
jalo fa e le gore re dirisa boranyane jo bo tsamaelanang le paka e re mo go yone. Gore re
nne bofefo go ntsha thobo e e lekanyeng go ya kwa mmarakeng, ke gore re dirise boranyane jwa gompieno.

Boranyane jwa gompieno ga se jo re ka epang ka peke, ra nyerolosa majwe a ka dikasetoronenyana gore re tle re kgone gore re hire batho ba bantsi. Ga se boranyane jwa gompieno. Ga se jo re ka iteisanyang borathana ka jone mo mmarakeng o o lwelwang wa mafatshefatshe.

Re tshwanelwa ke gore fa re lebelela go fatlhoga ga tsamaiso ya rona ya itsholelo, re amogele gore dikgwebo tse re tsenang mo go tsone ga se tse tsamaiso ya tsone e ka dirwang ka selekanyetso se re ka bong re elets ka sone gore e ka nna jalo gore e hire batho ka dipalo se di kwa godimo. Motlotleli Mopalaména wa Gaborone Legare o ne a digela ka mafoko a a reng, ee, temo-thuo e wetse kwa tlase. Go boammaaruri temo-thuo e wetse kwa tlase. Mme ga se gone gore goromente ke ene a e tlhokomologileng. Goromente o lekile ka ditsela tse di farologanyeng go leka go konkometsa Batswana go tlisa kgatlhego ya bone le keletso ya bone go tsena mo temothuong. Mme ka gone gore bontsi jwa batho ba tsena dikolo ba a fatlhoga, ba na le ditsela di sele tse ba ka itshetsang ka tsone, ba bonya go tsamaela kwa temothuong.

Ke neke elets ka gore ke tshwaele ka gore, le bone banana ba gompieno

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Ke kopa tlhaloso.

**MR MOLEFHI:** Ke tlaa go neela morwarre. Le bone banana ba gompieno go tweng go tla ajwa madi a a tlaa itebaganyang le temo-thuo, ke thulaganyo e ka yone go tweng, ba ba ka kgonang. Ga se kalafi ka bo yone e le esi. Ga twe ba ba nang le kgatlhego, ba ba ka kgonang e nne bone ba e ka reng fa ba re, rona re fano re ikaba gore re ka tsena mo
temothuong, go bo go na le meamuso e e ka dirang gore seabe sa bone se ba eletswang go nna naso, se tle se kgonege.

**MR LEFHOKO:** On a point of order Madam Speaker. We are in breach of procedure because upon a point being raised by a Member, the Member on the floor may yield and the Chair is the one who has authority. But if we are going to be dolling at each other willy nilly to say wait for me, after five sentences I give it to you, it is totally out of procedure.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** You are very right Honourable Lefhoko. Actually I was just about to say to Hounourable Mokgwathi, who asked you to stand up.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Ke a leboga Motlotlegi Molefhi. Ke siilwe ke Setswana sa go konkometsa, se o reng goromente o konkometsa batho mabapi le dithuso tsa *agriculture*. O ka re nna ke se tlhaloganya se na le tlhaloso e sele. Ke ne ke re o tlhalose gore fa a konkometsa go tewa a reng.

**MR MOLEFHI:** Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Morwarre o bolelela ruri, ke ne ke raya go okisa, e seng go konkometsa. Go ba okisetsa go tsena mo temothuong. *Thank you very much.*

Mme Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente, fa ke boela mo mafokong a e neng Tona wa tsa madi le ditogamaano a re a baya pele, tlhogo ya one e botlhokwa gore re e eletlhoko. Fa ke ka nopola bontlha bongwe jwa yone, fa o ntetla Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Nopola.

**MR MOLEFHI:** Ya re: “*Improved productivity.*” Ke bo ke ema foo ke sa tswelele pele le boleele jwa yone.
Gore re dire ka bonatla le bophala le go tlhalobola go dira ga rona. Nako ya go dira e botlhokwa, ditiro tsotho tsa matshelo a rona. Fa re bua ka ditogamaano ka fa di ajwang ka teng mo lenaneong la ngwaga o re neng re tswa mo go one, re ne re tshwanetse gore re ka bo re ne re bona go fegogela ga ditirelo tseo, gore di fithle kwa setshabeng. Fa re sa di dire ka nako e di neng di e rulaganyeditswe, ditshenyegelo tsa yone, tiro epe fela e e ka bong e ne e rulagantswe jalo, di tlaa re sia, go re turela.

Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente fa ke ne ke akgela mo mafokong one a, ke ka bo ke supa gore go na le thulaganyo e e latelang mo go yone paragraph e ya bobedi e, e e buang ka gore, if I may quote Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Do quote.

**MR MOLEFIHI:** Ya re: “To do this, we should continue to invest in our local talents.”

Re tshwanelwa ke gore fa e le gore re batla gore re nne le go tiisa moko bao ba re bonang ba na le bokgoni mo gae, re supe jalo ka ditsamaiso tse di ka itlhaganedisang go dira ga bone, di sa ba kgobe marapo. E ne ya re mo ngwageng o o fa morago ole, Tautona a ntsha lefoko mo tekodisong ya gagwe ya setshaba. O ne a re, mabaka a go a neng go re mo khirong go tse go batiwa motho wa dingwaga tsa selekanyo se se kana, a go bonwe ka one gore go hirwa bana ba rutwa ditiro, ba tlwaediwa tiro e ba e tshwere ka matsogo.

Mme re a ne re utlwa mo maphateng mangwe a puso gore bana bangwe, ditlhogo tsa maphata tse di okametseng ditiro dingwe, ga ba tseye tsa mafoko a a ga Tautona. Mma ke fe sekai. Jaaka batlhatlhobi ba dikago, architects. Go na le dikompone tse di ikametseng ka nosi, tse di nang le bana ba ba sa tswang go fetsa mo dikolong, mme ba tshwanelwa ke gore ba ithute ditiro. Maloba kompone nngwe e ne e ntekodisa gore ba ne ba roma modiri wa bone a na le dingwaga di le tharo a le mo tirong. O fetile a busiwa
Monday 12 February 2007

kwa sekolong se a neng a ile go se tlahlhoba, go se kaela modiredi wa lephata lengwe le e leng lone mong wa tiro eo. Modiredi yo o neng a le foo a mo raya a re, nnyaa monna, wena wa dingwaga tse tharo o sa ntse o le mmotlana, ya go bitsa foromane ya gago wa five years. Bana ba, ba ka ithusa diitiro tse jang fa e le gore ga re kgone…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** A kere tota fa o ntse o re bana o raya banana?

**MR MOLEFHI:** Ke raya banana mma, basha, bone ba dingwaga tsa bone tsa tiro di iseng di lekane bo five years go ya kwa godimo. Re tshwanelwa ke gore re ba neele nako, gore fa re bua ka gone gore re investe kana re tiise moko bokgoni jo re nang najo mo gae, re bo re raya ka go ba roma. Re ba neela diitiro tse gore ba di tshware ka mabogo e tle e re fa dingwaga di ntse di ya, le bone ba tle ba kgone go supa gore ruri-ruri seno se ba a se kgona. Kana kgang e, e tsamaelana le go neela beng gae diitiro mo tsamaaisong ya itsholelo. Mogopolo o Motlotlegi Sebetela a neng a o bua mo ngwageng o o neng o feta o e le tshutiso, gore a go dirwe seelo le selekanyetso tsa gore dikompone di kgona eng, di na le dikitso tse di kae. Se se tla dira gore e re fa di abelwa diitiro, re bo re itse gore batho ba ba abelwang diitiro tseo, ba na le bokgoni jo bo kae. Selo se re tshwanelwa ke gore re se eletlhoko fa re bua ka gone go tokafatsa le go tlhabolola go dira ka bonatla, botlhaga, ka nako le mo seemong se se lekanyeng.

Mafoko a ke eletsang go tsena mo go one ke a a neng a buiwa gape ke Motlotlegi Ntuane. Kana bagaetsho se se botlhokwa ke gore re lemoge gore, lefatshe leno le fa re re le humile, khumo e re buang ka yone e, ga e dirwe ke rona re le Batswana. Ke tlhola ke gakolola Batswana gore ga ba kgabe ka teemane. Mme fa re sa tlhoafalele go e somarela, ra elatlhoko gore meamuso e, le rona re le setshaba, re tshwanelwa ke gore re e emele ka
dinao. E tlaa re motlheng ba ba rekang teemanre ba re tlohonogelo, re palelwe ke go
tshegetsa itsholelo e.

Ke ne ke bua le ba kgaolo ya me maloba ka gore, e ne e rile fa ke etela *clinics*, go ne go
bolelwa gore Batswana ba gana go duelela ma P2.00 kwa sepateleng. Ba itse gore ka fa
tsamaisonya bongaka ga gona yo o ka busediwang kwa lapeng ka gore ga a duelela P2.00.
Ke ba gakolola gore, kana lefatshe leno re sa ntse re tshela botoka ka gore goromente ke
en a sa ntseng a belebokete jwa morwalo wa go duelela ditshenyegelo. Mme fa e le
gore re bona go ka nna kaone gore re re Batswana a ba duelewe madi otlhe a e aletsang.
Ba ka a duelewa e le dikamogelo, mme goromente fa a ntsha seabe sa gagwe se a ntseng a
tshegetsa Batswana ka sone gore ba kgone go ituelela ditshenyegelo (tsa thuto, kalafi,
kana ke tsa matshelo a rona) go tsile go re kokonela re le tshaba.

Mafatshe a re bapileng le one ditshenyegelo tsa bone di feta tsa rona. Go ka bo go lebega
dikamogelo tsa bone di re feta, mme makgetho a bone, *income tax* e feta ya lefatshe la
Botswana, le fa go simololwang go duelela *income tax* teng. Ditshenyegelo tsa bone mo
thutong di tswa mo dipateng tsa batsadi. Mme rona mono, e sa ntse goromente a rile, ke
tlaa tshegetsa bokete jo jwa ditshenyegelo. Ke gone ka moo ke reng, lefatshe le ga le a
huma ka gore, ga se khumo e rona letsatsi le letsatsi re e itaoleleng ka go reka meamuso e,
e ka bo e le teemanre kana bojanala.

Bontsi jwa batlojegi ba ba leng fano ga ba ke ba ya bojanaleng gope fa e se go ya kwa
merakeng le kwa metseng ya magae. Jaanong ditshenyegelo tse, re tshwanelwa ke gore
bagaetsho re seka ra itebatsa gore dipelo tse ga di ungwe mo go rona. Matlotlo e ka bo e
le a rona, mme rona ga re na seabe mo go dueleleng tse re eletsang gore re ka nna natso.
Mabaka a mangwe a ke batlang go tsena mo go one ke a gore Tona o ne a supa gore moo kabong ya madi ya ngwaga ono, lephata la dikago la ga goromente le tlaa bo le tlhomamisa gore go nna le makalana a a ikemetseng ka nosi a bogakolodi mo maphateng a puso. Ga ke bone tsamaiso eo e le yone e ka yone re tlaa tlang re tokafatsa go kgona go dira ditiro. Ke bona e le go dira tsela telele, ka gore, bone ba makalana a a tlaa bong a le kwa maphateng a, go tlaa bo go raya gore ba ntse ba boela kwa lephateng lone la dikago go nna ba botsa bogakolodi koo jo bo nonofileng. Mme se se bo se dia tiro go tswelela.

A lephata le le eme ka dinao, le bone gore go ithola ditiro ga lone, gore bonthla bongwe jwa ditiro tseo bo neelwe dikompone tsa Batswana tse di ikemetseng ka nosi go a ithaganelelwa, gore ditiro tse dingwe tse di tle di nne motlhofo go elwatlhoko gore di a dirwa. Ke belaela gore mabaka one ao, ga a na go re isa gope kgakala fa e se gore go tlaa bo go tla go dia ditiro go tswelela le go dira ka bofefo jo bo eletsegang.

Seabe sa maphata a kgwebo a a tlhakanetsweng le puso, public enterprises, ke bona fano go supilwe gore Botswana Telecommunications Corporation (BTC) e dirile poelo ya P139 million. A mme seno se, ga se kokonele Batswana? Palo potlana e re mo go yone ya lefatšhe leno, re le kananyana re na le megalá, le fa e ka bo merokotso e mengwe e tswa mo ditirelong tse dingwe tse BTC e di dirang, madi a nna ke bona a le kwa godimo thata. Ke ditshenyegelo tse e leng gore ditlhwathlwa tsone tse di kokonela Batswana le bagwebi.

Mme re tshwanelwa ke gore re eletlhoko gore ditiro tsone tse, tsa ditlhaeletsanyo tsa bo telecommunications, tsa metlakase le tsone di ntse di ko godimo.

Re ka bo re dumalana gore tsele e re fetlhang motlakase ka yone e turu, mme ditlhwathlwa tse di ko godimo tse di dira gore metlakase ko metseng ya magae le bontlha
bongwe jwa ditiro bontsi jwa batho bo seka ba tsenya metlakase e mo malwapeng a bone. Mme seo se bo se dira gore palo e potlana e e tsentseng motlakase e bo e imelwa ke ditshenyegelo tsa go duelela ditlamelo tse di sa phatlaledi wang ko sechabeng ka kakaretso. Ke dumela gore tota fa re ne re tlhoa falela go tswakanya itsho lelo re ne re tshwanelwa ke gore re lebe dilo dingwe tse e leng gore ka tsone re ka leka gore re tlhofo fale tse Batswana ditirelo tse ba le mo malwapeng le ba e leng bagwebi ba ba botlana tota.

Ke dumela gore fa re ntse re bua ka itholo ditiro Goromente ga a a itlhaganela. Mme ke dumalana le gore Goromente a tseye nako gore selo se e re fa se ya go dirwa re bo re tlhomamisitse gore Batswana le bone ba ba ka kgonang ba nale seabe mo go tseneng mo go itholeng ditiro mo go tlaa bong go dirwa le mo go bapatseng dikompone tse puso e nang le seabe mo go tsone. Ka gore jaaka re tsere nako re ntse re leka gore re bone gore a go ka rekwa Air Botswana a le tse dingwe re seka ra di itlhaganelela, gore Batswana ba tle mo seemong sa gore le bone ba ba ka reka diabe ba ikopantse kana le makgotla a ba ka kopanelang kgwebo nao. Go dira jalo go tlaa bo go nonotsha seabe sa beng-gae mo tsamaisong ya itsholelo. Re tshwanelwa ke gore re lemoge gore temo-thuo, jaaka ke ne ke akgela kgantele gotwe e wetse ko tlase, mangwe mathata a re nang nao ke gore selekanyo sa metsi, jaaka Batlotlegi bangwe ba itse ko dikga olong tse di ko bophirima letsatsi jwa lefatshe le ke metsi a a letswai. Ke ne ke tshotse pego e nngwe fano ya Mid-Term Review National Development Plan (NDP) 9 e e supang gore le sone selekanyetso sa metswedi ka ko tlase ga lefatshe ga re tlhomamisi gore metsi ao a bontsi bo ka e. Ke mangwe mathata a a dirang gore e re fa re ntse re bua ka temo-thuo re bo re etse tlhoko gore le one a a
nowang gompieno re sa ntse re sokodiswa ke gore a selekanyo se se kae. Mo metseng e mengwe seemo sa metsi a ba a nwang koo ga se metsi a a itekanetseng.

Ke batla go digele ka kabo ya madi e e tlaa itebaganyang le go lwantsha mogare wa HIV.

Ke sengwe sa dilo tse di tshwenyang tse re tshwanelwang ke gore rotlhe re se emele ka dinao re bue ka sone, bogolo-jang go tsalana ga puso le makgotla a a ikemetseng ka nosi.

Go ntse go le bonya madi a a neelwang lekalana la NACA gore madi ao a fitlhe ko makalaneng a mangwe. Mme gongwe thulaganyo e e motlhofo e ne e ka nna gore fa togamaano e dirilwe go itsiwe gore maphata a tlaa tlhoka bokae. Madi ao a gompieno a abelwang maphata a puso le ba bangwe ke NACA a tlhamaladiwe ko maphateng ao gore boikarabelo jwa go tla go arabela kabo ya madi ao bo tle bo nne motloho. Se se tla bo se dirwa ke gore bo tlaa bo bo le ko maphateng a a tshwereng ditiro ka diatla, go nale gore NACA *three months* mongwe le mongwe a bo a nna a neela yole sheleng e le yo o itebagantseng le ditiro tsa one. Fela jaaka Goromente a dira mo maphateng a mangwe, tsa metshameko le itsidilo mmele. Metshameko e abelwa madi, Botswana National Sports Council (BNSC) e neelwa madi mme e fete e ngathoganye madi ao maloko a yone. Mme maphata a mangwe le one a dira jalo. *National Youth Council (NYC)* le yone *through Department of Culture and Youth* e neelwa madi, *Botswana National Youth Council* e neele makalana a yone madi. A tsamaiso e le yone go elwe tlhoko gore fa puso e batla go nonotsha seabe sa makgotla a a ikemetseng ka nosi a a nang le seabe mo go lwantsheng mogare wa HIV… Go tshwanelwa ke gore le bone go nne le thulaganyo e e tlhomameng e Goromente a tlaa elang tlhoko gore ke makalana afe a a nang le boikarabelo jwa go okamela makgotla a a ikemetseng ka nosi. Maphatana a a ka neelwang madi a mme e le madi a ditiro e se madi a a yang go duela ditshenyegelo tsa bodiredi tsa diofisi, tsa
metlakase le tse dingwe. E tla bo e le madi a a itebagantseng le gore ditirelo tse e leng
gore ba lekgotla le ba ya go di dira di ka ba lopa bokae. Ka gore go dira jalo ba a bo ba
dira ditiro tseo ba tsaya puso tema mme e se gore ke madi a *profit*, e le madi a ditirelo,
*services*, tse e leng gore ba a di dira. Thulaganyo e e ntseng jalo e ne e ka dira gore
gongwe seabe sa rona mo go lwantsheng mogare se phuthuloge gore re tle re kgone gore
re lemoge gore rotlhe seabe sa rona mo go lwantsheng mogare se ka atlegang mo
dingwageng tse re mo go tsone. Se se tla re thusa go thomamisa gore maikaelelo a
lefathe leno a gore re bo re segile tema e e bonalang a tle a atlege. Ke a go leboga
Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente.

**MR DE GRAAFF (GANTSi SOUTH):** Thank you Madam Speaker for allowing me to
make a presentation. Let me take this opportunity to congratulate the Honourable
Minister of Finance and Development Planning for an excellent budget. It is because of
budgets like this that have achieved what we achieved today over 40 years. Sometimes to
me it looks like it is very painful for people when we talk about what we have achieved
over 40 years, but I disagree. If you have achieved what Batswana have, you must never
stop talking about it because you must be proud of what you have achieved as a country
or a nation. Everybody played his part in there, I do not want to give all the credit to
Domkrag, although maybe 99 per cent to Domkrag, but we have all played our role in
that. If you look at countries around Botswana, and I do not want to be seen as somebody
attacking neighbouring countries, or other countries in Africa, but by the time they got
their independence the infrastructure was there. They were rich countries, and where are
they today? Botswana had nothing, and where are we today? Children of today must
know where we started. Honourable Minister, I am standing here today to congratulate you and your predecessors and proud to say, we have achieved a lot.

The private sector and Non Governmental Organisations (NGOs) have played their role and we have achieved most importantly a better lifestyle for all Batswana. We know where we started 40 years back. We have increased productivity and service delivery to our people, which we are very proud of. Now it is for us as citizens of this country to also play our role. Government is coming up with all sorts of schemes to empower us and to empower the nation at large. It is expected also from the nation now to stand up and play their role and not only to point fingers at Government and say Government has to do this and that. The Honourable Member of Parliament for Palapye, has put in a motion recently about citizen empowerment which we all supported. Government has come up with many other schemes like; Agricultural Youth Fund and Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) and has reinstated other schemes like; Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP), Services to livestock Owners in Communal Areas (SLOCA). It is now time for us to also play our role. Major developments are coming. They include the expansion of the University, that is going to cost Government more than P700 million and a medical school that is going to cost more than P573 million. Teachers’ housing quarters are going to cost P50 million, power stations will be costing billions of Pula, University of Science and Technology P5 billion and even five more Senior Secondary Schools costing more than P150 million. All that is to better the lives of all Batswana. Even in my own area Government is going to come up with the design of the tarred road from Charleshill to Ncojane which will start very soon. There will also be construction of a rural technical college, electrification of five of my villages and a rural
telecommunication system that is going to be improved. They are even going to put up some towers in my area, like most of the villages, to improve the lives of all Batswana. I am standing here today to thank Government for all that it is doing. There is even improved telecommunication, which the Honourable Minister is going to launch tomorrow in Gantsi. As I said, at most of my places they are going to come up with towers to better the lives of people, which will enable them to connect their houses with landlines. As we did in the past Government will allow private companies like Orange and Mascom, to connect cellular network towards these towers and I even believe that Government is going to come up with their own mobile system. Through all these we can just say as a nation, we are busy building this country and we must all be proud of what is happening in our country.

Let me come now to employment. As I said, Government is coming up with all the schemes, it is now for us to empower ourselves. I remember recently when I was holding my kgotla meetings people said to me that, Member of Parliament we applied for all the schemes but we failed to get them. I say to everybody, stay positive and try your luck, eventually it will come your way. We have reinstated ALDEP to empower the small farmer and SLOCA where we will empower the bigger farmers. Government will come up with schemes to finance them with purchase of boreholes, the equipment for boreholes and the drilling of boreholes. We all know that ALDEP was stopped for a while because farmers abused the scheme. I hope when Government brings this back on the 1st of April we will monitor these projects and Government will work closer with the smaller farmer to empower them. I always say it is not a culture to be poor nor to be a destitute. It is for you when it comes your way to make use of it, as I said ALDEP strives to enrich and
empower us. We cannot always point fingers at Government and say Government is not doing anything for its people, it is doing a lot for its people.

Looking at the CEDA Youth Fund, I would like to urge all the youth to please stand up, when you get the opportunity try and make a success out of it. All the schemes that Government is coming up with if you fail in those schemes you would have taken the opportunity away from somebody waiting in the queue to get that financial assistance. Please let us strive to make a success because if you can refund Government somebody else also in the queue will get the same assistance. I am worried, sometimes that the property valuers, for example, go and value peoples’ land when they ask for the CEDA scheme. When people own land that is worth P20,000 they come and value this land at P300,000 to help these people to get these schemes. It is wrong, they put people in trouble by doing that. The main reason why they are doing it is because they ask for 1 or 2 per cent fee of the financial assistance that they will get.

Going back to CEDA, I am also worried about CEDA. If you apply for a CEDA scheme to construct something like a filling station or something, CEDA will assist you. But when you construct that same business out of your own pocket and ask CEDA to help you put stock in that business they hesitate to help you even after you have given security to CEDA. Where you have come up with the schemes they do not want to supply you with the stock. It is wrong and CEDA has got to look into that. With all the schemes coming up I think you must empower yourself, you must help Government towards unemployment, job creation and many more other things. Again when you look at the schemes, I always hear Honourable Molebatsi, talking about expatriates and employing people from outside. I agree with him, but we must be very careful, especially in
unskilled workers. We employ people as drivers and as shop keepers. When it comes to unskilled labour we must make sure as a country only to employ our own citizens. As I said last time we must be very careful of how we are doing it. This is because Batswana are also going outside the country to look for jobs and if we say no expatriates should not come to this country we are actually sending a message that other countries must not employ our people.

I have said that, to me for government to introduce schemes such as ALDEP, SLOCA, destitute persons’ allowance, orphan care products and the old age pension, is one way we are empowering the poor man who is really in need of support. ALDEP really is for the small man, and I must congratulate the Ministry of Agriculture for bringing all those schemes back.

Let me say something on paragraph 26, Botswana Development Corporation (BDC) financing the tannery that was recently up for sale from the Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) costing P28 million.

I am not so much worried if it is a 100 per cent citizen owned company or a joint venture, but what I am worried about is that they are employing more than 120 people. Are we going to allow all the raw materials to go out of this country because if we can keep at least 80 per cent of those raw materials in the country, we can employ 500 people instead of employing 120? By exporting all the raw materials, we are exporting jobs and when people are tendering on this as on the tannery in Lobatse, government must look into it and make sure that those companies winning the tender at least leave some of the raw materials in the country. Such should be used to manufacture hats, shoes, gloves, and many other things because you can do a lot from skins.
Monday 12 February 2007

On the issue of BMC on paragraph 34, the disposal of what I have just mentioned; the tannery, and the trimmed work force. I am sure that there is a big improvement at BMC, although we still want to see a bigger improvement. However, farmers must also play their role because BMC has the capacity to slaughter up to 250,000 cattle per year but now they only get something like 130,000 cattle. There was improvement from 117,000 cattle, the previous year up to 137,000 cattle, an increase of 12,000 cattle. However, I still want to urge farmers to make sure that we send our cattle to BMC, and that is why I will never support the opening of borders because if you open the borders you are exporting jobs. However, talking on BMC, I still think BMC has to improve the cattle industry. They have come up and all the farmers are very happy about the new system where you can send a young ox at only 24 months old. I believe some of the cattle have even fetched up to the amount of P8,000. That is good business, but you only get that price prime rate when you slaughter an animal that weighs 200 kg at slaughter weight. I still want to see BMC coming up with a sliding scale especially for the communal farmer. It is difficult for the communal farmer to send a 24 months old ox that will reach that 200 kg and when it does not reach that 200 kg and maybe reaches 199 kg, you lose something like P500, P600, P800. It is wrong, government has to look into it. Having said that, I believe and support the Minister of Agriculture because they want to encourage people to start breeding quality cattle. However, we have to look into a sliding scale. With those cattle that do not reach the 200 kg for 1 kg, that you do not lose something like a thousand Pula.

The Ministry of Agriculture has recently increased prices of cattle sold at BMC, and this I hope should be an encouragement to the cattle agents and the feedlotters. By saying that,
let me take this opportunity to thank the feedlots especially in my area, they are doing a wonderful job. They are going out in the rural areas, they are buying my people’s cattle at good prices but once we get more feedlots in this country, then the business will get more competitive or the cattle industry will get more competitive. The cattle agency, the feedlots will then pay better prices towards the farmer because my belief is that farmers are still not getting the right price for their cattle especially in the communal areas. I said that BMC has the capacity to slaughter up to 250,000 cattle and by not getting that as they are slaughtering 137,000 cattle do you know that for them to slaughter 100 cattle or 1,000 cattle per day is the same cost. Therefore, maybe once we have more feedlots, becoming more competitive, and the cattle industry getting healthier, we can then start thinking of the cattle agents, and the feedlots can start buying cattle from Namibia.

We all know that most of the weaners from Namibia are going in transit through Botswana to South Africa but once the feedlots are more competitive and paying the right prices because I believe at the BMC, the prices especially on the prime rate is not too bad. If the BMC can then get more cattle even from Namibia, the feedlots can make sure that they get all the young animals in the country and then send them to BMC. BMC will be able to slaughter more cattle around the clock and then be in a better position to make profit and then that profit can be ploughed back into the farmers’ pocket.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** On a point of clarification, Honourable Member. Thank you Honourable De Graaff. If I am following your debate accurately, would you be saying that this P28 million surplus that is expected from the BMC operating under capacity does not show inefficiency within the BMC, they are still making profit even without that capacity?
MR DE GRAAFF: Honourable Member I agree with you, but as I said, it is very difficult for BMC, I am not trying to protect them. I even said earlier that we still need improvement in the management. We still need the Ministry of Agriculture to come up with maybe as I said, the sliding scale although the problem lies with BMC who are not getting enough cattle. Currently, they slaughter 137, 000 cattle per annum and for them to slaughter 137,000 up to 250, 000 is the same cost. Therefore, if they can get cattle around the clock, they will be in a better position to make a profit and I say that profit then must be ploughed back to the farmer.

Now, talking about trade, do you know that government is coming up with so many schemes to empower citizens but what are we doing as citizens? Do you know that government is coming up with some of the businesses as filling stations, as general dealers.

MR MORUTI: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. The point of clarification that I am seeking for is that by the time when I talked about the same issue in this Parliament, the Minister of Agriculture answered me by saying that they are getting enough cattle now at the BMC. The Assistant Minister answered me in that way too.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: No.

MR MORUTI: No that is what he told me.

MR DE GRAAFF: Honourable Member yes, as I said I have got figures in front of me. Last financial year they got 137,000 and they had the capacity to slaughter 250,000 that is about 55 per cent of what they can slaughter. Therefore, they still need at least 45 per cent more cattle.
Monday 12 February 2007

Going to Trade, some as I said filling stations, general dealers, butchers have been put aside only for citizens of this country. What are we doing as citizens? We register companies and before we even open, we apply for land even tribal land is put aside for citizens. The law says when you apply for a residential plot you have to develop it in two years. The commercial, industrial, you have to develop it in four years but we apply for this land and before we even open businesses, we find loopholes in the law. We transfer out shares to non-citizens and at the end of the day they are sitting with our businesses and then we point fingers at government.

Let me also say something maybe on filling stations. It is very unfair for a filling station in a rural area like Ncojane where they have to do Environmental Impact Assessment study, which is costing them more than P80,000 to go to a consultant. Do you really expect a new small businessman to pay that amount of money? It is impossible because even the quantity of fuel they are selling, they cannot make profit to get that money back. Therefore, even the government must look into something like environmental management plan to support those people or even government through the country planning board. It must be the responsibility of government to do that environmental impact study and not to give it to the small businessman who is starting a business.

I feel that really we are keeping the businesses away from the small man because eventually, the big guy, the richer man will go in and he will be able to open a filling station because he has that P80,000. However, as a poor man you may not. Therefore, we must look into that to support the small businessman.

Wildlife, Tourism, Predator management, I have a big problem with that. Do you know that they have given out a quota for 37 lions to the concession areas? These are areas
where I believe we must protect those animals but they do not address the problematic lion and leopard. They allow that problematic lion and leopard to be hunted, to be shot by the farmer himself or as a citizen you can go and pay P3, 000 and hunt for that lion. Why is government not taking at least 50 per cent away from that quota in the concession area and give it to the problematic lion? Yes, the ministry came up with a pilot project two years back but it looks as if they are not going to expand the pilot project to other areas. I say this because government can get a lot of revenue from such an arrangement. They are charging up to P20, 000 per permit. Now, if they can bring in Safari Companies, do you know, as a farmer you can then go and pay P20, 000 which government can get as revenue and if you bring in an American you pay up to P100, 000. That is what is happening. They are paying up to P100, 000 but we allow them to hunt these animals and we do not give government any revenue and that it is wrong.

Conservation of wildlife: Do you know that we spoke about it for so many years and nothing is happening? When I debated here, previously, I asked if you knew the number of Kgokong and Wildebeest, both the Wildebeest and Hartebeest in the late 70s, in the early 80s was up to half a million. Yes there were 250, 000 hartebeest, 250 more or less of all the wildebeest. Today you talk about 17,000/18,000/36,000. Last time, I asked why government cannot come up with game farms; leave a corridor of 20 metres from the buffalo fence and come up with game farms. Then in that condition of those tenders, the people that applied for that farm can come up with good fences. The fence must be electrified and then government will not be forced to maintain that buffalo fence any more. It will be for the private sector and we all know that the private sector, those that will be allowed to do farming there will definitely maintain those fences. It will be
difficult for all those animals especially the buffalo that carries the diseases coming to go over. Once all that is in place, we left up the corridor, the fences at Kuke between the Red Zone and the Gantsi area. Immediately we have a bigger area where we can do cattle farming and that is what we are looking for, to get a bigger EU market where we can do cattle farming. In that regard, BMC will immediately get the cattle that they want. However, we talk about these things and it never happens. So, really government must look into it and see if they cannot do that because as I said, we will get our wildlife numbers back and we will get a bigger cattle area for the EU.

I appreciate what the Minister of Agriculture did in the last financial year or the last two years. There was a big improvement but the insertion of boluses is a big problem. Even in Gantsi, we are only getting a thousand per week, four thousand per month, that is not enough. I know that in a week or two weeks time, there is more than 350 boluses that are coming from Australia and maybe by then the problem will be solved. When they are still going around to insert these boluses, because they know that they are working on a programme, how would they not let the farmers know that they will visit them on the 13th, 14th of February. Farmers have told me that 80 per cent of the time the equipment does not work. I really think it is unfair and they have to look into that.

I now come to Education. Government is going to build a P5 billion second university, but I am very worried about what our children are doing to schools. Recently they vandalised school buildings in Gantsi to the extent where it cost government P3 million. I believe over the last ten years it cost government more than P20 million. Government wants to come up with other five senior secondary schools, which are going to cost us P1.5 billion. I urge all Members of Parliament that please, when we go out and address
kgotla meetings, let us talk to our children’s parents. They have got responsibility towards their children and we cannot allow these things to continue. That is why I am happy with the Honourable Minister of Education’s statement that we are going to withhold examination certificates and black list the students for further education. We have to do these things.

With regard to the Ministry of Lands and Housing, I really think that they must go out. They cannot only come up with Botswana Housing Corporation’s houses in cities like Gaborone. We also have problems in the rural areas and it is high time that they come to our areas to build houses there. If you look at areas where I come from, there is a lot of land but we do not survey plots for people when they apply. There is a backlog of thousands of applications and we just say there are no plots. One might think there are squatters in rural areas, but it is really homeless people that need land. The Ministry of Lands and Housing must address that problem. We are all waiting for the P7.26 billion development budget which is 25 per cent increase.

Thank you.

MR MOKGWATHI (LETLHAKENG EAST): Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisano tsa Palamente. Mafoko a ga Motlotlegi Rraetsho De Graaff, we talk about this things and it never happens. Rra, re tlaa nna re ntse re bua ka tsone fela mme go sa dirafale sepe.

Ke ema le nna gore ke akgele. Kana selo sa ntlha fela nna se ke tshwanetseng gore e re fa go buiwa ka kabo ya madi ke bo ke tsena mo go sone ke gore, kabo madi e e tsholetse kgaolo ya me eng? Go na le ba bangwe ba e leng gore kana bone ga ba na di constituency, ba ka bua ka dilo tse gongwe di sa amaneng le matshelo a batho directly. Bao ke ba ba
batlang *alternative budget*. Jaanong kgang ke gore *budget* e, e tsholetse kgaolo ya me eng?

Go buiwa ka *rural development*, ditlhabololo tsa dikgaolo tsa magae. Motlotlegi Tona o bua fela ka one mophako, ga a bue ka ditlhabololo tsa dikgaolo tse re neng re solofetse gore go tlaa bo jaanong go atoloswa ditlamelo… E re khansele e tshwana le ya Kweneng, e e sa leng gore e palelwa go gaesa dikhanele tsotle, re solofetse gore jaanong go na le *decentralisation and devolution*, go pala gore e re nako e re bo re itse gore le rona mo kgaolong e tshwana le ele ya Letlhakeng, re ya go direlwa eng. Re kgaolo e e tletseng ka botlalo, palo ya rona e ntsi. Mme o ya go fithhela dipalonyana tse di tshwanang le tsa kwa ga bo *Honourable Assistant Minister of Finance and Development Planning*, *mme* yone e le a *fully-fledged district*. Ke raya kgaolo ya ga *Honourable Mlazie*. Ke gore, kgaolo e tshwana le ya Letlhakeng, ke dikgaolo tsa selegae tse re solofelang gore re ka bo jaanong re itsamaisetsa, re itse gore re na le Rural Administration Centre e e nang le bodiredi bo bo lekanyeng. E re go kopiwa madi re bo re itse gore a thamalalela teng, ga a ye kwa Molepolole kwa re sa itseng gore a gongwe a felela kwa go bo Mogoditshane kampo kae. Rona mo dikgaolong tsa rona, ditlhabololo di sa tle. Ke tshwenngwa ke gore fa go buiwa ka *rural development*, e bua ka mophako wa dikhutsana, mophako wa batlhoki, madi a bagodi le *social welfare*, ke gore rona ba dikgaolo re bo Lasaro ba re tshwanetseng gore re je matlhotlhora. Mme ke tshwanetse ke le tlhalosetse gore mme mongwe o ile a opela pina e e reng ‘Mpiletseng Lasaro.’ Go raya gore lona ba puso ya ga Domkrag, fa re solofetse gore *rural development* le tlaa e gatelela le bo re le rona kwa ga rona re nne *social welfare State* re ne re phakisiwa fela. O kare rona re nna le seriti sa setho sa gore e re fa re tlaa ja go bo go tulwe atlarela. Golo mo ga le re direle sentle. Re solofela gore
jaaka go buiwa ka diteemane tse go tweng di a tlhatswiwa, teemane e tswa mo motlhabeng, e tswa mo kgaolong ya selegae, e bo e le gore lona la re go e tlhatswa go batla gore e bo e tsile mo Gaborone. Metsi a a tswang mo kgaolong ya Letlhakeng a tsamay a ya go nosa teropo ya Jwaneng le teemane eo. Mme go tlhoke go akanngwa gore ka nako nngwe go twee diteemane tse di tlaa ya go tlhatswiwa kwa Letlhakeng *just to inject life in that area*. Ka gore le a itse goremotho yo o humanegileng, yo o phakang ke motho yo o tlaa nnang a ntse a re tsholetseng Domkrag nako le nako. Bagae tso, ga le itirele sentle. Rona re madimabe mo go kana ka eng mo dikgaolong tsa rona re ka se ka ra tlhatswa teemane, e bo e le gore e tla mo toropong? *We are taking about development policy* ya Domkrag *in general, the economic position* jaaka go buiwa. Gore, tse la e le tlhabololang lefatshe ka yone ga se yone, le ithaya le re le tlhabolola ka gore le bo le bala gore e ne ya re jara fa e simologa le tsaya ditlhopho batho ba ba neng ba phaka ba ne ba le kae. E re fa le boela kwa ditlhophong le bo le boa le bala gore *social welfare* ya rona e phakisitse batho ba le kae, le bo le re ke gone fa le re tshabolola. Re solofetse gore mo budgeteng e tshwana le e, fa re bua ka mananeo a gompieno go buiwang ka one a bo ALDEP le bo ... a masho, ALDEP e re gore o kgone go nna le tshwanelo ya go bona dithuso tsa ALDEP o bo o na le dikatso tse di sa feteng P20,000. Motlotlegi Tona ya tsa Madi e le ene a neng a tlisa mogopollo fa le lenanaeo la Incomes Policy, e le ene e ne ya re fa re bua ka makgetho a bo a re motho yo o amologaing P30,000 ka jara o a bo a le mohumanegi a se ka a duela lekgetho. Mme fa go ya go ya go tsena kwa bathong ba ba tshwanetseng gore jaanong ba bone ditonki tseo, e a bo e le ba P20,000, jaanong ba ba fa gare ba wa reng ka bone? Kana re tshwanetse re tlhaloganye gore jaaka re ne re bua ka selekanyetso sa itsholelo le botshelo jo motho a tshwanetseng a bo tshele gore a nne le
seriti sa gore ke motho. Go buiwang ka poverty datum line, re a itse gore e tshwanetse e nne three quarters of the income. Mme poverty datum line e Motlotlegi a buang ka yone, o bua ka P1,901 gore, gore motho a tshele mo lefatsheng la Botswana a na le seriti sa setho, basic necessity, o tshwanetse a nne le P1,901, e le P63 ka letsatsi. Jaanong re a itse gore three quarters ya P2,500 ke P1,900. Mme o bo o re P2,500 e e leng P30,000 ka jara, batho ba ba fa gare ga P20,000 le P30,000 bone ga ba tle go bona dithuso tseo. Ke kopa gore le ne le akanyetsa dilo tse fa le di dira, ka gore o kare jaanong le lebala gore le ne le gata fa kae. Ntate o ne a tle a ntthe e a re fa o golegile tonki, fa o tsamaya ka tonki o e palame, fa e ka raga sesana se, fa e boa kwa e boa gape e se raga.

Bagaetsho, fa re bua ka rural development and service delivery, re ne re solofetse gore mo lenaneong le, sekai, tsela ya Molepolole-Lethakeng, e go neng go ntshitswe P3.5 million gore go dirwe design. Re ne ra solofediwa gore e tlaa re kabo ya madi ya 2007/2008 design e e bo e fedile tsela e bo e simololwa, ga e yo mo lenaneong. Mme fa re tlhalosediwa bodiredi bo sa dire tiro ya bone, fa ke buisa diphuthego maloba tsa kgotla, ka gore nna ga e sa tlhole e le boikarabelo ba me, ke biditse bodiredi ka re bo tlhalose gore tsela e tsamaya fa kae. Mme fa re bolelelwa gore evaluation ke gone e dirwang, mme jaanong re sa ntse re ya go isa dipego tsa yone tsa dikonteraka kwa Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (PPADB) gore e tle e abe madi. Go raya gore e tlile go aba madi a go dira design ya tsela ka 2007/2008 e e neng e ka bo e dirilwe mo ngwageng e e fetileng. Re solofetse dipatela, ga gona le fa e le sepe se se dirilweng. Ke gore go kwalwa fela. Ke sone se ke dumelang ka botlalo gore madi a otlhe, bontsi ba one, from the P5.6 billion a go neng go tulwe ke a ditlhabololo, kana ga go na sepe se se supafalang, bogolo
Jaanong ke tlaa bua ka six per cent across the board wa dikokeletso tsa babereki. Bagaetsho, Motlotlegi Raetsho Baledzi Gaolathe fa a ntsha Incomes Policy, o re tlhaloseditse gore kana go a bo go lekanyeditswe dituelo ka lebaka la gore ga go batlwe gore itsholelo go nne le ba ba jang, ba bangwe ba beetswe ka fa mosing, ke sone se jaanong go laolwang dituelo. Mme fa e le gore thulaganyo ya rona gongwe go buiwa ka social welfare state, re bue ka seemo sa gore madi a Motlotlegi Minister of Finance and Development Planning a tlileng go a amogela ka six per cent. Ke itse gore go tlile go tswa molao wa six per cent gone fa wa Mapalamente, go raya gore bana ba gagwe will have access to extra books, computers le bo MP3 bao. Ngwana yo ene mmaagwe a yang go amogela six per cent of P600 go raya gore ene ga a tle go bona ditshwanelo tsa gagwe. By virtue of your position having chosen your parents wisely, o ya go felela jaanong wena o bona ditlamelo, better education, better health services go na le ngwana yo mongwe. Jaanong, le bo le re ke gone fa le ntse le tsamaya sentle le le social welfare state. Fano re bua ka tekatekanyo ya ditshwanelo. Fa re sa lekane gompieno, let us not make our children also differentiated in terms of their generations. Ke sone se e a tleng e re ke bua ke re you are promoting intergeneration and inequalities. Madi a lona gompieno lona ba le amogelang madi a mantsi…

MR LEFHOKO: Point of procedure, Madam Speaker. Motlotlegi Mopalamente Mokgwathi a gakologelwe Standing Order, gore o tlhophile e fe puo e a batlang go bua le rona ka yone. O eta a ya kwa go ya Seesimane, a ya kwa go ya Setswana. Ga ke itse gore tota o bua jang. A o nitame fela, re ipeetse molawana oo.
MADAM SPEAKER: Indeed, o a tlhakatlhakanya.

MOTION

ADJOURNMENT

MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR SWARTZ): Madam Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and agreed to.

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 7.00 p.m. until Tuesday 13\textsuperscript{th} February 2007 at 2.30 p.m.

Tuesday 13\textsuperscript{th} February 2007

THE ASSEMBLY met at 2.30 p.m.

(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)

P R A Y E R S

* * * *

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER


MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Local Government what the value of procurement was at the Department of Tribal Administration for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

1) equipment (excluding IT)
2) office stationery
3) IT equipment
4) Consultancies/professional services
and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA):

Madam Speaker, I answered this question yesterday. I thank you.

EXISTENCE OF A SAVINGRAM FOR HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION OF GOVERNMENT SECURITY OFFICERS

MR P. P. P. MOATLHODI (TONOTA SOUTH): asked the Minister of Presidential Affairs and Public Administration to confirm or deny the existence of a Savingram that states that with effect from 3rd July 1998 the Botswana Government shall look positively into the housing, as well as transportation of Government Security Officers when knocking off late from work.

MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR SKELEMANI): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am aware of the existence of a savingram referred to by the Honourable Member for Tonota South. The security officers were informed that because of resource constraints, it is not possible for government to provide security officers with transport all the time. Funds permitting, a vehicle will be secured because permission has been granted by the Directorate of Public Service Management to transport those who knock off duty at night, that is at 10.00 p.m. but not those who report for duty when public transport is available. There was no issue of housing in the letter, which I have.

MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Local Government what the value of procurement was at the Department of District Administration for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

1) equipment (excluding IT)
2) office stationery
3) IT equipment
4) Consultancies/professional services

and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, the value of procurement at the Department of District Administration for office equipment, office stationery, IT equipment, consultancies and professional services was P85,776.70 and P823,000.05 for the financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 respectively. These represent 74 per cent and 92 per cent award of tenders to citizen contractors during the 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 financial years respectively. The breakdown of these are provided in a separate table, which I shall avail to the Honourable Member. I thank you.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>equipment (excluding IT)</td>
<td>P85,776.70</td>
<td>P823,000.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>office stationery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT equipment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultancies/professional services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) For the 2003/2004 Financial Year
b) For the 2004/2005 Financial Year:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Total Value</th>
<th>100% or Citizen Controlled Awards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office Equipment</td>
<td>P12,163.30</td>
<td>P0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
<td>P38,623.40</td>
<td>P27,800.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
<td>P0.00</td>
<td>P0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultancies</td>
<td>P34,990.00</td>
<td>P34,990.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>P85,776.70</td>
<td>P62,790.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LIABILITY OF BEAST OWNER TO MOTOR VEHICLE OWNER FOR CIVIL DAMAGES FROM A ROAD ACCIDENT**

MR E. O. MOUMAKWA (KGALAGADI NORTH): asked the Minister of Works and Transport whether the owner of a beast is liable to the owner of a motor vehicle for civil
damages arising from a road accident involving his beast and the motor vehicle, regardless of whether it is a primary; secondary; tertiary or access road.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF WORKS AND TRANSPORT (MR F. J. RAMSDEN): Mr Speaker, the liability of an animal owner to a motor vehicle owner for damages where the motor vehicle has collided with an animal is based on the negligent act or omission of the animal owner. The mere fact that the motor vehicle has collided with the animal will not on its own render the owner of the animal liable in damages to the vehicle owner. It is the negligent and wrongful conduct of the animal owner by not monitoring its movement and therefore resulting in the road accident that, if proved, makes him liable to the owner of the motor vehicle. Madam Speaker, I am aware that in some parts of this country, the road network is not fenced to protect the road reserve from livestock. Madam Speaker, an offence in terms of the Road Traffic Act is committed when an owner or person in charge of livestock or other animals permits such livestock or other animals to be on the road reserve unattended. It is also an offence for the owner or person in charge of livestock or other animals to leave such livestock or other animals in a place from where they are likely to stray on to a road reserve. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

MR MOKGWATHI: Ke a leboga. Ke kopa gore Motlotlegi a re tlhalosetse gore negligence ya kgomo e a buang ka yone, o raya e fe ka gore motho o na le thaloganyo, o tshwanetse gore a borike koloi e tsamaya mo tseleng. Dikgomo tsa lona di fula mo dipolaseng, jaanong, tsa rona ga di na kwa di fulang teng. Le tshwanetse le tlhalose gore le raya eng.

MR RAMSDEN: Madam Speaker, ga ke a re ke negligence ya kgomo, ke rile ke ya mong wa kgomo. I thank you.
MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Raetsho, ke a leboga. Ke ntse ke go reeditse o araba, mme thata o ka re o remeletse mo phosong ya modisa kana ya mong wa kgomo. Jaanong, ke ne ke batla go itse gore mo go yone thulaganyo e ya bofafalele mo tseleng kana go lesa dikgomo di tsamaya mo tseleng, bofafalele jwa mokgweetsi jone kgatlhanong le kgomo bo tla fa go rileng?

MR RAMSDEN: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, kana ke rile if proved, fa go supafetse gore yo o disang dikgomo kana yo o nang natso ke ene a dirileng phoso ya go nna jalo. Jaanong, tota fela dikgomo tsone ga di a tshwanela go kgweeletswa mo tseleng kana go disetswa fa thoko ga tsela. I thank you.

MR MOUMAKWA: A Tona o lemoga gore potso kwa e neng e ya teng, e ne e batla gore a thalose gore mme tsela e go ka tweng mong wa kgomo a duele ke e fe ka gore, re ne re lebile gore mo dikgaolong tse re tswang mo go tsone, le mo tseleng ya masimo fela fa o thudile kgomo, mapodisi ba feta ba go raya ba re o duele mong wa koloi.

MR RAMSDEN: Madam Speaker, mo ditselenyaneng tse tsa metlha ya dinoga tsa mo masimo tse, ga ke itse fa e le gore mong wa kgomo o a tle a bonwe molato wa gore kgomo ya gagwe e thulanye le koloi. I thank you.

VALUE OF PROCUREMENT AT THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH


MR L. B. SEBETELE (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Health what the value of procurement was at the Ministry Headquarters for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

1) equipment (excluding IT)

2) office stationery
and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

MINISTER OF HEALTH (PROF. TLOU): Madam Speaker, during the period 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 office stationery and office equipment (excluding IT) were procured from the Department of Supply. The value of procurement for the two items was P205,275.85 and P324,902.30 respectively. Regarding IT equipment and consultancies/professional services, in the financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 the procurement values are as follows in the form of a table:

Year 2003/2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Total Procurement Value (Pula)</th>
<th>Locally Registered Companies (Pula)</th>
<th>100% Citizen Owned Companies (Pula)</th>
<th>Citizen Controlled Companies (Pula)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
<td>1,276,653.90</td>
<td>1,245,261.00</td>
<td>29,148.90</td>
<td>2,244.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consultancies/professional Services</td>
<td>68,730.32</td>
<td>68,730.32</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1,345,384.22</td>
<td>1,313,991.32</td>
<td>29,148.90</td>
<td>2,244.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The rationale for the redeployment of members of the Botswana Defence Force to Government Ministries;

Terms and conditions of such redeployments;

Whether such officers are governed by the conditions of service for public servants as prescribed by the General Orders for the duration of such redeployments; and

Whether or not there is a limit to the duration of such redeployments.
MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR SKELEMANI): Thank you, Madam Speaker. In addition to the core business of defending the country, the BDF has the secondary duty of “aiding civil authorities”. The BDF Act (CAP 21:05) Part II (5) prescribes that “the Defence Force shall be charged with the defence of Botswana and with such other duties as may from time to time be determined by the President.”

It is within the ambit of this statutory provision that the BDF members can be deployed in other government departments. The rationale for such deployments recognises the department’s needs and the BDF member’s area of speciality.

The terms and conditions of redeployment would be agreed upon by the BDF and the concerned departments, usually with the department taking the administrative responsibility i.e. the day-to-day supervision of the members for the duration of the deployment, which may be anything from a few weeks to a few years depending on the request of the concerned departments.

The BDF members remain under the governance of the BDF Act and its regulations during the deployment. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

MR SEBETELA: Will the Minister say how these officers progress and get promoted when they are outside the normal service of the BDF.

MR SKELEMANI: Madam Speaker, they would not lose their ranking, they would be promoted as if they are still within the BDF. Remember, Madam Speaker, I have said that they remain part of the BDF for governance issues. If necessary, of course, reports will have been obtained from the departments where from day-to-day they are working.
ESCALATION OF CRIME IN CENTRES IN THE BUILD-UP TO AND DURING THE 2010 WORLD CUP IN SOUTH AFRICA

MR K. KARIO (SELIBE-PHIKWE): asked the Minister of Presidential Affairs and Public Administration to say whether his Ministry envisages/forecasts an escalation of crime in centres such as Selibe-Phikwe in the build-up to and during the 2010 FIFA Soccer World Cup in South Africa; if so,

1. Will the Minister say what plans he is putting in place to address such a potential crime wave in terms of increasing police manpower and equipment, back up and inter-agency co-operation and the like;

2. When does he expect to have completed 80 per cent of what he intends in anticipation of the 2010 crime wave.

MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR SKELEMANI): Thank you, Madam Speaker. We are aware that the Soccer World Cup 2010 to be held in South Africa will bring challenges and opportunities in the region. Amongst the challenges are issues of public safety and security. It is in recognition of these challenges that the Chiefs of Police of the Southern African Regional Police Chiefs Cooperation Organisation (SARPCCO) met from the 5th to the 6th of February 2007 in South Africa, amongst others to discuss the 2010 World Cup challenges. At this meeting, it was resolved to develop a Regional Security Plan for operational interaction by the member states. A planning committee has been established to compile uniform standards for operational activities. A Local Organising Committee comprising of Law Enforcement Agencies will be established to start addressing these issues. The committee should be in place before the end of March 2007.
During NDP 9 a number of development projects were completed countrywide, which are intended to build capacity in Botswana Police Service. In the Selibe-Phikwe area, Serule Police Station and 31 houses were completed. The station started operating in December 2004 and has a workforce of 29 officers and eight vehicles.

Madam Speaker, subject to approval by this Honourable House, we intend to start pre-construction processes in the Selibe-Phikwe area for the following projects;

1) Mmadinare Semi Urban Police Station and 55 houses
2) Semolale Police Station and 20 houses
3) 43 residential houses for Botshabelo in Selibe Phikwe itself.

Hopefully, Madam Speaker, a police and 20 houses will be constructed at Baines’ drift during the last financial year of this plan period. All these are efforts by Government to enhance Police capability to respond to national challenges. I would like to assure the Honourable Member that Government is aware of the opportunities and challenges presented by the 2010 World Cup and all these measures are being put in place to position the country for this event.

All the Inter-Agency and Interstate cooperation are optional. The Development projects for Selibe Phikwe Police District in exception of Baines’ drift will be completed during the financial year 2009/2010. All things being equal, our performance in this regard will be over 80 per cent by that time. I thank you Madam Speaker.

MR KARIO: Ke a leboga. Ke kopa gore Tona a re tlahosetse gore, a ga gona lenaneo lepe la go leka go bona gore kwa melelwaneng go tsenngwa machines to detect ditlhobolo le dipe ditshipi tse batho ba ka tsenang ka tsone mo Botswana e le nngwe ya dilo tsa go kganela borukutlhjo bo ka tlang ka ditlhobolo tse di tsenang mo lefatsheng?
MR SKELEMANI: Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, one of the things, which we are doing continuously and not just because the World Cup is coming, is to empower ourselves. For example, through getting dogs which we are getting from South African and Zimbabwe sniffer dogs, to use at any points of entry where we have reason to believe that this Republic may be exposed. That would include naturally such machines as would be available.

ELEVATION OF THE POSITION OF FINANCE OFFICER TO FINANCE MANAGER

MR. S. KGATHI (BOBIRWA): asked the Minister of Finance and Development Planning to state:

1) whether he does not consider elevating the position of Finance Officer in Ministries to the equivalent of Finance Manager in statutory bodies in order to enhance prudent financial management within all Ministries and to attract high calibre professionals;

2) What plans will be put in place to facilitate further decentralisation to Ministries in this regard.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR MLAZIE): Madam Speaker, my Ministry has undertaken an organisation and methods (O&M) review with a view to enhancing its ability and capacity to provide quality service to its clients. This includes enhancing prudent financial management, attracting and keeping qualified personnel within the Ministry. The report is currently being processed within Government. As part of the O & M review Madam Speaker, the Ministry will be reassessing various positions including those of Heads of Finance Units in Ministries.
Furthermore, the O&M review will determine any further decentralisation that may be required. However, Madam Speaker, it should be noted that these positions will not be equated to those of Finance Managers in statutory bodies, because they are governed by existing structures of Government which do not necessarily equate to those of statutory bodies. I thank you Madam Speaker.

MR KGATHI: Ke ne ke kopa go botsa Tona gore ka go na le maikaelelo a a tsepameng a go batla go supa fa go na le tshwaro ya madi sentle, a *a similar exercise* a go nale maikaelelo a gore e tlaa fetisetswa kwa dikhanseleng gore tshwaro ya madi e tshwane le ka fa o batlang ka teng o le Tona ya madi?

MR MLAZIE: Madam Speaker, I would suggest that maybe he should ask another question because I was just answering this one. I thank you.

MR SEBETELEA: Madam Speaker, in view of the decentralisation announcements by the Minister of Finance and Development Planning during the budget speech including P10 million for procurement and others, should this O&M exercise not be expedited to make sure that ministries have the capacity to deal with the job that we have given them?

MR MLAZIE: Madam Speaker, I would just say that the report is currently being processed within Government, which means that we are on it right now. I thank you Madam Speaker.

STATEMENT

THE CONSTRUCTION OF THUNE AND LOTSANE DAMS

MINISTER OF MINERALS, ENERGY AND WATER RESOURCES (MR KEDIKILWE): Madam Speaker, the latest status of the Thune and Lotsane dam construction programme is that tenders from prospective bidders shall be submitted to the
Monday 12 February 2007

Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (PPADB) on the 14th February 2007. This would be followed by the following activities;

1) Evaluation process which would take six to eight weeks leading to construction supervision award in April 2007.

2) Three months design audit

3) Four months tendering for construction

4) One and half months for tender adjudication

Based on these processes it is evident that dam construction should commence in January 2008 contrary to information provided by the Department of Water Affairs to Mmadinare and Bobirwa constituencies which information was reported on October 2007 or as second half of 2007.

Madam Speaker, the October date could not be achieved due to the fact that at the time of reporting, it was assumed that the design audit would take two months only. However, based on the experience gained at the Dikgatlhong dam it has been evident that design audit would take three months leading to November 2007.

Lastly Madam Speaker, as Honourable Members are aware, December is a dormant month with almost all companies closed for Christmas, therefore, this is the reason why construction works should practically commence in January 2008. I thank you Madam Speaker.

MR MOGAMI: Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke ne ke re potsonyana e khutshwanyane fela ke ya gore, a mme Tona mo mafokong a a buileng, a go nale sengwe se a ka se akgelang ka kgang e ke itseng e tshwenya ba ba go bapa le matamo a ya gore, madi a tshimolodiso a one a setse a simolotse go dirisiwa? Ke tsaya gore fa re
bua ka *construction* ke fa re tlaa bo jaanong re dira yone *construction proper*. Mme ke
tsaya gore pele ga foo, go na le go rema ditlhare, ditsela le dilaena le ditiro tse dingwe.
*For instance* fa ka botsa ka Lotsane, go ne go nale *five million* Pula e e neng e dule
pеле, e le yone ya tshimolodiso, mme re ntse re itse gore bokete ja madi bo tlaa tla kwa
morago. *Thank you.*

**MR KEDIKILWE:** Madam Speaker, kgang ke gore dithulaganyo tsa *water treatment*
works, ditsela tse di yang kwa letamong, matlo a a tlaa bong a agiwa foo a a direlwang ba
ba tlaa bong ba aga letamo, tseo di tlaa dirwa pele. Go tswa foo, tse di tshwanang jaaka
bo *pipes* tse di tlaa bong di isa metsi kwa metseng tsonedii tlaa nna di tla ka go farologana
ga dingwaga. Mme tiro yotlhe e bo e felela ka 2011, fa e le gore sengwe le sengwe se tlaa
bo se siame. Madi a tshimolodiso mangwe ee, a setse a ntse a dirisiwa. Ke a leboaga.

**MR SEBETELA:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente ke re, ga ke re mme Tona o a
itse gore *projects* tse di kana, fa go beilwe gore di a go simologa leng, ba ba ikemetseng
ka nosi le bangwe ba ba neng ba akanya gore ba ka kokomolola sengwe mo go tsone ba a
ipaakanya. Ba bangwe ba ya go adima madi, mothro a re ke tle ke ye gore gone foo ke re.
Tota fa o fitlhela *dates* di ntse di bewa, go tswa foo fa batho ba sa ntse ba re ba a
ipaakanya ba re ba tle ba sele dithebe mo go gone, go bo go sutisiwa Tona o a bona gore
mme thulaganyo e tota fela ga e tsamaele Batswana sentle, bogolo jang ba ba itekatekang
mo dikgwebong.
Go ikaelelwa go dirwa jang gore seemo se, se seka sa nna se diragala jaaka *university* ya
bobedi kwa Palapye, le tse dintsintsirraetsho. Ke re mme gone o ikaelela go dira jang
gore o ye go bolelela *private sector* gone koo e amegang gore go diragetse jang?
MR KEDIKILWE: *Madam Speaker*, ke bonye go tshwanela gore e re jaanong go nale diphetogo, tse dingwe di tsalwa ke jaaka kwa Dikgathong mathata a gore re ne re tshwanetse go neneketsa kgang ya mabitla go bo go nna go salela kwa morago. Le bone bo Lotsane le Thune fa sengwe se salela kwa morago. Ke sone se ke bonyeng go le matshwanedi gore ke tle ke bolele nako e sale teng. Gore bao botlhe ba ba amegang, ba tle ba itse, ke bo ke thalose mabaka a gore, ke eng go diregile jaaka fa go ntse. Fa ke ne ke sa bona go tshwanela, gape ke itse gore go na le batho ba ba amegang, gongwe ke ka bo ke sa kopa Palamente e e tlotlegang e gore ke bolelele phatlalatsa gore go diragetse eng. Ka mantswe a mangwe ke a utlwisisa ke a thaloganya ke selo ke bolelang jaaka fa ke boletse. Ke a leboga *Madam Speaker*.

BILL


*Second Reading*

*(Resumed Debate)*

MR MOKGWATHI (LETLHAKENG EAST): Thank you Madam Speaker. Yesterday before we knocked off I was called to order for using English and Setswana interchangeably. So I have decided to use one of those alien languages this time which is Setswana.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR MOKGWATHI: Ga se dipuo tsame tsotlhe. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, re kgaoganye ke bua ka kgang ya *six per cent* ya dituelo tsa badiredi e e leng gore, mongwe le mongwe, go simolola ka yo o feelang go ya go tsena ka *permanent secretary*. 
Ke tsaya gore le fa go ka fetolwa molao wa dituelo tsa mapalamente go ya go tsena ka yo mogolo mo go rona, e tlaa bo e le six per cent.

Se ke neng ke bua ka sone ke se ngongoregela bagaetsho ke gore, kana fela jaaka Motlotlegi Rraetsho Ntuane a ne a bua ka gore, re puso e e lekang go tokafatsa seemo sa matshelo a ba ba kwa tlase, a welfare state. Re tshwanetse re itse gore matsana a a yang kwa mohumaneging, kana yo o kobo dikhutshwane, a tsisa boitumelo le botshelo jo bo botoka mo go ene. Go na le madi a a kalo, a fiwa yo o setseng a na le madi mo pateng, mo ka Sekgoa bangwe ba bua ka utilitarian function.

Mme jaanong, fa re re mongwe le mongwe yo o amogelang one thousand Pula a ba a ya go nna le P60 ka kgwedi mme yo o amogelang P10, 000 a ba a ya go tsaya P600 ga re tokafatse seemo sa ba ba kwa tlase. A re neng re akanyetsa ba ba kwa tlase bogolo jang ka gore, se re buang ka sone ga re bue ka botsadi…

MR NTUANE: Clarification.

MR MOKGWATHI: Ke a gana bagaetsho 17 minutes o mokhutshwane. Le nna o ne wa gana maabane.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR MOKGWATHI: Ehe ke Ntuane, intshwarele Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

MR NTUANE: Thank you Honourable Member and I would like to carry on your analogy from yesterday. I agree with you entirely that if you give an increment across the board of six percent. You mentioned the minister and a cleaner, and again you said the minister would be able with a six percent to buy a computer for their child and the cleaner would not be able to do so. But will you agree with me that because of the welfare state
the child of the minister and the child of that cleaner both can be able to end up at the university in England because of the welfare state?

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Dipalo di supile mo go tweng *empirical evidence*, tse di supang gore *it is children of the better off who make it into successive levels of higher education*, go na le bana ba bahumanegi. Ke raya gore a lebelele seo.

Jaanong re nale go itshwantshanya le batho ba bangwe gore, nna ko lapeng lame go ne go nale khadi, ke lebala gore mo motseng o ke tswang ko go one ke mo seemong sa itsholelo se se ntseng jang go nale bontsi jwa batho. Re nale go itebatsa ke bo ke ikala ka yo mongwe ke sa ikale ka ba ke tswang nabo mo motseng wa go nna jalo kana mo seemong sa itsholelo se se ntseng jalo.

Mme mma ke tswelele ke re ka lebaka leo re lebeletse gore bontsi jwa batho ba fa kae. Ke letse ke buile ka kgang e nngwe maabane ya gore go tshwana le madi a re reng a ya go nna seelo sa P20 000...

**DR NASHA:** Ke gore fa go buiwa ka *empirical evidence* ya bana ba bahumi ke bo ke leba fela jaana mo palamenteng mo, ke ipotsa gore gone fa tota ngwana wa mohumi ke mang? Gompieno rotlhe fela jaaka re ntse jaana re ne re tsamaya bo 10 kilometers ka dinao re ya sekoleng, mme re pasitse go fitlhela re ya go tsena ko *university*.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente ga ke bue ka bo John D. Rocker fela, ke bua ka ‘*being better off*’, ke baya sekai *relatively to the community that you live in*. Jaanong fa o tsaya gore ko o neng o tswa teng one o se ngwana yo o botoka yo o kgonang go tsena sekole bana ba bangwe ba sala ba disa dikgomo tsa lona. O tshwanetse gore o tlhaloganye gore ke bua ka eng. Bana ba teng borraabone ba disa
Monday 12 February 2007

dikgomo tsa ga rraago le wena ba tla tla go disa dikgomo tsa gago, ke bua ka batho ba mofuta oo.

Jaanong kgang e ke tsenang mo go yone Mmaetsho ke batla go gakolola sengwe mabapi le *Arable Land Development Policy (ALDEP).*

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Honourable Members, le buela ko godimo.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Mabapi le ALDEP ke e e nyenyane e ke neng ke kopa Tona ka gore e tswa mo *paragraph 53* ya didirisiwa tsa ALDEP. Ko kgaolong potso e ba nkopileng gore ke e botse ke gore fa go sena mogoma mo ALDEP go buiwa ka *cultivator, harvester* le *harrow,* mogoma one ba ya go o tsaya ka? Ke tsaya gore o tlaa e araba ka gore re lemogile mo mokwaling o gore ga gona mogoma. La reng ka mogoma fa o tla tla o e araba Tona. Jaanong fa e le gore ke *omission* ke le gakolola gore e tsenyeng, ke sengwe sa di *alternative suggestions* tse re tleng ka tsone re le *opposition."

E ke tshwanetseng ke bue ka yone bagaetsho, ke ne ke bua thata ka dikgaolo tsa rona tsa selegae gore, go nale dikgaolo tse di seegetsweng ka fa mosing, ke baya sekai mabapi le thuto. Go buiwa ka dikole tse di yang go agiwa, fa o ka ela tlhoko, di *senior secondary* di ya go agiwa ko bo Goodhope, Kasane, le Nata. Fa o ka lebelela dipalo tsotlhe, ke dirile dipalo tse di tletseng, ga e yo metse ya Setswana kana metse mo Botswana e e nang le palo ya batho ba ba ko tlase ga 2000 e e senang *junior secondary* fela fa e se mo kgaolong ya Letlhakeng Botlhaba. Sekai, palo yotlhe ya batho ba Goodhope e re itseng gore jaanong ke *headquarters,* ke mabaka a a a tleng a ntshiwe, o fitlhela e le gore e nale batho ba le 2 972 o bo o e bapisa le Letlhakeng e e nang le 9 676. Mme ko Letlhakeng ditlamelo tsa mofuta o di seyo. Metse jaaka bo Pitshane Molopo le Mabule, ba ba nang le di *Junior Secondary School* ba nale 1 600 ya batho, Moshaweng e na le bo 2 886, bo Bothhapatlou
Monday 12 February 2007

ba na le bo 2000, bo Khudumelatswe ba nale bo 3 284. Ke mo kgaolong fela ya Lethakeng Botlhaba le Lethakeng Bophirima e e ne e le ya ga rraetsho… Gatwe ke se ka ka nna re bua ka maina a ba ba seyong. Ke fositse ba tlaa mpaakanyetsa mo dipeleng tsa bone, ke yone fela kgaolo e e leng gore, a re bua ka bo Motokwe, ke mafelo a e leng gore palo gotlhe ya batho e le kalo ga ba na junior secondary. O fitlhela batho mo Kauxwi e le 859 ba ya go agelwa.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ko kae?

MR MOKGWATHI: Kauxwi ko North West ba ya go agelwa junior secondary. Dikgaolo tsa rona tsone o fitlhela di secondary di le tharo mo kgaolong yotlhe, bana ba rona ba jaka dikole ko bo Shoshong bo Artesia. Re sena bana ba ba tswang kwano ba ya kwa.

Bagaetsho dilo tse di ntseng jaana ga di a siama. O fitlhela mo lefatsheng la Botswana go sena metse e e ka kwano ya palo gotlhe ya batho ba ba fetang 400 e sena primary school, ke bua ka metse e e simologileng jaaka bo Mmanoko jaana. Bana ba rona ba kgona go tsamaya sekgele ba tswa ko bo Maratswane ba ya ko bo Malolwe, eight kilometres. Re sale re bua ka sekole gore mme le fa le sa o dire motse thomogelang bana ba ba kalo pelo ba ba sa tseneng sekole ba ba felelang ba sa ye ko sekoleng ka lebaka la bokgakala le dipula. Jaanong dikgaolo tsa rona ke tse di leng ko morago. A nne e re go buiwa ka rural development e bo e le rural development e e lebanyeng.

Re ne re solofetse gore Tona fa a ema a bua ka se a se dirileng ngwaga o o fitileng le se a tshwanetseng gore a se dire ka kabo ya madi ya 2006/2007 mabapi le paragraph 65 ya temo thuo… Fa o ntleta Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente ke ne ke re ke e nopole, e e reng, “The Agricultural infrastructural development initiative study has been
completed and recommendations are being reviewed. The objective of the study was to frame a policy to facilitate Agricultural development through the provision of requisite infrastructure such as improved roads, electricity, water and serviced land for Agricultural Development throughout the country.”

Mme re solofetse gore ka gore gatwe ditlhotlhomiso tse di dirilwe e bile go ne go santse go sekasekwa ditshwetso tse di tlaa tsewang, re ne re solofetse gore mo nakong e a bo a re bolelela gore ditshwetso di ne di reng le gore di ko kae? Jaanong o fitile ka yone ga a ise a bo a re e tlhalosetse gore e tsamaya fa kae. Sekai se sengwe ke ya thuto, paragraph 83, e le yone mmaetsho ke tlaa kopang gore o ntetlelele ke e nopole. Mmaetsho ke kopa gore ke e nopole. Go ne go buiwa ka... mma ke seka ka e nopola ke e tlhalose fela, e ne e bua mo paragraph 83 ka go lebelela sesha kana go seka-seka molao wa thuto wa 1967 e e leng gore tiro e e tlaa fela ka 2006. 2006 o fitile mme ga re tlhalosediwe gore gone go tsamaya fa kae. Ke ne ke baya dikai di le pedi fela, fa o ka bala 2006/2007 Budget Speech o tlaa fitlhela e le gore go na le dilo tse dintsi tse re ne re tshwanetse go ka bo re ne ra lekodisiwa ka tsone mme re sa lekodisiwa ka tsone.

Mma ke tsene mo dikgannyeng tse dingwe bagaetsho. Go buiwa ka go atolosa ditlhamelo le go di isa ko metseng selegae, ko dikgaolong. Tsamaiso e, mma ke beye sekai ka kgaolo e tshwana le ya Letlhakeng. Letlhakeng ke kgaolo potlana Sub-District e go ne go twe go iswa ditamelo teng. O tlaa fitlhela e le gore boikarabelo jwa mopalamente bo felela bo sa tlale. Lebaka ke gore maphata a puso go na le gore ditlamelo tsothle di isiwe kwa le bodiredi bo ye koo, o fitlhela e le gore Sub Land Board, metse e tshwana le bo Ngware le Diphuduhudu ba ka fa tlase ga Sub Land Board ya ga Motlotlegi Rraetsho Pheto. Metse e tshwana le Bothhapatlou e ko Ntsewelaletau, metse e tshwana le bo Mogonono, bo Monwane
Monday 12 February 2007

e ko Molepolole, bo Moshaweng ba ko Thamaga. Ga go tsenwa mo temothuong kgaolo ya Lethakeng Sub-District o fitlhela bo Malwelwe ba ba leng ko Lethakeng, yotlhe Lethakeng e isitswe ko Kweneng East. Mme e na le dikgomo di le 166 000 mme ga o bala Kweneng East e e balelelang le kgaolo eo e na le 94 000 ya dikgomo.

O fitlhela e le gore bodiredi jo bo ka bong bo le ko Lethakeng, batho ba ba gaufi le Lethakeng ga twee ba late ko Molepolole. Mapodisi o fitlhela e le gore dikgaolo tse dingwe jaaka bo Bothhapatlou di ka fa tlase ga Molepolole. E re ga re tshwere diphutego tsa kgotla batho ba tla ka dingongora tsa mofuta o go bo gore jaanong ke ye ko dikgaolong tse dingwe ke ye go kopa bodiredi koo. Fa gona le a District Officer mo kgaolong, go nale Assistant Council Secretary, re tsaya gore fa e le nako ya gore ba tle go re bolelela gore ba tsamaya fa kae ka dithhabololo re bo re na le botlhe ba ba amegang mo kgaolong. Ke a tle e re le fa ke ba kwaletse ke ba kopa gore ka nako ya gore ke tlaa bo ke tshwere phutego ko kgotleng ya gore. Ga ba tle ka gore a ke re ga se ba kgaolo yame.

Jaanong ga se gore go a bo go tokafaditse seemo, a e re kgaolo e tshwana le Lethakeng e na le sub-district ditlamelo tsa mofuta oo tse e leng gore go na le bodiredi teng di isiwe teng koo. Ke gone tiro ya rona e tlaa nnang botoka. Jaanong re nna mapalamente fela a e leng gore tota ga re a lebelela gore tsamaiso ya puso e dirwa jang. Maphata a rona, le gale ka gore go sale go direga bogolo jang ka ditso tsa Bakwena gore Bakgalagadi ba bo ba abiwa jaaka magopelo jaaka e le seemo sa gompieno. Mme tsamaiso e e ntseng jalo ga re e rate ka gore ga e tokafatse seemo.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ke kopa thhaloso.

MR MOKGWATHI: Ke a gana aa!
HONOURABLE MEMBER: O gana sentle ka gore ke ne ke tlile go go bolelela dilo tse di sa siamang.

MR MOKGWATHI: Mpolelele.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, e kete o a tshameka.


MADAM SPEAKER: Nnyaa ke kopa gore e seka ya ne e kete go a tshamikiwa, fa o ga na fela Standing Orders di a go letlelela gore fa o sa battle go yielda ga o yielde. Jaanong gore go bo go buiwa fela o ka re bana ba le ko sekoleng, “ke a gana,” ga ke dumelane le gone. And then gape o bo o batla go mo letlelela. So please proceed and you are left with three minutes.

MR MOKGWATHI: Ga ke mo letlelele, ga ke mo letlelele ke a gana fela jalo. Bagaetsho go nale kgang e ya matimela e e leng gore re itse gore gompieno ga go buiwa ka mephako e e phakiwang ngongora e e mo dikgaolong ke bogodu jwa leruo jo re tsayang gore bogodu jwa leruo jaanong bo apesa batho ka kobo ka letshoba. Nako nngwe jaaka go na le Budget Speech jaana, fa go buiwa ka madi a mophako re bo re itse gore batho ba ba phakisang batho dinama ba sena dikgomo le dibuchara… Mme re itse gore go nale bo bolus. Ba kgaolo ba a ngongorega bagaetsho gore go senkwe tsela e e botoka ya gore e seka ya ne e le gore mongwe le mongwe e bo e le ene a phakisang dinama. Bogodu jwa leruo bo tsentse letsatsi mo kgaolong mme bothata jwa teng ke gore o fitlhela e le gore le bo Agente le Mmakaseterata ba ba sekisang ke Makwerekwere. Fa o mmolelela ka mmala le letshwao la kgado o a bo a sa itse gore o raya eng. Magodu fa ba tsena ka kgomo kwa ga Mmakasetera ba bowa ka yone.
Monday 12 February 2007

Kgang ke gore bagaetsho go nale bolus, dikhanele di re utswela dikgomo re ntse re itse ka tlhomamo gore dikgomo di tsentswe bolus. Dikgomo fa di tsentswe bolus jaana a go baakanngwe molao wa matimela le re bolelele ka dikgomo tsa rona ka gore bolus ga e tshwane le tshipi ya kgomo e o ka fitlhelang di le pedi di le tharo e na le mong a le mongwefela. Jaanong go bile go fokoditswe nako ya gore dikgomo di nne six months go bo go tla go buiwa letsatsi le dikgomo tsa batho di rekisiwang ka lone. Goromente wa Domkraga o utswa dikgomo tsa batho. Ke feditse ke a leboga.

MR MOGAMI (TSWAPONG NORTH): Ke a leboga. I beg your pardon. I thank you Madam Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Go tshwana fela kana o bua ka Sekgowa kana eng ke a leboga le thank you go a tshwana.

MR MOGAMI: I thank you Madam Speaker. He will soon notice the difference I realise he is not able to pick it up. Madam Speaker, may I take this precious moment to congratulate the Honourable Minister for Finance and Development Planning for the budget proposals that he has put before this Honourable House. I want to say from the onset that I lend my support to these proposals.

I think you and your team, Minister, have done us proud in coming up with a budget that we cannot say there could have been something better on the table. I cannot think of anything that would have been better than what we have and in that regard, I want to congratulate you and your team. It represents many of what we would like to see happen in the last two years of our National Development Plan 9 (NDP 9). Last two years of our Plan 9 because we know what packages are already in the Plan, we know the content regarding those last two, and as we read this budget we read it using what we already
know as a yardstick. Given that we are using what we already know, what is already in the Plan as a yardstick we find, or at least I find that it contains much of what we set out to do before the completion of NDP 9 and therefore, to that extent I congratulate you, Sir. However, I want to use your Paragraph 10 of your speech as a launching pad for my remarks. The paragraph briefs us broadly on the content of the budget proposals as Honourable De Graaff said yesterday. It contains a lot, which if realised would have extremely developmental beneficial achievements for us, it certainly would create lots of jobs, it certainly would come up with lots of business opportunities and to that extent really we are hoping that you might be successful in implementing this package. The P2 billion for four large dams the Minister responsible for those dams has just given us the impression that there is a slow down somewhere. The P702 million for the University expansion- UB (University of Botswana) here, the P570 million Medical School facility, the P500 million Teaching Hospital, the P5.3 billion University of Science and Technology, the P544 million rural electrification out of which 100 villages would benefit. Four of those are incidentally in my own constituency. The P265 million rural telephony programme; this package really for this coming year represents a huge challenge to the Government, and it is in the area of challenge that I want to speak about. As I said, I am using your Paragraph 10 as a launching pad for my remarks and I will be speaking in general terms, quoting randomly to illustrate the concerns. It is the concerns today that I want to speak about and these concerns I must say Madam Speaker, would revolve around the issue of implementation. They would revolve around the issue of implementation because as we are left with two years, anytime anybody wants to analyse the budget the operative question that one has to address is of necessity; will we manage
this load? What are the impediments as I say at that Paragraph you started yourself Minister by mentioning very briefly three. The first one you mentioned was the issue of land and I want to talk about land and I must say those projects that have been in the plan for quite sometime where land issues have already been resolved, almost likely not to create a problem.

However, there are instances where land is going to be a big problem because some aspects of the budget would require that land be allocated and it is those areas that worry me. If for instance you talk about Young Farmers' Fund, that Young Farmers' Fund requires that the land authorities be ready to deal with the issues of land and I know there will be constraints there and it is a matter where I think we ought to put our heads together. I will use the Palapye Land Board as an example. Early this year when I was making an inquiry I found out that between January and June of this year the Land Board would simply be dealing with Palapye issues alone - Palapye requests alone and nothing else in the entire area where the Land Board is responsible. Obviously, this leaves out all of the villages that are part of that Land Board system.

Now, if they can spend six months attending only one major centre to the exclusion of the others you can see what the effect of the slow down because in the other villages as well there will be requests. There will be attempts to want to exploit Government's schemes, people would be standing up, even as I was coming to Parliament people were saying look we know we are ready, but is the Government ready for us? And this is the issue that I am raising that yes, Minister you have identified that issue, it is indeed a serious problem that is going to nullify some of the programmes that are contained in this speech. Because if it takes six months for a Land Board authority to begin to come to address
your concerns it means you will spend the whole year waiting for the Land Board to come to your service. Of course, it means you are also not taking advantage of funds available for that particular year. Therefore, there is a problem there; we are in the same Government, Ministries in the same Government, Ministers in the same Cabinet singing the same song but the tunes tend to go differently and I think that there is an area here where harmonisation can be beneficial.

There is of course the issue of - it is a new issue, this Environment Impact Assessment (EIA) animal. It is a worrisome issue, it is a good thing to do, it is a good thing to achieve but it is a problem because first by its very nature it requires high skilled technical input, which we do not have, in abundance. Therefore, what is the point in creating a condition when you know you cannot fulfil that condition? I think that sometimes we tend to rush to implement certain fashionable things without realising that they are setting a trap for us. Therefore, I am glad that you are indicating your willingness to want to relax in some areas so that this impact is not a problem but in the case of the Lerala Information Office for instance, that issue was a problem for many years. Currently, the implementation of that project is three years behind largely because of design and its characteristics feasibility proper design and then after that you then go into this animal called EIA, which slows down everything.

I wish we could approach EIA in a manner that is highly sophisticated. In other words, recognise our strength and make it respond to our strength rather than us be stuck with a monster that we have created and then keep on complaining about the fact that it is slowing us down in implementation. However, as you say you want to see how you can relax things in that one but the worst form…
MR MOKAILA: Point of elucidation. Let me thank the Honourable Member for yielding, I will be brief to save his time. The issue of EIAs has been resolved Honourable Members. I think what needs to be explained is that all the projects that were conceptualised before the law came into effect had the problem but what we took a decision as Cabinet and as a Minister responsible to wave most of the EIAs, especially where development has already been done. Therefore, I do not believe that EIAs would become a problem from here and henceforth. Thank you.

MR MOGAMI: Thank you for that assurance, Minister. We will certainly be following progress of implementation with that in mind. As you know, you Ministers have said we should work very closely with you and at the time we were completing Mid Term Review, you said that as Members of Parliament we should work very closely with you. Therefore, we will be monitoring the degree to which indeed it is hampering us or not hampering us. One of the things though that I will request is for you Ministers as well to appeal to your officials to be open minded and accept our inquiries openly and not be afraid of giving us information as and when we want it. Sometimes we struggle to get very simple information simply because where a project is not proceeding they do not want to tell you the truth. In this particular case, I might say I have had confirmation from the Director of DBES (Department of Building and Engineering Services), whatever we call that, to say that okay, all those bothersome stages have now been passed and the Lerala Information Office will proceed and hopefully, construction can now begin.

However, maybe one last bit that is very bad about implementation, is the issue of how we implement things. Because sometimes it is not so much that there is no implementation, sometimes we do actually implement, the net result of such
implementation where it has been successful being implementation that is bad implementation. In other words, projects completed but completed in a state that renders them completely unacceptable. I will quote an illustration; several years ago the then Minister of Works went about his job organising a celebration for the Dikabea/Kgagodi road and of course his officials, Department of Roads and others were in the District there trying to mobilise people to get involved in this kind of celebration. Of course, the communities along which the highway was passing totally rejected that and refused and said there was no way they were going to celebrate something that is not what they thought it should have been. Of course, the celebrations collapsed. Now, I am leading to the point that really where implementation has succeeded but it has simply made things worse, that is another form of implementation gone awry. Now that kind of implementation is bad implementation. In a sense it negates the very sense, first it is waste of Government resources. The reason I was quoting that example was to lead on to the access roads in Tswapong also using them as example. Access roads that have been built soon after that particular road, that most of these access roads are in a state where they are completely unacceptable, one in particular will simply have to be redone in exactly the same way as this highway has had to be redone. Now these are matters, which you would have thought Government would be on top because they revolve around supervision; they revolve around the ability of the department to supervise people who have been given a contract in any particular area. Now, where are the department, of course goes to sleep. Then of course the companies would simply chaw the money and disappear and in many of these cases they have finished, they have been demobilised -
they have gone and Government will simply have to redo some of these things all over again.

In some instances, the culverts have been washed away or are washing away even as we talk. When ever little rain comes you fear that some roads are going to be closed now I am saying these are examples of problems of implementation that are worrying us even as we appreciate the content of your budget proposals, which as I say we are very happy to support.

One last matter, which I want to draw attention to, is the issue of variation of projects and Honourable Kgathi yesterday talked about this; Issue of variation of projects. I am talking about situations where a project is known, it commenced, implementation is going ahead, and money runs out, we go back to the budget and we provide more funds. That additional funding that has been provided somebody decides somewhere without reference to Parliament to take that money and use it for something else because people are putting him under pressure somewhere else. You have not talked to him but by the time you discover you find you are going to go back again for another year to the same Parliament, still saying unfortunately that money was used for something else, can you put up more money? Now, Tswapong telephones have suffered a great deal from this. I am glad that recently the current Minister put her foot down in insisting that this time around she was going to complete this project and it has been completed and I think I should give her a pat on the back and say well done. However, it is something that worries us Members of Parliament because when these variations are done without reference to the House, we are unable to intercede. We are unable to plead but it is
obvious that other elements; unseen elements, unknown and undetected elements are the ones that are pleady, and of course, agreements are struck etcetera.

Now, if you want to change, then come back so that we are all in the game, we are in the ball and we can go back to our respective districts and tell them that by the way, there has been a change. The money that was made available has now gone somewhere else; you will not be getting it. Now these are problems that I was quoting at random, but the final one is the empowerment issue.

Yesterday Honourable Masalila in response to Honourable Kgathi said, look, I understand what you are saying, Honourable Kgathi, I also agree with you. But part of the problem is that, because government is trying to empower in the sense of empowerment, certain things during the course of empowerment do not go right. In other words, performance is not what we would like. Now, I want to say that really to dole out money on the basis that it is empowerment exercises. When we are not able to supervise people who are learning, because if it is empowerment we appreciate that some companies may very well be new, they may be learning and therefore that is where supervision ought to be very stringent.

That is another element that I want to raise that we have these big projects coming. Ministers are going to come with their sectoral chapters, with smaller projects that are equally very important. Now, if we are going to take these projects and just give them away on the basis that it is empowerment and therefore it is okay, and departments just sit back and relax, by NDP 10 we will be redoing the same projects and really this we should avoid. Somebody was asking for clarification.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, no, Honourable Member, you did not yield at that time, so proceed. You did not even say anything.
MR MOGAMI: Now, I have left the area of problems that exercise our minds about these budget proposals, which we support.

Let me just talk briefly about government schemes that are intended to benefit people in general. Paragraph 37 talks about the Young Farmers Fund and Paragraph 53 talks about ALDEP, SLOCA and other related ones. I talk about these paragraphs because I know that they too, it is the intention for them to be implemented. The problem there is one of whether government is ready to meet the many applications that will arise. In other words, do we have staff in place to deal with these things? If you take ALDEP for instance, you cannot implement it without the physical presence of individuals. It is not like saying, give me a loan so that I can buy cattle and take them to the cattle post. ALDEP means measuring masimo, counting the fences, counting the poles, waking up every morning going around with farmers and seeing what they are doing. This means a very strong extension team.

At the moment, in many of our constituencies, extension service has collapsed, even what we call the Village Extension Teams (VET), really we struggle. Occasionally as representatives in the areas we convene meetings, we try to encourage them to keep busy, not to collapse, but we know that there is this general collapse. I am not even talking about NAMPAADD; I am simply talking about ALDEP. I am saying it requires the Ministry of Agriculture to be physically present in almost all our communities at all times. Now, if come 1st April that presence is not felt, it will be a year before anybody can stand up and say, yes, I have actually benefited from ALDEP. That means the programmes that have been put forward are actually not filtering through. So, with regards to these programmes, that is my concern.
As for the youth, they are crying. They are saying, what about land? When are we going to get land? Where are the Land Board Members etc? But I have already mentioned that one. They are saying, we are here, we are ready, we know that a lot of what you are saying we are not going to be able to get. I am talking about the bottlenecks, constraints and a good budget but a budget that has a myriad of constraints ahead of it.

This one last issue is that, I notice that at Local Government there is what they call Department of Local Government Technical Services. I welcome that. It is a good initiative in the sense that implementation problems there arise from the fact that there is very little by way of inspection of projects. It is as if contractors, once they have won tenders, in many instances projects get completed, houses and classrooms remain locked for over a year or two. When you ask simple questions you find people are fighting over the keys. No one knows what happened to the keys. There are many instances like that. You can count them by counting the number of your villages. Literally at every village there is a problem of that nature. We are hoping, Minister responsible, maybe this technical outfit gives you an opportunity now to deal with that bottleneck.

Madam Speaker, I am happy to rest my case here. Thank you very much.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mma ke go leboge motho wa gaetsho, gore o a bo o mphile sebaka sa gore ke eme fa ke dirise sebaka se go ema nokeng kgang e ya ga Tona wa Madi le Dithabololo tsa lefatshe leno.

Mme dikgangnyana tsame di mmalwa di ka nna lesome, mme fela ke batla go simolola ka gore ke ko ke akgele mo kgannyae e e ntseng e buiwa e, ya gore tota fela o kare re le puso re ka bo re tle re tseye budget e, re ye go bitsa ba kganetso, re bitse boreaitse ba tle go e
laola ba tshele bola, re bitse bomang fela, jalo jalo ba tle go e leba. Re a utlwa, ka e bile
go buiwa gore go dirwa jalo mo SADC mo. Tota fela dilo tse dingwe, bakaulengwe, re
tshwanetse gore re seka ra ne re tabogela fashion ka gore fashion fa o e bona e ntse jaana,
e na le mathata a matona. Bangwe ba kile ba nna le di-fashion, mokaulengwe Rre
Modubule o a itse. Ba kile ba nna le di-fashion teng mo SADC mo, tse re neng ra nna ra
di lebelela fela ra bona gore tse di-fashion tsa bone di tlaa fela, tsa bo-one party state, bo-
President for life. Dilo tse tsotlhe re ne re ntse re di bona fela re ntse re re, rona re na le
tsela e re tsamaisang ka yone.

Nna toda fa gongwe ke a tle ke eletse gore o kare kganetso e ka bo e ema fela gore e re ba
sena go tsaya setilo ba bo ba dira dilo re di bona jaaka bone ba re di tshwanetse gore di
dirwe, ba lese go re kgopakgopetsa. Ka gore, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente,
batho ba bangwe ba go buiwang ka bone, bone ba gotweng re ba lebe ba, ke gore o ka
ipotsa gore a ba na le budget. Fela fa re ba leba gore a ba na le budget e re ka buang ka ga
yone, bone ba. Do they have a budget to talk about? Mosong ono ke ne ke reeditse
wireless gotwe mongwe a re o ya go kgethisa batho gore a tle a tshware one point
something million Pula a bo a celebrata birthday ya gagwe. Ke tsone dilo tse re
tshwanetseng go di kopa tsone tseo. Ba mo kolekele gore a ye go dira birthday party.
Kana dilo ga di buiwe Bakwena, mme ga re kake ra nna ra bua ka batho ba e leng gore fa
o nna fa fatshe fela sentle o akanya gore, is there something we can learn. A go nale
sengwe se re ka se ithutang mo bathong ba, o tlaa akanya bosigo jotlhe, letsatsi le
phirime, le lengwe le bo le tle go tswa. Rre Mogwe gatwe e kile ya re nako nngwe a le
Minister of Foreign Affairs a raya mongwe a re, kana go tshwana fela le e re o sena
lewatle o bo o nna le navy o bo o reka dikepe, o bo o ipotsa gore o ya go di tsamaisa kae
when you do not have a sea. Le a bona gore ke raya jang? Ke raya gore dilo tse re nne re nna careful fa re bua ka tsone. Selo se se tona se e leng gore gongwe bakaulengwe ba ka bo ba re phenalaesa ka sone ke gore, give us the information, economic report, ga re na bo-Mid Term Review, ga re na se ga re na se. Re neeleng dibuka tse di ka re supegetsang. Mme ke na le bosupi gore tota fela fa o ya kwa Ministry of Finance and Development Planning o feta o raya Rre Serwalo Tumelo o re, ke kopa status sa economy o tlaa go thusa.

Banka ya Botswana e re bitsa ngwaga le ngwaga gore e ye go re kaela gore seemo sa madi se ntse jang, e bo e bitse le Mapalamente. Every year Mapalamente ba ya kwa, ba bo ba fete ba je lunch teng, ba sena go neelwa the whole spectrum ya gore re solofela gore seemo sa madi se tlaa bo se ntse jang. Ao, Bakwena ba ga Mokgalo-o-Thebe, a gone moo re batla gore re re go nale sengwe se re sa se itseng? I think there is a lot of information. Actually fa e le gore go nale goromente fela yo o tshwanang le mmantshe, ga se gantsi a ikgabetsa, dilo tsotlhe di mo pontsheng. Ke sone re le fa re le transparent, ke ene goromente o wa rona o. Jaanong a re nneng re bua boammaaruri, bagaetsho. Nna ke batla gore re tshwantshanye le ba re tshwanang nabo. Re seka ra tshwantshiwa fela go nna go tsewa mmanki gotwe SADC, nnyaa!

Jaanong, ke batla go boka Rre Gaolathe fela fa publicly, motshegare go se bosigo. Gore go gantsi re ntse re tla mo Palamenteng e, re mo raya re re, Rre Gaolathe le ministry wa gago, please a le ko le lebeng tsela e re budgetang ka yone gore a e sa ntse e le mosola mo go rona mo dingwageng tse re tshelang mo go tsone. Ke mongwe wa batho ba ba buileng jalo gore a re ko re yokotseng theipi e tshibidu e, ke yone e re ketefaletsang gore re diragatse mananeo a dipuso. Mme Rre Gaolathe, ke a go paka, rra. Modimo o go okeletse
malatsi, o gole o bo o tlhogole. Gompieno jaana o ntshitse ga tshwene. Fa e le gore re le diministiri tota re tlaa palelwa gompieno, e tlaa bo e le gore re paletswe. *Element* ya ntlha e a e ntshitseng ke yone ya *P10 million*, gore gompieno fa khansele e tswa kwa e kwadile *project memorandum*, ya *P9 million* kana sengwe sa mofuta oo, ke kgona gore gone foo fela ke bo ke betsa ka setempe, di boela kwa ba ya go implementa. Ke yone kgang e re sa bolong go e dia, ka gore go nna fela go fetela ka kwa *Finance* gore ba ye go approva re bo re fetela ka kwa, go ne go re jela sebaka, mokaulengwe Rre Mabiletsa. Golo mo go tlaa re thusa. Nna e bile ke setse ke boleletse dikhansele gore le direng botsipa, *project* fa e le kgokgonono e le kana, le bone gore le ka e riana, la e dira ka di-stage gore ma *P10 million* a re tle re fetise, re tseye dikoneraka re agele Batswana ditiro tse ba di thokang. *I think this is a very good move in the right direction.*

**MR MABILETSA:** *On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker.* Le fa Tona o bua gore o gakolotse dikhansele gore ba putlaputle, a mme o a lemoga gore ga go ka fa molaong. Jaaka e le gore gantsi fa badirelapuso e le fa go kopiwang di-quotatition teng, ba dira sone se o se dirang, ba supiwa ka monwana gore ke bone bofahalele ba go tila go tendara. E re fa o tshwaela jalo, o eta o gakologelwa seemo se ka gore, *Madam Speaker*…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Honourable Minister,* ga o kake wa ema a sa ntse a eme.

**MR MABILETSA:** Ga ke ise ke fetse. *Therefore, Honourable Minister,* ke ne ke re o lemoge gore gongwe o ba advisitse selo se se *illegal*.

**DR NASHA:** *This is perfectly in order and is legal and I am going to deal with my councils.* Re dumalane re tsere ditshwetso. Rona re a tsamaya. *The caravan is going to move* ko *Local Government* ka gore kgatleho ya rona e mo go reng dilo tse gotwileng re ye go di dira, re di dire. *It is legal to do things in phases. What is illegal about that?*
Bagaetsho, rona re ya go tswelela pele. Re dumalane fa gore re ye go lebaleba *PPADB Act* rona re le ba *Local Government* gore re fokotse *corruption*. Jaaka Tona a e buile jaana, golo moo ke a go leboga, Mokwena.

*One of the best things that he has put forward which we are already starting* rona ko *Local Government* ke gore *pre-contract procedures* di dirwe, E dumalanwe jalo *last year*. Ke batla go bolela fa pele ga Palamente e gore babereki ba me ko Dikhanseleng ba ne ba etsaetsega ka gore e ne e le selo se ba sa se tlwaelang gore a e ka re maduo a seyo fa, o bo o dira *pre-contract procedures*. Jaanong gompieno ba bonye gore ntseana golo fa go ne go tlhwaafetswe, *so* fa re bua jaana di-PM di a goroga ko lehateng lame, rona *caravan* e tlile go tsamaya. Re lebogela selo se sa gore re tla...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** (Inaudible)

**DR NASHA:** Ke gore wena fa re re bua dilo tse di go siametseng wa re a lo ntshitse madi a dikonteraka. Ga ke itse gore a reng tota. *This is flexibility*, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke a hakgamala gore fa re bua gore dilo di ya go re thusa go *implement* motho o a lela, ka gore go raya gore lekwati le a ntseng a itshwareletse ka lone le ya go manologa a bo a wela kwa ka sekota a bo a idibala, selo sa go ka tlhoka dingaka.

Ke leboga gore e rile re kopa puso gore re kopa lephata le le tlaa itebaganyang le *implementation last year*, puso ya re dumelela. Gompieno *unlike other ministries* ba gongwe ba yang go nna le *units*, rona re nale *department*. *A whole department* mme e bile re filwe P39 *million* wa gore e re re sa ntse re lwa le mogopolo wa gore re batla *staffing of the department* tema e bo e tsweletse pele ka gore *we can always outsource*. Gore e bo e le gore re ka tsaya bomaitsaanape ba ba itseng *for the coming financial year*, ba bapole matlho ba tsamaye le lefatshe le lotlhe re ba duela *and make sure* gore dilo di a diragala.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ke boleletse dikhansele tsa me gore gompieno fa go begiwa *projects*, ga ke batle go utlwa gotwe 60 *per cent* ke batla go itse gore a *foundation* e dirilwe, a lebota le fa kae, *window level, roofing and painting*, bo 60 *per cent* ba ke botsotsi. Re batla go itse gore a go pegilwe disenke fa godimo ga ntlo kana jang. Jalo maikaelelo a rona lona Matona a puso, ke a le kopa gore, *let us go and implement* re swabise saatane, ngwana wa etsho, bose bo ye pele. Jaanong fa o bona ba lela jaana ba sa ntse ba tlaa ngauga fa nako e ntse e tsamaya. Ke ne ke re ke go leboge, Rra ka tsela e e ntseng jalo.

Mme fa re tsena mo kgannyeng ya *poverty* bagaetsho, ke batla go le bolelela gore le Baebele e e boitshepho e buile ya re bahumanegi ba tlaa tswelela ba ntse ba le teng, mo bukeng ya ga Moreri, Ecclesiastics. Ya rialo ya re bahumanegi ba tlaa tswelela ba ntse ba le teng go sa kgathalesege gore go busa Ponto Pilatwe, kana go busa Herote kana go busa Botswana National Front (BNF) kana Botswana Congress Party (BCP). Ba tlaa nna ba le teng, se se tona fela ke gore le dira eng go ba tokafaletsatsa matshelo. Ga twe se ba kgbeng, se ba sotleng, ba thuseng, fa mokaulengwe wa ga eno a letse ka tlaa mo tsholele setampa, se tshele mo dustbineng. Mme mananeo a teng fa one a mantsintsi a re tlholang re bua ka one a batlhoki le bana ba masiela; le eng le eng. *I am so happy* gore nmake fale o letse a papamaditse kgang gore ga re kope dipheko mo go ope, re bua fela gore ga go na sebe sepe. Ke raya nmake Mopalamente Motlotlegi Ntuan a bua gore *welfare state is not a sin*, re dirile. Jaanong ke a leboga fela gore maikaelelo a rona ke gore re tlaa tswelela re dira jalo. *You see, there is no point* gore nako le nako fa o ema ka dinao o bo o boka lehumana. Go na le batho ba e leng gore ba na le maboko a lehumana. Ee ba a a boka Rra mahuma a, mme fa o ka mmotsa fela gore o dira eng wena ka ga lone lehumana le go thusa mong ka wena, dipone di tsesa mo setlhareng a re ene ga a buse. Nna gongwe fa e ka bo e se gore
fela ke tshaba gore re tlaa nna ma refugee, ke ka bo ke le neelela fela gore letsatsi lengwe le buse. Jaanong ke tshaba gore gongwe gone fa dineelelo tse fa Modimo o ka di utlwa, re ka tloga ra nna le mathata a re sa ka keng ra tlhola re a kgona, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente go intsha mo go one.

I am very happy, ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, gore re tsamaya golo gongwe ka ga diteemane, le go di thatswa le go di baakanya. Mme le fa re ntse re tsweletse jaana, go ntse go buiwa fela gore fa e ka bo e le gore. Kana ke tlhola ke bolelela batho gore go kile ga buiwa ka tsela e e yang Kgalagadi go twee le tlaa aga leng tsela, mme e rile fa re sena go e aga ga bo go twee, le ka bo le e agile maabane. Fa o tshwere mogoma o lema yo mongwe ene a le ka fa tlase ga setlhare sa mosu a ntse a boka monang jaana, ga go ka ke ga ba ga fela golo moo. It is so easy to do that go na le gore o bo o dira. Mongwe o kile a bua fa a ntshotla ka ga go pholecha diteemane go twee ke rile ga di ka ke tsa pholichiwa mo Botswana, ke ntse ke itse gore go na le difeme tse di pholechang fa. Se ke neng ke se bua and ke sa ntse ke se bua le gompieno, ke tlaa se bua go fitlhelela Jesu a tla, gore business ya diteemane is about competition. There is no doubt about that, re lebaganeye le mafatshe. Maloba ke ne ke utlwa mongwe fa a bua gore ko Israel go itaya go reng, di tswetse difeme koo comrade, ka gore Israel e ne e pholecha diteemane, e itlhophetse gore ba tlaa dira big stone polishing. Di tswetswe; ke mongwe wa ba ba kileng ba ya koo go ya go bona difeme tseo. Di tswetswe e le gore jaanong ba fetola madirelo ba dira di sele because they were not making money. The reason being that labour costs in Israel are not cheap. Jaanong fa o ya ko India kwa motho o tlhola a betla diteemane di le thano a duelwa $2 ka letsatsi, fact. Jaanong rona mo re na le melao ya gore o tshwanetse go duela motho selekanyo se se kana e seng go le kana, yes. Ke ne ka
raya Rre Nchindo a sa ntse a le fale, gompieno ke a go raya wena Tona wa Minerals, Energy and Water Resources, gore one day o tseye Mapalamente fa, ba tsamaye ba ye go bona diamond polishing gore e bereka jang mo mafatsheng a mangwe. E ne ya re Rre Dingake a re tsoseditse modumo gone fa, ra mo tsaya ra mo isa gone kwa. Mme fa a sale a tswa koo a bo a didimala tuu, a didimalela ruri, le gompieno o ntse o didimetse fela ka gore o ne a bona ka matlho gore golo mo ke mathata shololoviya. Jaanong fa go itikilwe gompieno go tsamaya fa go tsamayang teng jaana, I think re berekile, there is no doubt about that one.

Bagaetsho, mma ke bue ka ga dilo tse ke ntseng ke di bua tsa gore re tlaa simolola go itirela dilo ko maphateng a rona. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke batla gore ke ko ke bale sentence e e mo go Paragraph 62 ya ga Motlotlegi Gaolathe, ke tle ke e drawe to his attention ga mmogo le Tona Mme Mma Motsumi fale. Ya re, “The Department of Building and Engineering Services (DBES) of the Ministry of Works and Transport will provide guidelines and co-ordination of these units.” Ke tshwana le Kulenyane ke a belaela, ke a ngongorega. Ke a bo ke belaela gore fa o utlwa go twe lephata le tlaa re go sena go dumalanwa go bo go a go dirwa guidelines go bo go dirwa le co-ordinations, boriki bo ka nna ba tsena gone foo. Boriki bo ka tsena gone foo fa re sa ithhokomele, Tona Mme Mma Motsumi. Thokomelang borikiriki jo, bo seka ba bo ba nna teng; ntsanyana borikiriki bo seka ba nna teng mma. Ngwaga o o tlang re tlaa tla fa re tla go itlhola makowa gore a DBES ga a a apolaya boriki. Ke a le kopa le le Matona a maphata a a amegang fa gore le eme ka dinao go bona gore, boriki bo seka ba bo ba tsena mo teng ga kgang e, comrade. Mme ka gore fa o bona a ntibile jaana ke a itse gore o reeditse, mokaulengwe Motlotlegi Mma Motsumi, golo moo go seka ga diragala.
Monday 12 February 2007

Jaanong mabapi le HIV/AIDS, Mmaetsho Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke batla gore ke leboge. Fa o bala *Paragraph* ya bo 75 e e buang ka HIV/AIDS e bo e re lekodisa gore banana ba dira jang mo kgannyeng e, nako e nngwe go tshawanetse gore fa batho ba dira sentle re ba opele legofi. Re ba itumelele gore dingwaga tse tsotlhe fa re sale re ntse re bua ka ga AIDS, kgang e ntse e le gore banana AIDS, mme kgang ke e gompieno. E a bua fela gore banana ke bone ba ba di gogang ko pele mo go itlhatlhobeleng mogare. Fa e le rona dikgomo tse ditona nnyaa, re beile fela mo Modimong. Jaanong bana ke ba ba aitlhatlhoba, ke sengwe. Ga twe ba a itlhatlhoba e bile ditshupo tsa bone tsa re, *“The preliminary 2006 Sentinel Surveillance shows that HIV prevalence decreased to 32.4 in 2006 per cent, again the highest reduction being among the youth.”* O a e bona kgang? *My feeling is* fa re ka ba boka ra ba rotloetsa, re tlaa bo re ba neela mooko wa gore ba dire le go feta foo. Selo se se nkamang fela ke gore banna ga ba itlhatlhobele mogare wa HIV/AIDS Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Jaanong ke rialo ke re, a ko banana ba iketleetse, basadi ba a itlhatlhoba.

Ke batla go lebogela kgang ya bomme ko Sesoleng, le yone ke batla go e digela ka temana. Temana Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, e e mo speecheng sa ga Tona, e bua gore go tla a lekwa maiteko a gore go dirwe matlo. Nnyaa, bomme ga ba ise ba ko ba re ba tlaa tsena mo sesoleng fa go na le matlo. Re rile a ba tsene mo ditanteng fela jaaka ba bangwe ebile ba ba ipaakanyeditse go tsena mo ditanteng. Selo se, se seka sa ba sa dirisiwa e le letshwagole le ka lone e tlaa bong e le gore go ipatilwe gore ba re. Mme ke bua nao Rra, le fa o ntibile jaana ke sa itse gore o lebile kae, ka rialo ka re yang le tseye bomme mo sesoleng go seka ga ba ga itshwarelelwa ka eng.
Ke leboga ko bofelong mokaulengwe gore gompieno 6 per cent o o yang go tsenngwa yo e bo e le gore Tona o buile mo teng ga speech sa gagwe gore yone o ya go tsena bo VDC bomma-health, botlhe fela. Kana we have come a long way, guys, gentlemen, ladies, Honourables. Pele e ne e re fa go sena go nna go dirwa budget go bo go twe 6 per cent jaana, go bo go twe rona ba Local Government re ye go tla jaanong ka dikopo tse disha; ra nna ra bua. Puso ya Domkraga e e molemolemo e, e re utlwile, gompieno re ya go duela batlhoki re sa tla go senya nako re sa ntse re dira dipalo. Golo mo re tshwanetse re go lebogele mma. Ke a go leboga, Mmaetsho, le ka moso.

MR MOUMAKWA (KGALAGADI NORTH): Thank you Honourable Speaker, for giving me the opportunity to talk about the Appropriation Bill 2007/2008.

PROCEDINGS SUSPENDED FOR APPROXIMATELY 25 MINUTES

MR MOUMAKWA: Thank you Honourable Speaker. The Bill as presented before us Madam Speaker is an annual exercise to allocate the national cake in between the competing demands. But what one may hasten to say is that the allocation seems to have favoured the sectors which we normally call for money to them which is Education, Health and Local Government. But it appears sometimes we take that the allocation of funds is an end on its self, we do not look at the quality gore after giving Education P5.5 billion for instance; how much should we expect of the education sector, and how much should we expect of the Health Sector? Do we still have to get queues, do we still have situation in schools where there is definitely no governance?

The other issue relating to the budget which I think the Minister really has omitted is, he has not linked the issue of crime and corruption to this budget. But we are saying the economy is growing and Botswana is doing well but we are ignoring that Botswana is fast
catching up with crime and corruption. One will suggest that may be it is about time we do an audit, the economic cost of crime in this country. How many shops in Botswana do now close at 5 p.m because the owner would not want to be found by criminals at 8 o’clock while still in the shop? Look at the taxi industry for instance in Gaborone. The taxi industry in a city like Gaborone is supposed to make life during the night. There has to be life in a city during the night, but because taxi drivers cannot cruise around in the night, there is definitely a stand still when night falls because people have to go home. All these things have an impact in the GDP, they have an impact in the growth of the economy. We have to be seeing people actively economically or otherwise involved irrespective of time.

We should even look at the strategy. What are we saying about the police? What is the police strategy to try to curb crime? We still have to follow the systematic way that if you have a police station in Semolale it is going to have 25 officers, if you have police station in Ramotswa we cannot even differentiate that. If you look along the borders specially Semolale, Ramokgwebana area we are supposed to have more police, we are supposed to have more equipment to augment the police situation.

With regard to corruption the Minister is still not zeroing in and saying what are we doing about corruption. Because the Minister has a statement from transparency international which is still ranking Botswana as a least corrupt country.

I do not think we should be hanging on that because even if Botswana is the least corrupt country, the Minister and everybody here in this House knows Botswana is a corrupt country. So, probably it is still least because may be Africa, to pardon me, is a rotten
continent to be part of. But in Botswana we are catching up with corrupt practices and we have to be doing something tangible to try to curb those corrupt practices.

The next issue I want to go into is privatisation. The paper as presented by the Minister is showing a clear fast tracking of the privatisation exercise. Honourable Speaker, we have to acknowledge in this House that financial literacy in Botswana is very low. Economic literacy in this country is very low, Batswana still do not comprehend what privatisation is. We would want Batswana to have a stake in the privatisation exercise. Now, if you go ahead and privatise Batswana properties and they are unaware that we are literally handing over their property to somebody else, is it right for the populace? I think we should go out as a government and educate Batswana on these issues. I have listened to kgotla meetings held by Members of Parliament, they would rather talk about Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP) on all those vote-winning exercises, and they would not mention anything like privatisation. But Batswana should have a stake, they should understand. What we are doing Honourable Speaker, we are simply giving away the country and the owners of that country do not know what is happening.

Paragraph 29 concerns Botswana Vaccine Institute (BVI) where the government has approved involvement of a private sector to upgrade and expand the vaccine plan. This is part of privatisation or a partnership between a government department and a private sector but people did not know, it is just like an ELTEL kind of arrangement where BVI goes out negotiate with a partner, brings them in and the owners of that institute do not know what is happening in that sector.

Botswana Defence Force Budget. Madam Speaker, Botswana Defence Force is a department like any other department. I still do have a problem with the situation
whereby we always have to approve a single figure. Why can we not as Parliament, as a nation get the whole breakdown of the BDF budget? Because that will give Parliament an opportunity to be able to play its role of oversight. If we give BDF for instance P100 million for infrastructure, we should be able to look in the next year to say did you use the P100 million in the infrastructure? As we speak today, we always approve a single figure to the BDF. We do not know how much of this P488 million is for recurrent budget, how much will be going to improving the infrastructure, and military equipment?

There has been argument in this House before, that no, we cannot give you a breakdown because BDF is a sensitive area. This is our military and what is interesting is that if you go into the international literature. It is easy for you to know about the BDF from the international literature whilst here internally even the institute which approves the money to BDF is told no, we cannot give you more information on how the BDF is going to use money.

I would not suppose it would be for Parliament to prescribe to BDF which military equipment to acquire and which not to acquire. But all I say is let us get a clear breakdown of how money will be used by the Botswana Defence Force so that the oversight role will have to be exercised by Parliament.

The Youth Fund, when His Excellency first came up with this youth fund, I asked a question then *gore* why agricultural sector alone? I am still struggling to understand the objective of this youth fund.

I do appreciate it is going to have one or two or a number of youth who have interest in agriculture. I am struggling to understand the objective because one would may be wonder whether it is the intention or the objective to try to resuscitate agricultural sector?
Monday 12 February 2007

If so, why use the youth, why not open for any other person who would be interested in agriculture? Is the intention to empower youth? If the intention is to empower youth, why then confine to one sector? Why stifle youth creativity? Because I believe across sectors engineering, medicine, building or whatever we have youth who do want to do something and who would require capital like any youth who would be given money to go and acquire a field to plough.

Another issue which the Minister would have to clarify may be the Minister responsible for Agriculture is whether this is for agricultural trained youth because when His Excellency presented the issue he was very clear in his speech gore graduates of the Agricultural Institute. The guidelines of the youth fund are also clear on that. I have tried to discuss with the officer responsible at Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) he said no, that is not the case, any youth will be entitled.

Two weeks ago I saw the CEO of CEDA he was again on television. He was saying the very same thing that any youth would be entitled. But let us reconcile this, gore is it any youth who is interested who can benefit from this fund or as the guidelines and His Excellency did say in Parliament it would be youth with agricultural qualifications? This has to be clarified for the nation to know.

The other issue is the youth grants. Youth grants I do have a problem related to my …

MR SEBETELA: Ke kopa tlhaloso. Ke ne ke re ke botse Mokaulengwe gore nna kana ditlhaloso, the guidelines I have seen that have been sent to my office do not specify qualification as in Botswana College of Agriculture, University or anything like that. Ga twe just some qualification, and it appears to me that this includes Rural Training Centres that we have. If for example bee keeping, if you can go through the levels of the bee
keeping programme or piggery it appears you qualify. So, I do not know what your own take is at least this is what the understanding is.

**MR MOUMAKWA:** Just to come back to you Honourable Sebetela. This is the CEDA Young Farmers Fund. Paragraph 1.4 page 1 reads thus; “It is again this background that His Excellency the President in the State of the Nation in November 2005 announced the need to create a fund under CEDA to provide agricultural loans to graduates (Degree, Diploma and Certificate holders from Agricultural Training Institute and thus further improve efforts to tackle youth unemployment”. This is why we are saying, let us be clear. Is this open to any other youth or it is specifically for youth from Agricultural Institutes?

Coupon based system is something I have a lot of reservation with it. As I understand the coupon based system the Honourable Minister of Local Government has presented before this Parliament saying, because of the rampant corruption at the councils, where one council will be continually winning the tenders, we are going to introduce the coupon based system where a destitute would be given a coupon upon which they can go to any shop of their choice and get the food basket.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** The food basket or money?

**MR MOUMAKWA:** The food basket or money.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** No, the food basket.

**MR MOUMAKWA:** The food basket. Just do not derail me Honourable Sebetela. The problem I have with the coupon based system is that some of us come from very remote areas. I for instance in my constituency I have seven settlements, of these seven settlements non of them has a shop, there is no transport system **gore** if we are going to
Monday 12 February 2007

give an old lady or old woman or destitute a coupon in Nxai for instance, how are they going to end up in Hukuntsi to get their meals?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: O re eteletse pele too much.

MR MOUMAKWA: This is why I am saying this because I need to understand. I need to understand some of these things, I need you your protection Honourable Speaker. It is not only about that, it is even about the cash flow. As we know it now, the government is known to be a very bad payer, if I am a small shop owner in a small village and I have queue of destitutes for which I give all my stock to and then I have to rush to revenue to convert these coupons to cash so that I can go restock my shop, will I be able to get my cash in time to restock my shop? These are the issues we really ought to understand with the coupon system.

Paragraph 46 Madam Speaker is about bilateral investment treaties which has been signed, it is about the free trade agreement which had been signed. The problem with these agreements and protocols Madam Speaker is that, this is the information Parliament is getting now. This is the information one would presume we are supposed to go and tell our constituents and we were never part of it. Parliament has no ownership of these agreements. Parliament does not even have an insight.

When you talk about the SACU European Free Trade Area Agreement, there has never been a report of any kind to Members of Parliament to bring them on board that this is what we are doing and this is what will be the implication. If you do not involve Members of Parliament, if Parliament is not part of them, then really are we not giving so much to the government to run instead of these things going through Parliament for Batswana to appreciate what is happening?
I will now talk about youth grants. Madam Speaker, the youth grants are becoming a problem in our constituencies. We have had so many youth being turned down because the Public Health Department from the Ministry of Local Government requires that all businesses have to be done in commercial areas or industrial areas. Some of our areas are not even planning areas. If a young person comes and says I want to do a salon in my mother’s spare bedroom or something like that or say I want to do laundry in a spare house in our yard. They are being turned down because they have to do that business in an industrial area.

Madam Speaker, this is defeating the whole idea of trying to empower the youth. We have contradictory regulations, we are trying to go forward but somebody is pulling the whole process of going forward backwards. Even if we try to speak with the Minister responsible or the Permanent Secretary (PS) to assist, you cannot get help. So, at the end of the day, the Minister, the PS or the Member of Parliament cannot help. So, the whole exercise is not helping the youth.

We still have a problem Madam Speaker, in some of the areas, of the banking facilities. We have two banks in the whole of Kgalagadi including Gantsi. One bank is in Gantsi and the other one is in Tsabong. The Hukuntsi Sub-District with a reasonable number of the workforce, including Government employees, has no banking facility. The distance between Hukuntsi and Gantsi is about 400 km; between Hukuntsi and Tsabong is over 500 km; and between Hukuntsi and Jwaneng where there is another bank is 350 km. All this is impacting on productivity in the area because for people to get money, they have to go to Jwaneng, Gantsi or Tsabong. For people to go on a trip, they still have to first go to Tsabong or Jwaneng to get money for the trip. This thing has an impact on productivity in
the area. We do have a problem in the settlements where every Friday before month-end a council truck has to go and fetch all the teachers and bring them to Hukuntsi so that on Saturday they can proceed to the banks. At the end of the year when we do calculate the presence of the teachers in class, we are guaranteed that every Friday before month-end the teachers are not at school. As I said before in this House, some of them never even come back on Monday’s they come back on Tuesdays and Wednesdays for a variety of reasons. This Madam Speaker, is really affecting the level of productivity in the area.

With regard to the issue of interest rates, we are struggling with unemployment as well as investment in the area, but the Minister is not really telling us why the cost of money is still so high in this country. Are we really saying we are going to depend on Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) if locally we cannot control the interest rates to allow Batswana to borrow money? The cost of borrowing money in Botswana is hocking people who would otherwise go out there, borrow money and establish small businesses, which could help this country, but we are not addressing this. There is still a disparity, which cannot be explained by the Honourable Minister between inflation and the borrowing rates. These are some of the things the Minister should be able to explain to us. Does he really see that the fact that Bank of Botswana is not helping with the interest rates or the cost of money in this country is affecting the business sector? It is going through to unemployment rates and poverty which the government says, it is trying to fight.

**MR MOATLHO DI: **Point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you Madam Speaker, thank you my brother and friend Honourable Moumakwa. Concerning the question about the interest rate, is the Honourable Member aware that banks do thrive on generating or charging interest? If the Honourable Member is aware, what does he think should be
done? Do you expect us to give money for free? If you do not want us to give it for free, what type of rate do you think we should charge to the public? Bear in mind behind your medulla oblongata, that the banks thrive on interest. I thank you.

MR MOUMAKWA: Thank you Honourable Speaker. Honourable Moatlhodi, we are talking about the prime rate here. The prime rate is controlled by the Bank of Botswana. It does not matter, which ever bank can set its borrowing rate thereafter, but we are more concerned about the prime rate because it determines the rate that Standard Bank can get money at Bank of Botswana or anywhere else. That is what is more of my concern. Thereafter if Barclays Bank is going to charge you P45,000 and you choose to go and borrow money at that rate if you could borrow at 16 per cent somewhere else, that is not the issue here. So, now what Barclays lends is on profit. What I am saying now is that, let us do something about the prime Honourable Minister.

I take it that, Honourable Speaker, that was about all the points I wanted to say on this Budget Speech. I thank you.

MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR. J. NKATE): Madam Speaker, thank you very much for the opportunity to contribute to the budget presentation for this year. Let me commence by joining those of my friends who have congratulated the Honourable Minister and his team of technocrats and officials of the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, for the sterling work they continue to do at the ministry in terms of preparation of a well understood, cohesive, bold and ambitious budget for the country, but more importantly for the prudent resource husbandry. The resources of the country are in good hands under the leadership of the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning under the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP). The rates of growth that are reported here
Monday 12 February 2007

are not occurring just because of good fortune or because of diamonds. Sometimes I hear some of my friends posit a position that we are just lucky to have diamonds. I would like to remind them that there are many countries all over the world, and for that matter even here in Southern Africa or in the Africa region that have had and even have, as we speak, more resources than Botswana can lay claim to that are not doing half as well as we are doing. It is because of the management of these resources that we have come as far as we have come.

There are many figures we can quote, for instance, we are managing to bring inflation down under control, currently it is sitting at 8.6 per cent; real growth of the economy is at 15.2 per cent. Those areas where we have not shown growth over the last three or so years, we are now beginning to realise growth. So, it is very clear that we are in control of the situation. If we were to decide which direction to take, we would say to Honourable Minister Gaolathe and the team that, that is the direction that you have set us on, we are very happy with that direction.

Of course, we do have challenges Madam Speaker, diversification of the economy continues to be one of our greater challenges. It is a great challenge because through diversification, we would reduce our over-dependence on the diamond output and the revenue there from, which is always a risk to be overly dependent on one basket. Through diversification we would also increase employment, which employment would reduce in turn poverty. These are the two major challenges of our time, poverty and unemployment, plus of course, HIV/AIDS. Therefore, we must never relent in our desire to pursue diversification. It is for that reason that the likes of Botswana Export Development and Investment Authority (BEDIA) and any other scheme, be it a government or a private
sector scheme that is in existence currently, that encourages private businessmen to come into Botswana and open businesses must be encouraged.

Sometimes when we say this, our friends from the other side of the House are quick to suggest that we are obsessed with Foreign Direct Investment, we are not. In fact, I would say that we are more obsessed with local investors. That is why we have price preferences when it comes to tendering for local companies, that is why we have directives to the effect that local parastatals, local authorities, government departments must procure their goods as much as possible from local producers. That is, to encourage investment and business in Botswana in order to create those jobs, in order to reduce and ultimately to do away with the rates of poverty that we are having to contend with at the moment. The evidence is there for everyone to see. You could talk about CEDA or the Venture Capital Fund. CEDA currently has disbursed well over P750 million to citizens and citizen companies to open businesses in Botswana. If we were as obsessed as our detractors want everybody to believe with FDI, we would not be putting out some amount in the region of P1 billion to be drawn from by local businessmen. Let us not forget that CEDA is solely for locals. I do not even mean just locals coming from anywhere and everywhere, I am talking about locals coming from Botswana, I am talking about citizens of Botswana.

You have also indicated, Honourable Minister, that over the last ten years, employment has outstripped the numbers of people being turned into the employment market. In other words, the job opportunities being created by the economy have outstripped in terms of the numbers of people we are putting out into the job market. That is commendable. In fact, in the last year we have had employment growth in the rate of 4.7 per cent. These things people do not say because they do not make the negative case that people want to
make about our country. Our friends on the other side of the House would rather
concentrate on the negative.

I was listening to one of the private radio stations just two days ago, on my way to work
in the morning and I was astounded to hear the radio presenter declare boldly that
unemployment is sitting at 30 per cent in this country. In fact, you say in your speech that
unemployment has been brought down from 21.5 per cent to 17.6 per cent currently.
Now, either you have other evidence to challenge those figures or you cannot just stand
up and just open your mouth and say unemployment is sitting at 30 per cent. I know that
people would say but how do we know those statistics are correct. How come you believe
those same statistics when they are negative against the government? When
unemployment was sitting at 21.5 per cent, you people were regurgitating that fact as if it
was the only fact available under the sun. You were saying it everyday because it seemed
rather alarming. Now that it has come down, I am yet to hear a single one of our
detractors say, now unemployment has come down from 21.5 per cent to 17.6 per cent,
but this is a fact, it has happened. That really is the sort of projections that we have, the
overview that we have of the economy. It is an economy that is performing well under
good management, it shows all the signs that are positive and it is going in the right
direction, even as we admit that we have the challenges such as diversification, poverty as
well as levels of unemployment. I am not saying that I am proud of 17.6 per cent, but I
would rather have 17.6 per cent than 21.5 per cent. So, I am happy that we have reduced
the numbers. I am not saying we have done enough, there is still a lot to be done and the
opportunities are there for us to go further and reduce these rates of unemployment.
If Honourable Swartz for instance was to get the approval of his colleagues, Ministers of Agriculture or our neighbours in the region for us to draw some water from the Zambezi and the Chobe for the Zambezi project, it would benefit us a lot. We were hoping to have huge agricultural output, where for the first time we would have food self-sufficiency in this country. We will also have beneficiation in terms of adding value to some of the produce from the Zambezi agricultural project. We would go far and the rate of unemployment would come down. That is assuming of course, that our people would agree to go and work on agricultural projects. That is another problem because right now we have had, with your approval, to open up for people from countries in the region to come and work in the agricultural sector in this country. There are many of them. I know many of my friends who have employed people from neighbouring countries on their farms. Right now we are under pressure from citizens of this country to extend this to house workers. Under pressure, fact! *Ga ba ka ke ba nkgama ba itumela fa ke le bolelela gore bone ba reng.* Sorry Madam Speaker, *ke bue ka Setswana ba tle ba ntlhaloganye. Ke raya yone sentence e fela. Bone ba re ka gore Batswana ba tilhopha ditiro tse di leng teng gompieno kwa tlase in the market ladder ke sone se re dumetseng gore batswakwa ba tle go dira mo lekalaneng la temo-thuo,* fact! In fact, Honourable Swartz is reminding me quietly here, that if you read the Daily News everyday you will see adverts of people who are asking for agricultural workers. It is also a fact! *ga go na ope yo o ka nkgamang.* It is also a fact that people in this country are asking for the government to open so that even in that area of domestic workers we can have foreigners to come and work in our economy. That is also a fact. However, I am not saying that we have done everything that we ought to do, but I am saying that we have opportunities abound in front of us. I just
gave an example of the Zambezi project, I could also give you another example, the DTC that Honourable Gaolathe has asked for…

MR REATILE: Point of clarification. Ke a leboga Motlotlegi. Ke kopa go botsa Motlotlegi gore kana kgang e e leng teng fa ke gore ba ba tswang ka kwa ntle ba ka tswa ba le teng ba kopiwa gore ba tle go bereka mo agriculture Batswana ba le teng ba e leng gore gongwe ga ba tsene moo. Motlotlegi Nkate a kile a ba hira ba tshelela mo pogong ba ba ba itlhoboga ba bona gore go na le gore ke boge gotwe ke hirilwe go botoka ke ya go nna fa fatshe ke bolawa ke tlala. Jaanong tsone dipharologanyo tse re tshwanetse re itse gore fa re tsaya Ma-Zimbabwe kwa re tla go ba dira maids le badisa, re ba sotla, ba tshwantshanya tshotlego e e leng kwa gae le e e kwano, ga go reye gore ba a bo ba bonye tiro.

MR NKATE: If your argument were to be believed you are suggesting that it is better for someone to be unemployed out in the village than to be employed. You are suggesting that we are kinder employers on the farm to Zimbabweans, Zambians to other people from the region who come and work on the farm. In fact, you are suggesting Honourable Member, that our people do not need to go out on the farm and strive and work hard because it is backbreaking work and they do not need that. I would say that go to any country in this world you will have people who do hard labour for a living. It is not that I am suggesting that people should work hard and break their backs. The fact of the matter is that you will not have a country anywhere in the world where there are no people working on the farm, where there are no people working on the construction site. This is the mentality we need to change. You are telling us everyday that we have spoilt Batswana. We have created a culture of handouts, of entitlement in this country. You are
blaming us. We are saying that maybe it is time we started speaking about these things openly and factually so that we can deal with this culture once and for all. I shall not be yielding to Honourable Reatile, Madam Speaker. However, just to give you an example, on today’s Daily News there are seven adverts for farm workers. Therefore, the point that I am making is, if the Zambezi project comes on stream will we have Batswana willing to go and work there? If we have for instance the energy project at Mmamabula will Batswana be willing to go and work there? That is another opportunity that is coming up and it is a multi-billion Pula opportunity. The mines beneficiation is right here, down the road. The question is; will we have Batswana ready, willing, and prepared to go and work there? The dams that… Please stop disturbing me, I said I am not yielding. This is not fair. I am not yielding.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: …inaudible…

MADAM SPEAKER: Ignore him Honourable Minister and proceed if you are not yielding.

MR NKATE: The dams that we are now constructing; do we have Batswana prepared to go and work there? The fact of the matter is that, the economy is churning out jobs. Let us not argue about whether the jobs are well paying or not, but there are jobs out there and we want Batswana to go and take advantage and work and sustain themselves.

Earlier on, I was talking about this idea of us being obsessed with investment from outside and we are happy to welcome people from other nations, cultures and economies to come and work in Botswana. I have given the example of Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) and how much it has expended or paid out to have Batswana in business. I am sure it is one of the reasons why over the last so many years,
job opportunities have outstripped the numbers of people that their economy is putting out seeking jobs. That must be the reason, it cannot be an accident and now we know Botswana Export Development and Investment Authority (BEDIA) is continuing to go around the world seeking investment. Now we know, and according to Minister Swartz, we are going to have new schemes and old schemes revamp such as Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP). The other one is, Services to Livestock Owners in Communal Areas (SLOCA), the borehole scheme. They are now going to be targeted in favour of the poverty stricken and this will include the unemployed that we are talking about. The Youth scheme, a lot of unemployment is amongst the youth. So, they should come in and take advantage of the scheme and come out of unemployment. I therefore see an economy that is going in the right direction, Madam Speaker.

I return to the second theme in my presentation that there are challenges. I see that in terms of rural development we are giving a little bit more impetus to it. I have always stood up here to complain about the lack of tangible projects in the rural areas. All these projects that I have spoken about, the mines at Tati, the Morupule expansion, the dams, the Mmamabula energy project, the agricultural projects are going to be out in the rural areas. It is just a question of making sure that they make an impact in the rural areas. However, more importantly government is finally saying in terms of rural telephony and I have heard Honourable Tsogwane speak about this just the other day. Now we are having hundreds of villages. We are going to have telephones for the first time under the Nteletsa II project including in my own constituency; areas such as Bodibeng, Habu, Tubu and Xangwa.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …inaudible…
MR NKATE: Yes, they are in Botswana. Indeed, these include areas such as Kareng Honourable Member. We are also seeing that there is going to be rural electrification. This is something I must commend some of my friends for including those from the opposition. When the loan approval came to the House, we were all united in one voice that these projects must be undertaken, if there are any problems let those problems be investigated and sorted out while the projects are ongoing. I commend Honourable Members for that attitude. However, I also commend the government for going out and seeking out this finance so that we can open up our rural areas for the first time to become production centres. If you are going to be serious about agriculture you would need electricity, infrastructure and a telephone to be able to communicate with your market. You want to be able to know exactly what is happening out there; can you produce come in a truck, will it be readily received into the market. These are very important developments, indeed.

If you take my constituency as an example, one of the greatest challenges that we have in Ngami are roads. I know that there are areas where they are still crying for water, school, or a clinic. But if you ask me for one single area of need in my constituency it would have to be roads. We still have 120 kilometres where you need four hours to travel those 120 kilometres. That is between Nokaneng and Kangwa. We still have 38 kilometres between Mphathane and Kareng where you need one hour thirty minutes just to get there. These are the challenges that remain. Therefore, I am not just here to paint a rose coloured picture of a Botswana that has no challenges, there are still challenges. However as I say, I am happy to see that now at least in the area of telephones, rural electrification and hopefully the next one that will be hitting seriously hard is roads. I know why we have a
problem with roads because there is a department that is called Rural Roads and then there is something called the Local Council Roads department in the Council and then we have the real roads department, which is the National Roads department. Amongst the three of them, things are falling in the cracks. Right now, we have a road from Dobe for instance, which is the border with Namibia coming into Ngamiland. The Council says no, we cannot do that road because it is an international road, it should be a national road. I seem to understand that. Then I wrote to my dear friend, Honourable Motsumi, and she wrote me back, no, that is a council road it has not been gazetted to be taken over by Central Government. So, you begin to think that there is a problem here maybe between the various authorities there is a problem as to who does what and so forth. Therefore, I am challenging this Government to give roads in this country the attention they deserve. People cannot open production centres whether they be farms or industries in places where communication is wanting. Some people go to some of these areas just to take one look, then they turn and run because they realise that if they took the trip twice, thrice they would need to go and replace their vehicle. They realise that kind of thing will not enable them to do business. Therefore, in order to open up these places even more let us look at roads as well as telephones and electricity.

Honourable Mokgwathi spoke briefly this afternoon about service centres, specifically sub-district centres. We are now going to open Moshupa and Tonota. I would like to see us looking at the country a bit more and see if we can improve access to service for the people in the rural areas. Let me give you an example. If you take Shakawe, right now the only sub-district there is called Okavango but it is in Gumare. Gumare is in my constituency some 300 kilometres from Maun. Now, if you look at Okavango going all
the way to Shakawe and Seronga you expect those people to get their services from Gumare. If you look at the people in the areas around Bodibeng, Kareng, Bothatogo, Sehitwa, Tsau, Makakung and so forth, you say that the only place they can get those services from a sub-district is in Maun. Why not open one in Sehitwa? I know people will look at the start up funds and say it is too much maybe it is P50 million to build up the infrastructure and so forth. However, over the years all that cost you cut off people travelling, claiming petrol, vehicles breaking down, going back and forth. Of course, at the end of the day do not forget it is the convenience of the public that you should prioritise.

MADAM SPEAKER: You are left with three minutes.

MR NKATE: I beg your pardon, Madam. Thirty minutes?

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: laughter!

MR NKATE: Okay then Madam Speaker, let me speak finally in those three minutes about maintenance of assets. This is another failing of the Government. We build schools, roads, clinics and then we let them decay to the point where when you finally get someone to even look at one of them all you can do is start all over again. It is like building a new thing and I think this is an area that we must pay attention to. Let me give you an example, I keep giving these examples from my constituency, I know we are not talking about constituencies but I must talk about what I know best.

There is a road going off the Maun/Mohembo road, a road going into the village in Tsau and a road going into the village in Etsha. These roads were allowed to break up, to fall apart to the extent where people were now preferring to drive on the side of the road than on the road. One day Honourable Modubule and the BNF went to hold a rally in Tsau.
They came back from there in stitches, laughing at me like am the biggest joke, asking me how can you call yourself a minister and you can allow this thing to happen right under your nose. I honestly had no answer because I could not understand how we can allow these assets that we procure at such tremendous expense to the nation, to fall apart right there in front of our own eyes.

What traffic do you have coming into Tsau Honourable Speaker, very little. So for that road to fall apart like that means we have left it unattended for 15 maybe 20 years. All I am saying is not just speaking about this particular one, it is that assets are very important to maintain. You cannot just go around boasting that you are coming with new assets, which is important too because other people need new assets, but maintain the ones that you have got. Madam Speaker, thank you very much.

MR MASIMOLOLE (MOGODITSHANE): Ke a go leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke lebogela gore o bo o mphile sebaka se gore ke tle ke latlhele di le pedi di le tharo dintlha mabapi le kgaoganyo ya madi a setshaba. Mma ke simolole fela jaaka bakaungwwe bame ke re gongwe o ntlelelele fela ke bue ka chomi go le gonyenyane ke akgole Tona ke re, the Minister deserves a pat on the back for putting forward a Budget that will give the economy further impetus.

Ke batla go ema gone foo ke bo ke re, Tona, wena le lekoko la gago le dirile tiro e e molemo thata go dira kgaoganyo madi ya bosetshaba ya 2007/2008. Banna ba kile ba lela o ka re podi e sogotliwa ka thipa fa, ba bokolela fa go bodiwa gore e kae alternative budget ya lona ba re go kile ga dirwa kae. Karabo e nnyennyane, a re tshwanetse go dira dilo fela ka gore di kile tsa dirwa golo gongwe? Kana se re se buang ka kwano ke gore batho ba bolele gore fa e ne e le bone ba ne ba tlaa dira eng. Mme go a pala gore banna ba
tlhalose gore fa e ne e le bone ba ka dira jang. Ba a ne ba re bolelela dikai tsa ko mafatsheng a ba kileng ba nna ba a bolela bo Uganda, bo Kenya, bo kae. Mme e le gore ba tlhopa mafatshe a e leng gore ba tsaya gore ga re tshwane ka ditsamaiso, ga re tshwane le bone ka sepe, mme ba batla gore re ye go kopa dilo tse di dirwang koo. A bone ba simolole se re reng re a se batla e tle e re ka moso go twe jaaka ko Botswana go dirwa jaana, opposition e ya re e ema e fe se e leng gore fa e ne e le bone ba ne ba ka se dira.

Mongwe o kile maabane a kgala a bolela gore le fa e le ko Tsholetsa Budget e ga e tswe teng, le fa e le Botona kana Mapalamente ga go na le fa e le ope yo o nang le capacity ya go dira budget. Bagaetsho, budget e dirwa ke di-economists. Mme le lona yo ne e nne moeteledipele wa kganetso a ema a bua maloba fa a bua fa, le ne le e kopanetse, re itse gore e ne e kopanetswe ke bo mang ba kwala sone speech se a neng a re se balelela fa. Ke sone se re reng re boleleng gore fa le na le tsone dilo tse e leng gore di teng fa pele ga lona jaana lona le ka dira jang, le ka kgaoganya jang, la abela setshaba ka tsela e e ntseng jang. E seng gore nako le nako le tle go kgala dilo le sa re supegetse gore lona la re le ka dira mo go botoka mo go ntseng jang, go tswang fa le bo le bua gore re a boka fela ka kwano. Ee, kana ke budget ya rona re tshwanetse gore re boke ba ga rona ba re tsayang gore ba dirile tiro e e mosola e e molemo e e tshwanetseng gore e nne teng.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ... (Inaudible) ...

MR MASIMOLOLE: Kana ga twe o a bo o jele liquid lunch fa o bona o riana. Jaanong dilo tse di tshwanang le tse, ke ka le fa sekai ka South Africa, ba na le se e leng gore ke sa bone ba le bosí se ba a tleng ba se bitse ba re Trevor’s tips, gore batho ba letse ba bua gore ba akanya gore budget e tshwanetse gore e tle e ntse jang. Le lona le tshwanetse le bue gore le akanya gore budget e tshwanetse gore e tle e ntseng jang, e seka ya nna le tips
tsa setshaba fela. Le lona le le ba kganetso le nne le an input into the budget, le bolelele gore lona le ne le akanya gore go ka bo go ne ga tweng. E seng bo budget ga e a ntsholela sepe ke le motha yo e leng gore o tswana ke kgaalong e e rileng.

Se sengwe se re tshwanetseng go se amogela ka matsogo a mabedi re se itumelele, Tona wa Madi, ke gore o bo o bolela gore rate ya unemployment e wetse ko go 17.6 per cent. E ko godimo, mme selo se se supa gore go na le kgatelo pele, selo se ke tokafalo mo seemong se se ntseng se le teng mo lefatsheng la rona. Re ntse re lela re re ditiro ga diyo, mme fa e le gore seemo sa botlhoka tiro se fokotsegile ka percentage e e kana go a supagala gore go na le kgatelo pele. Mme re nna re kopa gore a go nne go lekwe methale gore percentage e, e re next time o tla fa o bo o re bolelela gore jaanong e fokotsegile gongwe ke ten per cent ka gore lhoka-ditiro yone e tlaa nna e nna teng yone.

Ke batla go bua ka kgang ya privatisation. Bagaetsho, re ntse re tle re bue ka kgang e ya privatisation kampo itholo-ditiro e e leng gore puso ka lobaka le le leele le tsaya gore e ntse e tsamaya ka borepe kampo e le very cautious ka kgang ya privatisation. Selo se ke selo se e leng gore, yes, goromente o tsaya gore o tshwanetse gore a nne cautious ka privatisation, mme ba business bone ba impatient, borakgwebo bone ba impatient ka gore bone ba batla gore ba tseny madi ba tseye ditiro tse e leng gore goromente o tlaa bo a di ithola godimo, gore ba bone gore gongwe selo se se tshwanetseng gore se tswelele se ka tswelela ka tsela e e ntseng jang. Bo Botswana Telecommunication Corporation (BTC) bo Air Botswana le tse dingwe fela jalo, re tshwanetse re ele tlhoko gore kana fa bo Air Botswana di ntse di nna le mathata a di nnang le one jaana, re tshwanetse re demoge gore le gone ka tsela mngwe go tlaa koafatsa yone itholo-ditiro e. Ka gore motha gompieno fa a
akanya fela go tsamaya ka sefofane sa Air Botswana, a akanya disorokisi tse di ntseng di
diragala mo malatsing a a sa tswang go feta ... 

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Tse di tshwanang le eng?

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** Tse di tshwanang le mo o a ne o utlwa go twe mongwe a re o se
thopile kampo se punchile se le mo phefong. Dilo tseo di a re bolaya kana re le lefatshe.
Re tshwanetse gore re ele dilo tseo tlhoko sentle gore re bone gore go seka ga nna le dilo
tse di ntseng jaana.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke batla go ya ko kgannyeng ya *housing*.
Kgang e ya *housing* re tshwanetswe ke gore re e ele tlhoko thata. Kana fa o tla go tsaya go
tlhoka diito mo toropong e tshwana le ya Gaborone, e e leng gore re tsaya gore gongwe
re ka fitlhela batho ba tlhoka matlo gongwe *about five thousands units*, batho ga ba sa
tlhola ba le mo mo seemong sa gore ba batle di *two and half*. Re tshwanetse gore re
akanye methale mengwe e e leng gore batho ba tshwanetse gore ba nne le bonno jo bo
kgatlhisang, jo e leng gore e tlaa re jaaka fa ba ka ba ntse jaana ba itse gore ba nna mo
bonnong jo bo eletsegang, e seka ya nna fela gore motho a re o kare ke ka ya go bona *two
and half*…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! Order! Honourable Masalila, please come back.
Honourable Masimolole please resume your seat we do not have a quorum.

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ne ke santse ke bua ka
letlhoko la boroko. Selo se se tshwenyang thata ka gore fa o ya ko Botswana Building
Society kgotsa ko dibankeng tse dingwe, o ya go fitlhela morokotso o e leng gore fa
motho a re o batla go adima madi gore a ye go aga ntlo kana o a itshenkele fa a ka nnang
teng le ba lelwapa la gagwe. Morokotso o a o lopiwang o fitlhela o le ko godimo mo e
leng gore morago ga ngwaga tse di masome a mabedi motho yo o duela madi a a ka bong
a agile mantlo a le mane ampo a le matlhano. *Interest* ya bone e tswa mo go 15 to 16 *per cent* mme fa o ya go e leba morago ga ngwaga tse di masome mabedi o fitlhela e le gore o
jelwe madi a e leng gore o ka bo o ne wa dira sengwe ka one. Tona, golo fa go tsennyeng
leitlho le bone gore Batswana ba ka thusiwa ka tsela e e ntseng jang gore ba nne le fa ba
ka nnang teng go na le gore go nne jaaka mo nakong ya gompieno. Batho jaanong ba
berekela mo go bo *two and half*, mo e leng gore *two and half* tota ga se boroko jo re ka
tsayang gore motho o tshwanetswe ke go tshelela mo go jone.

Ke lebogela kgang e Tona a neng a e bua mo *paragraph 59* ya motlakase ko dikgaolong.
Ga re bolo go bua ka lebaka le le leele re re kana motlakase mo nakong ya gompieno ga e
sa tlhole e le selo se se tshwanetseng go bonelwa mo go bo semangmang, mme ke selo sa
botlhokwa mo mongweng le mongwe. Mme e re le ntsha madi a a kanakana a a
tshwanetseng go ya go gokela motlakase ko dikgaolong, le go pataganya le madi a go
neng gotwe a adimiwa ko mafatsheng mangwe maloba jaana, a a tsileng go thusa go
gokela motlakase mo dikgaolong tsa magae. Re a leboga gore selo seo e bo e le gore
goromente o ntse o se lebile gore batho e re ka moso ba bo ba na le motlakase.

Nna ko kgaolong ya gaetsho ya Mogoditshane re eme thata re emetse motlakase o. Mo
nakong e e fitileng re kopile gore a batho ba gokelelelwe motlakase wa dikarata ka gore o o
ntseng o le teng o *di-bill* tsa one o tlaa fitlhela motho a neelwa *bill* e e leng gore ga a itse
gore motlakase wa teng ke wa leng? Mme fa a o laola o kgona go ya go ithekela di-*units* a
itse gore o tlaa bo a tsenya *units* tse di kana ka eng tsa motlakase mo ntlong ya gagwe.
Bana ba gagwe ba kgona gore ba dirise motlakase ba seka ba o tswela pelo ba o bonela
mo go ba bangwe. Ke sengwe se re se lebogelang fela thata.
Madi a a ntsheditsweng HIV a 800 *million* re a lebogela, Tona. Selo se se supa gore goromente o kgatlhegela go bona botsogo jwa batho ba lefatshe leno bo nna botoka.

Ke ya ko kgannyeng e e amang *Local Government*, ya dilo tse gantsi di dirwang, tse Tona a neng a remelese mo go yone e le konokono ya go tlhoka go dira ditiro, e setlhogo sa kabo ya madi ya mono ngwaga e remeletseng mo go yone, gore go dira ditiro ka tlhomama gore go ntshiwe madi go nne le *implementation* ya *projects*, e seng jaaka fa e le gore mo nakong e e fitileng go ntshiwa madi, mme fa go sena go ntshiwa madi golo gongwe dilo di a kgobelegalana di ema golo go le gongwe fela. Kana golo ka fa Kweneng ka fa ga ke itse gore a rona re loilwe kampo go rileng. O ya ko Kweneng fa gotwe *Land Board* ke mathata, o ya ko Kweneng fa gotwe bogosi ke mathata, o ya ko Kweneng fa go twee dikhanele ke mathata. Ke gore ga go na sepe se se tsamayang ko Kweneng, mo e leng gore re tla re belaela gore batho ba teng golo gongwe...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Mapalamente one?

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** Ga ke itse, Mapalamente a teng mme o ka re ba botoka mo go ba Ghanzi, o ka re ba botoka...

**MR MOATLHODI:** On a point of order, Madam Speaker. We appear Madam, regretfully to be out of quorum again.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Rre Maoto,* please always check gore a re *lekanetse pele ga o tswela ko ntle,* he has just come in so *ke tsaya gore re siame,* how many are we now?

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** …ke ntse ke bua ka di *projects* tse e leng gore golo gongwe Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo, di ntshediiwa madi mme ga di dirwe. Ke lebile thata ka kwa kgaolong ya gaetsho ya Kweneng. Gompieno jaana go sa le go nna le kokelwana ya P10 *million* e e neng e le gore e tshwanetse e ka bo e agilwe mo ngwageng o o fetileng. Go
agilwe matlo fela kokelwana go rile tsii, ga gona sepe se se diragalog. A e re fa madi a a ntse a ntshiwa jaana, ke dumalana le ba ba reng, go lekwe gore ka tsela nngwe go tlhomio we matlho thata gore a tsone projects fa gotwe dia dirwa jaana kana di ntshedivi madi a di a diragadiwa? Ke a bo ke simolola go belaela gore a yone tsela e gotweng e tlaa dirwa go tswa mo Molapo, ya di lane tse six e ema mo Mogoditshane. E bo e re e tswa fa Mogoditshane e nna lane tse six go ya go ema kwa Metsimothabe, a e a bo e tlaa dirwa ka nako ya teng tota? Ke bona Tona ya teng le Tonanyana ya gagwe ba seba-seba gongwe e a bo go sa ye go diragala.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR MASIMOLOLE: Mme a re ba tla e phimola fa ke ntse ke bua thata, ga ba ka ke ba bo ba e phimola, e ya go dirwa tsela eo.

Jaanong Senior Secondary School le yone ke batla go itse gore e ya go agiwa leng? Kana gompieno go nna gotwe go tshwantshiwa ga di-plan go tsaya bo six months, mo gongwe go bo gotwe go tsaya four months fa tendering e tsaya dikgwedi tse pedi. Se sengwe se tsaya lebaka le, ke gore o fetsa ngwaga otlhe e le gore go dirwa dilo tse e leng gore o ipotsa gore gatwe kago yone e bo e le gore e ya go simololwa leng. E bo e le gore re ya go felela e le gore jaaka mongwe a kile a bua…

MS MOTSUMI: Ke kopa go thalosa, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo. Ke a leboga mokaulengwe, ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo. Ke ne ke re mokaulengwe a itse gore gongwe le gongwe kwa go agiwang teng go tshwanetse go baakanngwa, mme a tlhaloganye gore di project tse tsa ga goromente, tsone tse di tona-tona tse a buang ka tsone, tsa madi a mantsintsí indeed go tsaya lebaka. Go ka nna ga ba ga tshwaragwaga ka gore go tshwanetse go ye go thatlhojwa lefelo, go tshwanetse go ye go dirwa dipolane,
go tshwanetse go ye go batliwa ba ba tla agang. Ke dilo tse di tsayang ngwaga jaanong a seka a tlhoboga.

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** Mme ke lebogela tlhaloso ya ga Tona mme se ke se buang, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente ka re, a lebaka le la ngwaga le ngotliwe ka gore o ka re go tsaya nako e telele. Ngwaga o mo leele thata. Fa re ntse re kopana le di-engineer tsa gagwe ba nkaela di drawing le eng jaana, re tswa pelo. Re batla gore e re ka *June* ampo *July* re bo re bona di *caterpillar* di tsene mo tseleng, re bona batho ba tlhomile dimapo ba aga sekolo. Ga re batle gore e re re solofetsa gore ka *April* kana *June* tiro e ya diragala go bo gotwe go sa ntse go eme golo gongwe go a tendariwa ka gore go tendara mo nna ga ke itse gore ke eng go tsaya lebaka le le leele mo go kana.

Ke batla go tlolela kwa kgannyeng ya Sepodisi, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Fa gotweng mapodisi ba filwe madi fa ke a ngongoregela. Ke bona e le madi a mannyennyane thata Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Kgaolo e ke e emetseng ya Mogoditshane, *police station* ya teng e thusa dikgaolo di le tharo tsa botlhophi, mme mapodisi a teng a tsena mo seatleng. Ga ba na boroko selo sa ntlha; ga ba na didirisiwa jaaka dikoloi mme kgaolo ya Mogoditshane ke kgaolo e e leng gore bontsi ja dirukutlhi tse di tswang mo Gaborone di tshabela teng. Fa e le gore seemo sa Mapodisi ga se ka ke sa tokafadiwa ka fa ke bonang seemo se ntse ka teng, ga re ka ke ra kgona borukutlhi ka fa ke bonang go ntse ka teng. *Police station* e e kwa Mogoditshane…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Honourable Member general principles*, wena jaanong o nwetse fela mo kgaolong.

**MR MASIMOLOLE:** *I am on general principles, Madam Speaker. I am not particularly addressing the sectors tsa nnetlane*…
MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Patrick Masimolole. *Will you please comply with Standing Order 75 (2) otherwise, fa go se na dikgang dipē o sutele ba bangwe.*

MR MASIMOLOLE: Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo ts'a Palamente. Ke ne ke feta fela ka kgang e ya gore maposisi ke bona ba filwe madi a mabotlana. Ga se gore ke raya gore ke sukeletse mo kgannyeng ya Sepodisi fela, ke ne ke feta ka yone gore mme o ka re lemme le ba le neetsweng le le botlana thata ka gore tiro ya bone e batla ba ka bo ba okeleditswe madi.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo ts'a Palamente, mma ke re re lebogela gore lwa bofelofelo e bo e le gore jaanong masole a basadi ba tlaa tsena mo Sesoleng. Re tseye gore kgang eo e tlaa dirwa ka manontlhotlho a a e tshwanetseng gore le sengwe le sengwe se e leng gore se tsamaelana le yone se bo se dirilwe ka tsela e e leng gore se tshwanetse se bo se dirilwe ka yone.

Ke ya kwa kgannyeng ya ALDEP (*Arable Lands Development Programme*) le SLOCA (*Services to Livestock Owners in Communal Areas*). Batswana ba a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo ts'a Palamente, gore e bo e le gore jaanong ALDEP 3 o a goroga. Mme re tsaya gore le ene o tlaa thomiwa leitlhho thata go nale mananeo a nako e e fetileng a e leng gore o ne o fitlhela e le gore o kare ga go a thomiwa leitlhho thata go bona gore a a diriwa jaaka go ne go ikaeletswe. E seng fela mo e leng gore o ka re go felela dilo dingwe di fetisiwa matlho di sa dirwe ka tsela e e leng gore e ne e tshwanetse gore e dirwe ka teng.

Ke tsone dikgang tse e leng gore Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo ts'a Palamante, mna ke le nosi fela ka re ke lebogela mafoko le tsela e Tona ya Madi o beileng *budget* ya gagwe Ntlo e ka yone. Ke a leboga.
MR MAOTO (FRANCISTOWN SOUTH): Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mmaetsho ke emela le nna go akgola Tona le ba ofisi ya gagwe ka tse di ntle tse ba re di beileng pele. Ke leboga jaaka fa a re beile pego pele; budget e ya madi a a kana-kana e re solofelang ka yone gore go le gontsi go ya go dirwa, go ya go kgonafula. Mmaetsho, re lebogela dilo tse dintsi tse re di bonang tse di dirilweng fano, mme tota re na le dingwe di re tshwenya mme re tlaa di bua le tsone. Bothata jo ke bo bonang mo budgeteng e tona-cona e re sa tswang go e bewa pele e ke gore, e tla jaana ka nako e e leng gore lefatsho le re tsayang didirisiwa ka bontsi mo go lone, la Aferika Borwa le mo dikagong tse di seng kana ka sepe ba ipaakanyetsa go tshwara metshameko e ya World Cup. Mme motho o a ipotsa gore a madi a a kana-kana a a beilweng a, a e leng gore re tshwanetse go ya go reka dilo go tla go tlhabolola lefatsho le la rona, jaaka re naile matamo a a tshwanetseng go agiwa. Mo matamong ao go dirisiwa semente se le se ntsi le ma-reinforce a steel jalo, mme le bone ka kwa ba aga mabala, ba dira ditlhabololo tse di seng kana ka sepe. A Tona o lebalebile dimmaraka golo gongwe kwa e leng gore e ka re fa go nna le bothata jwa gore re bone dilo tseo kwa re tlwaetseng go di tsaya teng kwa Aferika Borwa, ra bo gongwe re ka di batla teng. Mme fa e le gore seo o se dirile re ka leboga thata ka gore tota ke bona o ka re ke jone bothata jo e leng gore bo ya go re ema pele go ka dira ditlhabololo tse re eletsang go di dira. Mme gongwe ke mo leboge jaaka fa bangwe ba buile gape, ke lebogele meberekoko e a e tlhamileng jaaka fa a re supegeditse jalo gore mo ngwageng tse di lesome tse di fetileng, koketsego ya meberekoko e ne ya nna teng. Mme e supafala jalo gore e ntse e gola gongwe ka bo about 5 per cent; 4.7 per cent, se re a se lebogela. Ditiro tse di kana-kana tse di tshwanang le bo ALDEP, CEDA Young Farmers’ Fund, dikago tsa matamo, koketsego ya
University ya rona, kago ya sekolo sa bongaka le sepatela sa yone, le yone University e ntsha e e tlang kwa Palapye le tse dingwe fela jalo, di a go oketsa meberekho. Se re ya se lebogela. Mme motho a bo a ntse a ipotsa gore last year re ne re le fa re ntsha madi a a kana ka P5.8 billion, gompieno re a ngongorega gore ga re a bona ditlhabololo di goroga mo dikgaalong tse re di emetseng. Gompieno a tla a oketsegile. Le fa re utlwa gone go twe mabaka a re neng re a bewa pele a Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), a a neng a dirisiwa e le lebaka, kana batho ba ntse fa fetshe jaanong. E a re fa o re o bua se ba bo ba re EIA, fa o re o bua gore ditiro di kae ba bo ba re capacity. Bagaetsho, golo mo go tlaa re busetsa kwa morago. Rona re a ngongorega ka gore re belaela gore ditiro, bodirelapuso bo ntse ka tsone, ga bo di ntshe. Boradikonteraka ba kwa Francistown kwa ke tswang teng ba re, ditiro tse o filwela le e gore di fiwa dikompone di le dingwe fela. Jaanong kompone fa e filwe tiro le le tona gore e e dire, go emelwa kompone eo kana e nngwe e e tshwanang le yone gore e fetse golo gongwe, ke gone go bo go ya go ntshiwa tiro e nngwe. Mme fa e ne e le gore ditiro tse di ka ntshiwa tsothi jaaka fa di ntse jaana, ditendara tsa tswa tsa fiwa Batswana ba ya go dira nako e le nngwe fela, definitely di project tsa rona di ka tsamaya. Mme fa e le gore go ya go emelwa gore go lebiwe dikompone, di tlhophiwe tse dingwe di nne fela di sa dire sepe mme re na le Batswana ba ba kana-kana ba e leng gore ba nale bokgoni jwa ditiro tse, ga go ka ke ga re isa gope.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Nnyaa, ga e bereke jalo.

MR MAOTO: Kwa Francistown e bereka jalo. Mme tse dingwe tse e leng gore re bua ka tsone ke gone gore rona re tshwenngwa ke maphata a a teng a puso, bo Department of Building and Engineering Services (DBES), Public Procurement and Disposal Board PPADB, le tsone di Ministerial Tender Committees tse di teng tseo. Ke bone batho ba e
leng gore tota ba dia tiro gore e tsamaye. Nna e ya capacity ga ke batle go dumalana le yone ka gore Botswana jo re buang ka jone gompieno, barutegi ga ba kana ka sepe mo diofising tse tsa puso. Mme barutegi ba ba teng ba ba hirilweng kana sa bone ke go baakanya dilo tse gore dikompone di tswelele di bereke, ba ba dirang di inspection ba ne ba ya go dira di-inspection. Jaaka fa mongwe a ne a bua, buildings tsa dikhansele, tse rona re neng re tsaya gore bogologolo dikhansele di ne di na le baagi ba e leng gore fa go na le se se senyegileng ba a ya ba ya go repaira, ga ba tlhole ba dira jalo. Ke gore building fa e le foo e agilwe; a ke sekolo, a ke diofisi go a pala maintenance gore e dirwe in-house. Go emelwa pele gore go ye go deteriorate ke gone go bo go dirwa tendara batho ba tla go baakanya. Mme batho ba le teng ba gotweng ba hirilwe under Buildings ba e leng gore tiro ya bone ga se sepe ke go ya go inspecta dikago tse di agiwang fela.

Jaanong ke sone se re buang gore nnyaa, bodiredi jwa puso ga bo kana ka sepe. Ga gona gone mo go ka tweng capacity ga e yo ya gore di project tse di tona tse di dirwe. Di diiwa ke bone batho bao; ga twe ba bidiwa di Architects; ba bidiwa Quantity Surveyors, le di Consultant tse go tweng di a hirwa. Kana ditiro tsa puso jaaka fa re buile, project e tswa jaana e tendarelwa, ene wa Consultant yo ke ene yo e leng gore o ya go lebelela tsone dipolane tseo tse di dirilweng ke Quantity Surveyors kana ke bo mang. Go tsweng fa ke ene a yang go recommenda le gore go ye go fiwa bomang; ke dilo tse di diragalang. Go tsweng fa batho ba ba bereka mmogo, ba dira mmogo, project le fa di diega jaana e le gore e tshwanetse e fele in three years, e ya go tsamaya six years; di Consultant tse di ntse di duelwa fela. Ke bone batho ba ba diang di project tsa puso gore di tswelele.

Bothata jo bongwe jo bo teng jo ba Francistown ba ngongoregang ka jone ke gore, Botswana Housing Corporation (BHC), jaanong e iteisanya borathana le Batswana mo
dikhanseleng go dira ditiro tsa dikhansele le go act as consultants. Fa ba fiwa ditiro tse, bone jaanong ke bone ba ba yang go nna fa fatshe ba soboka ditiro ba di neela dikompone tsa Ma-China. Over and above di project tse e leng gore re di fetisitse fa, re kopela BHC madi gore e ye go dira ditiro, re ntse re itse gore batho ba ba yang go aga foo ke dikompone tse tsa Ma-China tse e leng gore ke kwa madi a tswang teng. Jaanong se ba eletsang gore se diragale ke gore, fa di-project di le di tona jalo e le tsa dikhansele kana go ya go agiwa di-police station, a di seka tsa sobokwa ya nna project e le nngwe fela e e leng gore e ya go tsaya diofisi tsa matlhatlaganyane le dikago tsa bonno di bo di dirwa a very big project.

E bo e le gore e tlogela dikompone tsa Batswana tsa bo-OC, bo-A le bo-B. E bo e le gore e ya go fiwa tse di kwa godimo fela tsa bo-D le bo-E. Ga gona jaaka re ka kgona fa e le gore Batswana ba ba kwa tlase ga re ba rotloetse ka ditiro tse di ntseng jalo. Mathata a ga se a Francistown a le nosi, a tletse lefatshe la Botswana lotlhe fela. Bothata jo bongwe ke dituelo tse re sa bolong go bua ka tsone, gore konteraka ya Motswana fa e filwe ditiro, heela, o tlaa sokola gore a duelwe. Le fa ba submit claims tsa bone go tsaya nako gore ba duelwe. Bofeletseang batho ba e leng gore o ba hirile ba a ngala, ba tlogela tiro. Mme dilo tse di dirwa ka bomo ke bodirelapuso jo bo teng. Motho fa go sena go submit claims go tshwanetse gore go duelwe, fa ba tla motho yo o tshwanetseng go saena gore ba duelwe ga a yo mo ofising o mo malatsing a boitapoloso, ba tlaa tshwenelwa ke gore ba mo emele. Dilo tse bagaetsho ga di re jese monate re le barongwa ba batho ba ba re tlhophileng.

E nngwe ke ya gore, tsonoe dikompone tse di tona tse, bogolo jang tsa batho ba e leng gore gongwe ke batswakwa, fa ba tendara le ba ga rona mono bone ba dikologa fela gone mo
ditoropong, ba fiwa gaufi fa. Ba Batswana fa a e tsaya fa o tlaa bo a supiwa go twe a ye Mohembo, kwa go kgakala, kwa ditsela di seyong teng.

**MS MOTSUMI:** Ke kopa tlhaloso Mokaulengwe. Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke kopa mokaulengwe gore a tlhalose sentle. Ke ne ke utlwa a re ba e leng dikoneraka tsa mo gae go supiwa motho. A mokaulengwe o lemoga sentle gore kana gore ba fiwe ditiro tse ba a bo ba di ikopetse, ga ba supiwe ka monwana.

**MR MAOTO:** Ke a leboga mmaetsho. Ke a itse gore ba a bo ba di ikopetse. Kana a ke re jaaka fa *tenders* di tswa jaana ba a tendara gongwe le gongwe kwa a teng. Mme se e leng gore ba se tlhokometse kana ba se etse tlhoko ke gore, o fitlhela dikompone tse di tona di dikologa fela mo ditoropong mo go bo Gaborone, Francistown, Lobatse. Fa bone e le gore, fa gotwe ba lebogile sengwe ke gone fa ba latlhelwa ko bo Kgalagadi, Chobe le Okavango jalo. Nnete e e sa jelweng pheko.

Bothata jo bongwe ke gore dikhansele, fa ba file dikompone tsa Batswana ditiro, go na le *clause* mo ditumalanong tse e leng gore fa go na le yo o ngongoregang o ka kgona gore a ye *for arbitration*. Fela fa Batswana ba ngongorega ba ya *for arbitration* mo dikhanseleng tsa ga *Honourable* Nasha, ke gore ba *blacklisted* ga ba thole ba fiwa sepe. Ke jone bothata jo Batswana ba lelang ka jone gore *clause* e e tsenyeditsweng. E a ba letlelela gore fa ba na le se ba se ngongoregelang ba itsheke kwa arbitration, mme e re fa ba ya teng, e bo e nna bothata jo o ka reng selelo sa motho a jetswe podi.

*Public enterprises*, re leboga dikatlego tse Tona a re di beileng pele tsa dikompone tsa *Water Utilities, Telecommunications*, jaaka fa di dira dipelo tse di kgotsofatsang. Mme re tshwenngwa ke Air Botswana. Air Botswana e ne e ntse e dira sentle go sa tlhabise ditlhong, e eteletswe pele ke Batswana. Maabane fela Motswana a sena go tswa jaana, e
Monday 12 February 2007

dapelwa ke go dira dipolo ka bo P3 million ngwaga o o fetileng, gompieno e ya kwa go P17 million. Selo se, se a tshwenya, ka gore, nna ga ke itse gore bothata jwa kwa Air Botswana ke eng.

Botswana Development Corporation (BDC) le yone, re a leboga jaaka fa e dira, mme tota ga go kgotsofatse. Bangwe ba buile, le nna fela jalo ga ke kgotsofalele seabe ya BDC. Re a itse fa e santse lefatste le le simolola, itsholelo ya lone e le kwa tlase, BDC e ne e tshwere dikompone ka bontsi tse e leng gore di agile itsholelo ya lefatste le. Mme okare ga e tlhole e kgaratlha thata, go bona gore e tlhoafalele go dira dikgwebo kana go tsenelela go ngoka bagwebi ba ba tsileng go bula dikgwebo mono. Tiro e ntsi o kare e dirwa ke BEDIA fela, ya go siana mo e batla batho ba ba ka tlang go banka mono. A BDC re bone le yone e ema ka dinao, e tlhoafalela gore lefatste le le a tlhabologa, fela jaaka fa BEDIA e dira, le yone BEDIA e ntse e leka jalo, ga e kgone mogo kalo.

Mme gongwe re tshwanetse re sekaseke gore kafa e lekang ka teng go ngokela bagwebi mono, mme re bona o kare bagwebi ga ba tle ka fa re bonang bone ba eme ka mashetla ka teng, ke gore gongwe re bone gore re ka dira jang Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Gore bogolo fa batho ba re eletsang gore ba tle go investa mono ba sa tle, rona re invest kwa go bone. Sekai ke gore mafatshe a re reng re benchmark mo go one, a a tshwanang le bo Singapore, ba nale a Ministry of Investment o e leng gore every year fa go ntshiwa budget e tshwana le e ya rona, ba na le seabe se mo go yone ba ya to the New York Stock Exchange, ba invest in the top ranked companies in the New York Stock Exchange. Le rona re ka leka something like that. Dipoelo tsa madi ao di a boa di tla kwa lefatsheng leo la Singapore. Ba kgona gore ditiro di tsamaye, ditlhabololo di diragale mo lefatsheng la bone. Mme le mo go rona gongwe re ka leba mafatshe a re bapileng le one, a a tshwanang
le *South Africa and Namibia*, ga nna le *a deliberate effort* ya gore puso *through* BDC le BEDIA, e romele Batswana, e reke gongwe *shares* mo dikhamphaning koo, kana e reke dikhamphani tse e leng gore e ka romela batho ba ya go tsamaisa dikhamphani tseo, *profits* tsa teng di tlaa goroga ka kwano.

Go ka nna botoka ka gore ke fa re a bona gore ga re kgone go ba gogela kwano. Mathata e le one a gore dilo di tshwana le motlakase, metsi, megala, mo lefatsheng la rona ga di *cheap*. Ga re *cheap* go feta mafatshe a mangwe a re bapileng le one. Mme ka jalo, go tshwanetse fela gore re leke gore ka tsela nngwe re bone gore re ka dira jang go leka go dira *diversification* e re e eletsang.

**MR GAOLATHE:** Madam Speaker, on a point of clarification. I would appreciate if the Honourable Member could clarify what he is saying. Is he saying that corporations such as BDC should invest in Namibia and outside and create jobs there rather than investing here?

**MR MAOTO:** Ke a leboga. Nnya Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Se ke se buang ke gore, maikaelo a puso ke gore ditiro di dirwe mo lefatsheng le, ke gore re ngoke bagwebi ba tle go dira dikgweto mono. Mme nna ka re o ka re ga re atlege thata, mme *investments* di ka dirwa, tse e leng gore dipelo di ka tla mo lefatsheng le. *Either* go reka dikompone ka koo tse e leng gore *they exist*, batho ba bereka mo go tsone e le ba mafatshe one ao *of course*, mme *management* wa yone o tswa mo lefatsheng la rona o tlhokometse kompone eo gore e tsamaya jang. E le *an alternative*?

Kana bothata jo bongwe jo bo teng ke jwa gore, le fa re ba ngoka jaana re re ba tle kwano, go sa ntse go le bothata. Mogwebi e re a goroga mono, dilo tse a di tlhokang tse di tshwanang le go kwadisa khamphani, *residence permit* le *work permit*, ga go motlhofo
jaaka mo mafatsheng a re bapileng le one gore motho a di bone ka bonako. Le fa rraetsho o re boleletse gore gongwe go tlaa tokafadiwa.

Le fa a ne a ka di bona, ga go motlhofo, ga re na dilo tse di tshwanang le factory shells tse di readily available gore mogwebi fa a tla, o ka tsena mo go tsone ka bonako, a bona go ka direla mo go tsone. Ke raya mo Gaborone le Francistown. Gongwe kwa Selibe Phikwe ke gone kwa e leng gore dilo tseo di teng.

Fa ke wela mmaetsho gongwe ke bue ka the Presidential Jet. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, go bothlokwa thata gore tshireletso ya ga Tautona e tseelwe kwa godimo.

Mme fa ke gakologelwa, last year ka May re le fa, fa go diragala bothata jo bo neng jwa diragalela sefofane seo, Tona yo o neng a le teng wa Presidential Affairs Rre Skelemani o ne a re tlhomamisetla gore ga go tlhoko gore go rekwe sefofane se sesha. Mme ra gakgamala e re re sena go tswa fa e bo e re maybe two weeks later go bo go tsewa tshwetso ya gore go ya go rekwa sefofane.

Mme bothata jo nna ke bo bonang, mo ngwageng o re neng re reile Batswana ra re itsholelo ya rona ga e letle, Batswana ba duelele bana ba bone school fees. Mo ngwageng one oo o ntse o le mongwe fela, ra approva madi a state house sa ga President fa a ya to retire to the tune of P20 million. Dilo tse re nna le bothata go di arabela, fa batho re le kwa gae, ba re botsa ka dilo tse di ntseng jaana gore, mme fa le ne le dirisa eng. Ke eng fa le ne le tsaya tshwetso e e ntseng jaana.

Rona re itse bo-Tautona ba rona e le bo-Tautona ba e leng gore gompieno fa re sa duelwe jaana, ba re batho ba tlaa reng. Ba rialo. Mme go raya gore lona bagakolodi ba bone, tlhomamisang jalo. Tshwetso e ga se ya ga Tautona gore o batla sefofane, ke tshwetso ya Cabinet. Mme fa le tswa foo la re, go nnile le a Presidential Directive, e boela kwa go
MR GUMA (TATI EAST): Thank you Madam Speaker. I would not take a lot of time
liberating, but I will try to use most probably all the time that has been allocated to me.
Madam Speaker, before I proceed, I am not sure whether that is proper, I would need to
be given direction, especially on paragraph 110 which if you allow me to quote Madam
Speaker.

MADAM SPEAKER: Do quote.

MR GUMA: Paragraph 111 Madam Speaker. “Mr Speaker, following the meeting of the
National Employment Manpower and Incomes Council on the 29th January 2007
recognition was given to ensuring improved productivity and sustainable economic
diversification and global competitiveness, in line with the theme. In this regard,
considering affordability, the need to promote productivity within the economy, and the
risk associated with the revenue forecast, Government has decided to award a public
salary increase of 6 per cent across the board.”

I need direction here Madam Speaker, because the Bill has been published on the
recurrent expenditure requesting about P19 billion, for the total amount requested is P24
billion, but it does not include the 6 per cent amount requested. I am wondering, if we
approving the Bill with the 6 per cent but it has not been published? What is the usual
direction in this particular, I need direction in this regard, will it be proper for us to move an amendment to this to reflect the proper amount which Parliament has requested to approve? I do not know how to proceed with it but maybe the Minister will be able to give clarification on this.

**MR GAOLATHE:** Madam Speaker, at the time decision was taken to increase salaries by 6 per cent the estimates had already been prepared and there is nothing extraordinary about it. What it means is that during the course of the year each department will come forward should it run short of money, will come forward and we will proceed to request supplementaries. In some cases we may not have to supplement because the provision may be enough because of vacancies or other reasons, so we were not going to ask Parliament to do anything at this point in time, if they have to do something it would be later in the year. Thank you very much.

**MR GUMA:** I am comfortable Madam Speaker, I will proceed.

Having said that I just want to dwell on this paragraph Madam Speaker, to say that at times we need to make a clear distinction between prudent management of resources and just being stingy. My personal and very strong view Madam Speaker is that the 6 per cent salary adjustment is not adequate really to meet what is prevailing on the ground. I am sure that even Members of Parliament here who are standing up and saying I support this if we were to take a private vote here none of them will agree that the 6 per cent is adequate.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** I have not spoken on that issue myself.

**MR GUMA:** Because you are a coward. In my view there is a need for us to really look into the salary conditions. Not only the salary structure but also the pay structure of the
civil service and the whole nation as a whole, including us who are sitting here because we keep talking about it and we do not do anything about it. In this particular case really I am more concerned about Members in the front bench, because my believe is that if I can look after them then they will convince the President to look after us.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: Laughter!

MR GUMA: That was my way of a joke. On a very serious note I do not believe that we have actually made enough provisions. In this particular regard I am more concerned about the salary conditions of the teachers, the police, and the industrial class, the working class as a whole, especially those that are on the bottom line. Really if you look into the rentals, the average rental for a Botswana Housing Corporation (BHC) house, low cost house, is what, P500? Will our people really be able to even do, afford to build a two-roomed house if they are earning about P1, 200? My Security Guard in my office is earning P1, 300, how much is 6 per cent salary adjustment, what does it do to him? I have spoken to him, he looks at me and says my Member of Parliament what are you saying to me? Then I am going to be going back in the rural areas and I will talking to the Village Development Committees (VDCs) thanks to Honourable Nasha’s intervention, that the VDCs and other committees have been given salary adjustments by 6 per cent. You know how much they are earning, P110, 6 per cent is how much, P5 or P6. You are going to tell them that no-no we have given you something bagaetsho lebogang Goromente wa lona yo o pelotlhomogi, lemme ga le bolaye. We know that it is going to be very difficult Honourable Minister, it is just going to be a very difficult task. I would have thought that really the so called adjustment, taking into consideration the average inflation during the year, is what we are going to be using to adjust the salaries of the civil servants, I think it
is an academic exercise. It is not really at times informed by what is prevailing on the ground, because at times even inflation figures that we get sometimes are not as accurate as we want them to be. I will then proceed on a different point again and say, I do say we should look into the recurrent budget and…

**MR MABILETSA:** On a point of elucidation Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Member. Now that you have raised this issue of this 6 per cent across the board and appearing to be critiquing it what is your suggestion? Would you not say the situation whereby this increment was staggered, saying looking at those that are in the higher income brackets maybe giving them a lower percentage, those in the middle-income bracket an improved percentage and those at the lower end of the bracket an enhanced percentage? How would you react to such a suggestion? I thank you.

**MR GUMA:** Thank you Honourable Member. I am suggesting a review of the entire salary structure taking into consideration some of the factors that you are raising as of now, they could be applicable by then at the time of review, but I do not want to dwell too much on that. The point that I am trying to say right now is that I am not comfortable with the 6 per cent salary adjustment.

**MR KGATHI:** *On a point of clarification Madam Speaker.* Motlotlegi ke ne ke re ke botse, gore e rile fa o bua wa re bontsi jwa rona re tshabile go bua gore ga re kgotsofalele 6 per cent. E rile maabane ke bua ka re, ke botsa potso eo mo go wena, gore le fa re ka tswelela ngwaga le ngwaga re ntse re oketsa ka bo10 per cent bo15 per cent bogologolo go ne go nale selo se gotweng price control. Mo e neng e le gore di-price di ne di chekwa, now ga bo gotwe is free market economy. Even if re ne re ka oketsa ka 15 per cent mme BHC ya oketsa rentals tsa yone ka 10 per cent, ba Water, because of existing
Monday 12 February 2007

*monopolies* tse di teng *do you think we are going to win?* I hold a view that so long as *there is no control in terms of prices and rates* tse re di duelang, even if *Government can do salary increases* tsa bo15 bo BHC ba a go tsenya bo10 per cent, metsi le one le ko dishopong, fela jalo. Bothata jo *how do you think we can resolve this?*

**MR GUMA:** Honourable Member, *jaaka o bua wa re ke rile bontsi*, I took note of what you said. Madam Speaker I want to now dwell a lot on the Development Budget. If you could allow me to just give a background and look at how much we approved last year, 2006, so that when I proceed further I will making comparisons and then making suggestions on the way forward. Madam Speaker, I have an extract, a summary which I got from Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, Budget Division, of how much we approved last year, broken down into various ministries, and how much they have spent as at 31st December 2006. If you allow me Madam Speaker, to read this extract so that I can make comparison.

The total amount that was approved by this Parliament was P5.800, 220,000 or P5.8 billion.

The approved budget was P10 billion and the total amount spent by this Parliament on the

**DEVELOPMENT BUDGET 2006**

**AMOUNTS SPENT BY MINISTRIES AS AT 31ST DECEMBER 2006**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MINISTRY</th>
<th>APPROVED BUDGET (P)</th>
<th>TOTAL AMOUNT SPENT (P)</th>
<th>AMOUNT SPENT IN PERCENTAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

186
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ministry</th>
<th>Budget 1971/72</th>
<th>Budget 1972/73</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parliament</td>
<td>10,000,000</td>
<td>700,000</td>
<td>6.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State President</td>
<td>1,200,000,000</td>
<td>600,000,000</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance and Development Planning</td>
<td>122,000,000</td>
<td>19,000,000</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour and Home Affairs</td>
<td>197,000,000</td>
<td>40,000,000</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>105,000,000</td>
<td>135,000,000</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>5,000,000,000</td>
<td>135,000,000</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade and Industry</td>
<td>70,000,000</td>
<td>9,000,000</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works and Transport</td>
<td>714,000,000</td>
<td>422,000,000</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mineral, Energy and water Resources</td>
<td>621,000,000</td>
<td>241,000,000</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>576,000,000</td>
<td>290,000,000</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign Affairs</td>
<td>24,000,000</td>
<td>267,000</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lands and Housing</td>
<td>334,000,000</td>
<td>199,000,000</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communications, Science and Technology</td>
<td>154,000,000</td>
<td>41,000,000</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment, Wildlife and Tourism</td>
<td>172,000,000</td>
<td>32,000,000</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**DR NASHA:** Ke kopa go botsa potso Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. A *Honourable Member is aware* gore dilo tse bo *amounts spent as at December or whatever month can mislead*. *As Honourable Maswabi knows* go nale mo gotweng
committed amounts, tse di sa balwang mo dipalong tse a di buang tse, mo e leng gore by the time tota fela re tsena ko go April these figures will have changed drastically.

MR GUMA: I know that, I am very well aware of that Madam Speaker. The critical thing is that if I requested for that information, I have got a breakdown of two figures in here. I have got warranted figures that the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning has actually approved to say this amount should be spent. I also have got comparisons, amount of warranted, out of warranted how much has been spent, but I did not want to bore this Honourable House by going through all these analysis.

My main focus here is do an analysis in terms of saying, as of now how far are we with the development budget such that from that point, I then want to advance a certain point and say why we are failing and I am going to advance that point. Honourable Member I am aware of that.

Now, if you can allow me to then proceed, Madam Speaker. The reason why I am bringing these issues Madam Speaker is, I am beginning to wonder where are we going wrong in terms of implementation. If you look at it, the total amount spent from out of P2.8 billion we have spent P2.5, which represents 43 per cent of the total budget and our view as Parliament, the only amount that we could be looking at is how much you came here and asked for and how much you have spent. The only measure of assessment is that you are asking us for money to spend this financial year, we are saying go ahead spend within 12 months and then we are going to only assess you within that 12 months period, we know that December, January and February are dead months. Nothing much is happening and then we are asking ourselves where are we going wrong? The point that I want to now drive at is Madam Speaker, I want to talk about decentralised control over
the budget. What I am saying here is that I am beginning to wonder with other agencies that have actually come through e.g. The Minister has already alluded in his speech that poor implementation has got nothing to do with Ministry of Finance and Development Planning. Always, when there is no implementation we are pointing fingers at Ministry of Finance and Development Planning.

The role of Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, it is you who have to tell them what you are looking for and they source funds for you and that they have done. But the delivery aspect of it is entirely on the departments themselves to make sure that they deliver. Now, where are we going wrong in my view? There are other various agencies that are involved in the delivery aspect of these projects. We now have the Environmental Impact Assessments that is coming in, we now have the tendering processes that are coming in, we also have issues of land acquisition. I have got other projects here which are about 90 which I am not too sure about figures that I got from Ministry of Wildlife which says, these projects as listed in here were approved but there were no signs. As a result you could not proceed in implementing what Parliament has already approved. What do Members of Parliament say after we have been told this is what is going to happen? We go back to our constituencies and we tell them, ngwaga o go ya go diragala se le se and then the next thing we go back again and tell them no, we are still waiting for this, but they are looking at you as a Member of Parliament. But what am I then saying Madam Speaker? I am saying the one-year planning process needs to be reviewed, the measures which the Minister has actually brought in here, yes they are very good but too late. In my view I am saying, the time has now come for us to look into our entire budgetary process and ask ourselves is one year, …
MR GAOLATHE: Madam Speaker, on a point of clarification. Thank you very much. I think as I have said in my speech, there is considerable room for improving implementation capacity or implementation but I do not think it will be fair for this House to go home with the belief that the situation in terms of actual disbursement, will end perhaps being as disappointing as the figures that he has just given because we are following these things on a continuing basis.

We are in February now, we have got more updated figures than that. Indeed we expect that there would be under expenditure but the situation will not be as bad as all that. If you look at last year, we also had the same problem to some extent, the outturn is that development budget was under spent by 15 per cent in terms of actual disbursement. What happens normally as Honourable Nasha was pointing out, there is always a tendency to rush and disburse towards the end of the year, the last few months of the year. So, in other words, work would have been done and in some cases it is a question of processing payments and all that but all I wanted to caution the House on is that, while we agree and government is trying to improve the situation and will improve, the figures given are too pessimistic and may be misleading. I think the situation, the outturn will be much better than what has just been narrated at the end of December. Thank you very much.

MR GUMA: Honourable Member, I am not here to come and defend inefficiency and if these figures are as pessimistic as I am told they are, they are not mine. You use figures for the purpose of decision-making and then we are 75 per cent into the year now, we have not delivered and the truth of the matter is that as at the end of December we were sitting at 75 per cent of the year and people out there on the ground are asking questions.
Monday 12 February 2007

Please this Honourable House should never be a house to condone inefficiency, period. We should not, we cannot, I cannot sit in here and say things are happening when they are not because when I get back to my constituency people are saying what are you doing about this?

I am aware that maybe things would have changed but we should be told where the changes are and we should constantly be briefed by Ministers that this is where we are so that we can get back to our constituency and give people feedback but if there is nothing forthcoming, we have to come back to this Parliament and be given these figures. Should we go back again and be singing the same song? I cannot do it. Certainly I cannot do it, I cannot go back and make myself a clown in front of people there, I cannot be singing the same song again of inefficiency, I am not going to do it, I would rather leave politics.

MR GUMA: No, I still have a lot of time, I am still going to speak. I am saying my suggestion is that there are quite a number of factors let alone poor delivery itself because any other, in the absence of a better explanation under expenditure really can only be attributed to inefficiency. Unless there is any other but I am not saying it is not only inefficiency. There are other areas that we need to look into. I am beginning to believe and have a strong belief that we need to look clearly into our budget cycle with more emphasis on the development budget and ask ourselves, is the time frame of 12 months adequate enough for us to implement the things that we want to do. Taking into consideration various agencies that are involved in the implementation of those projects? I have doubt, in other countries they work on a three year budget cycle on development expenditure, in other areas they work on a two year budget but not on a recurrent expenditure because that is no.
By the way, the Honourable Member of Opposition when he stood up to speak the other day, I could see Honourable Molefhabangwe dancing claiming that no you never have access information in order for you to make an alternative budget. I just want to disagree. I just want to disagree and say, our budgeting system, we know we have got the National Development Bank, it is purely historical. We have got financial statements, you know the revenues for last year and you know the expenditure pattern and you know the last year’s budget surplus or deficit, you can project based on that particular information. That information is usually available and any finance person who is worth it would not tell you that he is going to be waiting for something else to be given to him. It is not expected that you should actually come out with anything exact but you are supposed to be making an alternative with all the information that is given to you. It was just by the way because I thought I should actually pass through that point.

Madam Speaker, this year’s budget theme is “Improved Productivity - The Key to Sustainable Economic Diversification and Global Competitiveness”.

MR BATSILE (KANYE NORTH): Mma ke go leboge Mmaetsho Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Ntlo e e botlokwa e mme ke bo ke simolole ka go lebogela sebaka se. Bakaulengwe ba ntse ba akgela mo go yone kgang e, ba ntsha mabaka a a farologanyeng a mangwe e le a go kolopana ka noga e tshela, a mangwe e le a a isang ko re thokang go leba teng. Mme mma ke simolole ka go nopola ke kope tetlelelo ya gago ke bale temananyana nngwe mo go yone pego e o re e beileng pele ya pego ya madi kana ya tiriso ya madi ka tetla ya gago mmaetsho.

MADAM SPEAKER: Ke a go letlelela.
MR BATSILE: Fa ke e leba mo paragraph 62 e e reng “Mr Speaker, Honourable Members, the slow pace of the implementation of government projects remains a major concern to the nation”. Mmaetsho, mafoko a ke a a ntseng a buiwa ke Honourable Guma le fa a tuntse a tla a ikganetsa.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Wa re a tuntse.

MR BATSILE: Ee rra o tuntse. Ga a yo mo Ntlong, kooteng ke ngwao ya Ntlo e. Motho o tlaa tsosa modumo a bo a nyelela. Se ke ratang go ya ko go sone mo mafokong a Mmaetsho Motsamaisa Ntlo e e tlotlegang, kana re fano re beile pego e e tshotse ng dintlha e di tsaya fale le fale e bo e soboka e bo e supa dipharologanyo. Mme ka fa tlase ga one mafoko a ke ntseng ke a bala a, a a supang kgogo dinao ya go diragatsa maikaelelo go sena go rebolwa madi ke Ntlo e, a e rileng mo ngwageng o o neng o feta wa madi ra bo re aba madi a a tshwarang 5.8 billion, gompieno re tsamaya fa go 7.26 billion plus 2.7 ya new projects le tse di sekasekilweng.

Golo mo go a tlhobaetsa fa o go baya o go tshwantshisa gore mme tota re ya kae Batswana, re ya go raya Batswana re reng? Ga ke lebale lefoko lengwe le ne la buiwa ke Motlotlegi Tona yo o thomamisitsweng Rre Kwelagobe le a rileng a le bua a re, jaanong re tlaa tlhola re raya Batswana re reng ka e kete ga re bue boammaaruri. Re a bo re ba solofetsa se, se sa ye go direga, re ya kae? Re a ne re ya ko Batswaneng re ba raya re re le tsile go agelwa se, re dira se, re dira se ngwaga o bo o re ke! O fela go sena tswelelo pele. Jaanong potso ke gore re ya kae?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Nna ke a tsamaya.

MR BATSILE: Mme e re o ise o tsamaye o ye Tonota re sa itse gore o tlaa bo o tshotse eng se o yang go se bolela Batswana, le fa e bile gongwe pego yone ya madi e e na le
ditsholofetso tse di amang kgaolo ya gago, mme o e tseye ka motlhala go tswa fa moragonyana gore dilo tse bagaetsho di re baya ka fa mosing ka gore re bolelela batho ka fa re dirileng ditogamaano ka teng, le ka fa re di ntsheditseng madi ka teng mme ga go tswe ntlha. Mamina a felela nkong. Fa re tsena mo Ntlong e, re tsile go itlamanka fela re itlamanka re sa itse gore la bofelo tota re ya go raya Batswana re reng. Bagaetsho, pego ya madi ka gore ke tlwaelo gore re amogela se re se bewang pele, mme tiro yone gore e ye go nna teng e e kgotsofatsang ga e yo.

Ke ne ke re ke e simolole jalo, ke re golo fa re go tsenye leitlho thata fela go le go tona ka gore ga go re itumedise. Mafoko a le fa re a bua jaana a botlhoko ka gore bangwe fa ba ema, motho o tlaa bo a re ba bangwe ka fa mo Ntlong e ba ba potileng ka ko letsogong je le botlana kana ba ba botlana ka palo, ga ba tle ka motlhala ope wa gore bone ba ka dira eng, nnyaa moo ke ditota fela moo. Go tshwana fela le fa o apeile dikgobe tsa diphure o ne wa seka wa di sekela. Jaanong moo gone ke go tlotla fela.

Sengwe sa dilo tse di tlhokafalang fa re leba kgang e, kwa ntle ga gore o ka supa yo mongwe ka monwana wa re ga o re beye pego motlhala gore wena o ya go dira eng. Nnyaa moo o a bo o kgatlha sechaba ka kwa ntle ka gore se go reeditse, le kwa kgaolong gore e re ba reeditse mo radiong ba re, Motlotlegi Masimolole o ne a a ja nala mo Palamenteng, kooteng o ne a tlhoka yo o mo rayang a re o ya kae, a timetse. Jaanong le yone mma ke e tlogele foo.

Mmaetsho, sengwe sa dilo tse di botlhokwa, ke rata go fologela, mme ke tlaa e simolola ka fa e welang ka teng. Mo tsebeng ya bofelo ya 121, fa Motlotlegi Tona ya Madi a neng a re bolelela ka teng, e supa fa a leboga mekgatho yotlhe e e farologanyeng. Non-Governmental Organisations (NGOs) le e mengwe, di foundation tse re nang natso mo
Monday 12 February 2007

Botswana. Jaanong a yone tebogo e, a e raya e soboka tota le di *foundation* tsa bo Masitara, tse di tsyang madi di a kopa kwa mafatsheng a sele di tla go keta ka one di re di tlhabolola Domkraga, di re di tshela ditsela? A ke yone tebogo ya ga Tona? Ke ipotsa gore Domkraga ya reng tota. Fa o ne a bua eng, kampo o ne a bua a sireleditse Domkraga go e anamisa? Nnyaa, bagaetsho, a re ne re bua re tlhwaafala re lesa go ja nala. Le yone ke e tshwae, ke e beye lephaga ka nna e bile ke tshwaya lephaga. Ke ne ke e tlopinya fela ke feta ka yone.

Mongwe mokaulengwe o ne a bua mafoko mangwe a a neng a ntshosa, mme ke bonye a lebelelwa fela a sa tewe go twe o ya kae mokaulengwe. Motlotlegi *Honourable* Masalila o ne a bua mafoko a a neng a ntshosa a e leng gore….

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Honourable* Batsile, a sa tewe ke mang a re wa reng? Bua fela ka se o batlang go bua ka sone *without judging me*.

**MR BATSILE:** Ke a leboga.

Mafoko a mangwe a a builweng a ke batlang gore re a lebe re a tseele kwa pele gore fa a builwe mo Palamenteng a ka re busetsa eng. Mafoko ao a re go tsile batho ba tswa kwa Zimbabwe e le ba lekoko la ga Nswazwi ba latetse marapo a ga Nswazwi mo Botswana. Potso ke gore, mo dingwageng tse 60 a batho bao ke Batswana? Ke potso ya ga Batsile gore se, se amanang jang le *budget*. A se raya gore ditlamelo tse re thusang batho ba ba tlhokang ka tsone, batlhoki ba, a ba tlile go kgorelediwa ke batho ba ba ntseng *over 60 years* e le ma-Zimbabwe, mme jaanong ba bidiwa go twe ke Batswana? Ke dilo tse di re itayang tsebe. Re na le batlhoki le bagodi, a re oketsa palo ya bagodi re ntse re bokolela gore re a imelwa? Ke selo se ke ratang go se supa. Jaanong, kgang e ga e a re tsaya sentle.
Monday 12 February 2007

Jaanong, marapo a mangwe a ga El Negro one re tlaa a latela leng, a a tlhoka ba ba a latelang? Dilo tse re tshwanetse gore re ne re di leba tse. E ne e re re bua mafoko mo, re bo re itse kwa re yang teng. Gatwe batho ba latetsse marapo, ba e leng gore ba tlile go bewa ditsha at the expense of government. Fa re leba kwa Ministry of Lands and Housing, re bua ka lefatshe gore le ye go servisiwa. Le bone ba batla ditshwanelo. Fa re bua ka mophako wa bagolo o o khavarwang ke budget e, le bone ba na le tshwanelo ya gore ba ye go phakisiwa dijo. Fa re bua ka sekolo…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible).

MR BATSILE: Monna, ke bua fela ke sosologile, se ntsene ganong, o nkitaya tsebe. O batla go nntsha mo tseleng.

Re bua ka ditshwanelo tse ba tshwanelwang ke go di akola. Fa go buiwa ka gore go ye go okediwa madi a Village Development Committees (VDC), le bone ba na le tshwanelo ya go tsena mo di-VDC bone batho ba ba latetseng marapo ba.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Bo mang?

MR BATSILE: Batho ba ga Nswazwi, ba gago. Ba e leng gore o ya go oketsa ka bone ditalama. Ga re itse gore a ba tlile go oketsa ditalama kana ba tlile go oketsa mmoapamo le lenyora le le mo Botswana. Ke potso e Motswana a tshwanetseng go e ipotsa, gore a ke se Botswana a ka ikgatlhang ka sone. Foo ke a kgalema gore ga le re direle sentle. Se neng le tla go ikgatlha lona ba e leng gore you are the front-benchers, batho ba le tsenang khuduthamaga ya ga Tautona ka dilo tse di faphegileng tse di duleng mo tseleng le sa re rerisa fa le di dira. Le bo le tla go oketsa lehuma gore batho ba ye go phaka fa re bua ka mephako. Go nkutlwisa bothoko ka gore re ntsha madi a ya go thusa batlhoki, le bone ke batlhoki. Bana ba bone ba tlhoka dikolo, ba ya go tsena di primary mahala. Ba ya go
dueleloa mme ba tlogedisitswe manno a bone ka fa ba ntseng ba tshela botoka kateng, le tlile go ba tsosetsa leuba le lenyora ka go tlhoka go ba tlhokomela. Dilo tse re tshwanetse re di bue. Ke ne ke re ke kgaleme gore a e neng e re re bua re bo re ikakantse. Ke a e feta. Mmaetsho fa ke tswelela, ke rata ke bue ka mhama wa thuto. Mme mma e re ke ise ke ye koo ke fete ka nngwe ke e. Madi a, a arotse, a abetswe maphata ka go farologana jaaka e le tshwanelo mo pegong ya ga rraetsho Tona. Ke boammaaruri ebile ke tshwanelo, mme jaaka fa madi a a tshotse ka maphata, ke ipotsa gore a lephata le tshwana le la ga Tautona, le le filweng madi a a kana. Lephata le tshwana le la sesole le le tsheletsweng madi a a mantsi jaana. A e seng gore golo gongwe re tlaa felela re tshwana le dipalamente tse di fa morago tsa the 6th, 7th and 8th Parliament tse e leng gore go a ne go ntshiwa masole fela mo lefatsheng la Botswana a ya bo Lesotho go sa rerisiwa Palamente? E seng gore kgantele re ya go utlwalela masole a rona a tsamaya kwa go bo Darfur a bolaelwa ke tlala koo? A e seng gore go tsamaela koo? Dilo tse di re iteisa pelo ka gore Palamente e, ga e tsewe e le sepe e gatakiwa fela ka dinao. Jaanong, dilo tse re tshwanetse re di supe gore madi a a kana-kana a a tsholwang a, a a senang a proper analysis, a se ka a felela e le gore go ntshiwa masole ka setu re sa tewa sepe. A re tlaa tla go bolelelwa fa bana ba rona ba ka dirafalelwa ke kotsi, ba welwa ke mmaene, jaanong ba tla ba didimetse? A ke gone re tlaa tabogelwang mo Palamenteng go ya go batlwa madi? A re ne re rerisiwa, re batho, re emetse batho. Re fa ka thomo ya Batswana, go se ka ga dira dilo fela re sa rerisiwa. Madi a tlhalosiwe, re itse gore fa o tshela madi a le kana-kana mo sesoleng a o a tshelela gore ba ye go tsamaya le molelwane ba patrole kgotsa ba itlhokoletse ntwa. Re lwa le mang? O tshwanetse o tlhalose Rraetsho Tona? A Batswana re baba dikamo. Kana gatwe kwa mmaeneng go na le seteke, a re a fufula mo e bo ya go lwa le mang? Re
tshwanetse re tlhaloganye dilo tseo, madi a se ka a ntshiwa fela re sa itse gore a ya go bereka eng.

Mmaetsho fa ke tla mo thutong, ke boammaaruri re bona mathata. Fa ke bua jaana, e rile pele fa ke tla mo Ntlong e, ke etetse mafelo …

MR GAOLATHE: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. I would appreciate it if the Honourable Member could explain what his concern is about the BDF allocation, I assume he is talking about BDF allocation. I thought that it is clear in my speech what this money is supposed to do. Some of that money, if we are talking about the development budget, is going to buy the equipment. Some of it is going to be used for housing infrastructure and we are saying that part of this allocation, in particular this coming year, we have to improve the infrastructure further because we will be recruiting women into the BDF. So, I am not quite sure which aspect the Honourable Member is worried about, which is included but there is no explanation as to how the money will be used. Thank you very much.

MR BATSILE: Ke a leboga, Tona. Kana dithhaloso tsa Matona fa di ntse di tswa fa, e a bo e le go sireletsa se e leng gore o se kontse fela a re tima mafoko. Fa re ne re sa bue, re ne re tlaa itse jang. O tshwanetse go lemoga selo seo. Ke a e feta.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Go kwadiilwe.

MR BATSILE: Ee, go kwadiilwe mo letlapeng gore le re timetse. Ke dumalana le wena.

Mme fa ke tswelela ka tsa thuto Mmaetsho, ke tshwanelo goromente a re o batla go tsaya di *brigade*. Goromente o tsere dikolo tsa *community junior* mme o a imelwa. Maabane ke ne ke ntse ke etela dikolo tse di tona le tse di potlana, ke di tsamaile tsotlhe. Fa o tsena kwa sekolog sa Mathiba kwa Kanye, kwa godimo ga lentswe, se makgasa a makgasa. Ke
ipotsa gore mo dingwageng tse di kana-kana go ntse go dirwa eng. Mme gatwe se ka fa tlase ga tlhokomelo ya ga goromente. Mo go rutelwang ditlhaka tsa maranyane, bo Science and Technology, ke makgasa a a tsitsibanyak mmele. Le barutabana ba nna mo godimo ga ditafole, ba tlhoka fa a ka nnang teng, ba tshaba le go tsena mo matlwaneng a borutelo a mangwe a a dirlweng ka asbestos. Ke makgasa fela. Ke dilo tse di thlhomolang pelo. Barutabana ba re le rona re a boifa. Jaanong a ke sone se Domkraga e ikgatlhang ka sone e bo e batla an alternative budget, e sa diragatse dilo. Le tsere mo Batswaneng ba e leng gore le ne le iteka le tshwaraganetse le bone. Go a pala gore le service, go padisiwa ke eng? Mabaka ke eng? Ga le kgone le diilwe ke dikara tse dintsho fela go ja matantarapa, ke one fela o le kgatlhang. Ga le kgone. Dikolo tsothle tse di tona le tse di potlana, ga go na stationery and text books. Ngwana a ya go bala Standard 6 a sena text books le solofela gore a ye go kwala eng? A sena dikwalo fela tsa go bala. Ga go na library services. Nnyaa bagaetsho, a re akanyeng botoka Domkraga. A e re re tsaya platform ya go ikgatlha, we should provide the services tse di tshwanetseng, re lese go fora Batswana. Re lapisitswe ke go aketsa batho, re ya kwa dikgotleng re ya go ba fora go sena implementation, e le e kwadileng mo gore e a le palela.

Sengwe se ke ratang go digela ka sone ke gore, ke ikutlwa ke le motlotlo ka gore la re le lemogile fa go le botlhokwa gore go nne le education with production, e re saleng re e opela re le Botswana National Front (BNF). Jaanong le wela mo seporong. Fa le bona dilo di tshikhinyega, mananeo a a botlhokwatlhokwa a, le ne le re tanki. A le palelwa ke tanki le le Batswana?

MR KWELAGOBE: Point of correction, Madam Speaker.
MR BATSILE: No, I do not allow anybody, nako yame ga e yo. Ga gona correction epe ka gore thuto ya diatla le ya go e ruta. O baakanya eng? E kile ya re fa re tshwere tiro le bo le supa mothe ka monwana, ke tshaba go mmua ka leina, le bo le re o itaya bana tsebe o ruta dilo tse di kgakala, o sia le ma Fronta.

MR KWELAGOBE: Ke kopa correction tlherra.

MR BATSILE: Nnyaa rra intshwarele, o tlaa bua ka nako ya gago, o Tona. O ntse o bua fela jaaka ke bua, e bile o tle o re o a peperetla, mma ke peperetle. Itshegetse fela jalo, ga ke ye gope.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: (Laughter)


HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR BATSILE: Ke latotse, ke a fetsa.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Ke nna tlhe, ntsalaka.

MR BATSILE: Nnyaa, Kulenyane, ga ke a re omang nna fa fatshe. Ke a tswelela Ke tsena mo go tsa temo-thuo.

MR KWELAGOBE: Point of order, Madam Speaker. Mokaulengwe le fa a shakgetse, my point of order ke gore he is misleading the House. Education with production e tlile ka Van Rensburg. Mme ka nako ya Van Rensburg a preach education for production, my Honourable friend Rre Batsile e ne e le mo Domkrag, e ne e se mo Front.
MR BATSILE: Ke a leboga, Mmaetsho. Nnyaa mo, ke mo ka Setswana re reng, ke go dia ditiro, ke se dia barwaledi. A kgakala le se o buang. Ene Van Rensburg yo le ne le mo supa ka monwana le re fa a tsweletse le dithuto tse o tsunya boranyane, o eme BNF nokeng. A le raya a re thuto ke thuto ya diatla, rutang bana. Wa re point of order, point of correction. Wa re nnya, re ne rele mmogo mo platformong.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR BATSILE: Ee, ka rialo ka re ne re fora batho le wena. Ke a dumalana.

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: (Laughter)!

MR BATSILE: Ke a tswelela. National Master Plan for Arable Agriculture and Dairy Development (NAMPAADD). E kgang ya NAMPAADD bagaetsho, fa o tsena mo lephateng la temo, nnyaa, ke go senya nako. NAMPAADD ga e na maungo. Le fa e bala dipalo; mo ke dipalo fela tsa gore re tsamaise nako. Tahal Consultant e e leng gore e teng le jaana, sa yone ke go ja madi fela a Batswana. Ga gona maduo a re ka a bayang fa pele.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR BATSILE: Ee dipula ga di yo, mo ngwageng e e neng e feta go ne go na le pharologanyo, mme Tahal e ntse e le teng sa yone e nnetse go ja madi fela; ba a ne ba goletsega go twee ba fiwa malatsi ba ya ga bone. Ba duelelwa ditshenyegelo tse di seng kana ka sepe tse di ka bong di tlhobaeditse bana gore ba bone diphatlha kwa bo Sebele. Madi a tshameka kwa Tahal go bo go twee ke consultancy. Fa o tsaya report e, is it 139 million yo go tweng ke wa consultants under Ministry of Local Government, ke go tshameka; that is waste of time. Goromente wa consultants wa ga Domkrag. O fora Batswana ka eng? Lo re tsamaisa jang; le tshameka ka Batswana…
Monday 12 February 2007

HONOURABLE MEMBERS: (Laughter)!

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Batsile…

MR BATSILE: Ke a e feta ya agriculture.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, ke ne ke re, Rra le fa o tsweletse jaaka o tsweletse comply with Standing Order 41 (1) “A member shall speak standing” okay you are standing, “and address his observations to the Speaker.” Jaanong wena o gaketse fela ke gore… (Laughter)! … Tswelela.

MR BATSILE: Tanki Mmaetsho. Ke a leboga, Mmaetsho. Ga o ntshineletse batho ke ba ba batla go nja mokale. Jaanong mma ke e fete. Ke ne ke le fa go tsu temo, Mma. Mo bananeng ke ntse ke le ka fa tlase ga temo, yone thulaganyo e gotweng banana ba pepetlediwe ba ya go fiwa madi ba tsene mo temong. Ga e kake ya re rona bagolo re tlogela ditiro retiring, re tshabela kwa dipolotiking, re tsaya dikonteraka mo go goromente ra solofela gore bana ba tlaa kaelwa ke mang tsela. Ga go kake ga kgonega. Ke tsela fela ya gore re nne mooko mo baneng, re ba okele mo go se re itseng gore ga ba ka ke ba se kgona. Moo ke ‘didiya barwaleng.’ Ke ne ke rata gore re e tshegetse jalo; le itse. Le tla ka mananeo a mantle a a paletseng rona bagolo ba re sielang mo Ntlong e, ba re batlang go isiwa dikoleng re tsofetse, ba re ganelelang mo ditirong. Jaanong Motlotlegi Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, tsa temo ke ne ke re le yone ke e tlopinye ke e fete go le kalo.

Mma ke sutelele mo metsing a lefatshe, Mmaetsho…

MR GAOLATHE: Madam Speaker, on a point of clarification. Thank you very much, Honourable Member. I just want to be clear. I assume the Honourable Member is talking about the Youth Fund which government is extending to young people up to the age of
Monday 12 February 2007

35. Is the Honourable Member saying that all the youth in this country will not take advantage of this? Part of the concern was that the youth were complaining that they do not have the capital, the credit to make a start and we were seeing a situation where in fact agriculture could be abandoned because the average age of the farmer at present is more than 55 years. And unless we do something to attract these young people we will have more and more land as an example lying fallow. So, I am not very clear what the Honourable Member is saying. Is he saying this fund is not called for?

MADAM SPEAKER: You are left with two minutes, Member.

MR BATSILE: Ka bokhutshwane Rra ka re, ga e ka ke ya re lona batsadi ba bone le tlhotswe ke letsema, goromente a paletswe ke go le emeletsa le ganelela mo ditirong, la bo le solofela gore ba ka tswa ka sengwe. Le tshwanetse le nne lona examples. Ke se ke se buang. E khutshwane fela e kalo.

Ke ne ke utlwa Motlotlegi Rre Nkate a ja nala fale kgantele a bua ka kgang e a neng a e bua ya go tokafatsa matshelo a batho. Ga e ka ke ya re go sa ntse go retsete mo nakong e gore le tokafatse minimum wage, le paletswe ke go tla ka metlhale e e lolameng gore kwa dipolaseng le kwa magaeng go bo go na le tokafatso ya mothala, re na le the standing policy re sa ntse re oshaosha, le bo le re re itaya re re re tlaa tokafaletsa Batswana matshelo. Nnyaa moo ke ‘di diya barwaledi’ fela go senya nako. Ke ne ke re ke e ame ka bokhutshwane mo nakong e e setseng e mpheletse.

Mmaetsho ke re, mo go tse dingwe jaaka metsi le tsa meepo ee, re tshwanetse meepo ya nna teng. Mme fa e nna teng kana e tlaa leretse Batswana ditiro ke boammaruri, mme re tshwanetse ra bona tsela e e leng gore e dira ka yone ditiro. Ga e nne meepo fela e e leng gore la bofelo e tlaa bo e le gore e ya go sologela ditoropo molemo. Re gana go ya kwa
magaeng; gompienjaana re tsere diteemane kwa Orapa le Jwaneng re ya go di tlhatswetsa kwa Molepololoe. Fa re ne re tlola batho ba Moshana re ne re ba tlola ka lefe; ba e leng gore ke bone motswedi wa lefatshe le ba butseng meepo mo Batswana? Ga se tsela e ntle. Re tshwanetse to balance these things. O bo o di tsaya gape o di isa Serowe, ga se gone. Fa ke go timetsa Batswana e bile ke bokoa.

Ke ne ke re ya bofelo ke digele ke re nnyaa, Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) yone e jele Batswana ntsoma thata, Mmaetsho ka gore ya re, kgomo fa e le ka tlase ga 200 kilograms, tlhwatlhwya yone e lolea ga e a tswala e kwa tlase. Ditlhwatlhwa ka fa di ts hologitsweng ka teng di setse di siilwe ke selekanyo. Ditlhwatlhwa di ka bo di ne tsa tsholetsega ka bo 70 per cent, 40 per cent yo le leng mo go ene le sa ntse le eja mmamadikwadikwane; le tshameka ka Batswana le ba gopetse mo lebakeng le le leele.

Ke ne ke re ke e supe jalo. Ke a leboga.

**MR G. D. LEFHOKO (SHOSHONG):** Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me rise to say that the Bill before us enjoys my support though I have concerns that I will raise. I want to start by referring generally to the fact that there are three arms of Government and everybody by now knows that there is the Legislature, Executive and the Judiciary. My concerns are in the relationship between the Executive and the Judiciary and the pretensions that we want to parade as measures of convenience. True that we extract our Executive from the Members of Parliament and upon extraction then they seize in reality to be Legislatures and true representatives of the people. I am raising this because it is displayed in the budgeting process. You will find that the budget is a process driven mainly by the Executive and the role of this particular Parliament being to rubberstamp.

We must understand that for as long as this Parliament places itself in the position of a
rubberstamp; things will continue the way they are. We will continue to complain about
the same things. Therefore, the role of a Member of Parliament during the budget debate
in my view follows the following pattern year in and year out. We come here, some opt to
shower felicitations, some opt for commendations and then at the end of these niceties
they come out with lamentations. Between felicitations and lamentations a few opt to
critic the budget. That is as far as it will go. Even where you see that there would have
been necessary changes the rules set out prevent any changes. In fact the timing of the
whole process is such that you should come here felicitate sometimes critic and then
lament. And then as the Honourable Former Member for Maun/Chobe would say, and
then ‘the caravan moves on’.

Madam Speaker, Executives are necessarily about control because they rely on
bureaucracy red tape and autocracy. Parliaments are about accountability, transparency
and democracy. We need to strike the balance between these institutions in order to
ultimately serve Batswana right. For as long as there is a total skewed approach where the
Executive controls everything, we will continue to fail to deliver to our constituents.

MOTION
ADJOURNMENT

MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION
(MR KWELAGOBE): Madam Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and agreed to.

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 7 p.m. until Wednesday 14th February 2007 at
2.30 p.m.

Wednesday 14th February 2007
QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

PATIENTS ON ARV TREATMENT DISQUALIFIED FROM FOOD RATIONS

MR M. E. RALETOBANA (KWENENG SOUTH EAST): asked the Minister of Local Government:

i. if she is aware that some people who are on ARV treatment have been disqualified from the recent food rations irrespective of their employment status and that this has resulted in their defaulting in taking ARV drugs;

ii. will the Minister consider reinstating their entitlement to food rations as they cannot take ARV medication on empty stomachs.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, people who are on anti-retroviral (ARV) treatment do not automatically qualify for food rations.

The procedure is that doctors continually assess the health status of home-based patients and recommend them for food supplementation according to their needs. As soon as their health improves and the doctors discharge them from the Home Based Care (HBC) programme, social workers should assess them for their needy status in order to determine whether or not the patients should receive food rations under the destitute programme.
If the Honourable Member is aware of patients who, as he puts it, take ARV on empty stomachs, he should bring them to the attention of authorities without delay. I thank you.

MR SEBETELA: Madam Speaker, will the Minister emphasise the fact that the status of employment is not the only consideration because there are people who are not employed but who are very rich., who should not be benefiting from ARV. So that other people who have nothing can be assisted by Government.

MR MASALILA: I entirely agree with the Member and I confirm that he is correct.

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE SECOND PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION ON LOCAL GOVERNMENT STRUCTURE

MR M. E. RALETOBANA (KWENENG SOUTH EAST): asked the Minister of Local Government:

i. what progress has been made in the implementation of the accepted recommendation of the Second Presidential Commission on Local Government Structure contained in Government Paper No.1 of 2004, under coordination of decentralization functions, items 9.3.3 (a) and 9.3.3 (b);

ii. is the Minister aware that despite having the CTO in Gaborone and Mogoditshane within a distance of less than 15 kms, Council vehicles fuel in Molepolole which is 50 kms away; and

iii. when will the accepted recommendations be implemented to save or avoid petrol wastage by various Government Departments.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, I have been made aware that council vehicles in Gabane and Mogoditshane
travel to Molepolole for fuel, despite their proximity to Central Transport Organisation (CTO) in Gaborone.

This is a problem that I believe is not beyond the powers of the Kweneng District Council to resolve. They could, for instance arrange with a private garage in Mogoditshane to fuel council vehicles; and be paid at agreed intervals. We have brought this matter to the attention of Kweneng District Council and I hope it will be dealt with as soon as possible.

I thank you.

POLICY ON ALLOCATION OF OPEN SPACES IN GABORONE

MR A. MAGAMA (GABORONE): asked the Minister of Lands and Housing:

i. to outline his Ministry’s policy with respect to the allocation of open spaces in the City of Gaborone;

ii. in addition, the Minister should state whether the allocation of Plot 2394 in Bontleng was effected in accordance with this policy.

MINISTER OF LANDS AND HOUSING (MR SERETSE): Madam Speaker, open spaces are a designated land use in a settlement development plan and they include parks, pedestrian ways, playgrounds and other sites for communal use.

Government has taken a position that open spaces should be retained as such and not be rezoned for any other use.

If, however, circumstances should arise where it becomes necessary to re-zone an open space and allocate it, the Department of Lands in the Ministry will apply to the Town and Country Planning Board to change the use. The following, amongst others must be verified:
a) that the intended rezoning will not reduce the amount of open space required for the total area;

b) that there is no available land elsewhere for the proposed use and that there is a need for same;

c) that the proposed use is compatible with other uses in the proximity;

d) that the proposed use is aesthetically acceptable and is accessible.

Madam Speaker, once the change of use is approved the land can be allocated to any person in accordance with the normal allocation procedures. These could be direct or through public advertising.

It is my understanding that Plot 2394 in Bontleng was rezoned after the above considerations and was allocated through the direct process.

I thank you.

**SETTING UP A COMMITTEE TO INVESTIGATE MANAGEMENT AND LABOUR RELATIONS AT BCL**

**MR A. MAGAMA (GABORONE SOUTH):** asked the Minister of Labour and Home Affairs whether, in view of the numerous reports of conflict between management and workers of BCL, he does not consider it necessary to set up a committee to investigate management and labour relations at the mine.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LABOUR AND HOME AFFAIRS (MR MATLHABAPHIRI):** Madam Speaker, the Government has been concerned about labour relations at BCL mine. In the last one to two years, these relations have been characterised by dismissals, work stoppages and general souring of relations between the management and the union.
In view of this Madam Speaker, the Ministries of Minerals, Energy and Water Resources and Labour and Home Affairs held discussions with various affected parties during the month of December 2006. I am currently reviewing the information which was gathered, with a view to determining the next course of action. The option of further consultations therefore remains open.

I thank you Madam Speaker.

**MR MOATLHODI**: Ka Motlotlegi Mothusa Tona a re o sa ntse a sekaseka mabaka a gore o ka boela leng kwa kgannya e e botlhokwa e, fa a bona o ka bo a dirile leng ka pela? Le gone selelo se se botlhokotlhoko se se setseng se diragetse o ikaeletse go se alafa jang?

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI**: Ke tlhalositse jalo Motlotlegi Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente gore ditshekatsheko di dirilwe, mme kana go tshwanetse gore one maphata a mabedi a a puso, a thulanye ditlhogo, go bonwe gore tota go ka dirwa eng. Gore ke leng, go tlaa ya le gore Matona a maphata a mabedi a bonye nako leng go thulanya ditlhogo.

**MR KARIO**: Kana ga re tlhaloganye gore Tona a reng. A wa re go na le *meeting* mongwe o le setseng le o rulagantse le le maphata a le tshwanetseng go simolola *progress* kana, le tlaa tsaya ngwaga otlhe le ntse le emetse gore le tlaa kopana?

**MR MATLHABAPHIRI**: Nnyaa, ga ke ise ke ko ke re gona le phuthego nngwe e e setseng e dumalanwe gore e nna leng. Ka ke ka bo ke tlhalositse le gore e nna leng, nako mang.

Ka re, re sa ntse re sekaseka pego e e dirilweng morago ga ditlhotalhomiso tseo, mme fa re sena go nna re e sekaseka, maphata oo mabedi, Matona a teng ba tlaa rakana, mme jaanong ba bo ba bona gore tsela ampo dikgato go ka tsewa dife.
PASS RATE FOR BATSWANA STUDENTS IN THE FACULTY OF SCIENCE AT UNIVERSITY OF BOTSWANA

MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Education what has been the pass rate for Batswana students in the Faculty of Science at the University of Botswana over the last five years and state whether he is satisfied with it, and if not, state what he is doing to address the situation.

MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR NKATE): Madam Speaker, during the 2002-2003 academic year, University of Botswana changed over from an academic subject system to an academic course credit system. The previous subject system placed emphasis on students passing the subject, for example, Biology, Chemistry, Mathematics or Physics by averaging the final marks in the component courses.

The new system, on the other hand, puts emphasis on the mastery of the knowledge and skills in individual courses. As example, a chemistry student has to pass all four components of physical chemistry, organic chemistry, inorganic chemistry and analytical chemistry, (subjects of which I am very familiar). And requires that each course be passed with a minimum grade of 50 per cent. Students have to pass and earn a specified minimum number of credits to earn the qualification.

The higher academic standards required are designed to improve the quality of programmes as well as to ensure that graduates learn the subjects to the breadth and depth required.

The pass rate in 2002 and 2003 was 93.8 per cent and 87.9 per cent respectively. For the recent past three academic years, the pass rate has been steady around 50 per cent.

The sharp drop in the pass rate is largely attributable to two factors:
i) A student must pass all components of a subject they take to meet the minimum number of credits requirements;

ii) All levels/years of study from the entry year to the final year count in the final average grade. In the previous system, the final average grade was based on the final two years (Years 3 and 4) of study.

The passing rates are of course a concern Madam Speaker. The Faculty of Science has identified the school preparation of students for Science and Mathematics as a problem. Most students entering with a double award are not adequately prepared for the Science and Mathematics studies at university level. The changes to the assessment procedures also contribute to a drop in the pass rate, but once the system settles in the grades should improve.

The Faculty of Science and the University are working to improve the pass rates. This is a multifaceted issue. The Faculty of Science in association with the Department of Maths and Science Education is forming a liaison committee to identify the contributing factors and then to approach the Curriculum Development Division in the Ministry of Education with issues and proposals. The University of Botswana will also continually look into issues concerning the quality of its curriculum, staffing levels, class sizes, the size and quality of facilities. I can confirm that the said committee has already been formed. I thank you.

VIOLENT CRIMES IN PALAPYE SINCE 2004

MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister for Presidential Affairs and Public Administration to update the House on the incidence of violent crime in the village of Palapye since 2004 and whether measures to mitigate the situation are bearing fruit.
MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

(MR SKELEMANI): Thank you Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the update on the incidence of violent crime in Palapye since 2004 is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OFFENCE</th>
<th>2004</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2006</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Murder</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robbery/Attempts</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rape/Attempts</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grievous Harm</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rape/Attempts</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsual Wounding</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecent Assault</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defilement of persons under the age of 16 years</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assault Common</td>
<td>264</td>
<td>232</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assault occasioning actual bodily harm</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burglary and theft</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>328</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House breaking and theft</td>
<td>246</td>
<td>194</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Store breaking and theft</td>
<td>278</td>
<td>143</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Madam Speaker, it is clear that violent crime is generally on the decline in this policing area, and efforts are continuing to push it down further. This is a clear indication that measures in place are bearing fruit.

In addition to the measures in place a new Police Station with 70 residential houses is due for construction during the financial year 2007/2008. This should allow the Botswana Police Service to make substantial manpower increases in this area.

I thank you Madam Speaker.
Monday 12 February 2007

MR SALESHANDO: Mo karabong ya ga Tona o ne a bua ka dipalo tsa unlawful wounding, ke ne ke re gongwe a re tlhalosetse gore e kgaogannngwa jang, lawful wounding ke fa go ntse jang?

MR SKELEMANI: Lawful wounding is when you provoke me and I hit you back.

**TABLEING OF PAPERS**

The following papers were tabled:

**REPORT OF THE PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE ALLEGED FINANCIAL ADMINISTRATION IRREGULARITIES AND CORRUPTION AT THE BOTSWANA TECHNOLOGY CENTRE (BOTEC)**

(Minister of Communications, Science and Technology)

**WHITE PAPER ON REPORT OF THE PRESIDENTIAL COMMISSION OF INQUIRY INTO THE ALLEGED FINANCIAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE IRREGULARITIES AND CORRUPTION AT THE BOTSWANA TECHNOLOGY CENTRE (BOTEC)**

(Minister of Communications, Science and Technology)

MR MOKGWATHI: *On a point of procedure Madam Speaker.* Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Gore ke seka ka itlhabisa dithong, ke botsa gore tsamaiso ke efe fa go na le dipampiri tse di ntseng jaana, tse di nnileng teng ka lebaka la gore Palamente e tsere tshwetso ya gore go dirwe selo sa go nna jaana. Fa e tla mo Palamenteng e taibolwa fela, a go na le nako e re tlaa buisanyang ka yone re bo re tsaya tshwetso? *I am not familiar with this thing* fa e le gore ke dule mo tseleng o tlaa intshwarela Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mme ke ne ke eletsa go itse.
MADAM SPEAKER: O tlaa botsa re le ko caucuseng, gape o bale le tsone di standing orders but do ask. Tomorrow we have a caucus so o ka botsa ko teng.

TRAINING BY TRANSFORMATION SYSTEMS INTERNATIONAL

Statement

MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR NKATE): Madam Speaker, I am compelled to make a statement on the questions raised by Honourable Molefhabangwe on Monday 12th February 2007 as he made his contribution to the Budget Speech delivered by Minister of Finance and Development Planning. Specifically, I wish to address myself to his comments on the training my Ministry has sourced from Transformation Systems International.

I am aware Madam Speaker that the Honourable Member wished for the Minister of Finance in his reply to the debate on the Budget Speech to comment on these questions. I am also mindful however, that the Minister will have very limited time and could not devote sufficient attention to these matters.

Madam Speaker, I am compelled to make this intervention because I take seriously the Honourable Member’s insinuation that this transaction could be improper and even smack of corruption. The same insinuation is made in the article “Ministers Should Account for Millions – MP” which was the front-page story of Mmegi of Tuesday 13th February 2007. When Assistant Minister Mbaakanyi asked for a Question to be tabled, to give us the opportunity to investigate and give a more researched answer, the Honourable Member only lampooned her. I have to respond now rather than later lest this Honourable House and members of the public are left with the impression that there was something improper about this particular transaction. The impression that is created is that the
monies that are mentioned are going into personal accounts of individuals and that is contained in the Hansard as I have read it. In fact Madam Speaker, the paper goes so far as to allege that the parties into whose accounts the monies were being sent are individuals from my constituency. This is of course ludicrous. I think it should be stated for general information that here in the Republic of Botswana Ministers do not have access to public funds so as to personally mobilise the same into private accounts. This simply cannot happen.

Madam Speaker, I wish to confirm that;

I. An amount of P4,645,794.97 (US$ 756,800) was paid to transformation Systems International’s account with Bank of America, Account No. 2111118204 in Portland, Oregon, USA, with respect to Invoice No. 906 -14.

II. Payment was made for training 80 Ministry of Education employees (teachers, lecturers and education officers), selected from headquarters and all the Education Regions, in Change Agent Training and Leadership Strategies (CATALYST).

III. Training was approved by Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board (PPADB) on the 21st December 2006.

IV. The purpose of the training is to develop capacity within the Ministry of Education to drive Performance Improvement initiatives down to the school level in order to improve service delivery. The Trained Change Agents will in turn train teachers and officers in 724 primary schools, 233 secondary schools, 6 Colleges of Education, 7 Technical Colleges, 12 Education Centres, 11 regional offices, 9 Departments and 4 Divisions at my Ministry Headquarters. The 80 trained Change Agents will provide training to some 25 000 teachers and 9 000 Ministry Staff.
My Ministry is one of the biggest employers in the public service with a total establishment of over 34 000. I am giving these numbers relative to the number of people that we are sending overseas, which is 80. It is therefore, inevitable that if we are to effectively cascade performance improvement to all levels we will require many trainers. In fact, in the past we have trained officers as Change Agents who have since transferred to other Ministries, a fact of which we are proud as we are a human resource development Ministry!

Having the training conducted in the US will afford the participants the unique opportunity to visit sites and observe first-hand the concepts that are taught, being put into practice in the real world. This strengthens belief in the efficacy of the concepts.

It should be noted Madam Speaker that Transformation Systems International has a long-standing relationship with the Government of Botswana to provide training in CATALYST and Ministries are expected to make their own arrangements to finance their training.

The officers and teachers that are going for this training are broken up as follows;

11 from Headquarters
13 from the Central region
11 from the North Region
10 from South Region
14 from South Central
12 from the West Region, by the way Madam Speaker the West Region comprises Ghanzi District, Chobe District and North West District and then there are 9 from Colleges of Education and Technical Colleges
All these comprise 24 primary school teachers, 25 secondary school teachers 9 lecturers and 22 Education Officers.

Madam Speaker, while it is the prerogative of any Honourable Member, indeed a right of any Honourable Member to receive information and make enquiries on matters of national interest, Members should be wary of being fed misinformation by disgruntled officers and then publicly repeating the same without first investigating. This especially since my Ministry has always maintained an open door policy.

I hope that this information answers the Honourable Member’s questions and sets the record straight that there is nothing improper or corrupt about this particular transaction.

I thank you.

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Ke botsa potso di le pedi. Potso ya ntlha ke ya tsamaiso ka gore gatwe fa go sena go ntshiwa pego e ntse jaana, ga re a tshwanela go bua ka yone re tshwanetse ra botsa. Potso ya ntlha ke gore fa pego e ntse jaana, e le gore ga e arabe e bile e fapaana le se motho a neng a se bua go dirwa jang ka yone?

Potso ya bobedi ke gore a go ne go se kaone gore ka gore batho bao ke ba bantsi motlotlegi o bua ka bone go bo ba ka tsisetswa motho fa gore go fokotswe bokete jwa madi go ba ntshetsa ko ntle? Jaanong Tona fa o bua ka bo insinuation, o bua ka bo gore gongwe go na le pelaelo ya gore madi a tsene mo dipateng tsu batho. Le fa ke bala fale I never mentioned gore an individual’s account ke badile le leina la banka, meaning that a bank will never be an individual. Jaanong fa statement se ntse jaana se nale some pockets of misunderstanding of what I said go dirwa jang ka that statement?

MADAM SPEAKER: Ga go na response.
MR LEFHOKO (SHOSHONG): Thank you Madam Speaker. I was just talking about the different arms of Government. I was stating that for as long as we continue the way we do our role in the Budget would be just to rubberstamp. I take it that we have all benefited in the past and more recently by a workshop organised by this Parliament. We learnt what it means to be a rubberstamp Parliament, well on the continuum, the mid-point arena and a transformative Parliament.

In the way we are structured, we cannot run away from rubberstamping. It is until we have portfolio committees that we would begin to impact positively on the Budget. In particular being, as stated by colleagues who spoke before me, one of the most important pieces of legislation that we have to pass on an annual basis. This is because at the end we will pass it from bill to law authorising the different ministries to go and spend and implement the projects.

Be that as it may, I need to hasten also to say that one of the bottlenecks created that impedes implementation and is in-built in the system in as far as the Executive is concerned is bureaucracy coupled with layers and layers of red-tape. If you are a supplier of goods or services to Government, in order to get paid there is a whole processing of papers. Several officers have to just look at them and make a little mark, little signature here, a little mark here. It is a whole lot of red-tape. What we find in most cases in
executives of Government is that there is a lot of this red-tape and it is one word which actually makes it difficult for Government to implement project expeditiously.

Madam Speaker we have been told that we have euphemism if you want to right size and downsize. We have been told by some people that some experts, if I may use that word, that our civil service is bloated that is why there has been a freeze on the recruitment and creation of posts and so forth. In spite of the fact that we have continued to establish new ministries which necessitate that personnel be put in place. Therefore in instances like this we have actually created a situation, a fertile environment to fail to implement.

I have argued, and it is my opinion, that the so-called bloated civil service has a historical background and I think the situation continues in the civil service. If you join the administrative cadre, your chances of progressing to positions where you get better rewards and packs are higher than when you are just concentrating on your professional…

**MR SALESHANDO:** Ke kopa tlhaloso. Thank you, Madam Speaker. Indeed, the Honourable Member has in the past also expressed concern at the bloated civil service. Would you be kind enough to state the source of that information for the benefit of those of us who have not seen it?

**MR LEFHOKO:** Thank you, Madam Speaker. Right now on my feet, I cannot put my finger on the source per se but I will be able to find it for you and in fact, I have said experts at workshops, at seminars, Ministers in this very House have said so. I am aware that even at Cabinet it has been decided a few years ago to freeze recruitment, so I can check which Minister said what at a later stage. However, it has been reported - even reported to this House at Ministerial level. In my opinion, because of this skewed way of thinking where rewards are associated with administrative positions, you will find that
that is why we have doctors striving to be Permanent Secretaries. You have a specialist Surgeon at Marina who would rather be a Permanent Secretary because that is the only way they can get reward and therefore people have moved away.

There is a large number of professionals who are just locked in the Government bureaucracy doing clerical work and not fully utilising the skills and the knowledge that we have given them through education and training. Of course, the negative attitude that pervades where if anyone wants to leave the civil service and venture in the private sector they become a target. A target from colleagues to make sure that, that person must fail, *tota o ne a re o leka eng, o ne a re o ya kae*? That type of thing, I think the PhD syndrome that has been spoken about here in this House even by His Excellency the President in some of his speeches addressing the nation in this House.

Now, we are stuck with a thick layer of bureaucracy and professionals are not getting the necessary rewards. If you look at the Education Commission; the 1994 Education Report and the White Paper emanating from it, which is the policy. As an example, look at the pupil-teacher ratios. Within the 25-year period, we will start to move away from high pupil-teacher ratios as an example. We will move away from the 40s and 50s and try to move to the 40s, to the 30s, to the 25 levels of pupil-teacher ratios. That means we should employ, we should actually be employing more teachers because we are reducing the ratios; the proportions. However, we have many teachers roaming the streets, professionals roaming the streets because we are maintaining this cadre of administrators who perpetuate bureaucracy with the consequent layers and layers of red tape, that impede implementation. Therefore, we should actually look into resolving this because we need the professionals. We need those teachers in order to reduce the ratios and meet
the objectives of the National Policy on Education. I believe that these are some of the areas that we should explore.

Of course, I must hasten to move to the issue of decentralisation. Decentralisation over the years has formed part of the many speeches. Speeches that come to this House at the beginning of Parliament and during the budget, have been playing around with issues of decentralisation and the budget speech in particular, always toys around with the issue of economic diversification. Speeches are replete with these themes but we do not - we do not go ahead and do it. The Ministry of Local Government has attempted through their Councils but still, you know it is not enough to set up Councils, give them certain responsibilities and hold authority centrally. It fails the process of decentralisation.

The Central District Council, where I was a Member, ventured to not only devolve powers to the Sub-Districts but the exercise is incomplete because you know we have national policy to look at and their constraints. However, I do commend the Ministry of Local Government for their efforts with regard to decentralisation. Of course, a lot is still to be done to achieve the near ideal scenario. For as long as we are centrist in our approach, implementation will continue to be a problem because it has been blamed on something called capacity. I think we often and rightly so, pat ourselves on the back as a country and as a Government for having successfully over the years spent a lot of money on education and produced both locally and outside good products of the education system to serve our economy. Therefore, why do we have capacity problems?

It is also the lack of experience; I do not know where these young Batswana ought to get the experience, if we do not give them the jobs to do. I know many are Batswana young people who formed companies in various fields of endeavour and professions. I can name
for instance, Architects but they have been frustrated out there because they are not given the jobs to gain the necessary experience, to create the capacity that we will forever need if indeed, our path as a Government and a nation would be to continuously pursue development and the bettering of the living standards of our people. We need to take bold steps and, of course, I will come at some stage in this brief intervention because 25 minutes really is not enough, to deal with issues of citizen economic empowerment.

However, let me commend the Ministry of Finance for the P10 million dispensation that is being given to the Ministries. This is a step in the right direction; that I must say. The limitation is that there has not been training. This Government does not have any trained buyers. Procurement is about buying and we have not trained buyers and historically, we are told by Honourable Members of Parliament (MPs) and Ministers who have been former Permanent Secretaries and have held other responsible positions in this very Government; that the Department of Supplies and indeed Parliament in the past, I am not sure whether it still obtains today but in the past, there are many people who have come on record to say that these were areas where non-performers were dumped. However, they are charged with such the responsible tasks of procurement. We need to train our people to deal with these challenges; to throw money at problems is not…

MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE): On a point of correction.

MR LEFHOKO: I am not aware of that one on the Standing Orders.

MADAM SPEAKER (MS KOKORWE): Are you yielding?

MR LEFHOKO: To what, Madam Speaker?

MADAM SPEAKER: To Honourable Minister's request.
Monday 12 February 2007

MR LEFHOKO: He is raising a point that does not exist in the Standing Orders, so I am incumbent.

MADAM SPEAKER: What did you say Honourable Minister?

MR GAOLATHE: On a point of correction, Madam Speaker.

MADAM SPEAKER: Could it be clarification, Honourable Minister or elucidation?

MR GAOLATHE: Well, I can move to clarification but deal with a point of correction.

MR LEFHOKO: On what point does the Minister want me to…

MADAM SPEAKER: Clarification.

MR LEFHOKO: That is right, thank you.

MR GAOLATHE: Thank you very much. The Honourable Member is referring to the P10 million at Paragraph 108. The P10 million does not refer to procurement, it refers to project memoranda. In other words, when Departments prepare project memos to go ahead with certain projects, which are in the Plan, what we are saying is that; if those projects are going to cost P10 million or below that, they do not have to go beyond the Ministry. The Accounting Officer concerned can approve those projects. Thank you.

MR LEFHOKO: Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. I am not too sure, let me thank the Minister for his purported correction. The Accounting Officer would approve a project up to P10 million and below, and in the end whatever the project be it consultancies, be it construction of whatever, then that Ministry will procure the services. Therefore, I do not see where the procurement disappears.

MR GAOLATHE: If I may clarify further.

MR LEFHOKO: Oh, sure.
MR GAOLATHE: The procurement, in other words the PPADB (Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board) has procurement entities - there are procurement entities within Ministries. They have different limits; the limits do not necessarily have to coincide with this particular limit. Thank you.

MR LEFHOKO: Thank you very much. Whatever coincidence, at the end there will be procurement after the PM is approved by the Accounting Officer. That Ministry using all the structures including Ministry, Ministerial Procurement Committees and PPADB and whoever should be involved at what level of financing, procurement will take place. Therefore, I do not see where we are alinger, if I may borrow the Moeng College expressions from Honourable P. P. P.

However, be that as it may, I am even saying that the procurement committees in the Ministries need to be strengthened in terms of training; in Government and Council anybody who buys, he is a buyer. You just send Clerks there they become biased over night. It is like asking, go and buy my children some Christmas clothes or Valentine Day clothes. You think you do not have to train; I train my wife how to buy because I am trained as a buyer.

MADAM SPEAKER: You are left with three minutes.

MR LEFHOKO: Nako e e padile. Let me finish my brief intervention by looking at issues of productivity. Productivity is one of the things that continues to elude us and therefore assist in our failure to implement projects.

I am actually at a loss because this government has gone out to buy every supposed best practice intervention to reform the civil service and should have the consequence of increasing productivity. But productivity continues to diminish in spite of the WITS that
we have gone through, the current PMS, its PBRS and Balanced Scorecard which this
country procures every alleged best practice system to reform and improve productivity,
but productivity continues to plummet. There must be other issues that we are not
addressing.

I think one of the issues that affect the morale of our public service is the paltry purported
increase like the 6 per cent announcement that we just got recently. Over the years the
very Ministry of Finance and Development Planning has inflicted a lot of pain through
their devaluations and all sorts of things. I am not saying they should not have devaluated,
I always quarrel with the approach, it was just not the right way, too shocking to the
system, and they know where Batswana are landed today. So talking about 8 per cent last
year and now 6 per cent, I do not think will do well to motivate our public service. I do
not know why this time the Minister of Finance and Development Planning chose to call
it an increase. In the past we have been cautious, we have talked about inflation
adjustments, but then he chose to call it an increase; that even baffles me further. There
are just too many issues and no time.

I must end my intervention by saying that, I do not agree with the manner in which money
was gotten and the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning is not getting tired
lately to be at it again. Lately we have heard that the Ministry of Finance has been
sleeping and private companies have been the ones running around identifying people
who can lend Botswana money. So I am not impressed with that approach and I hope
there will be no repeats where companies end up getting awarded contracts because they
are being rewarded for being the ones who have identified sources of funding. The
Assistant Minister of Finance came out…
MR MASI SI (FRANCISTOWN WEST): Ke a go leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke ema tshutiso e ya tiriso ya madi ya ngwaga o nokeng. Ke akgola Tona go bay a puo ya gagwe ka botswerere a e tlhalosa ka tsamaiso ya rona e re e itseng e bile re tlhaloganya gore re na le mananeo a a tshwanetseng go dirwa. Mme e bile a ntshitse le matshwenyego le tsotlhe tse di ka dirang gore go lejwe matshwenyego a rona, bogolo jang go fetisa tse di solofetsweng go dirwa.

Ke akgola le yone puso ya Domkraga e e busang, e e tshwereng ka thata go bopa le go babalela setshaba sa yone. Mme e dira ka bonatla gore se e se ikanetseng fa e tsaya puso, e re e tlaa busa ka puso ya batho ka batho, mme e ba bay a mo ma i lamong le maikan a bone a puso ya batho ka batho, democracy. Le gore e tlaa aga popagano ya batho, unity, e bo e e fa maikan a gore nako le nako re tlaa boela kwa go lona le le Batswana gore le re kanoke gore a re le busa jaaka re ne re dumalane. Mme le gone re le solofetsa gore re tlaa le tlhabolola, development. Fa re bua ka tse tsa madi tse, re bua ka fa le phateng la
development ya go tsamaisa di-project le tse tsotlhe tse re di solofeditseng batho re di dire. Re mo maikanong a re a dirileng mo setshabeng. Mme ke lebogela bonatla jo ka ga re ise re bone ba ba ka solofetsang jaaka re solofetsa setshaba sa Botswana, re tsaya fela le mo Afrika ka fa re tshwereng ka teng. Go na le bangwe ba ditsala tsa rona ba re utlwalelang gore ba kopa gore setshaba se ba kolekele, gore ba dire birthday party. Jaanong, ga go ise go nne, re sa ntse re tshwere puso re ntse re dira ditsholofetso tsa rona. E bile setshaba se a re tshepa ka gore fa re bua gore re tlaa dira jaana, re dira jalo. E seng gore ka moso re bo re fetogela mafoko a rona.

Ke dumalana le Tona fela sentle fa a re re na le dikgwetlho, challenges, tse di re lebaganeng, tse e leng gore re tshwanetse go itsise Batswana ka tsone. Gore Batswana
wee, botshelo jo bo tlang bo thata, re itshwarelele, e re le sa ntse le tlhabile re le aramele.

Le rona re le babusi fa e sa ntse *economy* kampo itsholelo ya rona e le botoka, a re e diriseng sentle gore kwa bofelong re kgone gore Batswana ba rona ba tle ba obe letsogo, ba tshele sentle ka go nne dingwaga tse di tlang, go tlaa bo go le bokete. Gompieno ke dumalana le setlhogo se Tona a se beileng fa pele ga rona a bua ka:

5) *Improved productivity*. Ke gore, go tsholetsa bonatla

6) *Sustainable economic diversification* – Diphetogo kampo dikakanyo tsa itsholelo, kampo go baakanya itsholelo ya rona kampo go akanya sesha go akanya go tlhabolola itsholelo ya rona.

7) *A global competitiveness* e e leng gore re lebagana le yone e etla. Re rile re a e tshaba mme e ntse e tlaa goroga, e e leng gore e tsile go dira gore botshelo jwa rona bo nne bokete. Kana e tlaa bo e le dikgaisanyo tse di tlhakaneng tsa mafatshe a re nang le one. Mme dilo tse tsotlhe tse, ke dumalana le ene mo statementeng fela sa ntlha Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, fa o ka ntetla ka nopola mafoko a ke a ratileng mo *paragraph 2*, a a reng: “*Mr Speaker, we face many challenges in our efforts to improve the lives of all Batswana. A central challenge is to be internationally competitive so that the goods and services we produce have a wider market and yield high incomes for Batswana. This means we must strive to increase productivity and service delivery to meet international standards in all sectors of the economy.*”

Mo go re supegetsa gore fa re sa iteke le rona jaaka e le gore madi re a beilwe pele, go leka gore tse re di solofeditseng batho re di dire. *Implementation* e batho re ngongoregang ka yone, e e leng gore maano re setse re a logile rotlhe, re tsenye matsogo gore sengwe le
Monday 12 February 2007

sengwe fa re leng teng re kgone gore re fetse tse re di solofeditseng batho. Whether o Mopalamente, o Minister, Mapalamente kwa dikgaolong re leke go tlhoma leitlho re okemele gore projects tse di dirwang di diiwa ke eng, gore re ikgolaganye le batho. Mme le gone mongwe le mongwe Motswana kwa a leng teng, fa a bonang go dirwa sengwe sa setshaba a tseny leitlho because le ene o contributa towards to improve implementation le productivity. Ke dilo tsa botlhokwa tse e leng gore re tshwanetse gore re rotloetse Batswana botle gore, fa selo se dirwa ga se sa ga goromente, ke sa Batswana, goromente ke wena.

Batswana ba na le attitude ya gore fela fa selo se senyega ba bo ba re, nnyaa, ke ga ga goromente. Go na le ya gore tlogelang fela le fa go senyega. Gompieno re setse re na le ngongora ya gore go tsenngwa madi a mantsi a neelwa dikompone. Nte ke fe sekai, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Fa go dirwa project ya ga goromente, a go agiwa sekolo kampo letamo kampo ntlo, fela ka gore ke goromente, ba ba kopang go dira selo seo ditlhwatlhwa tsa bone di ya kwa mankalenkaleng. Mme fa o ka tsaya motho yo o ka kgonang go go agela ka rate e e tlwaelesegileng, e nna tlhwatlhwa e e utlwalegang. A ga gona batho mo go goromente ba ba tlhatlhobang gore a golo fa ga gona tsietso? Ka gore di-project di felela di pala, e le gore go aga sekolo kampo one classroom, o fitlhela e eja madi a mantsi mo e leng gore e ka re e ikagelwa ke rona fela, room e e ntseng jalo madi a yone a nna botoka. Ke sone se se re tshwenyang.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, gore re lwantshe gore batho le bone re ba babalele ka go tswelela ga rona mo re go solofeditseng Batswana, ke na le megopolo e e leng gore ke leba gore ka re ntshitse madi a a ntseng jaana, gore e re re ntse re budgeta, a re nneng re akanyetse setshaba sa rona gore le sone se kgone go ja sengwe mo budgeteng ya rona
kampo mo madi kakanyetsong a rona. Ka gore bontsi jwa one madi a e leng gore gompieno jaana re setse re a beile P7.26 billion, potso ke gore, bone Batswana ba re buang madi a bone ba, ba fofora bokae mo teng. *How many billions* e e leng gore e tlaa boa e boela mo go bone. Kana *we should not be ashamed* go dira Batswana ba rona *millionaires*. Re tshwanetse gore re nne bold and face it gore ra re *this project* ya P$5 billion, konteraka e, go ya go aga letamo kompone ya Batswana ba le batlhano, ba le bane. *That is how we can build millionaires.*

Kana gompieno jaana, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, *budget* fela P7.26 billion, South Africa e reeditse fela jaana, baagisanyi tikologong tsotlhe, gore bone ba ya go natha bokae mo mading a le a Botswana. Jaanong, rona le fa go bidiwa di-billion tsa bone, ga re nathe sepe. Mme jaanong re tshwanetse gore ka ditsela tse tsothle, *all the ministries* di leke gore madi ana a felele mo baneng ba rona, gore madi a, a ba neele ditiro. Mma ke fe sekai, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mo ke go akantseng ke gore, mo agriculture go a tle go dirwe schemes and programmes tse di lekang go thusa Batswana gore ba fofore sengwe mo dibudgeteng, mme *to my observation it is not enough*. More and more schemes so that madi a a tle a kgone gore a circuleite mo Batswaneng, mme le matshelo a Batswana a nne botoka, tse e leng gore di ka dirwa. Mme e bile mo agriculture go a subsidaesiwa heavily. Goromente wa rona a ititeye sehuba a itse gore botshelo jwa go baya Batswana kwa temothuong, o tshwanetse gore a ba thuse gore ba nne koo.

Gompieno re na le mathata rona ba re emetseng dikgaolo tsa teropo, batho ba tletse mo diteropong jaanong ke mokgwlele o montsi. Masimo a tlogetswe fela, go setse go ithokomolositswe ka gore ngwaga le ngwaga le fa pula e ka na ga go lengwe. Jaanong ga
gonakoatlhogo e e kae ka gore tota ga gona subsidy e e ka kgonang go baya morafe kwa masimong. Kana fa ba lemile o kgona go ja le ba lapa la gagwe le ba ba mo thusang, mme ba nna koo. Jaanong fa go sa lengwa ba ya go kgobokana kwa toropong, go nna le mathata a boroko le a ditiro. Ke tsone tse ke di buang tse, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Fa re tsena mo education, ba dira schemes and programmes gore jaaka gompieno jaana re a bo re tsheletse baagisanyi madi a mantsi ka go isa bana koo, e ka bo e ne e le gore mathitshara a a nang le dikitsokitso le bana ba Batswana, ba ka bo ba agile dikolo tse e leng gore e ka bo e ne bana ba, ba setse ba tsena mo go tsone. Mme go ne go tlaa bo go tsholetsatshelo a bone. E le di-scheme tse di gogelang gore Motswana a kgone go dira a itse gore o tlaa re mo mading a a budgetetsweng mo ngwageng le bone Batswana ba nathe sengwe. Jaanong gompieno re tswa go tsholetsatsholelo ya baagisanyi ka madi a a tswang mo education a isa bana koo, mme e le gore re tshwanetse gore re dire dikakanyo tse di ka kgonang gore re beye bana ba rona mono, go nne le more and more schemes. Private schools di ka thusiwa ka go enthaesiwa ka schemes tse di botoka ka tsela nngwe e e ka dirwang, whether in terms of interest e le kwa tlase, in terms of logistics tse di baakantsweng ke various departments gore go nne conducive. Kampo le tsone commercial schools, to encourage, to make a booming in this country, mme e le gore go dirisiwa madi one a, a re tlholang re a bua fa re a budgeta.

Fa re tsena mo health, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, there are so many doctors ba ba rethaearileng, so many doctors tsa bana ba rona ba e leng gore ba a trainiwa, ba boela ko bo-America. Mme fa go na le di-scheme tse e leng gore ba ka dira powerful
clinics, gompieno e ka bo e setse bangwe e bile ba tsere gore ba dire di-clinic tsa malwetse a mangwe.

Clinics like the therapy clinics, le eng fela tse di ntseng jalo, tse e leng gore baoki ba ba nang le dikitsokitso ba kgone go tlogela ba mme mo legaeng mo, ba dire sengwe se se bonalang. Gompieno malwetse a mantsi, go tlhoka fela le ko motho a ka kgonang go ka baya nkukuagwe gore a tlhokomelesege teng. Gompieno re bereka rothhe ga go tshwane le bogologolo. Mme fa go na le such schemes tse di tswang ka foo tsa gore, batho ba nne le such clinics tse di nang le malaonyana a ka nna bo-10 kana five mo ba ka kgonang go robatsa balwetse ba ba rileng teng, go ka thusa. Dipatela di tletse. Tona o ka supa le ene gore go tletse mo e leng gore bangwe ba romelwa ko gae ba sa ntse ba le bokoa. Mme fa o ka mmaya fa kokelwaneng ya ga Mme Mma Mbaakanyi e le an experienced nurse, o ka kgona go mo duelela madi a a rileng; ene o ka mo oka, a mo fa motogo, a mo sidila a mo fa dipilisi ka fa tshwanelong.

Re lemogile gore Batswana ka bontsi ga ba nwe dipilisi sentle le fa ba laetswe, bogolog-jang bagodi, fa a tsaya tsa blood pressure o a di tlhakatlhakanya kgantele o dira overdose or what. Mme such things fa go butswe dikokelwana tse di tshwanang le tse, go ka kgonwa go ngathwa sengwenyana mo budgeteng e ya Health.

Fa ke tsaya Ministry wa Labour and Home Affairs go na le di consultansinyana tse batho ba direlang ba bangwe di permit and all sorts of things. Mme di consultancy tse di dirwa ke batho ba ba tswang ko mafatsheng a baagisanyi, mo go ka bong go rotloediwa our locals to do such things e le di scheme tse di tswang in those ministries. Ditiro tse di tshesanyane di ka dirwa di enthaesitswe ka tsone di programme tse ke di buang tsa di scheme gore Batswana ba kgone go anya sengwe mo itsholelong ya rona.
Jaanong sengwe le sengwe e a re se tlaa dirwa go thendariwa. Re dumela thata mo go thendareng, jaanong go felela motho a tla ka *briefcase* a feta a thendara a bo a tswana a tsamaya ka madi a rona. Go thendara go na le boretshwa ka gore o fithlheka go neelwa batho ba le bangwe fela nako tsohlhe, mme ba felele ba palelwa ke ditiro. Mme *other services* e le *through schemes* di ka kgona gore di thuse go servisa batho; gore dilo di ye ko go bone.

Ke ka bua di *ministry* tsohlhe fela ka go farologana ga tsone, mme mma ke fe sekai ka wa *Finance and Development Planning*, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. O na le dilo tse dintsi tse di ka fa tlase ga one; go na le *insurance brokers*, go na le dilo tse dingwe tse di tsamaisiwang ke batswakwa, mo e leng gore le bone ba ka bo ba dira gore bana ba rona ba rutiwe *in those various fields*. Re setse re na le 40 *years*. Fa go ne go na le di *scheme* tse di kgonang gore di rotloetse bana ba rona ba ba routegileng kampo bangwe ba ba ithutileng dilo tsa *insurance* le tse di *related to finance*, e ka bo e setse gompieno jaana e le bone ba tsamaisang dilo tseo.

*All these* ga se mo e ka bong e re ngwaga ono jaana re bo re sa ntse re lela ka gore re neela madi a rona batswakwa kampo re a isa go sele. Mme fela madi a rona re tshwanetse gore re hire *our locals*, batho re ba dire *millionaires*; re ba dire gore ka moso le bone ba kgone go thusa ba bantsi. Mma ke fe sekainyana, fa e le gore ke moagisanyi a bo a wina thendara, kampo a dira *business* kampo a tsaya *scheme*, fa a setse a a ja o rwalela 25 *per cent* ko ga bone. Mme fa e le Motswana ene o tlaa bo a dira moraka mme a hire *more people*, le ko masimo a ya go dira eng o tlaa bo a nna le batho ba bantsi ba e leng gore ba tlaa bo ba aja mo go ene. Fela *Honourable Mbaakanyi* a le nosi fela jaana batho ba ba
tshelang ka fa tlase ga gagwe e le Batswana, ba foforang sengwe fela gore letsatsi le phirime...

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! Order! It has been brought to my attention that we do not have a quorum, as early as this, can we ring the bell.

**MR MASISI:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mme ke go leboge. Re bua ka development expenditure e e leng gore e bothokwa mo matshelong a rona, ka ke sekgantshwane sa rona, ka re kgonà go bolelela batho gore kana re le tlêla bokana go dira ditiro tsa lona. Mme e bile ke leboge thata fa bo Tona balemogile gore go dirwa tiro ka bonya, mme ba ya go leka go nna le batho ba ba tlâa kgonang gore ba tthatlose dinao gore tiro e dirwe. Jaanong le rona re tlâa batla gore re mne re bolelelwa nako le nako gore go tsaamaya fa kae.

*Ministry wa State President* le one o tsere madi a mantsintsi ka mabaka a a itsaganeng. Mme Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, o ka re Goromente wa rona o tshela madi a mantsi mo HIV/AIDS, P896 million, mme malwetse a mangwe a teng a re feditse. Malwetse a mangwe ga a ke a budgetelwa mme a re feditse. Fa ke bua ka malwetse a mangwe a mantsi, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke gore go ruta Motswana fela ko gae gore a kgone go ja sentle a tshabe eng gore a seka a lwala, *needs a lot of money*. Le *general cleanliness* fela, gore fa go nna maragaraga o tshela mo lesweng o reng, o nna ka makgome le eng jaana ke go oka bolwetse, *and that is an effort* e e tshwanetseng go dirwa ke Goromente; *to prevent* gore malwetse a mangwe a seka a tsena.

Mma ke fe bolwetse jo ke bo itseng bo nna ke bo lwlang jwa hypertension, *high blood pressure*, madi a matona. Kana fa e le gore o rata letswai thata, mafura le nama, o a go felela o tsenwa ke bolwetse jo, mme ga go na *that education*. Batswana re goletse mo
nameng, re ja nama. Bagologolo ba ne ba aja nama ba sa e loke jaaka re e loka, mma. Rona re e tshela letswai, e bile re e ja go feta batho ba bogologolo le fa go twe ba ne ba a ja nama. Every weekend re ja nama mo dintshong, mo manyalong, mo lwapeng, three times a day. Jaanong se ke se buang ke go thokega go ruta Batswana.

Nna fela ke ne ke kopela bolwetse jo e leng gore ke itse gore jaanong bo godile; jwa diphilo, jo batho bangwe bo ba tsenang ka high blood pressure, jo bo tshelwanang ka go tsalwa fela, gore o ka nna wa nna le bone, gore P6 million o o ka fa thoko o, mo go P896 million wa AIDS ba re fe fela P6 million. Tona wa Health o ka kgona go ya go dira a dialysis unit ko sepateleng sa Nyangabgwe. Gompieno go na le batho ba e leng gore ba setse ba tsamaya ka mechini ya dialysis. Batho bao ba setse ba le about 45, ba ke ba itseng, mme fa ke botsa mo dipateleng o fitlhela e le gore batho ba ba setseng ba lwala go tsamaya ko go bo 2,300; ba ba setseng ba tsentswe dialysis machines, mme ba tlhoka mechini e e tshwanetseng go dirwa. Six million (P6 million) yo fa re ka mo neelwa gore a ye go dira unit ko Nyangabgwe le ko Marina, batho ba bangwe ba ka kgona gore ba tshele botoka. Gompieno jaana batho ba bantsi mma… ke mathata.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Kgetsana e ke yone ya dialysis.

MR MASISI: Yone kgetsana e ke ya dialysis. Ka gore every four hours o tshwanetse gore o tsamaye o ye go pompa metsi o tshele a mangwe, o itlhatswe, o pompe metsi, o itshele a mangwe. Mme fa ka ba kgona go dira dialysis e e leng gore e pompa madi, o kgona go e dira gangwe fela o bo o nna two days o sa dire, mme o tshela. Go na le ditsala tsa me ka fa baagisanyeng ba e leng gore ba na le 25 years ba ntse ba tshela ka dialysis. Mo e leng gore go kgona go oketsa botshelo jwa motho gore a tshele mme a dire ditiro tsa
Monday 12 February 2007

gagwe; a kgweetsa, a dira eng. Jaanong gompieno ke yone e e leng gore madi a a ka kgona go rotloetsa go tshedisa batho ba bangwe sentle.

Ke raya gore selo se se botlhoko thata gore go bo go lebilwe ntlha e le nngwe fela mme e bile mo go one madi a AIDS, mma ke go bolelele, go a celebreitiwa ka one.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR MASISI: Nnyaa ga se motion oo, ke one a AIDS a ke buang ka gore fa a bewa a le mantsintsi kwa, go celebraitiwa mo dikgaolong mo ka one; go bewa tante foo go bo go rekwa dijo go bo go twe re celebraita letsatsi la AIDS; go rekwa dikipara go tweng, mme rona ba diphilo re sena le fa e le sepe. Ke raya gore this is unfair to the nation, it is not only AIDS alone e Batswana ba e lwalang. Ga se gore ke diphilo fela, there are many others; sukiri, eng, ke malwetse a mantsi. Now let us shake up and then budget sentle, re akanyetse malwetse a mangwe.

Mma ke tsene mo go e nngwe ya di salary. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, nna ke suggesta fela gore go dirwe salary review. Salary review fela yotlhe ka gore barutabana ba a lela, mapodise a a lela, bo-nurse ba a lela. Mme e bile ko Health go lebilwe bo-nurse fela, other related services ga di buiwe; pharmacists le ba physiotherapy and whatever ba a lela. Ke mathata fela; le gone fa go a lelwa. Ke gore go nne le structures tse disha le tsa mapolotiki, tsa di civil servant, tsa eng, di dirwe tsotlhe tse.

CEDA Young Farmers Fund; Rra a go bulwe ditsela tsa gore bana ba e tlaa re ba tsere loan ya go a go rua dikgomo le eng, go a go isa ko mmaketeng e bo e le gore go motlhofo. Monna yo mongwe o swetswe ke dikgomo di le 400 maloba, a di tsentse ka koloi a re o rekisa lesaka lotlhe, e bo e phancha, go le dibambara, melatswana, ga go na di culvert, koloi e robegile, a senyegelwa a bo a bokolela. O ya go duela CEDA ka eng? Ke
mathata. Bana ba le ba tsenya mo mathateng. You must build roads, access to market and le gone go nne le selo se se ka dirang. Thank you, very much.

MR MAGAMA (GABORONE SOUTH): Thank you, Madam Speaker. Let me also take this opportunity to comment on the Budget Speech.

First of all I would like to deal with the issue of project implementation. Over the years Ministers of Finance in their Budget Speeches have been complaining about the problem of poor implementation capacity in the Public Service. The President in the State of the Nation Address also raised the same issue. I believe all of us here are concerned about the problem of poor implementation capacity, it affects us in one way or the other. In my constituency the Gaborone City Council is sitting on a P90 million project, which is intended to upgrade infrastructure in Old-Naledi. One and half months before the end of the financial year this project has not started, a project, which is supposed to be on its second phase as we speak. I am however disappointed that the measures announced by the Minister aimed at addressing this problem do not go far enough. There is limited emphasis on issues of leadership, responsibility and accountability, all of them, are key influences on implementation.

Madam Speaker, it is my contention that the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP) government must take full responsibility for the problem of poor implementation capacity in this country. It is evident that this country is led by a Government, which is dangerously incompetent because it is not interested in the implementation of development projects. This is why both the President and Government Ministers hardly visit different parts of the country, to monitor the implementation of development
projects. In other jurisdictions, Ministers would have resigned in disgrace for failing to implement development projects.

Having said that Madam Speaker, I should emphasise that all of us must acknowledge that project implementation is fundamentally a leadership and management problem.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Molefhabangwe, there are only 21 Members in the House, so please take your seat.

**MR MAGAMA:** Let me repeat that. Government must acknowledge that project implementation is fundamentally a leadership and management problem; it requires total transformation of the Public Service, including the appointment of senior public officers on the basis of merit, not sycophancy and loyalty to the ruling party.

Public Service salaries: Madam Speaker, in a country which is characterised by wide income disparities, adjusting salaries by six per cent across the board is not appropriate. In my view salaries should have been adjusted on a differentiated scale in order to narrow the gap between the high-income groups in the Public Service and the lowly paid employees. If you compare someone who is earning the minimum wage, an Industrial Class employee, and someone who is in F1 or F0 the difference is just too wide.

I am not necessarily saying that these people should earn the same salaries, but adjustment of salaries should be on a differentiated scale.

In fact, I endorse the views raised by Honourable Masisi and Honourable Guma yesterday that perhaps, what we need is a comprehensive review of the salary structure in this country. I think salaries and conditions of service have not been reviewed for many years.

**MR MOATLHODI:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. *Ke nna tsala ya me.*

**MR MAGAMA:** What are you clarifying, everything is clear.
MR MOATLHODI: Ke a leboga Madam Speaker, and let me thank my colleague for yielding. I wonder whether I did understand you correctly to be saying salary adjustments and if indeed you said so, you are glossily wrong. This is just an adjustment to cushion people against inflation.

MR MAGAMA: I talked about salary adjustment, I think you are just wasting my time. On a related matter Madam Speaker, I am disappointed that the Minister of Finance and Development Planning did not announce any new measures to address the long-standing grievances of some cadres in the public service. I am referring here to teachers, nurses, doctors and police officers. Botswana continues to lose hundreds of nurses to other countries because of poor working conditions. By now I think government should have realised that, a unitary pay structure for the entire public service is not appropriate. I think what we need in this country is a pay structure and conditions of employment which reflect the peculiarities of each cadre in the public service, and I think it is high time we address these issues. We probably need to go back to the report of Tsa Badiri Consultancy, because looking at that report I know that it addressed these issues quite comprehensively.

Crime and violence, Madam Speaker, the alarming rate of crime in this country is largely a reflection of the way in which some people live particularly the problem of unemployment, the influx of people from the rural areas to the urban areas with the hope of finding jobs. This problem is aggravated by the influx of illegal immigrants from Zimbabwe.
I am not sure how many Members of Parliament have been to BBS mall. It is frightening. So crime is a threat to the economy of this country, you cannot expect investors to come and invest in an environment which is not secure.

Even the small businessmen in Botswana, those who operate small general dealers, are forced to close their businesses at around 7 o’clock because of crime. So crime is a real threat to the economy of this country, and I am surprised that the Minister did not announce any strategies aimed at combating crime in this country. This was a serious omission in the budget.

I wish to call upon the government to train and equip law enforcement agencies in sufficient numbers because, an inadequately remunerated and poorly equipped police officer cannot be expected to have the motivation to perform to expected standards. Government must take seriously the welfare of police officers in this country. You must make sure that they are provided with accommodation, transport and other equipment which is necessary for them to combat crime effectively.

Young farmers fund, many Honourable Members have talked about this issue. My only comment is that many young people in this country are not inclined towards agriculture. In addition to that, government has established this fund without addressing the many constraints that are currently facing the Agricultural Sector, for instance, the problem of lack of infrastructure, lack of markets and extension services. These are all constraints which are well known in this country which are frustrating people who are involved in the Agricultural Sector.

The government is setting up these young people to fail. If indeed the government is serious about the economic empowerment of young people, I think what you need to do is
to set up a sector neutral fund, which will allow young people in this country to venture into various areas, rather than restricting them to agriculture. The fund is discriminatory although, there are contradictory views from the government side. Yesterday Honourable Moumakwa quoted the guidelines, which clearly state that the fund will benefit young people with Certificates, Diplomas and Degrees in agriculture. What about those who do not have qualifications in agriculture?

Diamonds, Madam Speaker, Botswana as a country which has been in the forefront of diamond mining for many years, should be in the forefront of diamond research. As a country which has been mining diamonds for many years, we should be having a pool of citizen experts who have been trained. Citizen diamond experts, people who have full knowledge about what diamonds can do to the economy of this country. People who are well conversant with trends in the global diamond market.

So far government has been relying on De Beers for information and misinformation on diamonds, and this situation cannot continue forever. On a related matter, in an effort to promote citizen economic empowerment in the mining industry, government should enact laws compelling mining companies such as De Beers to set aside share capital in the mines for workers and other citizens. That will be a step in the right direction intended to promote citizen economic empowerment.

Secondly, let us ensure that all new mining contracts between the government and the mining companies should put more emphasis on the local beneficiation of our minerals. In that way, we will be able to generate more jobs to absorb the many young people in this country who are unemployed.
Brigades take over Madam Speaker, the decision by the government to take over brigades and convert them into technical colleges to me is ill advised. It is ill advised Honourable Kario, because it will defeat the purpose for which brigades were originally established. Their conversion into technical colleges will kill the production elements in the brigades. I think that government should have assisted the brigades to improve their management capacity rather than convert them into technical colleges. They will now become elitist institutions which are completely divorced from the world of work. And this situation is not desirable particularly given the high rate of unemployment in this country.

On a related matter, the Ministry of Education has no capacity to manage all these secondary schools and brigades. The Ministry took over the community junior secondary schools and currently there is a crisis. Buildings are falling apart, students do not have books, classroom shortages, etcetera.

So, I do not believe that the Ministry of Education has the capacity to manage the brigades over and above the current problems which the ministry is facing. This was not a wise decision at all, what you should have done is you should have assisted the brigade to improve management capacity. I think that was the only thing which was lacking within the brigades movement in Botswana.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MR MAGAMA: No, no, no I do not believe that. My suspicion is the decision to take over brigades, I think it is part of the ideological struggle which is waged by the Ministry of Education against education with production. You want to transform these institutions into elitist institutions which produce people who cannot immediately be absorbed in the job market. This is certainly not right. If you go back to the original philosophy
underlying the establishment of brigades, you will find that government has never supported brigades wholeheartedly. Government has always been against these brigades, and will never support them, that is why you are converting them now into elitist institutions.

Economic growth, Madam Speaker, we cannot dispute the fact that Botswana experienced high economic growth rates for much of the post independence period. But the point which I want to emphasise is that, this was largely due to fortuitous circumstances such as the discovery of minerals, especially diamonds upon which the country is heavily dependent. For the Minister to parade indicators of economic growth as evidence of success is misleading. You should further interrogate this growth. Who has benefited from this growth? How has this growth contributed to the problem of unemployment, poverty and social inequalities?

MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE): Madam Speaker, on a point of clarification. I think the Honourable Member is misleading this House and the nation to claim that this country has not witnessed unprecedented growth, and that growth came about not just by sheer luck, but by the hard work of Batswana albeit using the resources that were available.

Also to give the impression that the benefits of growth have not been enjoyed by all Batswana. You do not have to go too far, you just have to look at this budget and say where does the money go to? If you look at development budget, biggest item, is fighting disease, to try to improve the welfare of Batswana. If you look at the recurrent budget, the biggest spender; education, to improve ability of Batswana to sustain themselves.
MR MAGAMA: Well, I stand by my point. The real issue is that not everybody has benefited equally from this growth. I was reading the 2005 United Nations Human Development Report recently which revealed that 20 per cent of the population of this country controls 70.3 per cent of the national wealth and that the poorest 20 per cent controls only 2.2 per cent. That clearly indicates inequitable distribution of wealth.

So you cannot argue that we have all benefited equally from this growth. Botswana’s model of development based on neo-liberal economic policies cannot improve the material conditions of the majority of these people. Market fundamentalism which this government is pursuing, has resulted in scandalous poverty amidst plenty. In fact it is a well-known fact that in all countries whose economies are driven by unregulated market forces, there is this tendency for scandalous poverty to exist side by side with wealth and Botswana is a classical example. So we cannot runaway from that.

PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED FOR APPROXIMATELY 25 MINUTES

MADAM SPEAKER: We always start late after tea, I do not know what to do or say.

The theme of the budget speech is “Improved Productivity.” Page 3 of the President’s Speech also talks about productivity, but I do not see productivity mo Palamenteng, gotthelele.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Inaudible.

MADAM SPEAKER: Only a few. Jaanong, a re thusanyeng. A ba bangwe ba ba sa tleng ka nako, e ko e ne e re le le kwa le kopanang le bone teng, le bua le bone gore please. Le re tshegisa batho.
HONOURABLE MEMBER: Mathata kana, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke gore jaanong go tlaa nna go omanngwa rona ba re teng, diganana di seyo fa.

MADAM SPEAKER: Di nthuseng diganana tseo. Golo mo go a tshwenya, go tlhabisa ditlhong. *I do not know how many times I should say it. But anyway*, a re tsweleleng.

MR MAGAMA: Thank you Madam Speaker. When we broke for tea I had concluded my comments on economic growth.

Let me now talk about privatisation. The Minister talked about the privatisation of public enterprises in his budget speech. As you all know, the position of the BNF with respect to privatisation of public enterprises is well known in this House. We are opposed to the privatisation of public enterprises because as far as we are concerned, this is tantamount to transferring national wealth into private hands, particularly in an economy which is already dominated by foreigners. Privatisation means job losses, therefore, we would not support it. In any case, as I stated before, we know that this government is going ahead with privatisation anyway. Now, the point which I want to emphasise is that, there are no mechanisms in place to ensure that Batswana also benefit from privatisation of public enterprises. I wonder whether the manner in which privatisation is being carried out in this country is consistent with government’s own policy on privatisation. What are we doing to ensure that Batswana are empowered through this process? I think we should learn from the examples of other countries.

It is extremely dangerous to proceed with privatisation without the necessary legislation. This may result into patronage and corruption. We need the necessary legislation to drive privatisation process in this country. If you like for example, in Russia after 1989, with the advice of the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, the Russian
Government privatised all the public enterprises without legislation. At the end of the privatisation process, there were only five millionaires in Russia. The national wealth had been transferred into the hands of very few people and this is what is likely to happen in this country if we do not enact the necessary legislation. In our case, it will even be worse because the wealth will be transferred into the hands of foreigners. I know that in the case of Air Botswana for instance, the preferred bidder is a foreigner. What are we doing to ensure that Batswana also have a stake in these enterprises, which are going to be privatised? We need proper legislation to drive this process.

I will now talk about unemployment Madam Speaker, in particular, youth unemployment. Unemployment is a serious macro-economic and social problem, which requires a coherent strategy instead of these jointed institutional responses. I am aware that government’s employment strategy is anchored on private sector growth and investment, yet there is sufficient evidence that despite Botswana’s political stability, not enough foreign direct investment is coming into this country. The little foreign direct investment that we are getting in this country is concentrated in the mining sector and mining by its very nature, is capital intensive and does not employ many people. In addition to that, I have problems with the 17.6 per cent unemployment rate reported in the Minister’s budget speech. The accuracy of this figure is doubtful. As you know, in the past I have questioned the methodology which is used to collect data on unemployment because what happens is that, the questionnaire which is used in the survey covers people who have been actively looking for jobs in the last 30 days only. It excludes others who have given up, people who are called discouraged job seekers. So, the unemployment figure is probably 10 per cent higher than the figure which has been given by the Minister because
of the methodology which is used. In addition, I am not even sure whether the 60,000 people who were engaged in drought relief projects last year, were counted. So, this figure is not accurate at all.

The unemployment situation in this country is probably much higher than 17.6 per cent. Given the number of young people who are roaming the streets in Gaborone, it is not convincing to anybody to claim that unemployment rate has dropped from 23 per cent to 17.6 per cent in this country. There are many people, young people in particular who are migrating from the rural areas because of the collapse of agriculture to come to the urban areas with the hope of getting jobs. All these people are roaming the streets in Gaborone.

In fact, related to that, let us look at those who are said to be working. There is now a problem of what people call the casualisation of labour. Most people who are employed by Chinese firms, particularly the textile firms in Gaborone, some of them are employed for a week and dismissed. Because of the large number of people who are unemployed, the so called foreign direct investors like the Chinese, are taking advantage of that to exploit and ill-treat Batswana employees.

It is a pity that our Labour Department is not effective at all. Most people who work in textile industries owned by Chinese can hardly work for a month or even two without being dismissed. So, while we invite these people to come and invest in our country, let us ensure that our labour laws also protect employees. Let us ensure that the quality of work is improved. I just hope that during the Committee of Supply the Minister of Labour and Home Affairs will come up with new strategies of dealing with this problem because there is hardly any labour inspection at all in this town. Numerous cases are reported to the Department of Labour but there is no action. Honourable Matlhabaphiri, the new
Assistant Minister, two days ago said that all those people who are unemployed should go and register with the Department of Labour. This is nothing new, people have been registering all these years. It is not a new announcement, people have been registering all these years but they are still not getting jobs. Many companies, Chinese construction companies employ Zimbabweans because they are paid very low wages instead of Batswana. So, even if people can go to the Department of Labour in large numbers and register, there is no hope that they will ever be employed.

The last point Madam Speaker…

MR MATLHABAPHIRI: On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Motlotlegi Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ne ke re, kwa diofising tsa Department of Labour, ke bona gantsi go kwadisa batho ba e leng gore ke ba ditiro tse di kwa tlase, professionals and graduates ga ba registare. Mme jaanong fa di-company tse di tona di batla batho ba ba nang le dithuto tseo, ga re kgone gore re itse gore ba teng ka gore ga ba a registara. Jaanong, ba registare gore e ne e re go na le diphatlha, Immigrates Selection Board e re batho ke ba. Ga re ka ke ra tsaya batswakwa batho ba, ba le teng. Ke ne ke e baya jalo. Jaanong, wena o bua ka batho ba sele fela, ga o bue ka batho ba ke neng ke bua ka bone.

MR MAGAMA: They used to register, but because of the incompetence of the labour department, I think they have given up. Nobody can bother now to go and register at the Department of Labour. I challenge you to go to the radio and announce that all people who are unemployed must go and register at the Department of Labour. You have totally no control of what is happening in the labour market. So, there is no point in going to register with the Department of Labour.
Monday 12 February 2007

Now, budget priorities, I think is the final point Madam Speaker. Government’s budget priorities are somewhat confused. In my view, there is need for a radical shift or reordering of our budgetary priorities in favour of the more productive sectors of the economy. I believe this will be consistent with government’s own stated objective of diversifying the economy and achieving global competitiveness. In our view, more resources should be channelled to sectors such as agriculture, trade and industry and education. Education, science and technology should be given top priority. They are the foundation of sustained economic development. The development of human resources is critical to the transformation of any country. Of course, we are not talking about the current education system, we are talking about a new type of education. We are saying that our education system must be transformed both in its content and form so that it can assist students, its recipients to be ready for the world of work when they graduate.

MADAM SPEAKER: Your time is up.

MR MODIPANE (KGATLENG WEST): Ke a go leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente gore le nna ke tseye sebaka se go akgela mo mafokong a, a kgaoganyo ya madi.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, fa go sale go simololwa go akgela mo mafokong a, go dule dintlha di le dintsi tse di builweng ke bakaulengwe. Mme le nna ke ne kere ke akgela go gatisa mo go tsone le gore gongwe ke tswe ka megopolo e mengwe. Dintlha mo kgaoganyong e ya madi e, di mmalwa tse e leng gore re ka di opela legofi, tse e leng gore e tlaa re ke tsweletse ke supe dingwe tswe tsone. Mme le gore gongwe re arabe dikgang dingwe tse di neng tswe tswa, jaaka e le gore budget ya gompieno e kwa go P22 billion mo ngwageng o wa madi wa 2006/07. Mme re ne re kgalelwa gore gongwe re seka ra ne re
bua, re gakolola batho gore dilo tse ke kgatelopele mo lefatsheng le la Botswana gore re
bo re nale budget after 40 years ya P22 billion go tswa kwa go ya P10 million. Jaanong
gatwe dilo tse ga re a bolo go di bua, re di bua kgapetsa-kgapetsa, mme batho ba a itse
gore go ntse jalo. Jaanong, e rile gongwe Tona a akgela a bo a re, ker gore re ne re ntse re
ipelela dingwaga tse di masome a mane mo bogaufing. Mme ke tlatsa mafoko ao a ga
Ministara ka gore, ga se one fela mabaka a a dirang gore re re gakolola batho jalo gore
selo se se supa gore ke kgatelo pele mo lefatsheng. Le rona re nna re gakololwa re le
goromente gore, ga re a dira sepe mo dingwageng tse di masome a mane. Jaanong, re
tshwanetswe ke gore re arabe gantsintsi. Kana kwa sekolong, fa morutabana a ne a ruta
bana, bogolo jang ba di-grade tse di kwa tlase, go boelelwa mafoko go fitlhela …

MR MASIMOLOLE: On a point of order. Kulenyane fa a tswa, we will have problems.

MADAM SPEAKER: Proceed, I will check the quorum.

MR MODIPANE: Jaanong, re ntse re boelela mafoko a ka gore re ntse re gakololwa
kgapetsa-kgapetsa gore ga re a dira sepe mo dingwageng tse, kana puso ga e a dira sepe
mo lefatsheng leno mo dingwageng tse di masome mane tse di fetileng.

Dilo dingwe tse e leng gore di tshwanelwa ke gore di opelwe legofi ke gore madi a re a
kgaoganyang mo lefatsheng le ke madi a a dirilweng mo lefatsheng le …

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Order! Let us wait until they come back.

MR MODIPANE: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ne ke sa ntse ke re madi a
re a dirisang; a re a kgaoganyang, ke madi a a dirwang mo lefatsheng le. Ga se madi a a
kopiwang kwa ntle ga lefatshle ke gore re tle go dira budget ya lefatshle la rona. Selo se se
tshwanetse gore se akgolwe ka gore mafatshe a le mantsi o fitlhela e e gore, go feta
sephatlo sa madi a ba a dirisang ke madi a a adimilweng kana a a kopilweng mo
mafatsheng a mangwe. Mme re pharologanyo mo ntheng eo ka gore ke madi a re a itirelang re le lefatshe le Botswana a a tswang mo go rona.

Kgang e ya lehuma Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, re tshwanelwa ke gore re ikakgole. Fa re itshwantshanya le mafatshe ka bontsi a a mo Southern Africa, o fitlhela e le gore poverty datum line e tsamaya mo go bo 60-70 per cent. Mo lefatsheng le, Batswana ba ba fetang borobabobedi mo lekgolong, ba fa re ka reng ga go na letsatsi le le ka fetang ba sena se ba se latlhelang mo ganong.

Kgang ya madi a a abetsweng dithlabololo le one re bona kgolo mo go one. Mo ngwageng wa madi o o neng o feta e ne e le P5.8 billion mme gompieno re bua ka P7.2 billion. Jaanong le yone e e araba dikgang dingwe tse e leng gore go ntse go duwa ka tsone tsa gore gongwe kgaoganyo ya madi e remeletse fela mo Batswaneng ba se kae. Fa re bua ka madi a a P7.2 billion, re raya madi a e leng gore a ya go dira dithlabololo, a hira Batswana ka bontsi. Ga re ka ke ra re botlhe, mme fela ra re Batswana ka bontsi ba tlaa bona sekgethe mo teng. A ya go dira ditiro mo lefatsheng le lotlhe ka gore ga go na kgaolo epe e e leng gore ke ka re madi a a P7.2 billion ga a e go fitlha kwa go yone. Mme kana seo ke go phatlalatswa itsholelo ya lefatshe le Batswana. Ke selo se re tshwanetseng gore re se akgolele puso le ba lephata la madi gore ba tlhokomela ditsa-Batswana sentle.

Gore go bo go na le madi a a ka kwa ntle a a setseng fa re leba mo mading a re a solofetseng go a bona mo lefatsheng le a a fitlhang kwa go bo seven million Pula, le gone ke selo se e leng gore re tshwanetse ke gore re se opele legofi. Ka gore re ntse re a gola re le lefatshes la Botswana ga re a tsa mo tseleng ya gore gongwe re bo re tla go nna le deficit budgets. Mo dingwageng di le mmalwa re ntse re tsweletse ka go nna le surplus budgets mme ke selo se e leng gore le sone se tshwanetswe ke gore se akgolwe. Re

Monday 12 February 2007
tshwanetse go akgola gore le madi a re a beileng kwa mafatsheng a mangwe ga a a ema
golo go le gongwefela, a setse a tsamaya kwa go bo 48 billion. Mme se se bo se raya gore
fa go nna le mathata, go ka re tsaya dikgwedi tse di masome mararo re ntse re kgona gore
re tswelele re sa babalelwe re le lefatshe. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente dilo tse
dintle tse tse di itebaganyang le thokomelo e e masisi e e nang…

**MR GUMA:** *Clarification, Madam Speaker.* Ke a go leboga Mopalamente yo o
tlotlegang. Ke ne ke leka go thaloganya sengwe ke re jaaka o re tsatsanka jalo gore re na
le madi kwa mafatsheng a sele, e bile go lebega o ka re re botokanyana, ga o bone gore
gongwe re ka bo re latlheletse bana ba rona botokanyana go feta *six per cent.* Re seka ra
nna mo go nnang go ntse gotwe o se ka wa bona ba humile jaana bana ba bone ba bolawa
ke tlala, mongame. Ga o bone gore gongwe ga re na le bokgoni jo bo kalo, ra latlhelela
bana ba rona mo go leng botoka?

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** O raya le Mapalamente ga ke re?

**MR GUMA:** Ee rra.

**MR MODIPANE:** Ke a go leboga mokaulengwe. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa
Palamente, kana Motswana a re ‘phiri o rile ga bose gangwe.’ Jaانong fa o ka tsaya mo
gotlhe o bo o sa lebelele gore e tlaa re ka moso a bo e le gore tse o di jeleng tse tsotlhe ke
tsa letsatsi le le lengwefela. Ga o utlwe gore ka re fa go nna le bothata re ka kgona go
tsamaya 30 months. Jaانong re lebeletse kwa pele go bona gore e re fa go nna le bothata
re bo re ka kgona gore re tswelele. Mme le gone Makgoa ba re *half a loaf is better than
no bread.* Jaانong fa o filwe sengwe o bo o re, nnyaa, mme ga se a lekana mme fela go sa
tshwane le fa o ka bo o sa fiwa gotlhelele, fela ke ntlha e e leng gore re tshwanelwa ke
gore re e lebe le yone.
MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Mabletsa you have to wait until I have called you.

MR MABLETSA: Point of clarification. Madam Speaker, I want the Honourable Member holding the floor to be specific to the Honourable Member’s question. He is not saying a re tseyeng gotlhe, he is simply saying could we not have increased, and then you are answering by saying ‘phiri o rile ga bo se gangwe ga re ka re ka re tsaya gotlhe.’ Ga ke tseye gore o itebagantse tota le se Motlotlegi Guma a se buang. A re go oketsanyana go gaisa six per cent mme o sa tseye gotlhe, e seng 100 per cent.

MR MODIPANE: Ke tsaya gore go ne go seka-sekwile Honourable Member gore selekanyo se se ka tsewang sa fiwa le se se ka sadisiwang ke sefe. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, e re ke sena go bua jalo ka dilo tse e leng gore di ka opelwa legofí mo go kgbokanyeng le go aba madi a rona, ke re gongwe dilo tse dingwe di tlhatswiwe. Ke ne ke bua ka P5.8 billion wa madi a e leng gore mo ngwageng wa madi o o neng o feta a ne a beetswe dithhabololo, jaanong re tshwanetswe ke gore re itse gongwe kgang e e tlhatswiwe ya gore dithhabololo ga di dirwe kana ga di fetswe ka nako. Jaanong re seka ra nna ra ipoka fela go tlhatswiwe kgang ya gore mme mo go ene P5.8 billion, a ke madi a otlhe a a neng a reboletswe dithhabololo. Kana go setse madi mangwe mo go P5.8 billion a e leng gore a fetiseditswe kwa go P7.2 billion o e leng gore gompieno re tlaa mo rebola ka ke itsa re tlaa mo rebola. O akanyeditsweng gore a rebolelwe dithhabololo tse di teng. Re se ka ra tloga gongwe ra oketsa marago ka maje ra re mme jaanong re godisitse madi a dithhabololo mme gone e le gore tota fela re tsere madi a a neng a sa dirisiwa mo ngwageng o o fetileng, ke one a re a fetisetsang kwa pele. Go botlhokwa gore re tlhaloganye selo se se ntseng jalo.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ke buile ka eo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mme ke fetele kwa go e nngwe ya dikompone tse di tlhakanetsweng le mmuso. Tiro ya tsone kana ke gore di fe Batswana ditlamelo. Bo Botswana Power Corporation (BPC) ba tshwanetswe ke gore ba fe Batswana motlakase. Water Utilities Corporation e fe batho metsi le bo Botswana Telecommunications Corporation (BTC) jalo. Mme re bona le le gore bana le dipoelo ngwaga le ngwaga, di fokotsegile go se kae gongwe mo ngwageng ya madi e re mo go yone, BPC e na le P120 million e le madi a dipoelo. Mme fa o lebelela BPC, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, o bo o lebelela tsone ditlamelo tse e leng gore e tshwanelwa ke gore e di dire, tota ke ngongorega ka tsone nako le nako le nako gore di turu.

Go gokela motlakase go turu fela thata mo e leng gore Batswana ba ba kwa dikgaolong bogolo jang, e tswa le bone ba ba mono, go thata ga go ka ke ga kgonafala gore motho a duelele go gokela motlakase ka madi a a kanang ka bo P50, 000. Ke madi fela a a gakgamatsang a e leng gore tota fa re na le maikaelelo a a tletseng a gore re anamise ditlamelo tse…(inaudible)… P50, 000 mme o bo o lebelela profit e e leng gore bone ba tswelela…(inaudible)… O ile jaanong Kario, ke gone jaanong ke ka buang ka motlakase wa Rasesa ka gore o bua boammaaruri, go na le kgaolo kwa Rasesa e e nang le mathata a go gokela motlakase ka ntata ya one madi a a boturu, mme go na le dipoelo. Tota dipoelo di batla eng mo komponeng e e leng gore sa yone ke gore e fe sechaba ditlamelo. Jaanong ke yone kgang ya me fela eo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Go gokela metsi le tiriso ya one; Water Utilities Corporation e na le dipoelo, P93 million. Le yone fela jalo gore fa dipoelo tse tsana bone di ka bo at least di beelwa mo selekanyong sa gore go seka ga sala go sena sepe fela, gongwe go sale bo three million Pula. Mme
madi a otlhe a ba a ka isiwa kwa go reng a Batswana ba kgone gore ba gokele motlakase, ba itsenyetse metsi Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente…

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** *Point of clarification.* Ke a leboga, Mmaetsho.

Mokaulengwe Motlotlegi Mopalamente wa Kgatleng Bophirima kgang e o e buang e ke kgang e re e buang fa letsatsi le letsatsi o le mongwe wa batho ba e leng gore ga go na Palamente epe e e reng e tsenye e tle go tswa o sa bua selelo se. Mme gantsi fa re bua ka boturu bogolo thata jang ja motlakase le one metsi jaaka rrætsho o bua jaana, go na le dikakgelo mo Ntlong e. Dikakgelo tse e le tsa ba ba fa pele ba ba neetsweng boikarabelo ja go anamisa motlakase le metse ya rona. Ba re fa re re o turu jaana re raya re o tshwantshanya le ka e gore ditlhwathlha tsa rona di kwa tlase go feta gope fela kwa o ka go akanyang mo lefatsheng. O ipaakanyetsa jang kakgelo e ya malatsi otlhe fa e ka akofà e tlhagogile ka gore, nako le nako fa re bua ka kgang e gatwe re tshwantshanya le bo mang ka gore dipalo tsa rona di kwa tlase. Ke lebogile mogolole.

**MR MODIPANE:** Nnyaa, eo ga ke e dumalane, Motlotlegi, re itshwantshanya le mafatshe bogolo a re bapileng le one. Ke ne ke tswa lenyalong beke e e feticeng ko South Africa, mme ke fithetse mo motseng o e leng gore go na le matlo a a agilweng ka disenke fela, motlakase o le mo teng, mo o bonang gore motho yo ya go na jaaka a ne a ka kgona motlakase fa o ne o le boturu bo bo tshwanang le ka kwano ka go leba ntlo fela e a e agileng gore o dirile fela gore fa ke ka tsenya tlhogo mo teng. Jaanong ga ke dumelane le kgang eo e bile ga ke kitla ke dumalana le yone, ya gore re itshwantshanya le bo mang, re itshwantshanya le ba re bapileng le bone. Le fa e le gore gongwe go ka tswa dipuo tsa gore *economies* tsa bone ga di tshwane le tsa rona. Mme fela gone eo, bagaetsho, ka re e re kobela bagwebi bone ba re batlang gore ba tsise ditiro mono, fa ba re tshwantshanya le
one mafatshe a gore ko Botswana kana dipelo tsa me di tlile go ya fela ko motlakaseng le ko go diriseng metsi, nnyaa kgang eo ga ke e dumalane.

Botswana Telecommunications Corporation (BTC) e na le dipelo tsa P139 million. Mme le yone ke ntse ke bua yone kgang e fela gore BTC, ke boditse potso, ke boditse Tona le jaanong gore batho ko Kgatleng kwa ba a lela ka gore ba setse ba na le bo five years ba ikopetse gore ba gokelelwe megala mme ga ba gokelelwe megala. Di-profit tsa di-million million ke tse di teng tse e leng gore ga o itse gore ke eng go sa phatlaladiwe megala mo metseng. Ke ne ke bolelelwa gore ka ko metseng ya Noka ka kwa, megala e e teng kwa ke ya bo 1901 e e leng gore ga e tlhole e bereka mo nakong e, it is obsolete. Mme fa re tsentse megala e e ntseng jalo go na le dipelo tse tsa bo P139 million, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ne ke re a re lekeng, bagaetsho, ga ke dumelane le kgang eo ya gore re itshwantshanya le bo mang.

Ke itumelela Botswana Development Corporation (BDC) ka gore e tsweletse ka go tlhabolola lefatshe le, ka gore dipelo tsa BDC di a boa di dirisetswa gore di nne di tlhabolole Batswana. Jaanong eo yone koporase ga ke na bothata le yone. Fa e ka bo tse dingwe tse dikoporase le tsoni de kgona go tsweledisa dikgang tsa go anamisa ditlamelo jaaka di ntse di ipusolosetsa ka tsone dipelo tse.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke fete fela ka bofeso ka CEDA Young Farmers Fund. Kana lefatshe le la rona le go feta 50 per cent ya batho ba ba nnang mo go lone ke banana, mme le gone ke akgole. Go na le kgang e e ntseng e re ga le ka ke la bo le dira lenaneo le le ntseng jaana le le itebagantseng le gore le rotloelelese banana ko temo thuong fela. Nnyaa mananeo a setse a le mabedi a a itebagantseng le banana fela, mme fa e le gore ga o ye ko temothuong o ka ya ko go le lengwe le le ntseng le le teng, le e leng gore
madi a a ntshitsweng ko go P3 million jaanong ke P30 million gompieno, gore lone le itebagantse le kgwebo nngwe le nngwe fela e e leng gore monana o ka bo a ka e akanya, ba ya go ikopela gore ba thusiwe mo go lone.

La *Agriculture* kana tsa temothuo, mmaetsho, ke re mananeo a teng a a buseletswa a bo Arable Land Development Policy (ALDEP), a bo SLOCA. Selo se re a se itse gore ARAP fa e seyo mo teng ga re ise re fitlhe teng. Re a itse gore ARAP e ne ya re fa e le teng re re ra bona go ntsifala Batswana ba ba lemand. A Batswana ba thusiwe ba mo leubeng. Gompieno morogo o lopa P2.50 fa ole *cheap*, Masalila o o jesa P3.50 ko ga bone kwa. Jaanong ga go na Motswana yo o ka kgonang madi ao a go lema. A Batswana ba thusiwe fela jaaka ba ntse ba thusiwa. Lenaneo le fa le sa ntse le tlogetswe ko ntle ga re ka ke ra kgona gore re sosoetse gore dijo di ntshiwe mo lefatsheng le, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Kgang yame ya bofelo ke ya tsa botsogo e e leng gore *Honourable* Masisi o fetile ka yone. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, Tona go na le di-paragraph di le pedi ka *health* mme go buiwa fela ka HIV and AIDS, ga go na tsa botsogo ka bophara. A re seka ra leba ntlha e le nngwe fela. Malwetse a teng a a bolayang, AIDS ga se yone fela e le nosi e e bolayang, malwetse a nna a ntse a buiwa fa go ntshiwa dikai ka one a a bolaya. Batswana ba swa ka dipalo tse dintsii ka ntata ya go tsenwa ke malwetse a bo *high blood pressure, diabetes le malaria*. Ba a swa, mme re tshwanetswe ke gore re leke to balance dilo tse fa go abiwa madi re seka ra leba ntlha e le nngwe fela, ra leba kwa go reng nnyaa go na le AIDS. Mo nakong e, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, dipalo tsa batho ba ba swang ka ntata ya malwetse a mangwe a e leng gore ga se HIV and AIDS le tsone di thatlogetse ko godimo.
Monday 12 February 2007

Jaanong a re seka ra itebatsa ntlha e ra tloga ra palelela fela mo go reng re boloke ba ba lwalang bolwetse bo le bongwe, ka fa go na le ba bangwe ba e leng gore ba a nyelela le bone. A re direng dilo tse re lebile dintlha tsotlhe mo go tsa botsogo, re seka ra tloga ra iphitlhela gongwe re fedile. Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR SIELE): Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, go nneela sebaka se gore le nna ke akgele mo mafokong a ga Tona. Mme ke ema fano, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, tshokologong eno ke ema jaana ke dumalana e bile ke ema nokeng Tona ya Madi ka mafoko a a rotseng mo Palamente e ya kabo ya madi a monongwaga le ngwaga o o leng fa pele ga rona. Palamente e a tshwanelwa ke gore e dumalane le Tona gore madi a a rotseng fano a tle a fetisiwe a ye ko ditirong tse di farologanyeng. E bile gape ke batla go akgola Tona gore a bo a rotsa pego e e matsetseleko, e e bophara, e e botlhale, e e nang le tebelopele, e e tshwanang le e a e beileng fa pele ga rona.

Mafoko a ke a buang fano a, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga a a buiwe ke rona fela ba party ya ga Domkraga mo Palamenteng e, e rile fela mafoko a fa Tona a sena go a rola bomaitsaanape ba bodiwa mo dikgannyae, ba bodiwa mo seromamoweng gore ba bona jang kabo ya madi a mono ngwaga. Ke gakologelwa mafoko a a neng a buiwa ke mookamedi wa lekgotla le le tlhokomseng dikgwebo Botswana Confederation of Commerce, Industry and Manpower (BOCCIM) a supa fa kabo ya madi ya mono ngwaga e na le tebelopele e bile e na le mosola thata mo setshabeng.

Go ne gape ga bodiwa moitsaanape yo o entseng dilo tlhoko bogolo jang ka fa mhameng wa sepolotiki ko university. Le ene one a bua mafoko a a ntseng jalo a supa fa e le gore mafoko a Tona a a rotseng kampo ka fa kabog ya madi e ntseng ka teng e lebanye, e
tshwanetse, e bile e tlaa isa lefatshe leno ko pele. A supa gore kana madi fa re bua ka itsholelo, ditiro le go fokotsa lehuma, fa madi a mantsi a supilwe a abetswe go ya ko ditlhabololong kana go raya gore borakgwebo ba ba ikemetseng ba tlaa kgona gore ba tseny e letsogo, mme ba tle ba kgone gore ba hire batho ba kgone go tsenya mabogo ba bo ba kgone gore ba ntse jaana ba sologelwe ke molemo, matshelo a bone a tokafale. Ke selo se se mo pontsheng se dule le mo dipampiring ka fa se neng se buiwa ka teng. Mo go supang sentle gore Tona ya Madi le goromente yo wa ga Domkraga yo ba tshwere itsholelo ya lefatshe le ka matsetseleko, ga ba a e tshwara ka dimpa tsa menwana. Ke sengwe se tota re tshwanelwang ke go akgola Tona ka sone.

Gape ke bo ke akgolele Tona gore mo tshekatshekong ya gagwe a bo a ile a re fa a sekaseka gore tlhogokonokono ya mafoko a a kab o ya madi ya monongwaga e ka nna efe, mme a supa fa gore tlhogokonokono ya mafoko a rona e tshwanelwa ke go itebagany a le go dira ka bonatla, mme e bile gape e itebagan tse le go khwakhwaelela itsholelo le tswakanyo ya yone. Re lebile kgaisanyo e lobopo le e tshwereng gompieno mo kgwebong le tsa itsholelo. Ke sengwe sa dilo tse di supang gore re gatela ko pele, bogolo jang re le mo dingwageng tsen o tsa sekete sa bomasome a mabedi le motso.

Bagaetsho, kana fa go buiwa ka go dira ka bonatla, tiro ka bonatla ga re a tshwanelwa ke gore re e bue fela ka go e kwala le go e bua re le ko dikgotleng, re tshwanelwa ke gore go dira ka natla kana yone productivity, e simologe mo go yone Palamente e re leng mo go yone e. O ntse o bua ka tlhoba elo, Motsama isa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, o re gangwe le gape o bua boamma rauri jo bangwe ba rona ba re nnang mo Palamenteng e ka nako tsotlhe, re bonang e le gore go diragala tiro fela e e tlabisa ditlhong. E e leng gore nako le nako go tshwanelwa ke gore Motsama isa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente a emise dipuisanyo.
ka ntateng ya gore, ga re palo e e lekanang gore re ka tswelela ka dipuisanyo. Ke selo se e leng gore tota ka fa go ntseng ka teng ga se supe bangwe ba rona ba ba sa nneng mo Palamenteng mo gore tota golo fa re dira tiro ka bonatla. Mme go dira ka bonatla go tshwanelwa ke gore go simologe gone fela mo go rona fa mo Palamenteng e. Go dira ka bonatla mo go leng teng mo, gompieno jaana bangwe ba rona ba ba leng mo mhameng o ke lebaganyeng le one, bo sehadinyana ba bua puo e e reng ...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Bo sehadinyana ke ba fe?

MR SIELE: Bo monnawe sehadi.

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, go na le kgang e ke a tleng ke utlwe e buiwa gore fa motho a bua mo Palamenteng a seka a dirisa lefhoko lepe le lebegang o ka re le sotla kana le nyenyafatsa yo mongwe mo Palamenteng. Mme jaanong ga ke itse, ke utlwa Tona nnyaa o itolokisa fela o bua jaaka a rata, o bona batho dihadinyana, a ene ke sehadi le ba a nang nabo ka kwa. A bone ke dihadi ene le ba ba nnang ka fa, fela botlhe go simolola fa go ya go wela ko go welang teng, go simolola ka setilo se le se se kwa sele a ke dihadi?

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, o ka re ga ke a utlwa a supa ka monwana o rile ka ...

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: A re ba ba ka fa pele ga gagwe.

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Order! I will send you outside.

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Ee ke a itse.

MADAM SPEAKER: Ke utlwile a re bangwe ba a lebaganyeng nabo jaanong kana o lebagane le batho ba le bantsi bangwe ba ko godimo, so proceed.

MR SIELE: Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente…
Monday 12 February 2007

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** Point of order, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, with due respect this is not a joke I want to know whether it is proper for the Member holding the floor to refer to other people as *dihadinyana* in front of him and *a bua e le gore o raya* the people in front ...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** ... (Inaudible)...

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** No, *le fa ke ka ntshediwa ko ntle*, I want to know the procedure. My feeling is that the Honourable Member is completely out of order. If he is not being protected by the Chair, I think these words are unparliamentary.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Siele, are you referring to your colleagues *ba* opposition.

**MR SIELE:** Ke bua ka batho ba ba ganetsang e bile ba tswapola tsamaiso ya puso e, ke gone go hala.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Honourable Member*, mme jaanong go raya gore ee, ka mmannete o raya; kana nna ke itse e le bone ba ba ganetsang, *those on my left*. Jaanong se ba bitse jalo o tlaa ba bitsa le le kwa Freedom Square. *Can you please withdraw that?*

**MR SIELE:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga ke ka ke ka lepalepana le wena. Ke tlaa le boela kwa morago ka gore ga re tlhaloganye Setswana ka go lekana.

Mme gone Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, kana gone le fa batho ba tswapola tsamaiso e ya puso ya ga Domkraga, go buiwa ka gore ditiro gompieno jaana ga di tsamaye di eme fela. E kete go tewa go twee ga re lebe bontlha bongwe ja tsamaiso gore ditiro tse dingwe tse di sa tsamayeng tse, ka re bua ka go dira ka bonatl, re bo fitlhela gape bo le mo seemong se e leng gore batho ba ba neelwang ditiro - *private contractors* ke bone ba e leng gore ga ba dire tiro ka bonatl. Jaaka e le gore ditiro tsa ditlhabololo ka
bontsi di eme mo metseng ya rona e metona; mo metseng e mebotlana le mo ditoropong.
Di emisiwa ke gore bone borra dikonteraka ba, e ka tswa e le borra dikonteraka ba ba agang kana ba ba dirang ditsela, ba phuaganya ditiro gangwe le gape. Mme ke sengwe se e leng gore se supa gore tiro ka bonatla ga e yo. Batho ga ba a tlhwaafalela…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable, can you please count them first before you go.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** (Inaudible)

**MADAM SPEAKER:** No, no I have checked. Come back please. Honourable…

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** (Inaudible)

**MADAM SPEAKER:** *Ba* 21? Okay, proceed I am told they are 21.

**MR SIELE:** Go supa gore batho ga ba dire tiro ka bonatla, mme ke re selo se re tshwanelwa ke gore re le Mapalamente fa re se bue. Re supe gore tota ditiro tse dingwe tse ga se gore fa di sa diragale jaana, ke botlhogole ja puso e ya ga Domkraga e e busang ka lebaka la gompieno.

Mme gape ke re kana mafoko a ga Tona a, a ile a supa ka bophara ka fa itsholelo e golang ka teng ampo ka fa e godileng ka teng. A supa a tshwantshanya seemo sa rona mo tikologong eno ya borwa ja Aferika, a ba a e tsaya ka bophara a e tshwantshanya le seemo sa mafatshefatshe, a supa ka fa re gatetseng kwa pele ka teng. Ke batla go ganetsa lefoko le le reng itsholelo e ya lefatsho la Botswana e diragetsa ka letshotswa, ke re ga se boammaaruri. Itsholelo e e godile ka ntateng ya go bo e tshwerwe ke batho ba ba nang le tebelo, ba ba seng dipelo di matshwago jaaka fa re bona batho go diragala mo mafatsheng a mangwe.

Gompieno jaana fa re tla go tshwantshanya seemo sa rona sa lebaka la gompieno, re fithlha re gatets kwa pele thata go na le fa re se na go tsaya boikarabelo ja go busa
lefatše le. Kana fa re tla go tsaya boipuso jaaka fa Tona a buile, madi a a neng a dirisiwa e le madi otlhe a tsamaiso ya mmuso, e ne e le bo *million* ba le lesome fela. Mme e le gore ba ba some ba ga se gore ke madi a a tswang mo pusong ya lefatše; a mangwe e ne e le makotswa a tswa mo mafatsheng, mo bathong ba ba neng ba re thlhomogela dipelo ka ntata ya lehuma le re neng re le mo go lone.

Mme gape ke re ke supe gore, kana tota yone puso yone e, le fa re bua ka itsholelo re bua ka 40 *years* gompieno jaana. Tota re simolotse re le lefatše la Botswana go tla go tsena mo seemong sa go lekalekanya yone kabo ya madi, ke gore *the balanced budget* ka ngwaga wa 1972; dingwaga di le thataro go tswa mo ngwageng o re neng re tsaya boipuso ka one. Mme itsholelo ya feta ya simolola go gola mo dingwageng tsa tshimologo le magare a bo 1980, e e leng gore gompieno jaana, e gata fa e tsamayang teng mo lebakeng la gompieno. Ke re ke sesupo se e leng gore ke kgatelopelo thata e tona e puso e e tshwanelwang ke gore e ka e akgolelwa.

Go tswa mo go bo *million* ba ba lesome ka dingwaga tsa bo 1966 go tla go tsena mo selekanyong sa gore gompieno jaana re bo re bua ka bo P22.4 *billion*, e le madi a e leng gore ke madi a a tshwereng yone itsholelo e; ke namane e tona ya kgatelopelo. Bona gore gompieno jaana mo ngwageng o o neng o fela, re le gone fa mo Palamenteng e, Tona o ne a kopa Palamente gore e rebole tiriso ya madi a a yang kwa ditlhabololong a selekanyo sa P5.8 *billion*; ke namane e tona ya kgatelopele. Gompieno jaana o kopa Palamente e gore e rebole madi a selekanyo sa P7.2 *billion*, jaanong fa motho a tla go bua a re dilo tse di diragetse ka letshotsha; *it was just by coincidence* ga se selo se e leng boammaaruri ka gore, go supa sentle gore tota goromente yo o tshwere tiro.
Fa re tla go tsena mo mhameng wa thuto re tshwantshanya selekanyo sa fa re tsaya boipuso jaana, batho ba re neng re le teng ka nako eo mo tshimologong tsa dingwaga tsa boipuiso jaana, ke gakologelwa gore nna e rile fa ke bala Standard 6 e e leng Standard 7 gompieno, ka dingwaga tseo re na le bo Tona Nasha jaana mo kgaolong ya Southern District, class e ne e le nngwe fela ya Standard 6 e e leng Standard 7 gompieno. E le nngwe fela the whole of Southern District mo e leng gompieno jaaka fa re bua fano jaana, Southern District e na le dikole tse dipotlana di le 104. Mme re bua gore ga go na sepe se e leng gore se dirilwe. Mme fa o ya go tsaya tsone dikole tsa di primary schools mo lefatsheng lotlhe la Botswana, re bua ka palo e e tshwarang 744. Ke namane e tona ya kgatelopele e e leng gore puso e e dirile e e leng gore ga se tiro e o ka reng e dirilwe ke motho a ne a sa itse gore o dira eng, e le selo se nne se mo wela fela.

Mme sengwe sa dilo tse gompieno re buang fano ka sone re re puso e ga e na tlhokomelo gompieno jaana, go na le batho ba ba thelegelang mo lefatsheng leno ba tswa ka kwa ntle jaana, go raya gore puso e ga e dire sepe. Batho ba ba tswang ka kwa ntle (illegal immigrants) ba aila le ditoropo tse. Ee, go a diragala mo mafatsheng otlhe. Ga se tlholo ntsha mo lefatsheng la Botswana. Fa o tsamaya o ya kwa Fora gompieno jaana, o ya kwa Jeremane ampo o ya teng kwa Enyelane, le fa e le teng kwa Amerika, o ya go fitlhela go na le batho ba ba tswang kwa mafatsheng a e leng gore itsholelo ya bone kwa go one ga e kalo, itsholelo kwa mafatsheng ao e ya tshutshuma. Ntswa le rona mo lebakeng le le la maloba fa le, re ne re ntse re sianela kwa mafatsheng a mangwe kwa e leng gore itsholelo e ne e le botoka teng. Selo se sa di illegal immigrants ga se dirwe ke ka ntate ya gore puso ga e tlhokomele, go dirwa ke gore batho ba bona kwa e leng gore ba ka kgona go bona.
botshelo jo bo leng botoka teng. Ke sengwe sa dilo tse ke neng ke re ke eme fano go bua ka ditlhabololo tse e leng gore di a diragala mo lefatsheng leno la rona.

Re a itse gore e rile fa re tsaya boipuso selekanyo sa ditsela tse di neng di tshetswe sekonotere fela, le e bontshonyana jaana, e ne le le dikhilometara di ka tshwara borataro ampo bosupa fela mo lefatsheng leno. Teng fela kwa Lobatse go tswa fa Pakistan go ya go tsena fa High Court, kwa o nnang teng Motlotlegi. Mme gompieno jaaka fa re bua fano jaana, goromente yo o dirile megolagang ya ditsela tsa mheru, tse di tshetsweng sekonotere tse di lomaganyang metse e mebotlana le metse e metona, le ditsela tse di tona tse di tsamayang. Re bua ka dipalo gompieno tse e leng gore ke ditsela tse di fetang 15,000 tse e leng gore di dirilwe; di betlilwe. Ke ka fa itsholelo e e dirwang ke batho ba ba nang le tebelopele, ba ba seng mabogo a dipholtla ka fa e ntseng ka teng, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Mme ke re le fa gone re ntse re tshwere jaana re tshwanelwa ke gore re itebaganye le ditiro tse dingwe tsa bophara, go leka go tswelela ka go tokafatsa matshelo a batho mo dikgaolong tse di farologanyeng le mo ditoropong tsa rona. E re jaaka fa gompieno re ntse jaana, re mme le kakanyo ya gore re simolole go oketsa metlakase jaaka fa Motlotlegi Rraetsho Rakwadi Modipane a ne a tswa go bua gore, go na le metse e e leng gore e godile e thhoka gore metlakase e atolosiwe mo go yone. Bogolo jang jaaka fa re bona e le gore mo sebakeng seno sa gompieno, motlakase ke one konokono e e tshwanelwang ke gore batho ba bo ba ka ithusa ka yone ba dira ditiro tse ba ka itshetsang ka tsone. Bogolo jang jaaka fa re na le dikole tse e leng gore di thhoka metlakase jaana gore di kgone go tsenngwa didirisiwa tsa segompieno. Ke sengwe sa dilo tse e leng gore ke ka bua gore e
Monday 12 February 2007

re fa re ntse re atolosa jaana Tona, dilo tse o bone gore mo lebakeng le le tlang go nna le ditlamelo tsa go nna jalo.

A go atolosiwe metsi ka gore metsi ke sengwe sa dilo tsa botlhokwa mo matshelong a rona. Ga re ka ke ra tshela kwa ntle ga metsi a a leng phepa ka go nne botshelo ja gompieno, batho ke dikoa mme ba ka kgona gore ba ka tshela botoka fa metsi a a leng phepa a le teng a lekana batho mo metseng yotlhe ya lefatshe la rona. Fa re gogela kwa ngwageng o le wa 2016 re tshwanetse gore e re fa re ya go tsena koo, e bo e le gore metse ya rona e kgona go nna le ditlamelo tsa sebopego se se ntseng jalo. Ke bua jaana ka gore nna yo ke emeng fano ke emetse kgaolo e e nang le metse seka meraka le masimo. Ke re ditlamelo tse di ntseng jalo Tona, ntswa le wena ke itse gore o emetse kgaolo ya sebopego se se ntseng jalo, gore matshelo a batho ba rona a tle a kgone gore a tokafale.

Mme seemo se se ntseng jaaka fa re ntse re bua fano jaana, jaaka ke ne ke utlwa kgantele mokaulengwe a tlhobosa dingwe tsa dilo tse a bua gore diteemane tsa rona ga di dire sepe, ampo di mo diatleng fela tsa batho ba e ka bong e se beng gae. Ke re ao, batho betsho, kana gompieno fa re bua ka tsone ditlhabololo, re bua ka di billion tse, ke ditlhabololo tse di dirwang ke tsone diteemane tse re buang ka tsone mo mafatsheng a mangwe, jaaka fa le utlwa gore Tautona o tshwaraganye le bothata go buelela diteemane tsa rona. Mo mafatsheng a mangwe go buiwa ka seemo sa gore diteemane di tswa mo mabogong a a tletseng madi, mme diteemane tsra rona tsone di itebagantse le ditlhabololo.

Sengwe se ke ka buang ka sone e le ditlhabololo fela gompieno jaana; re bua ka selekanyo sa tthatlogo ya ditlhwathlwa; re bua ka inflation. Mme ke re re akgole Tona gore le fa re tshwaragane le bothata jo bo ntseng jaana, re nna le dikgwethlo tsa sebopego tse di ntseng jaana tse di leng fa pele ga rona; o kgonne gore ka tebelopele ya gagwe
kwelo-tlase ampo tsholetsego ya dithlhatlhwa; yone inflation e bo e le mo maemong a e leng mo go yone gompieno. Re bona mo mafatsheng a mangwe le mafatshe a re bapileng nao e le gore, inflation e tsamaya kwa godimo thata. Batho ba kokonelwa ke matshelo. Ke ne ke bala maabane mo pampiring ke utlwa gore mo lefatsheng lengwe le le gaufi le rona, inflation e tsamaya ka selekanyo sa 1,200 per cent. Mme ke re ka fagoromente wa ga Domkraga a tshwereng ka teng, inflation e fa e leng teng gompieno jaana, ke selo se e leng gore se a lebosega.

Se tlaa tshwanelwa ke gore se nne se tswelele se ntse jalo e be inflation e, e wele kwa tlase go feta jaaka e le fano gompieno jaana.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Two minutes left.

**MR SIELE:** Mme ka ke saletswe ke metsotso e le mebedi jaaka fa Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente a bua jaana, mo mabakeng a ke buileng ka one ke ema sentle fela ke tsepame fano ke re, a Palamente e ka bongwe fela jwa pelo e dumalane le kabo ya madi a mono ngwaga. Bogolo jang ka e rotswe ka botswerere jo e bo rotsweng, jo e itebagantseng le seemo sa matshele a rona. Fa go ka diragala jalo re tlaa gatela kwa pele. Ka mafoko a a ntseng Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ema Tona nokeng. Ke a leboga.

**MR MODUBULE (LOBATSE):** Thank you Madam Speaker. Mma ke tseye sebaka se Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente le nna ke akgele mo metsotsonyaneng e ke e filweng, e ke sa itseng gore a ke tlaa kgona go fetsa puo ya me. Mme legale ga go molato ke tlaa felela fa ke felelang teng.

Ke simolola ka gore mmaetsho, puo e re e beilweng pele kana ditogamaano tsa madi le kabo ya tsone ka fa e ntseng ka teng, e supa sentle gore go na le mananeo a goromente a
akanyang gore o ka dira eng ka one. Mme fa ke lebelela poverty eradication, ke simolola ka yone fela ya lehuma ke a tlhobaela gore, ga go supagale go na le tema e re e segang, e e supang gore re ka tswa mo lehumeng. Ke ne ke utlwa bangwe ba bua gore yone thulaganyo e ya social welfare state ya gore re tlhokomele batho ka namola leueba, ka go ba phakisa dijo, re e tshegetse fela jalo, ke yone e e ka bayang Domkraga mo pusong. Kana mafoko a a utlwisa botlhoko, e bile a tlhabisa ditlhong. Gore a ruri ke mafoko a a ka buiwang ke Mopalamente wa monana. Gore sone seemo se sa gore batho ba tshele mo mophakong se re beile mo pusong, mme re se tshegetse fela jaana, re seka ra ba ra tswa mo go sone, re ka tla ra latlhegelwa ke puso. Golo mo ke matlhabisa ditlhong.

Fa ke lebelela mo budget speech sa ga Tona ka 2005, mo go page 9, Tona o ne a bua gore, goromente wa Domkraga jaanong o tsile mo seemong sa gore a thape motho yo o bidiwang go twe ke ene Poverty Reduction Advisor. Gompieno ga re bolelelwe sepe gore motho yo, yo o neng a thapiwa ke puso ka 2005 o dirile eng, o thusitse go le kae mo go reng lehuma le fokotsege. Ke batla gore Tona a tle a re bolelele gore motho yo, o mo duela bokae, mme le gone o re thusa jang, ka gore ga gona sepe se nna ke se bonang motho yo a se hiretswe gore a se dire. Go ne go twe o tlaa hirwa, e bile ba senkisiwa motho yo ke ba UNDP. Gore motho yo re bolelelwe gore o fa ka ko o ne a thapiwa ka September 2005. Ke batla Tona a tle a tlhalose le tiro ya gagwe gore tota o re thusa jang, go fokotsa lehuma ka gore o kare ra re, nnyaa a re le tshegetseng jalo, re mme re ba oketse batho, social welfare state e tlaa ba tlhokomela. Bagaetsho, seemo se nna se a ntlhobaetsa.

CEDA - Fa re bua ka Young Farmers Fund, e na le mathata a yone a a setseng a boletswe. Tautona e rile a bua mo puong ya gagwe, ka gore speech sa ga Tautona sa 2005 le sone se
ne se tlhabisa ditlhong ka gore go ne go sena **page numbers**. Mme le fa go ntse jalo, ke tlaa nopola. E ne e le mo **paragraph 25**, fa a ne a bua gore, **CEDA Young Farmers Fund** o batla gore go nne le **a window** e e leng gore e tlaa bo e itebagantse le se, and *I want to quote with your permission Madam Speaker.*

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Do quote Honourable Member.

**MR MODUBULE:** *President o ne a re:* “Create a window under **CEDA** to provide *agricultural loans for graduates of agricultural training institutions.*” *President o ne a sa bue a oshaosha,* gore batla gore **fund** e, e itebaganye le eng. Le banana ba ba ithutetseng tsa temothuo. Ke sone se a se buang. 

Fa le tla mo Young Farmers Fund **guidelines** jaanong, le bo le specifaya gore fa a ne a riana Tautona, o ne a raya bomang. Jaanong mo go yone e, le bo le kwala clearly gore mo go **page 1 under introduction, 1.4,** ga bo go buiwa gore, ka mabaka one a **background** ya gore Tautona o ne a reng, jaanong **fund** e, e itebagantse le **the graduates**, go bo go twe ba **degree, diploma and certificate holders.**

Jaanong fa re tsamaya ka gore Ma-Domkraga ke batho ba ke sa itseng gore a ruri Modimo o na le bone, kana go diragala eng. Ke gore fa ba le kwa ntle kwa, nnyaa, monana mongwe le mongwe jaanong o na le tshwanelo. Jaanong fa ba tla fa e nna kgang e sele. Dilo tse bagaetsho, a re lekeng go tlhalosetsa setshaba gore a ra re Tautona se a neng a se bua, re tswa go dira se sele. Tautona mo puong ya gagwe ga a bua gore a o batla batho ba **degree,** ba **diploma,** kana ba **certificate.** Mo **the guidelines** jaanong le tlhalosa clearly le bua ka batho ba **degree, diploma and certificate holders.**

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker.

**MR MODUBULE:** Rraetsho ga ke na nako. Ke tlhalositse gore metsotso yame e kae.
MADAM SPEAKER: Ke Tona.

MR MODUBULE: _No, no. I am not going to yield, not even to a Minister. There is no provision for a Minister in the Standing Orders. I am afraid I am not going to do that._ O tlaa tla a thalose gore ke eng dipuo tsa bone di sa nyalane. E seng mo nakong e nna ke e filweng. O tlaa tla o thalosoa rraetsho. Ga re na nako Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ka bo ke mo letlelela.

ALDEP III, yone ke matlhabisa ditlhong. Re bua ka setlhogo se se reng, re tshwanetse ra nna mo seemong sa gore re phadisanye _globally_. Fa o ya kwa go ALDEP III, e sa ntse e bua ka go neela Batswana ditonki. Ke gore ke ipotsa gore, _how do you compete globally_ o lema ka tonki batho ba lema ka diterkere, ba lema ka dilo tse e leng gore _they are so sophisticated._

Fa gongwe o ka bona fela gore, re sa ntse re tshameka ka Batswana mo e leng gore go tlabisa ditlhong. Rona re le ba kganetso, bogolo jang ke bua ka Botswana National Front, re thalositse fela sentle gore, Batswana ba ba nang le keletso ya go lema, ba tlaa kopanngwa ba nna dithlopho, ba dira dikoporasi. Ba bo ba fiwa di-tsa-temo, diterkere, megoma le eng, ka nako ya temo, ba kgone gore dilo tse ba di dirise e le dikoporasi tse di ikopantseng. E seng tonki. Fa o bua ka tonki mo nakong ya gompieno, go bo go tse re phadisanye _globally_ le ba bangwe, ke gore o bona fela gore _this government is just not serious._

_ Unemployment –_ Fa re bua ka letlhoko la diiro mo lefatsheng la rona, re filwe dipalo ke Tona a supa gore jaanong re dule kwa go 21.5 wa 1993, jaanong gompieno re mo go 17 _point something_. Bagaetsho, seemo se se a tshwenya, e bile dipalo tse o ipotsa gore go tsewa dipalo ka tsela e e ntseng jang. Kana jaaka Motlotlegi Magama a ne a bua, fa o
lebelela goromente wa Domkraga ka fa a dirang ka teng, ke gore o ka tsaya dipalo ka sebaka se se rileng gore di tle di supe e kete seemo se a tokafala. Ka sebaka sengwe o tsaya tsele, di tle di supe se sele. Ga ke itse gore *statistics* tse re tshwanetseng ra di dumela tota gore ke tse di siameng tse di re bolelelang boammaaruri ke dive.

Ke bua jaana ka gore re na le *statistics* tsa *household incomes and expenditure survey*. Go na le tsa *labour force survey*. Go na le tsa *population census*. Tse tsothle fa o di tsaya, ga gona tse di nyalanang. Sone seemo se, se re baya mo go reng, re sala re sa itse gore tota boammaaruri jwa *statistics* tsa lefatshe la rona ke eng. *I still challenge the Minister* gore, mo gone mo ga *labour force survey*, ga gona le fa e le bonnete mo teng jwa gore re ka dumela gore lethoko la ditiro le wetse kwa tlase. Re a bona fa re tsamaya mo gore Batswana ba senyegelwa ke ditiro ka selekanyo se se kae. Jaanong ga se boammaaruri gore re ka dumela gore lethoko la ditiro le wetse kwa tlase.

Se ke buang ka sone ke gore, gompieno fa o lebelela seemo, o ka tsaya Botswana Meat Commission (BMC) kwa Lobatse, gore e ne e kgaola babereki ba ka tshwara 322. Fa o lebelela gore babereki ba le 322 ba kgaotswe, gatwe go ya go tlomiwa dikompone di ka nna pedi, ya *tannery* le ya *cannery*. Jaanong, tsone tse ka bobedi, di ya go hira batho fela ba le 160. Seemo sa lethoko la ditiro se ya kwa godimo, ga se fokotsege. Jaanong, nna ga ke itse gore se fokotsega jang, ka tsela e e ntseng jang.

Gompieno re bua ka gore go ya go nna le *project* e tona e e tlaa hirang batho ba le 3,500 fa e simologa. Mme boammaaruri jwa kgang ke gore, batho ba ba yang go bona ditiro tsa sennelaruri, ba 500 fela. Jaanong, 3,000 yo, o boa gape a tsena mo mmaketeng a batla ditiro. Fa o ya go tsaya *survey*, ka nako ya fa go dirilwe *project* eo, ke gore o tlaa bo o re
seemo sa ditiro jaanong se tokafetse. O lebala gore batho ba they are only temporarily employed. Ke one mathata a re lebaganyeng le one mo pusong e ya Domkraga.

Mma ke tswelele pele ke ye go bua ka mo go ntseng go twe, nnyaa, itsholelo ya rona re ntse re e tsamaisa sentle re le puso ya Domkraga, ga re na tshenyo. Hee, ke batla go bua ka yone ya corruption. Page 17 ya speech sa ga Tautona ka 2006. With your permission Madam Speaker, page 17, a bua ka tshenyetso setshaba, corruption. A re: “Mr Speaker, one of the major challenges we have to confront as we seek to consolidate our remarkable achievement is corruption.” Tautona o amogela sentle gore corruption e teng, ba bangwe ba re ga gona. Mme fa o ya go tsaya le report, ba re it is the least corrupt in Africa. Ke gore o ka bona gore fa e le tshenyo e e kana-kana mo Botswana e re e bonang ka matlho, go bo go twe we are the least corrupt, it means Africa is rotten and therefore, we cannot be proud of that. Mma ke go senosetse gore ke eng ke re corruption mo Botswana ga se sengwe se re ka ipelafatsang ka sone, ra re re ntse re tsamaisa meamuso sentle, ka nngwe tsela.

Heelang, re tswa kgakala le lona le ntse le busa lefatshe le. Re ka le botsa gompieno gore report ya ga Boswaen e kaе, ya dipolase tsa ga Rre Masire. E kaе report eo? Ga e ise e ko e rolwe fa. Batswana le gompieno ga ba itse gore dipolase tseo ga twe di ne di bonywe ka tsela e e ntseng jang. Dilo tse, it is corruption. Ga gona sepe gape mo godimo ga moo. Unless you can bring out that report ra tla ra e bona ra itse gore ga twe go ne go rileng.

The Kgabo Report e ne ya tswa, e supa corruption, e le gore it is rampant in this country. Ga se sepe fela. Batho ba ne ba amega. The late Peter Mmusi. The current Minister Daniel Kwelagobe. The late Washington Meswele. These people ba ne ba amega mo go yone Kgabo Report. Ke gore mo Botswana le fa o dira dilo tse e seng tsone, o sa ntse o ka
tlhatloswa maemo fela wa nna Tona fela ga go re sepe. Christie Report e e neng e ama
Honourable Councillor Tshipinare gompieno, the late Letsholo le ba bangwe, mma ke ba
tlogele ke seka ka ba bua ka maina.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** …(*Inaudible)…

**MR MODUBULE:** E ne e le Permanent Secretary ka nako eo. Mongwe wa ba ba neng
ba amega, e ne e le Permanent Secretary Venson. Seemo se, ga ke tlhoke go bolelelwa,
ke dilo tse di diragalang re le teng mo Botswana. Re itse gore this government e corrupt
jang. Ga se mo go ka tweng nnyaa, re a galalela fela, Batswana ba ntse ka thokgamo fela,
re tsamaisa puso. Nnyaa, dilo di a senyega. Ke gore Batswana ke batho ba ba bonolo, ba
ba sekeng ba tsaya dikgato fa dilo di senyega.

The Zakhem saga ya ga Honourable Nkate, hee, matlhabisa ditlhong, monna a ba a
ipholosa mo boToneng a wela fa fatshe, a boa a palama gape. Ke gore o bone fela gore,
this government ya go re sepe gore o ka senya go le kae, ke dilo fela tse e leng gore they
are acceptable. Dilo tse ga le kake la ipelafatsa ka tsone la re seemo se go raya gore dilo
di siame.

Lesetedi Report, hee, *I was misled by my officials, misled by officials. People were just
seated, promoted Ministers and nothing happens.* Ga go tsewe dikgato. Dilo tse di a
tshwenya Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

**MRS VENSON MOITOI:** On a point of order Madam Speaker. Thank you Madam
Speaker, I think unless the Honourable Member can put fact to all this wallowing that he
is making, he should not continue on this path ka gore he is defaming people. Some of us
might want to take him on ka gore if you are going to make a statement about people
being corrupt and having performed corrupt acts, ba bo ba tlhatlosiwa maemo ba diriwa
Matona he may have to prove it here. Ke kopa gore leina la ga Venson be withdrawn in that litany, unless he has proof.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, do you have proof?

**MR MODUBULE:** Honourable Speaker, I need not have proof here in the House but it is a fact that the Honourable Member, who was not an Honourable Member then, was even expelled. I do not think I owe anybody an apology here.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** You are referring to ... *(inaudible)*

**MR MODUBULE:** Yes, as PS, it is a fact.

**MR MOATLHODI:** On a point of order Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the point of order I am praying for, I pray Madam Speaker, that you invoke Standing Order 46(5), you are imputing motives on other Honourable Members. If I could read it with your good speakership Madam. It says clearly, “A Member shall not impute improper motives to other Members.” What Honourable Modubule is saying about other people alleging that they are corrupt when he is failing to come up with documentary evidence, he is imputing motives on other Members of Parliament. I pray Madam, that you put him on the right track.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, go bokete fa e le gore ga o kake wa ntsha proof wa kgona to quote wa bala gore ka mmannete mongwe o ne a kojwa ka mabaka a le a. Go mpaya mo seemong se se bokete because nna ga ke na dilo tseo fa pele game. *Will you please desist from quoting people’s names.*

**MR MODUBULE:** Thank you Honourable Speaker, let me continue.

Honourable Speaker, *ke ne ke sa ntse ke bua ka gore* this Government cannot claim to to be clean.
MRS VENSON MOITOI: On a point of order Madam. Madam Speaker, I do not wish to challenge your ruling on this matter. But I think the Standing Orders are intended to protect Members whose names and reputations might be intentionally misaligned by other Honourable Members. The Honourable Member is imputing improper motive against several Members without proof. I think it is only proper that he must withdraw the statements that he has made for record purposes. It has gone on record, and I do not think I wish to have my name associated again with a lot of things that he was saying, unless he has proof.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: On a point of order Madam Speaker.

MADAM SPEAKER: No-no, I have to make a ruling. Honourable Member, although I was saying you should desist from quoting people’s names really if you do not have something se o ka se bayang fa pele ga rona gore nnyaa kana fa ka riana, so I think just withdraw, or else we will adjourn and ask you to go and get evidence.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker, I think I clearly mentioned Boswaen Report, Kgabo report, Christie Report and I went on to mention the Lesetedi Report, I do not know what else, what type of proof is needed in this House? I am mentioning these reports because the Members’ names I am quoting are included in these reports, and they are mentioned in those reports. Indeed the Honourable Members that would have appeared before this committee because they were alleged to have committed acts of corruption. I am saying even now these reports stand, I am not going to withdraw anything here.

LEARNED PARLIAMENTARY COUNSEL (MR NGCONGCO): Madam Speaker, I too am trying to follow the reasoning of the Member on the floor. If I understand him
correctly he is saying people’s names, the people to whom he has alluded to in the course of his debate, their names are indeed mentioned in certain reports. That might well be, but it is one thing for your name to be mentioned in a report and it is another thing separately for it to be said in that report that there was specifically a finding that you were guilty of corruption. The mere fact that your name was in the report, it will depend still on the nature of the finding that was made against you in that report.

MADAM SPEAKER: Again I want to say, and this is for the last time now. You either withdraw, or else we adjourn and you go and get those reports and then you give us proof that indeed those people that you have mentioned are corrupt or were corrupt.

MR MODUBULE: You know what, I have got nothing to fear about what I am saying.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Re adjourn?

MR MODUBULE: Yes if you want to adjourn let us adjourn, what is the problem?

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, talk to me please.

MR MODUBULE: Oh, Honourable Speaker, Madam, tanki mma go nkgakolola gore ke ne ke le mo Setswaneng jaanong ke fetogotse ko puong e sele ya baeng.
Mmaetsho, ke ne ke supa gore ga go na sepe se Goromente o a o ka reng o clean o ntse a tsamaisa dilo sentle.

MADAM SPEAKER: Re fa maineng. Honourable Member please, re fa maineng.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker, ka rialo ka re i am not withdrawing, that is what I am saying, I am not withdrawing.

MADAM SPEAKER: Then we will have to adjourn. Ee we will just have to adjourn so that you go and get proof.
MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule, will you be able to furnish us with the evidence in 30 minutes?

MR MODUBULE: …(Inaudible)…

MADAM SPEAKER: Ee, let us adjourn, the House will adjourn for 30 minutes.

PROCEEDING SUSPENDED FOR 30 MINUTES

MADAM SPEAKER (MRS KOKORWE): Fa re adjourner e ne e le gore Honourable Modubule a ye go tla ka bosupi. It is either o re fa bosupi Honourable Modubule, or you withdraw mafoko a o neng o a buile.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule.

MR MODUBULE: Ehe!

MADAM SPEAKER: Gake ise ke nne fa fatshe. You know what, I will send you outside and not only for today, for a week, and that will be humiliating on your part. Ke raya gore ga e kake ya re ke sa ntse ke eme ke bua o bo o ema ka dinao. Take the floor.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker, mma ke go leboge. Mma ke tswelele fa ke neng ke eme teng. Ke boletse Honourable Speaker gore I am not going to withdraw anything. Unfortunately let me say I have not been able, ija, ka ke ne ke dirisa Setswana, ga ke a kgona go bona di-report tse dingwe but ka bolesego the Christie Report I have, and ke batla gore ke tswelele ka yone ke fe bosupi mo go yone jo bo papametseng jo bo kwadilweng. Mo go ba ba ka bong ba e tshotse fa e le gore ba e bonye, ka in our Library ke fitlhetse e seyo, page 221.

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Order! Christie Report is one of them, mme fela, fa report e sena go tswa go tswa White Paper. Ke gore tota fa o bua ka bosupi o tshwanetse o bo o bua ka selo se e leng gore ke sa mafelelo, se feletse se e leng sone se se reng nnyaa motho
o ne a bonwa phoso kana o ne a seka, e seng fela moo, ke di-allegation. Usually after a report go tswa a White Paper. Bangwe ba o ba buang jaaka o ne o ntse o nopola di-report, bangwe e ne ya re ba tswa foo ba bo ba tsamaya ba ya go itsheka ba bo ba fenya dikgang tsa bone. Gape o tshwanetse gore mo case e e ntseng jalo o tle ka ruling gore kana mme motho yo o ne a welwa ke case. Tota nna fa ke re bosupi ke raya bosupi jo bo feleletseng jo bo supang gore this person, o ne a le corrupt case e ne ya mo wela.

**MR MABILETSA:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. When the Honourable Member was holding the floor he referred to the Christie Report, ga a ise a ko a bue ka White Paper, tsone ke tsone tse a neng a bua ka tsone tse. I do not think Madam Speaker, it will be proper for you to say come up with the White Paper. That is the report and it does not even have a White Paper, that one I am sure.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Mabiletsa, you are out of order, because ene o buile ka di-report nna ke buile ka bosupi. Jaanong bosupi ke conclusion ya gore go fedile go reng, ke bone bosupi jo nna ke bo batlang.

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** On a point of procedure Madam Speaker.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Who is out of order? Honourable Modubule, please take the floor, I am not allowing you. Am I out of order!

**MR MODUBULE:** Honourable Speaker, with due respect may I quote from the Christie Report what I was saying. If further evidence then is required let me be given time to find those documents that you require. Because there will be no point, I have been quoting the Christie Report and that is what I have been debating on and nothing. Therefore if anybody else needs anything that will probably help them we would then have to adjourn.
Monday 12 February 2007

then they can bring anything that will actually help them to maybe withdraw their cases if the case be.

I am saying the Christie Report as it stands, anybody who can read this Christie Report will come out with what I am saying. Therefore, I find it very difficult Honourable Speaker to say I should bring the White Paper and the High Court judgement and so forth in 30 minutes, I do not think it is fair.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, I said ya go tla ka bosupi. O ne o sa bue fela ka Christie Report, Christie Report ke e e amang Honourable Venson Moitoi. O buile ka The Kgabo Report, o buile ka di-report tse dintsi, jaanong fa e le gore ga o a kgona go di bona, *what I am going to do Honourable Member* ke a gore *we adjourn*.

*I want to give you time because I want* to be fair mo go wena. Ke go fa nako, *we are adjourning* mme e re kamoso ka 2.30 p.m fa re tsena fano fa, o bo o tsile ka bosupi. Fa ke re bosupi ga ke re di-report, o tle ka bosupi jo bo feletseng jo o reng *so and so was found guilty and therefore* go ne ga lemosega gore o corrupt. Jaanong fa o dira fela jalo o bo o ya; ke gore o bue ya ga Rra-Gaone ka o ne wa mmua, o bue ya ga Rre Kwelagobe ka o ne wa mmua, o bue ya ga Rre Mmusi, ba bangwe o ne o ntse o bua the late. Ba botlhe ba o ne o ntse o ba bua ka gore go mo Hansard, jaanong o bo o re bosupi ke jo kana fa le bona ke re batho ba ba corrupt, ke raya jaana. *Otherwise* fa e le gore ga o kgone o bo o boela morago kgang gore nnyaa ga ke a bona bosupi, *I am withdrawing, I am going to adjourn the House to give you time. This is a waste of time* ka gore tota kana Budget Speech jaaka we are debating it jaana, re thaemilwe gore re fetse ka nako e e rileng. Jaanong re jela ba
bangwe nako gone fela jaaka fa re riana. *I have no choice but to adjourn the House again,*
gore re go fe nako o ye go senka bosupi, bosupi jo e leng tota-tota bosupi.

**DR NASHA:** *On a point of order Madam Speaker.* Ke ne ke re Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo
tsa Palamente, a mme gone, ga ke itse, a ditsamaiso ga di letlelele gore fa ene a sa ntse a
ya go senka kgetse ya gagwe ka o boloditse lerwa a sa rwala ditlhako a ga go na yo
mongwe yo o ka buang ra tswelela le kgang, ene o tlaa boela kamoso, kana jang?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Ga ke batle a tsenwa ke ope fa gare, ee ke ne ke sa batle gore
kgang ya gagwe e tswenwe ke ope fa gare.

**MOTION**

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MINISTER OF STATE PRESIDENT (MR KWELAGOBE):** Madam Speaker, I
move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and *agreed to.*

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 6.35 p.m. until Thursday 15th February, 2007 at
2.30 p.m.

**Thursday 15th February 2007**

**THE ASSEMBLY** met at 2.30 p.m.

**(THE SPEAKER in the Chair)**

**PRAYERS**

***

**QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER**

**BRISTOL MYRES SQUIBB AND/OR OTHER ASSOCIATED PARTNERS ON**

**THE BOBIRWA ARV PROJECT**
MR S. KGATHI (BOBIRWA): asked the Minister of Health:

(i) when the assistance provided by Bristol Myres Squibb and/or other associated partners on the Bobirwa ARV Project is expected to end; and,

(ii) to state the terms and conditions contained in the Memorandum of Understanding between the Botswana Government and Bristol Myres Squibb on the establishment of the Bobirwa ARV project in respect of the following:

(iii) stakeholders involved in the administration of the project

(iv) plans for the absorption of staff and how many there are by way of professional categorisation.

MINISTER OF HEALTH (PROF TLOU): Madam Speaker, the Bobirwa ARV Project, supported by Bristol-Myers Squibb (BMS) Company ended on the 31st December 2006. A no-cost extension period of 12 months has been agreed upon between BMS and the Government of Botswana.

The project was jointly administered by BMS and the Government. At national level, the Ministry of Health, together with the Ministry of Local Government administered the Project. At District Level, there were three main implementing partners namely, Bobonong Primary Hospital, Borotsi Clinic and Bobonong Community Home Based Care Society. Implementation of activities was done in collaboration with the District Multi-sectoral AIDS Committee. The overall coordination at District level was done by a project secretariat office set up for effective implementation of the project.

Madam Speaker, most of the staff under this project has been absorbed by Government as follows:
Monday 12 February 2007

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employee Category</th>
<th>Number under the project</th>
<th>Number absorbed by Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project Coordinator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation Officer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Offered and turned down the offer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Officers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2(1 resigned)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurses</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laboratory Technicians</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1 resigned, the other officer turned down the offer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacist</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>resigned</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Workers</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3 (1 resigned)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrator</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Employed else where</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Clerk</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>To be absorbed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dietician</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Education Officer</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drivers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2 (No vacancy for 1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleaners</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0 (No vacancies)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

So most of the staff has been absorbed.

Thank you.
NUMBER AND STATUS OF EXPATRIATES

MR O. S. MOLEBATSİ (Tswapong South): asked the Minister of Health to give:

(i) the total number of expatriates by country of origin in her Ministry;
(ii) the contract value of all these expatriates i.e. total money earned plus terminal benefits to be earned; and
(iii) the longest serving expatriate and what plans are in place for localisation of the post/s.

MINISTER OF HEALTH (PROF TLOU): Madam Speaker, the total number of expatriate personnel in my Ministry is six hundred and ninety-nine (699). This number, broken down by country of origin, is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Employees</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bangladesh</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbados</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Belgium</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulgaria</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burundi</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cameroon</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congo Republic</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuba</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country</td>
<td>Value</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Czech Republic</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democratic Republic of Congo</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Egypt</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eritrea</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghana</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guyana</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesotho</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberia</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mozambique</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Namibia</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Russian Federation</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sierra Leone</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Madam Speaker, the contract value of all these expatriate officers, including terminal benefits to be earned, is P65,604,602.00. Personal emoluments at the end of the current contracts will amount to P49,757,681.00 while the total value of terminal benefits will be P15,846,921.00.

The longest serving expatriate officer in my Ministry is a Chief Medical Officer (D1) who was first appointed on the 23rd January 1987. Madam Speaker, most of the Chief Medical Officers posts in our hospitals are occupied by expatriates because we do not yet have Batswana senior medical officers to localise them.

I thank you.

**NUMBER OF ORPHANS IN BOTSWANA**

**MR N. M. MODUBULE (LOBATSE):** asked the Minister of Local Government the number of orphans in Botswana categorised regionally and according to gender.
Monday 12 February 2007

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASIMOLOLE): Madam Speaker, there are 53,309 orphans in Botswana. Out of this 26,866 are male while 26,443 are female. The number of orphans per region are as provided in the table which I shall avail to the Honourable Member. I thank.

OWNERSHIP OF ASSET MANAGEMENT FIRMS IN BOTSWANA

MR K. KARIO (SELIBE-PHIKWE WEST): asked the Minister of Finance and Development Planning, to brief the House on the ownership of Asset Management Firms in Botswana in relation to citizen directorship and shareholding of these Asset Managers and whether the Minister does not deem it prudent to legally require Asset Managers to sell shares to citizens so that profits being realized in this sector do not accrue to foreigners only and thus enhance citizen participation in the economy.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR MLAZIE): Madam Speaker, Asset Management firms are registered under the Companies Act, like any other private company operating in the country. Furthermore, the Registrar of Companies does not have the details of ownership of these firms at hand. It should be noted that asset managers are agents who manage funds for individuals and institutions by investing them through stocks, real estate, derivatives, bonds or cash equivalents. They invest funds in different portfolios to get the maximum return for the investor, for a specified commission.

Since these companies are registered under the Companies Act, with no restriction in relation to their directorship and shareholding, my Ministry does not deem it prudent to force them to sell shares to citizens. We see no reason why this particular sector should be singled out for restrictive treatment. Instead, the Ministry would rather encourage more
citizens to enter the sector directly, with a view to promoting competition and deepening
the domestic financial market.

I thank you Madam Speaker.

IMPLEMENTATION OF MANYANA VILLAGE DEVELOPMENT PLAN

MR M. G. K. MOOKA (MOSHUPA): asked the Minister of Local Government when
the Manyana Village Development Plan will be implemented, or if it was just a waste of
time and money developing the plan.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Madam Speaker, the
Manyana Development Plan (1999 – 2023) produced in December 2001 is a physical
planning document, which explicitly sets out the policies and objectives to guide and
shape future growth and development of Manyana. However, I am informed that the Land
Board took some time to acquire the identified fields for demarcation of plots until 2006.
Currently 500 plots have been demarcated and the Sub Land Board is in the process of
allocating them. This plan will therefore be implemented accordingly over the next
successive District Development Plans.

I thank you.

NUMBER OF YOUNG PEOPLE WHO BENEFITED FROM THE OUT OF
SCHOOL GRANT

MR D. SALESHANDO (GABORONE CENTRAL): asked the Minister of Youth, Sports and Culture the number of young people who have benefited from the Out of School Youth Grant in the villages of New Xade and further state the number of young people employed by the funded projects.
MINISTER OF YOUTH, SPORTS AND CULTURE (MR PHETO): Madam Speaker, at the start of the current financial year New Xade and Kaudwane were allocated P260,760.00 each for youth project funding and short term skills training.

The New Xade office covers the following settlements; New Xade, East Hanahai, West Hananahai, Bere and Kagcae. The office received six (6) project proposals and managed to process four (4) of these. Out of the four (4) projects processed, two (2) were approved with projected employment of five (5) and two (2) were deferred.

a. Approved Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Enterprise</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Projected Employment</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guinea Fowl</td>
<td>Okwa</td>
<td>49,352.00</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Acquisition of project items ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts &amp; Craft</td>
<td>West Hanahai</td>
<td>48,812.59</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Acquisition of project items ongoing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The two (2) unprocessed proposals have been referred to the Animal Health and Production’s Small stock Office for technical appraisal and will be presented during the Production Development Committee (PDC) sitting of the 22nd February 2007.

a. Deferred Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Enterprise</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Reasons for Deferral</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
The Kaudwane Office covers the following settlements; Kaudwane, Salajwe and Sorilatholo. Six (6) project proposals have been received. Out of the four (4) processed proposals one (1) has been approved with a projected employment of three (3) while three (3) have been rejected.

(i) Approved Projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Enterprise</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>Projected Employment</th>
<th>Status</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Broiler Production</td>
<td>Salajwe</td>
<td>P34.458.60</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Setting up on site</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(ii) Rejected Proposals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Enterprise</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Reasons for Rejection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Small stock &amp; Beef Cattle Production</td>
<td>Salajwe</td>
<td>Project not feasible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpentry &amp; Welding</td>
<td>Salajwe</td>
<td>Project not sustainable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goat Rearing</td>
<td>Salajwe</td>
<td>Project not feasible</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I would like to assure the Honourable Member here that these are also being reviewed by our office because we had some observations on them.
Madam Speaker, a total of fifteen (15) young people; fourteen (14) females and one (1) male, were trained in various skills as a way of preparing them to undertake projects in due course. A total of P53,455.60 was spent on these training; among others they were trained for Bread Making (P22,170.60); Vegetable Production (9,075.00); and Bead Making (22,210.00).

In an effort to push the loan applications, the Production Development Committees (PDCs) meet on a weekly basis to adjudicate on the applications. The Department of Culture and Youth is closely monitoring the situation in order to ensure that the funds are disbursed accordingly.

Therefore, the situation will change for the better by the end of the financial year and I am also personally monitoring this on weekly basis. Thank you.

MR REATILE: Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke ne ke re ke botse Motlotlegi Tona gore ka gore batho ba kwa Salajwe go lebega e le gore dikopo tsa bone di ne tsa ganwa mme le o dumela gore di project tsa teng are not feasible. Kgakololo e e leng gore le a ba e neela gore ba tle ba kgone go tsena mo diporojekeng tse lona le bonang di ka ba isa golo gongwe ke efe ka gore ke utlwa gore le a ba rutuntsha, mme thutuntsho kana ke go sele. Kgakololo e e leng gore motho o ka tsaya porojeke e e ntseng kwa Salajwe le yone ke e sele.

MAJ. GEN. PHETO: Se re se dirang, Motlotlegi, ke gore mo thutuntshong ya baikopedi, re gakolola gape gore se se lejwang fa o batla go dira kgwebo ke eng jaaka thekiso ya dithoto tse o tlaa bong o di dira go bona gore o ka di rekisa ko kae. Ka jalo, ke dilo tse di pataganeng mme le tsone dikopo tse dingwe tse di boetseng kwa morago
kgotsa tse di gannweng, taolo ya me ke gore a go lejwe sentle mo go tsone gore a tota re a re motho ga a ka ke a rua dipodi kwa Salajwe.

**MR TSOGWANE:** Ke ne ke re ke kope Tona gore a ko a tlhalose gore tota tsone di porojeke tse tsa banana tsa temo-thuo fa a bo a di gana jaana mme rona re tlhoma letlole la temo-thuo la banana la CEDA, o a bo a re batho bao jaanong ba ya go reng?

**MAJ. GEN. PHETO:** Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga re re batho ga ba ka ke ba rua, ga ba ka ke ya re mo dikopong tsa bone ba ikopela leruo. Ga se mafoko a rona, mme go tswana gore wena o rile o batla go dira jang. Go tswa mo kopong ya motha ka fa a e beileng ka teng, ka fa a akanyang ka teng e seng gore ra re leruo ga le ka ke la ruiwa.

**MOTION**


**(NO. 4 OF 2007**

**SECOND READING**

**(Resumed Debate)**

**MADAM SPEAKER (MS KOKORWE):** Fa re kgaogana fano maabane *Honourable* Modubule e ne e le ene a neng a bua. Mme ke ne ke me laetse gore ka o ne a buile ka di *allegations* tsa *corruption* - tshenyetso setshaba mme a bua maina a batho ba a neng a re tshenyetso setshaba e teng mo Botswana bakeng sa bone ka ba kile ba senyetsa setshaba. Ke ne ke sa tswa go mo kopa gore a e go tla le bosupi e seng jalo *he withdraw* mme ka mo fa *the whole morning* tsatsi jeno. Ke solofela gore jaanong o tshwere bosupi jo a tla re bo bayang pele kante e seng jalo a boele morago kgang. Nako ya gagwe e ne e setse e fedile; 25 minutes e ne e setse e fedile. Jaanong go raya gore go tla jone bosupi fela re bo re tswelela le ba bangwe.
MR MODUBULE (LOBATSE): Honourable Speaker, mma ke go leboge le sebaka se o se nmeetseng. I would like to start where we ended up yesterday and Honourable Speaker I would like with due respect to put my...

MADAM SPEAKER: O ne o bua ka Setswana and therefore comply with Standing Order 10 (1).

MR SEBETELA: Procedure, Madam Speaker. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, nna ke ithaya ke re golo fa re dumalane gore mongwe le mongwe o tlaa nna le masome a mabedi le bothhano. Jaanong e kete ba bangwe o tlaa ba okeletsa, ke re a ko o re tlhalosetse gore jaanong o dira jang, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Sebetela, you are out of order because ke go bolelela gore golo fa go na le kgang so re batla go e feleletsa re e tswale. Ao, ga go na go opa diatla ga sepe.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker, go siame mma ke tswelele ka puo e ke neng ke bua ka yone. Ke ne ke rile ke e tseye ka boripana ka gore puo ya Seeng e khotshwane mme le fa go ntse jalo mma ke tswelele ka ke ne ke bua ka Setswana, Mmaetsho, ke re Mma ke tswa go senka tse o neng o rile ke di senke. Ke tswa go batla dipego, di White Paper le molao kana di judgement jaaka o ne o batla, ke di bonye. Jaanong ke tlaa simolola ka fa ke rulagantseng ka teng; ke simolole ka se ke neng ke se bua; the confirmed allegations. Ka re confirmed ka gore go simolola e le di allegation kana e le ditlhobaelo tsa batho go bo go nna le Commission of Enquiry mme e bo e tla ka di findings. Ke gone ke tlaa simololang teng, ke bo ke ya go fetsa ka tsone ke bo ke tsena kwa White Paper, ke bo ke tswelela jaanong ke ya kwa di katlholong gore di ne tsa reng.
Jaanong ke sone se e leng gore ke tlaa tswelela ka thulaganyo yone eo Motlotlegi, ka e bile ke lebogela gore o mphile sebaka go feta ba bangwe. Ke re selo se ke selo se sentle thata. Mma ke tswelele Mmaetsho, fa ke bua ka The Christie Report, ke tlaa simolola ka yone eo mme ke ya go simolola fela mo go Page 47, Paragraph 210 ya Christie Report e e supang se ke tlaa se thhalosang; Page 47. Jaanong ya re, Mmaetsho e balega jaana mme e kwadilwe ka puo ya Seeng, ke tlaa kopa go e nopola ka tetlelelo ya gago…

**MR SEBETELA:** Procedure, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I am aware of the fact that you ruled earlier on my point of procedure. However, I think you need to guide the House; how long are you going to allow the Honourable Member to give this evidence. I am asking this question, Madam Speaker, because we are debating an Appropriation Bill with a given time period and I believe it finishes, I think next week Tuesday according to the calculation based on the Standing Orders and the number of Members of Parliament in this House. Therefore, I think you need to give us a more light into how this particular trial or whatever you want to call it will last in the House. I think it is very important, and I am wondering, Madam Speaker, *gore* in terms of Standing Orders is what we are allowing to happen in the House given the fact that the time is for the Appropriation Bill. Is he still on the Appropriation Bill?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Member, *ke a go utlwa. It is just unfortunate that e rile fa a bua yone Appropriation Bill a bo a thlagisa kgang e gompieno e leng yone e e re beileng fa, a bua ka maina a batho. Mme jaanong kana go ne ga nna le a point of order raised by Honourable Moatlhodi le Honourable Venson-Moitoi, gore nnyaa, se a se buang ga se sone. Jaanong ga ke re re ne re batla gore a rurifatse gore se a neng a se bua e ne e le sone. Mme ke tshwenyega ka nako jaaka fa le wena o bua, ka gore le maabane ke*
ne ke ntse ke tshwenyega ka nako. Jaanong ke tlaa mo kopa gore a nne brief. Se ke se batlang tota, se ke neng ke se mo kopile maabane Honourable Members e ne e le ditshwetso; ke rile ke batla di White papers - ke gore fa e le pego, gore e ne e reng ga go re thusa thata. Re batla go itse gore nnyaa, ee, White Paper e ne ya re kana ruling ya High Court kana ya Court e ne ya re gore re nne ba khutshwane. Because tota jaaka fa re bua bagaetsho le maabane ke ne ke ntse ke bua ka selo seo gore fa re bua kgang e re e buang gompieno, re a bo re beile mo nakong. Fa go tulwe each Member o filwe 25 minutes re a bo re itse gore ke 25 minutes e e leng yone e tlaa re isang kwa go 22 re bo re feditse sengwe le sengwe. Jaanong fa e le gore you are going to go into through the report ka fa ke bonang o ikaelela go dira ka teng, a bo jaanong e leng gone o yang kwa di findings - go raya gore re tlile go lala fa and I do not think I will allow it because tota nako ga e re letle.

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Point of procedure. Madam Speaker, tsamaiso e ke batlang gore o re fetise mo go yone ke e. Maabane o buile ka gore o batla bosupi ka botlalo, go kwadilwe mo kgannyeng e o neng o e bua; ka botlalo. Ke kgang e wena o e buileng, ke gore fa o re bosupi ka botlalo o raya detailed evidence; ka botlalo. Jaanong ga ke itse gore fa go tla mo go reng, ga re ise re itse gore mokaulengwe bosupi ja gagwe bo tlaa mo tsaya nako e ka mme re setse e bile e le gore we are jumping the gun. Jaanong selo se ke batlang gore Mmaetsho fa o se ntlhalosetse e le tsamai…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudile)

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Rra tlhe didimala. Selo se ke batlang gore Mmaetsho o nthuse mo go sone e le tsamaiso ke gore gangwe le gape fa motho a bua…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Owai!
Monday 12 February 2007

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: Hei, shut up! Gangwe le gape fa e re motho a bua a ba a umaka mokwalo mongwe gatwe a nopole mokwalo oo. Mme jaanong Raetsho fa a bua ka di judgements ke raya mo go se a neng a se bua se se in the Hansard, ga a a bua ka di White Paper o buile ka di reports. Jaanong fa e le gore gone mo go se a se buileng ke mo Speaker a sa go batleng, o batla gore a e go batla se a sa se buang, a ke yone tsamaiso, a to quote go diriwa jalo?

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Members, Honourable Molefhabangwe, se o se buang ga se boammaaruri. What I said yesterday ke se and I was actually responding to Honourable Mabiletse. Ke ne ka re, "Honourable Mabiletse, you are out of order", I told him so. Ke bo ke mmolelela gore because o ne a buile ka reports, ke raya Honourable Modubule. O ne a buile ka di reports nna ke buile ka bosupi, ga ke ise ke re bosupi ka botlalo. Ka bo ke tswelela ke re jaanong ke re bosupi ke conclusion ya gore go fedile go reng, ke bone bosupi bo nna ke bo batlang. Ke gore go re go fedile go tweng mo kgangnyeng ya ga Christie mabapi le Honourable Venson-Moitoi go ne ga fetswa go tweng. Mme fela fa a ka ya kwa go tsone dintlha tseo, he will not even take 10 minutes ka gore o tlaa bua gore e ke - kana le one maina a re itseng gore re itebagantse nao a in the Hansard. So o tlaa kgona gore a bue ka bone botlhe, a bua ka di findings.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): On a point of order, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, this Honourable House has been used to impute motives on Honourable Members by name. Jaanong let me tell you, Madam Speaker, rona re le Ma-Domkrag we are willing, actually a lot of us who have not spoken, to forego our time gore mokaulengwe a lale a re boleletse. Jaanong, no, this is serious - this is an Honourable House, re batla gore dilo tse di tswe, di tswe fela jaaka a ne a di bua.
Jaanong this is a strategy Madam Speaker, to filibuster le go kgotla gore o tle o kobe batho. Ga ba kojwe sepe, ba tshwanetse ba bue fa. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of order.

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Order! Ga ke sa tlhole ke letlelela dipe di point of order. Yo ke mo lebileng jaanong ka motsotso o ke Honourable Modubule, and Honourable Modubule o dire jaaka fa ke go kopile gore o dire. Re bolelele dinako; 10 ten minutes tota o tshwanetse o bo o feditse so tswelela. Ga ke be e nako thata mo go kalo-kalo ke batla fela gore o tswe ka di findings - Honourable Modubule, o na le tendency ya gore e re ke santse ke eme o bo o fela pelo o bo o ema. Tswelela Rra.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of procedure Mma, e seng order, ke a kopa; procedure.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Maswabi, ke rile ga ke sa tlhola ke letlelela procedure. I am not out of order, Honourable Modubule, tswelela.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker, ke rile ke simolola on the point of reference. Ke simolola fa ke neng ke supa gore boatla bo a dirafala, ke gone fa ke simololang teng ke bo ke tswelela ka White Paper, which is a doctored version by the Government. Ke ka fa ke tlaa tswelelang ka teng and ga ke tle go dumela gore go bo gotwe ke tle kwa conclusions ke sa supa kwa tshimologong. Moo ga ke go dumele, Honourable Speaker.

MADAM SPEAKER: Tswelela Honourable Modubule, and be brief.

MR MODUBULE: Thank you. Page 47, Christie Report – The findings. We find that:

(a) Ms Venson, Mr Letsholo, Mr Rabana Petrus collusively agreed that the contract for Block 5 North will be awarded to the Wade Adams Mech-Joint Venture without competitive tender.
(b) By so agreeing, Ms Venson failed in her duty as BHC Chairperson to protect the Corporation’s integrity and financial interests, and failed in her duty as Permanent Secretary and Accounting Officer to safeguard public money.

(c) In so doing, in not putting the contract out to tender or referring it to the Tender Committee and giving Mr Sergeant only the final summary sheets of the provisional Bills and in instructing him to settle a price with Wade Adams, Mr Letsholo was failing his duty as General Manager to protect the Corporation’s integrity and financial interests.

(d) In so agreeing Mr Rabana was failing his duty as Deputy General Manager (Technical) and protect officer to protect the Corporation’s integrity and financial interests.

(e) In acting on Mr Letsholo’s instructions without equipping himself to carry on proper negotiations, Mr Sergeant was failing in his professional duty as Quantity Surveyor.

(f) The resulting loss to the Corporation and improper benefit to Wade Adams was approximately P20 million.”

Page 221, paragraph 974. We find that Ms Venson:

(a) “Colluded with Mr Letsholo to have BHC house 5293 demolished and replaced at a cost to the Corporation of P151,000 to provide a justification for her moving to a BHC house which she preferred.

(b) Misled Mr Legwaila in his capacity as Permanent Secretary to the President into approving her application to change houses by falsely representing that her
predecessor as Permanent Secretary Mr Mokone had not dealt with the matter and by concealing a File Minute recommending the refusal of her application.

(c) Was given a financial advantage to which she was not entitled by permitting her to occupy house 5293 and house 5371 concurrently for six months without paying more than the normal instalment under her contract purchase scheme agreement.”

Honourable Speaker, on page 224, which I think is the critical page, paragraph 1099 says: “We find that Ms Venson in her capacities of Chairperson of the Corporation and Permanent Secretary in the Ministry must bear the ultimate administrative responsibility for the BHC debacle.” Ke ne ke nopola kgang ya ga Mme Venson mo puong ya report.

The White Paper e a tswelela. The findings of the White Paper mo go 5(b) under assessment findings. “The Commission was made up of a panel of experts with a wealth of experience and expertise. It had abundant evidence and made in-depth investigations. Against this background, government accepts the Commission’s findings.”

Goromente o amogela tseo. Tsone tse ke neng ke di bala tse di amogetswe ke puso. Jaanong, fa re ya kwa molaong, ga ke a bona gope kwa Mme Venson a kileng a itsheka teng. Jaanong, gone moo, ke gone mo ke se nang nago. In other reports jaaka ke tlaa tswelela ka tsa ba bangwe, ke tlaa supa gore bone go na le judgements tsa bone tse ke di boneng, tse di supang gore bone ba ne ba itsheka, ga felela go reng mme go itsheka le gone kana go raya gore o itsheka ka gore o ne o bonwe molato mo go sengwe. Ga o kake wa itsheka fela go sa bonwa sepe mo go wena. O itatola kana o ikgolega.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…
MR MODUBULE: Nnyaa, ga ke boele gope kwa ga Christie. Ka re, eo nna my findings, ga gona gope fa ke boneng a itshekile teng. So the recommendation stands as per the report. Ke se ke se buang, ga ke itse gore wena wa reng jaanong.


Fa o tsaya page 164, Honourable MP Daniel Kwelagobe. Paragraph 883 – “The Honourable Member was offered high cost house 5373 on special allocation after he left the government in March/April 2002. There appears to be no precedence for this and it has not become the general rule. After he resigned from the Cabinet in March 1992, the house was allocated on lease on a temporary basis, only until Mr Kwelagobe would find alternative accommodation. Mr Kwelagobe concurrently owns another house and several flats in Mogoditshane, which are let on a commercial basis. In view of this, we recommend that his temporary occupation of house 5373 be terminated as soon as practically possible, or at any event, as soon as any of these other accommodation becomes available. He should certainly not be permitted to purchase the temporary house.” E e leng gore the Honourable Member o ne a ntse fela mo bathong ba Modimo a re, mphang ntlo eo. The Commission says this is not right, Honourable Member. As a Minister you do not have to do that, and I think that was totally out of order. Honourable Kwelagobe, I am now going to the Kgabo Report, which report obviously o itse ka yone.
HONOURABLE MEMBER: ...(Inaudible)…

MR MODUBULE: Yes, I am addressing the Honourable Member, he is making comments. O ntse o dira running comments tse ke sa batleng to entertain, mme ka gore ke ene a di dirang go nna bokete gore o mo tlhokomologe fela. Fa a ne a ka didimala ke ne ke tlaa tswelela.

The Kgabo Report, page 43, section 2103, e ke tlaa bong ke e bala, e e lebaganeng le Motlotlegi Kwelagobe. Yone e sa ntse e balega jaana, ka gore dilo tse ke di khoutang tse, Honourable Speaker, di teng gongwe le gongwe mo metlobong ya dibuka and so forth.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: ...(Inaudible)…


Page 43 ya pampiri e, 2.103. Ya re: “In the case of Mr Kwelagobe, the story revolves around his acquisition of a plot in the Nkoyaphiri area of Mogoditshane. The case history in 1984, the Ministry of Local Government and Housing gazetted Mogoditshane and its environs as part of the Gaborone planning area. Declaration of a planning area was intended to create orderly development in the public interest. At a later date, about 1988/89, the layout of the planning area was approved by the PCPB and subsequently by the Minister of Local Government, Lands and Housing. Immediately following the gazettement of the planning area, the Kweneng Land Board initiated negotiations with individual masimo holders in the affected areas like Nkoyaphiri, where a certain Mr Rankswe Kowa had two masimo. The Kweneng Land Board Members testified an oath that they negotiated with Mr Kowa. Eventually Mr Kowa was compensated for the two masimo, but he refused to accept a cheque for the other tshimo since his name had not been properly written out. He then alleged to have given the tshimo to Mr Kwelagobe
who he alleged was his nephew. Mr Kwelagobe then emerged and the question that the tshimo be transferred to him. The Land Board turned down his request on the ground that it was too late since the tshimo had already been acquired from Mr Kowa and detailed plans for development approved by the Minister. At this time it was public knowledge that the layout plan was approved. Incidentally, the layout plan had a commercial centre covering the whole tshimo, which was the subject of discussion between the Land Board and Mr Kwelagobe. There were twenty plots, part of a primary school on this tshimo. On the 30th October 1989, Mr Kwelagobe wrote an appeal and personally handed it to the Minister of Local Government, Lands and Housing who later directed the Land Board to comply with Mr Kwelagobe’s request. The appeal did not follow the normal channels. The Land Board granted Mr Kwelagobe customary grant certificate, that is, for a tshimo. This provoked a second protracted dispute, since Mr Kwelagobe wanted the tshimo converted to a common law grant, which enables the holder to initiate commercial activities on the property and again the Minister ruled in Kwelagobe’s favour. Mr Kwelagobe’s plans were produced for him by public officers of the Ministry of Agriculture.” This is a shame.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member, you are quoting, by the way.

MR MODUBULE: I have ended the quote and I am saying this is a shame, Honourable Speaker, for a Minister to use his employees to draw up plans for him, and this was uncalled for. I am debating mind you, do not think I am just going to be reading. I am debating the speech.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: You have asked for quote…(inaudible)…
MR MODUBULE: I have asked to quote, but quoting does not debar you from debating the issues on the floor.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule, ignore side remarks and address me.

MR MODUBULE: Thank you, Honourable Speaker. “To get to the root of the case we interviewed Mr Kwelagobe twice, Mr Kowa once, and all the senior people of the Kweneng Land Board…

MR MOLEFHABANGWE: On a point of order, Madam Speaker. Nnyaa Mmaetsho, ga ke fapaane le tshwetso ya gago ya gore ga o amogele point of order, ke dumela gore o ne o raya mo kganyeng e e neng e buiwa ka nako eo. Jaanong fa re mo Palamenteng, ga ke bone gore a re na le any special way of running our Parliament. Mmaetsho golo fa o kopile Rraetsho gore a ntshe bosupi mme e bile gape o tlhobaela ka nako. Jaanong fa a ntse a tsweletse a bua, bakaulengwe ka fa ba a bua ba a reng mme wena o lela ka nako. Go na le molao o o reng fa yo mongwe a bua, ba ba ntseng fa fatshe ba fokotse go dira modumo. Jaanong wena o mo raya fela o re nnyaa, avoid side remarks. Bakaulengwe fa e le gore ba na le kgatlhego mo go utlweng se se buiwang fa a ba didimale. Ke dumela gore tsamaiso e ntse jalo. Ele ya kgantele o re ga go na point of order o ne o raya eng, o ne o sa reye gore ba nna out of order jaaka go lebega jaana?

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Member is right, please let us listen to Honourable Modubule re bolokeng nako.

MR MODUBULE: Honourable Speaker let me thank you very much, more so that you have allowed me more time than any other Member who would get into this Parliament, I appreciate. Honourable Speaker, Page 44, I am still continuing, 2.107.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)
MR MODUBULE: No-no, I am trying to put my case straight. “To get to the root of the case we interviewed Mr Kwelagobe twice, Mr Kowa once and all the senior people of the Kweneng Land Board, and we visited the site at Nkoyaphiri.” On Page 45, 2108, “we cannot help but conclude regretfully that Mr Kwelagobe, armed with the knowledge that a commercial centre was planned over Mr Kowa’s tshimo approached the old man for his tshimo for the purpose of exploiting the opportunities created by the plan; very unfortunate. Mr Kwelagobe once said to the Land Board, “Yes I can develop the mall according to your plan. There are 20 plots plus part of a primary school on the tshimo.”

Honourable Speaker, ke batla gore ke supe jaana gore fa ke ntse ke nopola jaana bakaungwe ba re tswelela o bale, ga ke tswelele ke bala fela, ga ke balele go kgatlha ope ke balela gore ke sapote *my arguments*. Ke sapote se ke neng ke se bua gore, fa ke re ga le ka ke la ipelagatsa ka gore le tswa kgakala le ntse le dira dilo sentle fela, ga go na go dira dilo sentle fela, tse dingwe di ne di dirwa ka tshokamo, mo banna ba neng ba fologa ditilo. Ke sone se ke neng ke se bua le maabane. Ke sa ntse ke tswelela ke re, nnyaa, gone moo, mo ke go buang mo;

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR MODUBULE: Heela, ka re ke tsweletse ka go bua gore gone mo ke go buang nna as far as I am concerned this was corruption. *I am saying fa e le gore report e ke boammaaruri jo e bo buang, jo ke senang selabe sepe mo go yone, ke dumela gore *this is corruption*. Ga ke na pelaelo ya gore go dira jaana ke corruption.

Mme mma ke tswelele, a ke re ke rile ke a tswelela Rraetsho, ke ya go tsena le mo reporteng ya gago gore go ne ga tweng ko go wena ka *the doctored version* yone ya ga Goromente. Goromente fa a sena go nna a bona pego le nna fa fatshe, le wena o le mo
tengo le ntse fa fatshe le seka-seka gore jaanong o ka tweng, ga bo go tweng. E le lona jaanong le le puso, kana White Paper ke ya ga Goromente a ke re, ke ya lona, nte ke e baakanye.

MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR KWELAGOBE): On a point of correction, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, le fa Rraetsho Modubule o ka re o letlelesegile jaanong go tlogela taelo ya gago a bala di sele, mme o ne o rile a ye ko ditshwetsong. Jaanong fa a re ke ne ke le mo teng o a mpaneletsa, ke ne ke se mo teng, I was not a Minister. White Paper e, was produced ke Goromente ke se Tona, so it is wrong for him a ntse a wabola jaana gore a bo a mpaneletsa a re ke ne ke le mo teng.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule, please a ko o bue se e leng boammaaruri.

MR MODUBULE: Mma ke amogela gore o baakanya sentle, kana o ne a fologile setilo ka one mabaka a gore o mo tshenyong; a bo a se fologa. Mma ke amogele gore o baakanya sentle mokaulengwe, nako ya fa report e e dirwa ke fa o siile, o batla gore jaanong o tle o itsheke sentle. Mma ke tswelele ka gone boammaaruri ke gore o ne o umakesega nako eo o le mongwe wa babusi. Fa report e dirwa; ee o ne wa sia ke boammaaruri, ka March 1992.

MADAM SPEAKER: Proceed, Mr Modubule.

MR MODUBULE: A ke re ke gore ba tla ba ntsobera ba batla dipotso mo go nna Honourable Speaker.

Mmaetsho, mma ke tswelele ke supe gore mo the White Paper, e ke reng is a doctored version by the Government... White Paper re tshwanetse ra itse gore fa Goromente a sena go bona pego o nna fa fatshe a re ke dife tse re ka di ntshang ra di neela batho tse di
tshwanetseng, tse dingwe ra di baya kana ra di nna ka marago. Mme Goromente o ne a nna ka marago ka tse dingwe. Ga ke na mathata kana e tlaa re ka nako ya re tsaya puso Rra re tlaa leka go itse gore go ne ga diragala eng.

Mo go Page 21 ya The Government Paper Number One of 1992, Land Problems in Mogoditshane and other peri-urban villages. Mo go Page 21 jaaka ke ne ke bua, mo go Paragraph 2. E bua jaana, fa it is under the late Rraetsho Mmusi; the appeal. Mme e bua jaana, ke tlaa nopola dintlha tse di buang ka Rraetsho Motlotlegi Kwelagobe. It is under;

2. (d) “Mr Kwelagobe appealed to the Minister who directed the Land Board to comply with the request. Mr Kwelagobe insisted that he wanted a Common Law grant, and again appealed to the Minister. The Minister instead of assisting the Land Board asked them to negotiate with Mr Kwelagobe. The Land Board felt it had no option but to approve the application.” Indeed, kana le bua o ka re ga le itse gore batho ba ba ne ba tshaba Tona.

(g) The Ministry files have been examined and they show that although the appeal was to the Minister, the necessary internal official advice was sought from officials responsible for the matter.

Section 40 on Tribal Land Act provides for an appeal to the Minister himself, it is not a violation of the procedures for the final decision on the appeal to come from the top.”

A o a utlwa gore eo favours you e bile o opa tlhogo.

(i) The Minister’s ruling in favour of Mr Kwelagobe frustrated the operations of the Land Board in their attempt to implement the 1984 declaration and the planning scheme approved by the Ministry around 1988-1989.’ This is what I
call corruption. ‘Decision was aggravated by the fact that the Minister does not appear to have given the Land Board the opportunity to explain or defend their refusal to Mr Kwelagobe’s request’. The Minister e ne e le Rre Mmusi.

“Land Boards are agencies to the Government and the Ministry of Local Government Lands and Housing in particular. Therefore not only should they be given the opportunity to be heard in cases of appeals against their decisions, but they should also be given reason for overruling their decisions as the reasons for reversing their decision provided guidance for the future. The need to give reasons was also … by the fact that the Minister was dealing with an appeal by his colleague. He should have realised that failure to grant the Land Board a hearing or to give reasons would lead to suspicion of favouring a colleague.”

Honourable Speaker, may I continue, on Page 23(4), Mr Kwelagobe. “The facts of Mr Kwelagobe’s appeal have been summarised under (2) above”. Yone e ke neng ke e bua gore Rra, ga le a dira sentle le colleague ya gore le bo le ne le dira tse le di dirang. “We accept that Mr Kwelagobe as a Minister frustrated the Land Board in the implementation of the decisions of Government made in 1984, 1988, 1989.” What does that mean to the Honourable Minister or to the Honourable Member? Obviously in my own submission and conclusion is that this was an act of corruption.

“Although the Commission points out that at the time of transfer of Mr Kowa’s land to Mr Kwelagobe, it was public knowledge that the layout was approved,
although the Commission had no evidence that Mr Kwelagobe had personal knowledge of the plan approval.”

MADAM SPEAKER: What are you reading from by the way? The White Paper, what page?

MR MODUBULE: Yes Honourable, I am on Page 22, under Mr Kwelagobe.

“It was public knowledge that the layout was approved. We have no evidence that Mr Kwelagobe had personal knowledge of the plan approval. However, Mr Kwelagobe knew of the Land Board plan as he applied for the formal transfer. As a Minister in the Government whose plans were being implemented, he should be helpful to the Land Board rather than being confrontational.” Jaanong tse ke neng ke di nopola Mmaetsho ke tse ke reng nna fa ke di bala le ditshwetso tsa tsone … ( Interruption)

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR MODUBULE: Nnyaa, o raya tshwetso ya eng? Gongwe o tshotse tshwetso gongwe o tlaa tla o e bua, nna ke go balela se ke se tsayang mo White Paper le tse ke di tsayang from the reports, tse e leng gore ke di report tse di ka fa molaong. They are in the library, in the archives, tse di gongwe le gongwe ko e leng gore o ka eletsa go di bona teng. Jaanong kana Motlotlegi go utlwala gore e ne ya re morago a ya go itsheka. Ee, Rra go utlwala jalo gore o ne wa itsheka Rraetsho gore e re ntswa batho ba ne ba ngongorega ka wena ba supa gore nnyaa o senya thata, Commission le yone e supile gore nnyaa mme gone o ne o senya, wena wa bo o ya go itsheka, go raya gore jaanong Court e lebelele mabaka otlhe a gore dingongorego tsa batho or allegations tsa batho, the findings of the Commission le ka fa o itsheka ka teng a e ya go go golola mo molatong kana e ntse e a go go bona molato. Go supagala wena o ne wa itsheka Rraetsho, ga ke ka ke ka ganela seo.
Mme Raetsho mo go itshekeng ga gago, go a supagala gore o ne wa itsheka mo go Page 347 ya The Botswana Law Reports 1994. Gore nnyaa, gone ke boammaruri Rra wena Rre Kwelagobe and another versus Kgabo, and another in the High Court ko Lobatse ka the 26th August 1994 le ne la itsheka. Raetsho yone e, kana ga ke itse gore a ke ke bale case yotlhe gore e ne ya tswelela jang.

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule, listen to me, bala tshwetso. Ema ka dinao o bale tshwetso.

MR MODUBULE: Ee mma. Mmaetsho, kana ke ne ke re mma ke tle ke bale.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Read the judgement!

MR MODUBULE: A ke re ke judgement gone mo ke go balang.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR MODUBULE: Ka re ke yone e ke e balang e, o batla eng gape?

Mma ke tswelele; “State Proceedings, Commission of Enquiry requirements for public hearing, Commissions of Enquiry Act Cap: 05:02 3.4 Administrative Law, Judicial Review, with decision subject to review, Commission of Enquiry, Commission failing to hold public hearing, Administrative Law, Rules of Natural Justice, Breach of what constitute Commission of enquiry investigation applicants without informing them of nature or allegations or what the way being investigated. The President acting in terms of the Commission of Enquiry Act established Commission of Enquiry under the chairmanship of the first respondent. The Commission sat and produced report, which inter alia criticised and censured the two applications. It was an admitted fact that …

MADAM SPEAKER: Honourable Modubule o ka re ga o kgone go bona tshwetso. Nna fa fatshe, fa ke ema ka dinao o tshwanetse go nna fatshe. O tshwanetse go bala se e leng
tshwetso, so ke tlaa kopa Parliamentary Counsel Lizo Ngcongco a tle go go kaetsa tshwetso foo and then o bo o re balela tshwetso and please a re seka ra tshameka o ka re wena o mo motshamekong. Honestly, because o iketlile o a tshega you are not even worried about time, ao!

**MR MODUBULE:** Honourable Speaker, *ke ne ke re, le fa gongwe jaanong ke tlaa bo ke bala tshwetso* out of context but I will oblige. *Mma ke tswelele jaaka* the Learned Parliamentary Counsel *gongwe a gakolola ke seka ka re ke nganga le ene.*

On page 348 of the Botswana Law Report 1994, the judgement *e tswelela jaana,* “It was held (i) Law. The provisions of the Act were mandatory that unless the President ordered otherwise the enquiry had to be held in public. It was common cause that the President had not given any such order”. *Se ke batlang go se bua ke gore,* this is a technical …

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** …(Inaudible)…

**MR MODUBULE:** No, no, no, let me advance my debate.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** Debate?

**MR MODUBULE:** No, *ga o bale tshwetso* out of nothing.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Give him a chance please.

**MR MODUBULE:** *Tshwetso e balwa* out of the judgement, *gore judgement e ne e reng go ne go sekwa eng? Ga o bale tshwetso fela.*

*Ke ne ke supa gore judgement e on (i) ba supa gore Tautona o ne a na le tshwanelo ya gore a dire Commission of Enquiry le gore e utluwe in public* which was one of the things that were contested by the Honourable Member. *O ne a re tsamaiso ya commission ga e a dirwa sentle* and (i) High Court *e dumela gore tsamaiso e dirilwe sentle, ke sone se ke se buang.* (ii) The argument that the report was not subject to review assumed that the
findings of the Commission were valid. Where a body constituted by a law acted outside its terms of reference or all side its jurisdiction or took evidence in a manner specifically prohibited to it under its constitution then what such body did or purported to do was null and void. What had occurred in the instance case was a fundamental failure of a prerequisite for the commission’s legality”. Eo o a dumela jaanong?

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Tswelela.

MR MODUBULE: This is where we have a problem. Where the judgement does not favour an individual go simolola o ka re go na le mathata. Let me continue.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: It is normal in fact.

MR MODUBULE: Very normal I accept that. “(iii) The Commission had furthermore failed to observe the rules of natural justice by investigating the two applicants without advising them in anyway that they were in jeopardy and without informing them of the nature of the allegations against them. The proceedings of the Commission were therefore accordingly set aside”.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Tswelela.

MR MODUBULE: No, ke tswelela mo go eng fa le re ke tswelele? I have closed the quote Madam Speaker. And I am saying, we are not talking about the findings whether di ne di siame kana di ne di sa siama, we are saying the proceedings ke tsone tse e neng e se tsone, not the findings and I contest, no judgement anyway fa e kileng ya bua ya re, the findings were wrong, there is no way.

So, I am saying the proceedings ka fa dilo di neng di dirwa ka teng go ne go se just, but the findings might be correct. Therefore, I am saying ga gona sepe mo molaong exonerating the Honourable Member gore ga a molato, ga gona.
Monday 12 February 2007

_O ne a seka gore a ditsamaiso di ne di siame kana di ne di sa siama_ and the court found the proceedings were in fact not done properly, but the findings is something else. And I am still _insisting gore the findings di ne di siame_ Honourable Member and therefore this is the end of the judgement.

**MR MOATLHODI:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker _kana_ yesterday afternoon I stood on a point of order and requested you to invoke Standing Order 46 (5) which you later graciously did. I am just wondering this afternoon, Honourable Modubule has repeatedly quoted past literature concerning Honourable Pelonomi Venson. He has said absolutely nothing that incriminate Honourable Pelonomi Venson and I beg, I pray,.......Somebody is pulling me down Madam Speaker and I wanted to take the man to task.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** Nna fatshe, monna.

**MR MOATLHODI:** Thank you.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Proceed Honourable Member, proceed.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** A re o feditse.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** O feditse rra?

**MR MODUBULE:** _Nnyaa, Honourable Speaker ga ke re ke ne ke sa ntse ke bua, kana kgang e ke e ke neng ke e boditswe gore ke e thalose e ke tsayang gore nnyaa eo ke e thalositse ke tswelela ka debate e ya me jaaka ke ne ke na le tshwanelo ya go tswelelela._

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Modubule fa o feditse o bue, e ke ne ke go file sebaka sa gore o bue. O ka nna wa nna fatshe.

Parliamentary Counsel Lizo Ngcongco ke ne ke rile le wena o lebalebe _on my behalf_ ka fa kgang e e tsamaileng ka teng, a o ka mpha _your side of the story?_
LEARNED PARLIAMENTARY COUNSEL (MR LIZO NGCONGCO): Madam Speaker, in the course of his debate yesterday, the Honourable Member for Lobatse said several things and in so doing made reference to certain past Commissions of enquiry and the like.

I am not sure if he is entirely through yet right now or whether he still intends to substantiate others, but so far from what he has said, one of the matters to which he has alluded to today is the matter of the Presidential Commission of enquiry in to land problems in Mogoditshane and other peri-urban villages otherwise known as the Kgabo Commission.

Now, in relation to the Kgabo Commission, the Honourable Member has indeed read out at some length the relevant pages from the report in so far as those pages impacted upon the late Mr P. S. Mmusi and Honourable Kwelagobe.

The issue at hand is here, in fact before I go to the cracks of the matter, there is just one other matter to which the Honourable Member alluded which he seems to rely on amongst other things. This is particularly the observation by the Kgabo Commission to the effect that the Honourable Kwelagobe in the course of the preparations of plans for the plot in question, had relied upon officers of the Ministry of Agriculture. And I think the Honourable Member indicated shame.

What was not stated by the Honourable Member in the course of his reading of the White Paper specifically in so far as the White Paper deals with the issue of the preparation of the very plans. It is actually stated and I quote from page 23 of the White Paper. “On the question of the production of plans by officials, there is no impropriety if the plans were produced by a civil servant friend, outside office hours for no pay and without using
government equipment. The statement in the commission’s report on this matter is contained in one sentence. The commission does not say whether Mr Kwelagobe was called upon to react to the allegation. It is not stated whether the work was done during or after work working hours. Mr Kwelagobe admits that the plans were drawn by a public officer but maintains that he was being assisted by a friend. In the absence of a detailed statement in the report o this matter, it is not possible to rule that an impropriety was committed. We confirm however that work of this nature is not supposed to be performed at government expense, by government officers, during working hours using government equipment”.

Madam Speaker, as the Honourable Member has read out from the judgement in the matter of Kwelagobe and another versus Kgabo and another 1994 Botswana Law Reports page 347, that case was a case in which the applicants in the matter now went to the High Court to challenge the validity of the proceedings and report and finding of the Kgabo Commission. It is clear from the very judgement, the holdings of which the Honourable Member has read out that the High Court particularly Justice Barry Martin Horwitz who presided over the matter found several things. He found in favour of the applicants basically.

The first reason for holding in favour of the applicants that is Kwelagobe and Mmusi was that firstly Commissions of enquiry are supposed to conduct their business in public unless the President in his instrument constituting them directs otherwise and says, they must be in camera. In this particular instance under discussion, no such direction had been given by His Excellency the President with the result that sitting in public by the
Commission, which was considered was therefore, contrary to the constitutive document and terms of reference of the Commission, that is the first part.

The second part was, it is true that ordinarily the proceedings of Commissions of enquiry would not be amenable to any form of judicial review by a court. But that position, obtains only in so far as the Commission of enquiry has itself acted within the parameters set for it in the constitutive documents.

In other words, you can only close a matter from judicial scrutiny where there has been strict compliance, but where, as in the case under discussion, a commission proceeded to sit in private when it was to sit in public and therefore contrary to the procedure determined for it, then you cannot oust the court’s inquiry in that case. That is the reason for the third and final holding that this commission had set outside its terms of reference and had gathered evidence in a manner contrary to how it was supposed to gather it.

Lastly and in conclusion of the judgement on this part, it is also stated, and as was read out by the Honourable Member, another equally important reason was that the rules of natural justice which require anybody or entity undertaking judicial or quasi judicial functions to give persons affected the opportunity to be heard had not been complied in this case. The judge’s finding was that the Commission had investigated the Kwelagobe’s and the Mmusi’s without ever drawing specifically to their attention that they were in jeopardy. So, those were the reasons for the holding by the court that the proceedings and indeed the report of the Commission were invalid. So, basically according to that judgement, the entire proceedings, findings and report of the Kgabo Commission are null and void.
Madam Speaker, I am therefore unable to accept that the distinction that the Honourable Member seeks to draw, that it is only the proceedings which were rendered null and void but not the findings. I am sorry that if the matter does not land itself to that form of division, it is all or nothing. That is the first part. Madam Speaker, I think that should conclude the matter involving the Kgabo Report.

The first point that was dealt with was in relation to Honourable Venson-Moitoi. The findings which were summarised by Honourable Member for Lobatse, particularly as he read from Page 221 of the Christie Report, I do not propose to repeat that, but let me say something because he mentioned it. In arguing this part, the Honourable Member for Lobatse read from Paragraph 5 of the White Paper, particularly Paragraph 5 (b). With your permission Madam Speaker, I quote what he read. The Honourable Member read the following, “The Commission was made up of a panel of experts with a wealth of experience and expertise. It had abundant evidence and made in-depth investigations. Against this background, government accepts the Commission’s findings.” I stop there because that is where the Honourable Member then closed his quote. He did not proceed beyond there. But with your permission Madam Speaker, I would like to proceed beyond there because there is something beyond there which is important. It continues, “Such acceptance does not, however, mean that the evidence laid on each issue has been re-examined. This has not been done. Government’s acceptance of the Commission’s findings is thus subject to the important qualification that such acceptance should not be taken as a prejudgement of any issue which may be re-examined in detail should civil proceedings, disciplinary proceedings or criminal proceedings follow. This paper will accordingly not detail specific reactions to individual findings by the Commission.”
Madam Speaker, if I may just explain because I think it needs to be said. There is another very important part of this report which he has not alluded to but I think it is important in order to put matters in their proper context. At 5 (c) it is stated and I quote, “Government has resolved that the full report should be referred to –

(i) the Attorney General, so that appropriate directions can be given to the Botswana Police to open dockets on all potential cases of criminal wrongdoing with a view to prosecution.

(ii) The Board of the Botswana Housing Corporation, so that all legal avenues should be pursued with a view to recovery through the courts of such of the nugatory expenditure as is recoverable."

Now, in pursuance of that, it then happened that criminal proceedings were indeed instituted against the Honourable Pelonomi Venson, as she then was, in case CRBG 59 of 1994. In that case she faced two counts of abuse of office. That being an offence which in terms of Section 104 (3) required the specific or express consent of the Attorney General. Such consent was obtained; I have copies here. This consent was granted on 31st January 1994. The charges were prepared on the 3rd of March 1994, but the case was then withdrawn by means of nolle prosequi by the then Attorney General dated 11th May 1994. So, in line with what the Government states in the White Paper, the criminal proceedings were instituted but for whatever reason, it was decided not to proceed with that and the proceedings were discontinued. Madam Speaker, although it is said that o ne a tshaba by somebody as I overheard such remark, there is no way in which an accused person can withdraw a case against themselves, that power is with the Attorney General.
Madam Speaker, if I may continue, the White Paper also said that the Board of BHC must pursue civil avenues with regard to recovering so much of its nugatory expenditure as was recoverable. Indeed, the BHC instituted civil proceedings against the said Ms Venson which proceedings were later withdrawn by the very BHC. If it is recalled, one of the specific findings by the Commission against Ms Venson was that she had received an improper financial advantage arising out of the fact that she was living in one house for which she was not paying rental while paying Tenant Purchase for another house. Therefore, what BHC was instructed to recover was the unpaid rental for a period of six months. In other words, the BHC itself withdrew the recovery of its own rental due to it, so to speak.

Madam Speaker, one of the other matters which was alluded to by the Honourable Member for Lobatse when reading the report, and particularly the findings against Ms Venson, he read from Page 221 and one of those adverse findings against Ms Venson was specifically, and I quote, “We find that Ms Venson misled Mr Legwaila in his capacity as Permanent Secretary to the President into approving her application to change houses by falsely representing that her predecessor as Permanent Secretary, Mr Mokone, had not dealt with the matter and by concealing a file minute recommending the refusal of her application.” Madam Speaker, it so happens that in the course of the criminal investigations against Ms Venson in the very matter which was withdrawn by the then Attorney General, amongst the papers there was an affidavit deposed to by one Elija William Legwaila, then Permanent Secretary to the President, in which he says among other things, I quote, “I, Elija William Legwaila do hereby make oath …” I go straight to Paragraph 5 of that affidavit, I omit paragraphs 1 to 4. “I did not approve Ms Venson’s
change of houses and therefore I was not misled into approving her application. If the Commission had called me I would have informed them so.” Madam Speaker, I would not want to go too much beyond that unless I am specifically asked. The reason I have gone to that length to explain matters in an endeavour to show that by and large, commissions are formed as a result or in response of allegations being made about people or a certain state of affairs. Committees or commissions of inquiry can be constituted to investigate those very allegations. Sometimes those allegations may be substantiated up to a certain point or they may be rejected, but even where those allegations may be substantiated, it is important for all of us to recognise that findings by a commission, no matter how eminent, learned or erudite its membership may be, remain at most allegations and can never, without more, be conclusive in and of themselves. Madam Speaker, I thank you.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED FOR 25 MINUTES**

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Fa re phatlalala re ya go kopa mogodungwana re ne re sa tswana go reetsa the Parliamentary Counsel a thalosa ka fa dikgang tse re di beilweng pele ke Honourable Modubule di tsamaileng ka teng. Jaanong jaaka fa ke ne ke reeditse bobedi; Honourable Modubule le the Learned Counsel go ntshupegeditse gore ke dumalane le point of order e e neng e raisitswe ke Honourable Moatlhodi e yone e leng mabapi le Standing order 46 (5) e e balegang jaana: “A Member shall not impute improper motives to another Member.” Le ne le reeditse ga go thoke gore ke boelele mafoko a the Learned Counsel a a buileng. Report ya ga Kgabo, Christy o di thalositse sentle null and void. Enngwe, case withdrawn.
Monday 12 February 2007

**Honourable** Modubule mmaabane o buile gape le ka tse dingwe tse di amang bo

**Honourable** Nkate tse gompieno a sa buang ka tsone tse ke tsayang gore go raya gore o ne a sa tsaya bosupi ja tsone. O buile gape le ka Borre Masire mabapi le dipolase maabane, mme ke tse e leng gore gompieno ga a a bua ka tsone. Mme mo go tse a buileng ka tsone gompieno le tlhaloso e e duleng ka the Learned Counsel ke bona gore ke dumalane le kopo ya point of order ya ga Honourable Moatlhodi ya maabane. Honourable Modubule, ke go raya ke re withdraw mafoko a o neng o a bua mabapi le bakaulengwe ba gago ka gore ga go na proof epe e e kgotsofatsang e o e mphileng letsatsi jeno. Jaanong ke sone fela se e tla a reng fa ke nna fa fatshe ke bo ke re o se dire. Withdraw and apologise re bo re tswelela ka debate ya budget.

**MR MODUBULE:** Honourable Speaker, with due respect I am unable to comply with your request.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Rules of order, Standing Order 49 (2) “The Speaker shall order a Member whose conduct is grossly disorderly to withdraw immediately from the Chamber for the remainder of that day’s sitting, and may direct such steps to be taken as are required to ensure compliance with this order.” Therefore, Honourable Member, fa o sa dumalane le se ke reng o se dire ke tsere tshwetso e o ke ne ke re comply with Standing Orders o re sutele for the remainder of today. Ke kopa gore on my right hand side le didimale.

**MR MODUBULE:** I will comply, Honourable Speaker.

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** …inaudible…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Order! Fa e ka re le bana jaana.
MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

(MR KWELAGOBE): Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente ke emela go ema nokeng mokaulengwe wa me, Tona ya tsa madi le ditlhabololo ka mafoko a mantle, a a phepa, a a ropameng a a a beileng pele ga Ntlo e mabapi le kgolo ya itsholelo ya rona. Le mabapi le ditlhabololo tse re sa leng re tsena mo go tsone fa e sa le 40 years ago, tse e leng gore di re beile fa re leng teng gompieno.

Ke ka bua fela gore mafoko a mokaulengwe a a beilng fa pele ga rona, Madam Speaker, ke mafoko a boammaaruri jo bo papametseng. E rile fa go ntse go tsweletswe le puo e, se ke batlang gore ke itebaganye le sone segolo-bogolo, ke fa go buiwa ka lehuma. Mokaulengwe yo o sa tswang go lelekelwa kwa ntle maabane e rile a bua a ise a tsene mo matlhapoloseng, o ne a bua gore ga go na tsele epe e e supagalang ya ka fa phathi ya Domkrag le goromente wa yone ba lwantshang lehuma le le mo Batswaneng ka teng. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke batla go bua ke thamaletse gore lehuma mo lefatsheng la rona ga le a bolo go lwantshiwa ka ditsela tse di farologanyeng ka gore lehuma le bakwa ke mabaka a a farologanyeng. Mme goromente wa Domkrag, mo dikabo mading tse di farologanyeng o ntse a itepatepantse le go lwantsha lehuma ka tsone ditsela tse di farologanyeng tseo. Selo sa ntlha, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke thuto. Thuto ke tsela nngwe e go tlhabantshiwang lehuma ka yone ka gore fa batho ba le mo leffing fela ba sa itse gore gatwe go diragala eng ba ka nna ba tlhoka ditsela le maano a ba ka ipolokang ka one. Mme fa o neetse batho thuto o a bo o ba neetse thebe e ba ka itshireletsang ka yone mo lehumeng. Jaanong se re tshwanetseng ra itebaganya le sone ke gore mo ngwageng tse di ntseng di feta go tla go fitlha gompieno, goromente wa Domkrag o ntse a dirisa madi a mantsi go ruta bana ba lefatshe le gore e re ka moso ba bo.
ba tlhabolola lefatshe la bone. Gore e re ka moso ba bo ba intsha mo lehumeng le le neng le ka ba tsena fa ba ne ba sena kitso ya gore ba ka ipoloka jang. Thuto ke empowerment e re e neetseng bana ba lefatshe gore ba tle ba kgone go ik golola mo dikeetaneng tsa le huma. Mme e seng thuto fela formal education kwa university, primary schools kana secondary schools, le thuto e goromente wa rona o ntseng a e neela sechaba ya ditsela tse ba ka ipolokang ka tsone, e ntse ke thuto. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga ke na go ya le ditsetlana tsa yone ka gore nako ke yone e khatshwane e tlaa re gongwe ke ya le tsone ke bo ke tlhaela go tsena mo go tse dingwe tse ke ka di buang. Mme fela batho ba ba reng goromente ga a na motlhala wa ka fa a lwantshang le huma ka teng, boammaaruri ba bo potile ka kwa morago, ga ba bue nnete ka gore e bile gape go bua bone ba e leng gore ba fa. Ba e leng gore botlhe ba rutilwe ke yone Domkrag bone ba ba tletseng fa. Ke yone e e ba rutileng ya ba ya ba ruta le matilelo a ba ka tilelang le huma kwa go one. Jaanong go tla go peperetla fa motho a ba a re ga go na ditsela tse di supafalang ka fa goromente a lwantshang le huma ka teng ga se boammaaruri.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, re ne re sa ntse re bolelelwa mo go pegong ya ga mokaulengwe ka bridages tse e leng gore goromente o a di tsaya gore a di tlhabolole, a ba a tsholetse le seemo sa tsone gore e nne technical colleges. Bana ba ba yang go tswa moo ke bana ba e leng gore ba ya go direla lefatshe le ka go itirela kana ka go thapiwa ke ba bangwe ba ba direla. Tselo e e ntseng jalo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke tselo ya go lwantsha le huma. Jaanong ga ke tlhaloganye gore ba ba reng ga go ise go salwe metlhala ya go lwantsha le huma ba raya jang.

Tselo e ngwe e le huma le ka tsenang motho ka yone, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga se fela fa a sena kitso. Fa o le bokoa mo mmeleng o lwala o le molwetse, o
ka se ka wa itirela, o sena nonofo ya go itirela, lehua le ka go tsena la ba la go bolaya ra
ba ra go katela mo mmung. Lebaka e le gore ga o na nonofo ya gore o iterele, ga o na
nonofo ya gore o ithokomelele tse e kileng ya re o sa ntse o nonofile wa bo o di itiretse.
Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, tsaya ka fa goromente wa rona o dirisang 

millions le millions mo go tsa botsogo re ba re tsaya le batho re ba isa kwa mafatsheng a mangwe
fa ba sena madi le rona re sena boitsaanape ja go lwantsha malwetse a bone. Mme go
tswa millions ba ba yang go tlhokomela batho bao gore re ba busetse mo mmeleng, re ba
busetse mo boitekanelong gore ba tle ba kgone go itshetsa, a bo motho a ema a re
goromente wa Domkrag ga a na ditsela tsa go lwantsha lehua. Ke tsaya gore fa re
lwantsha malwetse a a dirang gore mebele ya batho e tle mo seemong sa gore ba seka ba
itirela, ba se ka ba ithokomelela di tsa bone e a bo e le tselo nngwe ya go lwantsha
lehua mo lefatsheng la rona.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, go boammaaruri jo bo papametseng gore le
gompieno Batswana fa ba ya mo dipateleng tsa rona tsa bo Princes Marina le tse dingwe
ba duela two Pula. Ba duela two Pula mo kalafing e e ka felelang e tsena mo diketeketeng
tsa dipula, mme motho a sa lopiwe gore a duele diketekete tseo a duetse two pula fela.
Mme e le gore maiteko a puso ke gore motho yoo a boele mo nonofong, a boele mo
botsogong jo bo tlaa mo letlang gore a iterele matshelo a bo a direle bagabone matshelo a
a botoka. So, fa re dira jalo e a bo e le nngwe ya ditsela tse ka tsone re lwantshang
lehua.

Ke bone mongwe wa tsala ya me yo ke mo tlotlang thata a tshikinya tlhogo, ga ke itse
gore fa a ka lwala e bo e le gore bolwetse bo mo koega golo go le gongwe fela, a re o ka
itirela eng se a ka lelekang lehua mo lapeng la gagwe ka sone?
MR GABORONE: *On a point of elucidation, Madam Speaker*. Ke a leboga, mma. A re farologanyeng dilo, fa re bua ka mananeo a a diretsweng go lebelela tsa botsogo, re bue ka one re a tseye e le mananeo a a itebagantseng le botsogo. Fa e le mananeo a a lebagantsweng le go lwantsha lehuma, fa go tla go buiwa ka one go twe ga a direle Batswana sepe go a bo go lebilwe le gore e ya re le fa puso e sena go nna e ntsha madi gone batho ba bone eng tota mo mading a a ntseng jalo, lehuma le fokotsege go le kana ka eng. Ka gore fa re bua ka mananeo a botsogo re bo re bua ka lehuma e kete ke go dira jalo, re bona batho ba lwala ba bolawa ke malwetse a a tlhokang gore ba ka bo ba tshela sentle fa ba ka bo ba na le dijo. Mme fa e le gore tsa botsogo ba a di neelwa dijo tsone di seyo ga go na pharologanyo mo matsheleng a bone.

MR KWELAGOBE: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke latlhega jaaka a latlhegile mo dipuisanyong tse fa e sale go tswa bogologologong. Se ke se buang ke gore fa mmele wa gago o o itirelang khumo ka one o koafetse o ka seka wa itirela khumo eo, kampo one o e dirile mmele wa gago wa bo o koafala o tsena mo seemong sa gore ga o ka ke wa itlhokomelelela khumo eo ya gago e bo e tlhotlhorega jaaka gotwe, khumo matlhare e a tlhotlhorega o bo o wela mo lehumeng. Ra re selo seo fa goromente a tsaya dikgato tsa gore a go nonotshe o tle o kgone gore o itirele tsa botshelo, ra re ke nngwe ya metlhala e goromente a lwantshang lehuma ka yone.

Gompieno, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, P800 *million* fa godimo ga ma P650 *million* a a ntseng a ntshiwa ke goromente a lwantsha go kokonelwa ga batho ke *HIV/AIDS*, batho ba bangwe ba fitlhetswe ba le mo seemong se e leng gore ba ne ba ka seka ba bo ba dira le fa e le sepe ba bile ba fiwa dijo ke goromente. Gompieno re re batho bao ba kgonne go tlotloana mo mmeleng e bile ba dule mo go fiweng dijo ke goromente.
jaanong ba a di itirela, le mahumo ba a a ikgobokanyetsa, a a neng a le teng ba a a itlhokomelela. Ra re selo seo ke nngwe ya metlhala e goromente wa rona o lwantshang lehuma ka yone mo lefatsheng leno.

Go lwantsha lehuma, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga se fela fa o fitlhela motho a tshwere ke tlala o bo o mo rekela borotho le dibiscuit pale o bo o re tsaya o je, e re a kgotshe o bo o re ke gone fa one o lwantsha lehuma.

Jaanong ke sone se re lekang go se bua, ke sone se re lekang go se supa. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, jaaka ke ne ke bua ke ne ke ka nna ka tsenelela ko teng ka supa le in budgets tse di farologanyeng madimadi a goromente yo a a ntshitseng mo lekaneng le la Botsogo, go leka gore Batswana ba tle ba nonofe go intsha mo lehumeng.

Jaanong ga ke dumalane le ba ba reng goromente wa Domkraga ga a na metlhala e a e supileng kana e a e dirang ya go ntsha batho mo lehumeng.

Re eletsa gore bone ba ba kganetso, ba e ya reng fa go buiwa e bo e le bone ba ba bokang lehuma, ba re bolelele gore nnaare mme bone mananeo a bone a ba ka thusang Batswana go leleka lehuma ka one ke afe. Ke sone se re se tlhokang mo go bone e seng go ema fa ba boka lehuma. Leboko la lehuma le teng mo dibukeng mo fa le batla go leboka. Fano fa re tlohilwe ke batho gore re tle go bua fa ka mananeo a a ka ba thusang gore ba leleke lehuma ka one mo magaeng a bone. Jaanong go tla fela fa motho a tsile go boka lehuma a e ta a akela ba bangwe a re hee wee ba rileng, ke diphapsane fela dilo tseo, ga se mo e leng gore go ka isa lefatshle le gope.

Mme jaanong mma ke supe gape, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Re ntse le mananeo, ka gore Rraetsho Baledzi Gaolathe, Honourable, one a bua ka 40 years. Mo dingwageng tse di 40 tse. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, re ntse le mananeo a
goromente o neng a a dira ka maiteko a go leka gore a ntshe lehuma mo malwapeng a rona re le Batswana. Mme se ke tlaa se buang fa, ga ke bone gore a o teng gone fa, teng ka fa go bo latolobe ka fa, yo o tlaa se ganetsang. Nngwe ya dilo tse re neng ra di dira fa ke itebaganya le *Agriculture*, re simolotse ka mananeo a bo AE10 a re neng re rotloetsa ditlhopha gore ba kgone gore ba itemele merogwana mo magaeng a bone, re ntse le mananeo a bo AI a e leng gore...

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** A ile kae jaanong?

**MR KWELAGOBE:** Ke eng o sa ye Ramatlabama, ga ke re di gwediswa ko Ramatlabama, o buduletse wa re a ile kae? Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, re ntse le mananeo a bo AI a re neng re rotloetsa Batswana go rua dikgomo tsa letsopa tse e ka reng fa ba di rekisa ko matlhabelong ba nna le dipoelo, kampo ba di rekisa ko ba batlang go di rekisa teng ba nna le dipoelo tse di botoka tse ba tlaa tsamayang ba ya go itokafatsa matshelo ka tsone. Re ntse le mananeo a bo *Ram Development* tsa *small stock* ko Lubu, tse e leng gore gape goromente o ne a rekisa diphoko, kana ene e le ka *half price* kana e ne e le ka bokae. Tselo e e le tsela ya go rotloetsa Batswana, e le motlhala o Goromente a o dirang gore Batswana ba tle ba kgone gore ba ipoloke. Re ntse le mananeo a re neng ra sega dipolase kwa go bo Haina *Veldt*, ra epa didiba ko go bo Lerolwane, ra epa tse dingwe mo dikgaolong tse di farologanyeng. Re dira jalo re direla gore Batswana ba ba sa kgoneng go nna le metsi a leruo la bone ka re lefatshe la sekaka ba tle ba kgone gore ba nose dikgomo tsa bone di ba tshelele ba leleke lehuma. Re ntse le lenaneo la kepo ya matamo a goromente o neng a a epa, e re a sena go a epa a bo a a fa ditlhopa, matamo a bo Mmamokhasi. Re ntse le mananeo a mangwe, Madam Speaker, one a bo *Arable Land Development Policy (ALDEP)* a a neng a itebagantse le matshelo a batho. Re ntse le
mananeo a bo *Water Development* a a neng a itebagantse le gore go thusiwe batho ba epelwe didiba ba kgone go nosa dikgomo tsa bone. Mananeo a e leng gore gompieno re a boeletsa gape mo bukaneng e, e seng *Pamphlet No 1*, mo bukaneng e, mo e leng gore go supagala ka fa re yang go thusa batho e leng balemi ba ba botlana ka teng, ka bongwe ka bongwe jwa bone. Go supagala ka fa re yang go ba thusa ka teng e le ditlhopa tse e leng gore di tlaa bo di itirela matshelo, *Madam Speaker*.

Fa ke tswa mo go tsone tseo ka bokhutshwane ka gore ga twee ga ke na nako, ke mosupi wa gore gongwe Rraetsho Rre Baledzi Gaolathe o tlaa supa gape le ene. Go na le a mangwe, le mo dikonterakeng tota re na le madi a a duelwang a bo *advance*, a eng, a eng, a e leng gore *it is a loan, interest free loan* e e neelwang bana ba lona ba ba tsamayang ba aga mantlo mo le tse dingwe tse ba di dirang. Golo moo ke mananeo a a thusang batho go leleka lehuma mo lefatsheng la rona.

Gompieno *employment creation, P42 billion* yo o yang go tsenngwa ko go yang go dirwa motlakase teng kwa, batho ba ya go hirwa koo. *Refinery* e Tautona a letseng a dira *ground breaking* ya yone kwa e e yang go hira batho gone koo, ya koporo le *nickel. Expansion* ya Morupule ya *P7 billion* e e yang go dirwa, dilo tse tsotlhe go ya go hirwa batho. *Beneficiation* ya diteemane tsa rona, *cutting and polishing* tse di yang *to create* mebereko ya bana ba rona. Fa re dira jalo, Honourable Mokgwathi wa Letlhakeng Bophirima, re dira gore bana ba rona ba bone mebereko ba leleke lehuma mo malwapeng a bone, mo magabone. Jaanong go tla go peperetla fela fa motho a bo a re ga go na metlhala e Domkraga e e segileng ya go leleka lehuma, ga go na metlhala e Domkraga e e dirang ya gore go nne le mebereko, nnyaa ke go feta botsenwa go bua dilo tse di ntseng jalo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ga e ka ke ya re go epiwa moepo ko Mmamabula ga tlhoka gore go nne le meberekö. Ga e ka ke ya re go epiwa meepo ko Lerala ga tlhoka gore go nne le meberekö. Ga e ka ke ya re go tlaa epiwa moepo gaufi le Orapa ga tlhoka gore go nne le meberekö. Ga e ka ke ya re go okediwa bo Morupule ga tlhoka gore go nne le meberekö. Golo moo ke ditsela tsa gore go nne le ditiro mo lefatsheng la rona. Gompieno bana ba newa mananeo a P30 million last year wa Youth Fund, 50 million wa this year Young Farmers Fund yo mokaulengwe mongwe wa me a reng a e ka re fa bagolo ba tlogela temo re bo re re bana ba ye teng. Ee go ntse jalo. Ga ke re gompieno bagolo ba tlogela ditiro ka bogodi mo, bana ba ya gone koo, a o tlaa re ka gore bagolo ba tlogetse tiro ka bogodi bana ba seka ba ya go tsena mo ditirong tsa bone?

Jaanong fa e le gore bagolo retire mo temong, ke eng fa o sa batle gore bana ba ye go tsena koo? Gompieno Honourable Member Batsile o thibetse bana fa, o ka bo a ba sutetse ba tla gone fa. Jaanong ke sone Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente se re reng, go botlhokwa gore fa bakaaulengwe ba ema ba bua mo Palamenteng mo, ba eme ba bue dilo tse e leng gore di fa tlhaloganyo. E seng go tla fela fa batho ba tla go lora. Gompieno bana gatwe ba rue dikgaka, dikoko, dinotshe, ba leme, ba bo ba dire feed - le teng le batsadi ba bone. Jaanong…

**MR BATSILE:** On a point of order, Madam Speaker. Ke ne ke re ke lemotshe mokaulengwe gore he is out of order ka gore o tsosafetse fa since 1960 to date, a sutele bana.

**MR KWELAGOBE:** Honourable Member, o letse a tshwara letlalonyana maabane. O tsile fa a wetswe ke mopalo…

**HONOURABLE MEMBERS:** (Laughter)
MINISTER OF HEALTH (PROF. TLOU): Thank you, Madam Speaker. In my contribution I want to thank the Minister of Finance and Development Planning, for this very well thought out budget whose theme, of course is inspiring us to be even more productive if we are going to have sustainable economic development.

Madam Speaker, among the African countries Botswana is the only one that is set to meet some, not all, but most of the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Indeed I am not speaking just among African countries; it should be also in the developing world if we consider other continents, we are really on target and it is all thanks to the leadership of the Botswana Democratic Party (BDP), which is able to bring budgets such as this one.

Madam Speaker, I want to thank Honourable Kwelagobe for educating Honourable Gaborone about the social determinants of health and disease. Poverty is one of the social determinants of health. When you are poor you cannot do anything for yourself, and indeed when you are poor you are more prone to malnutrition and other diseases of the heart, mental health diseases. So indeed the fact that the BDP Government is fighting poverty really does contribute to our health. We can pride ourselves with being one of those nations where diseases of poverty are not even…

MR MOKGWATHI: Point of clarification. Thank you, Honourable Minister for yielding. Can you clarify your last statement as to the causal relationship between poverty and health? Did you say social determinants of poverty are health or vice versa; can you clarify what you said please?

PROF. TLOU: Madam Speaker, I said poverty is one of the social determinants of health and disease, meaning if you are poor you are not able to provide for yourself. When you are poor you will not be able to even have that strength to go to the health post or to
health clinic and all that. It can be vice versa but indeed the fact that the Botswana Government is fighting poverty that well, is shown by the fact that here in Botswana diseases of malnutrition are very rare. When was the last time you saw a child go twe o na le kwashiorkor, you will not? When was the last time you heard of somebody dying of poverty or of malnutrition in Botswana; you will not. However, if I read you the list of killer diseases or killer conditions in Africa you will find; Madam Speaker, I am going to read that list. In fact what I did was I distributed the Africa Health Report, which I had the honour to launch in Geneva last year in December. And you know why I had the honour to launch it? It was not because of anything except the fact that Botswana is the shining example of health when it comes to the African continent. So the Minister of Health of Botswana had to be asked to go all the way to Geneva to go and launch the Africa Health Report; that shows you the leadership of the BDP. That shows you what we mean when we say, political will and commitment, prudent spending; zero tolerance for corruption.

Madam Speaker, the killer diseases in Africa are HIV and AIDS, Malaria, Upper Respiratory Tract Infections, Diarrhoeal Diseases, Peri-natal Conditions, Cardiovascular Diseases, Tuberculosis, Heart Diseases, Measles, Road Traffic accidents, violence, Whopping Cough, Malnutrition, Nephritic Syndrome, Syphilis E, War, Tetanus, Diabetes and Drowning. From that list I am sure you are well aware that we do not consider things such as whopping cough and measles as killers in Botswana. They are causes of morbidity and minor ones, why because under the leadership of the Democratic Party for the past 40 years, Botswana has been able to attain almost 100 per cent coverage as far as immunisation for childhood diseases is concerned.
Botswana under the leadership of the BDP has been able to provide infrastructure to the point where even now when people ask us; how did you manage to roll out ARV’s so quickly, we are able to say, it is because under primary health care, we had one of the best infrastructures in Africa. We have thus been able to roll out better than any other country in the developing world. So Madam Speaker, it is really to just say, it is this budgeting process that really enables citizens to be able to live that healthy.

This budget also addresses the social determinants of ill health such as illiteracy that is already been alluded to. We know that education especially female literacy, is very essential when it comes to promoting health, preventing disease and in fact sustaining health for families. When females are educated they are more able to take care of their families, more able to respond to health messages and indeed more able to influence their communities towards adopting proper health measures.

Looking at providing social infrastructure, you know, sometimes we take for granted; we do forget that health is complete social, physical, as well as mental wellbeing. And under social health, I will include such things as provision of water, sanitation and transportation. These are parameters that are essential for health promotion. Indeed we know the value of water, how last year because of the sudden rains we actually had a catastrophe. Now, in Botswana we proud ourselves as the only country that has provided more than 75 per cent, of the households with clean portable water. It is more than 95 per cent but the mark for Africa has at least been 75 per cent; a mark that we have long surpassed. We can proud ourselves that under the leadership of the BDP, our people are able to have clean, safe water. And we can be proud of that.
I really like the chapter on HIV/AIDS. Madam Speaker, three years ago, or was is it four or five; no, in 2001, almost six years ago. Our leaders; our Presidents met in Abuja, Nigeria and declared that for them to be able to tackle public health problems, they must devote at least 15 per cent of the budget to health and HIV/AIDS. If you look at this budget, Botswana is the first country, mark it; the first country to be able to surpass that mark of 15 per cent. Other countries have not even gone up to nine per cent. So indeed I very much applaud the Minister of Finance and Development Planning.

You know as Amin used to say, "If you were a woman I would marry you myself". It is really great that we have achieved this 20 per cent and with that 20 per cent we can do a lot; with that 20 per cent if we look at what then is ailing the nation, we can be able to really ensure that by the year 2016, we are proud of that healthy and prosperous nation.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Point of clarification.

PROF. TLOU: Ke a gana. I decline Madam Speaker, ga ke na nako. Speaking about HIV/AIDS I must say that as you stated in the budget, the incidence is going down and we are doing quite a lot. The incidence is going down but it has to go even further down. Otherwise, we will not be able to sustain it. At global level, if you are looking at the global epidemic, we used to be classified as the highest with a 37 per cent prevalence in the sexually reproductive age group. Now that prevalence has gone to 24 per cent, ga ba re praise ga ke itse gore ka go reng but if you look at 37 and 24, that is a drop of 13 per cent. That is quite a lot and I am simply urging my Honourable Members of Parliament to be sure to spread the AIDS messages and ensure that our population has them, because only when it is reduced, Honourable Masisi, can we be able to talk about organ transplants.
People say HIV/AIDS is not everything, I say HIV/AIDS is the only thing. A lot of time when you look at those renal failures they are due to what; to HIV and AIDS. You look at diabetes, when we try to diagnose somebody it is due to what; HIV/AIDS. Hypertension; people have to realise that HIV/AIDS destroys all your tissues and indeed it will bring about diseases that used to be only for older adults. We now see them among children, so it does not even matter when you are talking about organ transplants because who are you transplanting to who is already infected. It does not help. So we need to be able to reduce the incidence and prevalence of HIV in order to be able to really say, we are now going to be tackling other diseases that are non-communicable in nature.

However, we are trying a lot to be able to tackle non-communicable diseases to ensure that people are educated; people do have medical supplies. I can assure you some of you have seen in your clinics right now, the renovations that are going on because we are talking health, we are not just talking about the medicines and all that. We are talking about the overall infrastructure. I am glad some of you have come to me to say, Minister, our hospital now looks really great, it has been painted and renovated. That is the essence; we are improving health that way. Not only that, we are ensuring that the health care workers work in an environment where they can be comfortable and that they can be proud of. So I must simply say that under the leadership of the BDP, we plan to do even more.

I am glad to report Madam Speaker that even the funeral parlours are complaining. There are no more funerals, you know and indeed when you look at that, we are also reducing the numbers of orphans because their parents are able to live longer and work for their children, thus reducing poverty.
HONOURABLE MEMBER: On a point of order, Madam Speaker.

PROF. TLOU: *Ke rile ke a gana.*

MR MOKGWATHI: *On a point of order, Madam Speaker.* Ke a dumela Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, *it is a point of order.* Fa go twe, ‘no more funerals’, ga a bue nnete and is misleading the House.

PROF. TLOU: *Ke a tswelela,* Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, I want to emphasise however, that prevention is still the way to go when it comes to HIV and AIDS. I cannot re-emphasise that and I will point out something.

If you look at our figures, in order to put 80,000 people on ARVs, and to ensure that the 300,000 that are infected do not develop AIDS, we are spending almost P1 billion.

Supposing there are no more new infections, in 10 years time, as the 300,000 that are infected develop AIDS and get on to need ARVs, it means we can expect to be spending about P3 billion. That is not sustainable. That is almost half of our budget. That is why I am trying to show people that we need to really get into this thing together and talk about prevention and ensure that people who are infected do not re-infect themselves or infect others in the process.

On that score, I want to talk about the controversial PMTCT programme. How disappointed I was, that last time when the so called Human Rights Organisations wrote about the rights of women who are infected to have children, very few people responded to that. It was interesting that I would be walking in the street and somebody would stop me and say, *ba reng Tona basadi ba? Ba re ba batla gore ba le infected ba bo ba sa ntse ba tshola bana fela?* And I would say, why do you not respond? That is exactly what I was saying. The basic principle that we have Madam Speaker is that, if you are infected
Monday 12 February 2007

or you do not know your status, use a condom. Now, what part of that prevention message do people not understand? We have people here…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: …(Inaudible)…

MRS TLOU: That is the point. Madam Speaker, we are providing all reproductive health commodities and at this particular point in time I am sure everybody has seen on TV, in the newspapers, everywhere, even billboards that are really encouraging men to be part of the PMTCT and to prevent HIV for their children.

However, we do have to ensure that males are included at every aspect, including ensuring that they go for testing, even before marriage. But some people wait until they are married, until they are pregnant, that is when they start testing. That is still way too far. We are trying to really say before people get married, they should know their HIV status and plan children accordingly.

Also, ka Setswana, this thing of trying to say, kana ke a mo rata ke mo tsholela ngwana, should stop. You cannot tsholela ngwana somebody whose HIV status you do not know. And indeed I am very much perturbed by women who are on heart on ARV’s. Women who were almost dying, they have been plucked from the grave, suddenly two years later that woman is pregnant. Golo mo is worrying because you start wondering that, did the partner, whether or not he was forcing you to have a child, it is immaterial. Indeed in our social situation she may have been forced by either parents or husband or whatever to have a child. But the point is, the person who impregnated her, did he know she is HIV positive. If he himself is HIV positive, are the two of them aware that they are infecting each other and therefore causing resistance.
We are now having cases of resistance because this virus is like a human being. *Ya re iphetole*, and it actually will mutate so that it does not therefore respond.

**HONOURABLEMEMBER:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker.

**MRS TLOU:** *Ke a gana* Madam Speaker. *Ke saletswe ke mnetane, go gontsinyana thata.*

I am familiarising the House. I am trying to explain this Madam Speaker so that Honourable Members can be able to give this message. We are simply saying, let us prevent HIV.

**MR GABORONE:** On a point of order Madam Speaker. This is not time yet for discussing chapters. It seems the Minister of Health is just on the Ministry of Health now.

We are talking budget here, general principles.

**MRS TLOU:** I do not know what Standing Order he is pointing at.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Tlou, proceed.

**MRS TLOU:** Thank you Madam Speaker. I was almost about to finish anyway. In fact in my finishing statement, I really want to appeal to Members that when we are in this House, we need to be able to respect each other. What just happened this afternoon is uncalled for, and I hope that as Honourable Members we need to do our research. Maybe it is high time we given more researchers to be with us in Parliament, to be able to research on everything that we intend saying so that we do not then end up hurting people. Because *bagaetsho*, in the ultimate we are all relatives, we know each other. We need to be kind and we need to be considerate of each other. With that Madam Speaker, I thank you.
MR MOOKA (MOSHUPA): Ke a go leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Mafoko a the Honourable Prof. Tlou a fetsang ka one, a gore re tlotle Ntlo e re bo re tlotlane, ke mafoko a le nna ke a buang.

O ka re re setse re simolola mokgwa o o seng montle ka kwa le ka kwano, fa ke batla go tsena mongwe ganong a bua, mme a bo a gana, ke batla tsela e ke ka mo tsenang ganong, e a sa kakeng a gana ka yone. Golo foo go a nk gorele tsa, ka gore gantsi e a bo e le gore se se buiwang ga se point of order, e a bo e le di sele.

Jaanong ka re tsamaisa ka molao, melao e e thomihweng, gongwe go tlaa re re akanye ka go baakanya e mengwe. Mme ka re bua ka budget speech mma ke tlogele foo Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Ke simolola ka rural development, mme ke leke go le gakolola gore, kana fa o leba mafatshe a Afrika fela jaana, le Botswana a le mo teng, ka nako ya re tsaya boipuso, ke ntsha sekai sa ditsela, ditsela tsotlhe di ne di tswa mo motsemogolo di ya kwa lewatleng. Ditsela di ne di isa a ke diteemane kana ke eng, kwa motsemogolo wa mafatshe a a neng a re busa.

Mme e rile re sena go tsaya boipuso mono Botswana, ra bo re simolola go tshwaraganya metse e metona le motsemogolo. Go tloga foo ra tshwaraganya metse e megolo ka bo yone. Ra tloga ra ya kwa metsaneng e mebotlana, gore ditiro tsa ditlhabololo di kgone go tsamaisiwa, di isiswa kwa le kwa, kwa re neng re batla gore di ye teng.

Re ne re na le ditselanyana, mebilanyana fela, mme ra tloga ra rema ditlhare mo dithoko, ra gopa, ra tshela gravel, gompieno jaana ba a bua ba ba buang, re na le dikete tsa dikhilomithara tsa ditsela tse di tshetsweng sekonotere. Selo seo, fa e le gore go na le ba
Monday 12 February 2007

ba sa se boneng, ga ke itse gore a le fa o ka mmonesa ka torch mo matlhong, o tlaa bona
gore phathi e ya Domkraga e dira sengwe.

Dikole tse, kana ke gakologelwa Gaborone Secondary School e le sekolo sa ntlha go
agiwa mo motsemogolo wa Gaborone, kwa ditlhaakoreng kwa go sena le fa e le dikolo
dipe kwa. Legale, e re jaaka gompieno jaana di aname le lefatshe lotlh, ke kopa ba thuto
gore ba nne ba akanyetse mafelo a dikolo tse dingwe di seong koo, bogolo jang tse di
kgolwane. Ntlha ele ya bophirima jwa lefatshe leno, dikole tseo ga di dintsi.

Mme mo metseng e mengwe jaaka bo-Moshupa jaana, ke feta ka sekai seo, re na le dikole
tse e leng gore batho ba ba ka ntlha ya ka kwa bophirima, bana ba bone ba tla sekoleng
mo ga Moshupa mme go sena boroko. Jaanong, fa go ne go ka agiwa matlo a boroko kwa
ga Moshupa, kana go ne go raya gore jaanong ba tlaa tsholega sentle bana ba, ba sa
kgoreletsege mo thutong ya bone.

Metsi le one ke sengwe sa dilo tse re ka di supang, tse di supang ka fa ditlhabololo di
tsilelang mo lefatsheng le ka gone. Re ne re e nwa mo megobeng, mo dinokeng, mo
melatswaneng le madutela. Jaanong, ga nna le didiba mo mafelong a le mantsi. Go tloga
foo ga nna le didiba tsa bo boromatshine. Ga tloga ga na le stand pipes mo metseng. Go
tloga foo jaanong ba le bantsi ba kgona go nna le diphaephe tse di isang metsi mo ntlong.
Selo seo se supa gore, re ntse re lekela go gatela pele kwa ditlhabololo di tshwanetseng
gore di re ise teng.

Jaanong, go na le sengwe se se sa ntseng se saletse kwa morago. Batho ba ba nnang mo
metseng e metona le e mebotlana, go na le lephata la puso le le ba nosang metsi koo.
Leaphata la temothuo le nosa leruo. Mme kwa masimo gone, ga gona leaphata la puso le le
lebaganeng le go isetsa batho metsi kwa masimo. Mme a itse ka temo, letsema ke lone le
le re neelang dijo. Mme fa go sena lephata le le isang metsi kwa masimo, kwa dijo di lengwang teng, re tlaa lelekwa re busiwa kwa masimo ke lenyora.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Re tlaa lelekwa jaaka Modubule jaana.

MR MOOKA: A itse ke ene a itelekileng. Ke ntsha mogopolo wa gore, tsweetswee, a re akanyetseng batho ba masimo go ba nosa metsi, re le goromente. Fa re dira jalo re tlaa bo re gatela teng kwa ditlhabololo di re gogelang teng.

Ke feta ka bonako ka ga ke aka ya re ke sena go kwala dintlha tse, ka ipha nako ka bona gore ke nako e e kae. Jaanong ke tlaa nna ke feta ka bofefo

Fa re bua ka go tswa kwa go paragraph 25, public enterprises, ke lemoga fa tlhwatlhwa ya utilities, motlakase, metsi, jalo-jalo, e sa ntse e le kwa godimo. Ke gore re akanyets e golo foo gore go ka isiwa jang tlhwatlhwa kwa tlase, bogolo jang kwa mafelong a magae ka gore, e tlaa re motho a re o a iteka ka kgwebo koo, o a turelwa ke go e tlhoma ka gore, utilities di kwa godimo thata. Banana fa ba re ba tlhoma dikgwebo gone koo, utilities di a ba feketsa, ampo bone bagwebi ba re tswang go ba laletsa ba tswa kwa mafatsheng a sele, ba bangwe ba kgorelediwa go tla kwano ke the cost of utilities.

Motor Vehicle Fund – Ke a leboga fa go twe molao wa yone o tlaa sekwa-sekwa o tsenngwa ditshetla. Kwa gae kwa ga Moshupa re fitlhela e le gore go tlhokafetsa batho ba le bantsi. Mme ga ba a ka ba thusega ka ntlha ya gore go ne go sena bosupi jo bo papametseng gore kotsi e e tsereng matshelo a bone ampo ya ba golafatsa, e ne e dirwa ke koloi e mokgweetsi wa yone a neng a nna botlhaswa.

Jaanong ke solofela gore jaaka go baakanngwa molao o go tlaa bo go dirwa gore o itebaganye le batho ba ba mo dikotsing. Kotsi e tsalwa ke sengwe le sengwe fela, ga se
gore ke ka gobo mokgweetsi wa yone a ne a le botlhswa, jaanong golo foo go baakanngwe.

Ke bo ke tsena mo go Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency CEDA. Go na le bothata jo batho ba ntseng ba bo kaya gore ga go motlhofo gore o kwale proposal e e amogelesegang ko diofising fa o e isa teng, jaanong banana ke ba le bone ba tlaa bo ba kopiwa di proposals. Jaanong ba ga Moshupa ba re ke kope, legale ke tlaa kopa mogang re itebagantseng le that chapter, le fa ke sa itse gore ke tlaa bo ke le kwano kana ko Afrika Borwa. Gore go ka nna molemo gore puso e hire mongwe kana bangwe go thusa go dira di-proposal ba bo ba bitsa banana ba, bogolo-jang ke bua ka banana, ba tla go ba ruta gore fa re re o kwale jaana o re re raya ka gobo, ba ba ruta ba bo ba ya go ikemela kwa ba itse se go buiwang ka sone e le gone jaanong ba yang go araba dipotso tsa CEDA.

Ke fetela ko Tourism and Wildlife, paragraph 47. Gore fa o ikopela go sa ntse go le go leele go tsaya lobaka lo lo telele gore o bone karabo. Jaanong fa gongwe tsone dipampiri tse di lopiwang mo go wena ga ke bone botlhokwa jwa tsone; gore e re fa o kopa gore ko madirelong a gago o gokelelwe metsi o bo o ya go tla ka Articles of Association, ka dilo tse dingwe tse di ntsintsi fela ke sa itse gore jaanong tsone gatwe e a bo e le eng, di batla eng di thusa jang. Re ntse re le gone foo fa bojanaleng di-Trans-Frontier Parks, a tota go sekasekilwe sentle ga bonwa ka boammaaruri gore these trans-frontier parks di thusa Botswana kana di dira botshelo motlhofo mo mafatsheng a re bapileng nao a re dumalanyeng nao gore re tlaa nna le a Trans-Frontier Park. Go naile lekgotla le le sekasekang le lebaleba madirelo a tourism, the Grading Committee or something, o ka re ba bonya go dira jalo. O ka re e ka re Tona a araba fa, a araba se re ntseng re se bua a
bolela gore ba tsamaya fa kae bonya bo tsalwa ke eng mo go reng madirelo a *tourism* a diriwe *grade*.

*Paragraph 62;* ke bua jaana e kete ke a kgala kana ke a reng, ke ntsha megopo polo ya tse di sa ntseng di tlhela, ka gore dilo tsotlhe tse ke buileng ka tsone le tse ke sa ntseng ke tlaa bua ka tsone di gatsete pele thata mo go itumedisang, jaanong ke ntsha fa go sa ntseng go tlhela teng fela. *Paragraph 62 e bua ka go dira ditiro ka bonya,* slow pace of *implementation,* golo foo go a re koafatsa. Ka gore fa jaaka re a bo re tsile go leba kabo ya madi ya mono ngwaga re a go aba madi a bo a tlaatlaga le a ngogola mme re ne re tshwanetse gore a seka a tlaatlaga, re bo re simolola fa re feletseng teng ngogola re ya ko pele mono ngwageng le mo go isago.

*Paragraph 72;* e bua ka go tseyo ditshetla mo melaong. Go tseyo tshetla mo melaong ke solofela gore go tlaa dirwa jalo go lebilwe *gender;* go nne *gender sensitive and gender neutral.*

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** O buelela basadi.

**MR MOOKA:** Ke bo-mme kana.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** *Gender* ga se basadi.

**MR MOOKA:** Ke boammaaruri *gender* ga se basadi.

Ee 50 *per cent of gender* ke bomme.

Ke bua ka *Health.* Ke ne ke lebile *paragraph 74 and 75,* jaanong Tona wa Botsogo ga a yo fa. Mme kgang ya *paragraph 74 and 75* ke HIV/AIDS fela, mme ke itlhoma gore ga se jone bolwetse, HIV/AIDS ga se jone bolwetse fela jo re ka buang ka jone jo bo re tshwenyang. Go nale malwetse a le mantsi a go ka bong go builwe ka one: bo-*malaria,*
bo-tuberculosis jalo-jalo. Mme Motlotlegi o kwadile ka AIDS fela mme ke solofela gore o ka bo a ntse a kwadile ka tse dingwe.

Paragraph 59 e bua ka go gokela motlakase mo mafelong a magae. A e re re ntse re tswelela ko pele re gokela metse e mesha re tle re lebile e megologolo ka gore metse e a gola, fa e gola jaana e tlogela ba bangwe ka ko dithoko ka kwa, ga go na motlakase. Mme batho ba palelwa ke go ikgokelela motlakase o ba o isa koo ka gore o a tura, o tura go feta. Kana ga ke itse gore ke ba le ka ba ba itseng ka Moshupa, tla ke ntshe sekai; go nale mortuary ka fa ga tsela, ntlha e nngwe ya tsela go na le lefelo la madirelo le le senang motlakase. Go tsaya motlakase fela o o ntsha ka fa o o isa ka ntlha e nngwe ya tsela ga twe ke P94,000, quotation e ne e rialo. Is this reasonable? Go nale di-study jaaka paragraph 53 e bua, on the viability of long term development strategy for livestock sub-sector. Gore ditlhotlhomiso tse kana re tshwenetse re di neelwe re le balemi-barui, ba e leng balemi-barui, go bo go tlhomamisiwe gore Lephata la Dipatlisiso le le ko Sebele kwa le re solegela molemo, gore re bo re itse gore go ruiwa jang go lengwa jang, go kwadilwe go tlhotlhomisitswe ke baitsaanape, ga go a lekana. Go tshwanetse gore kitso eo e isiwe ko bathong ba ye go e itse gore e re mo temong ya bone ba bo ba dira jalo ka kitso.

Se sengwe se se tshwenyang ke ditiro tse di dirilweng; go agilwe di-clinic go agilwe dikolo, mme fa re ntse re tsweletse re aga tse disha tse di ko morago tsele di a onala ga di nne sentle, jaanong go onala moo go tshwanetse gore go baakanngwe.

Kgang yame ya bofelo ke e ke dumalanang nayo thata, ya go rekela Tautona wa rona sefofane. Kana ga re batle Tautona a tloga jaanong a nna le kotsi ka ntlha ya gore sefofane sa gagwe se a se dirisang gompieno jaana se onetse, re tshwaenetse gore re se dire. Jaanong mme ke a utlwalela gore tsela e go kopilweng madi ka yone ga se e go
kopelwang ditiro tse dingwe tsotlhe madi. Fa go twe go dule *directive from Office of the President* kgang eo mo go nna ga e ntle, ka gore go tlaa pala eng gore ere ka moso go tlhokega se sengwe gape go bo go tswa *directive* gore se dirwe jalo. Lebaka le lengwe la bobedi la gore ke eng fa kgang eo ke e bona e se ntle mo go nna ke gore mafatshe a Afrika ke yone tsela e ba berekang ka yone eo, jaanong o ka re re sokametse ko tseleng ya gore *we are just any other country* mo Afrika. Mme re tshwanetse gore re dire dilo ka tsela ya Botswana, re itsiwe ka go dira dilo ka bophepa go sena le fa e le sepe se se ntseng jalo. Mme ke thomamisa gore tota sefofane sa ga Molotlegi Rraetsho Tautona se ka bo se sa bolo go rekwa ka gore ke gantsinyana re ntse re utlwalela gore go ne ga nna le mathata fale ga nna le mathata fale, mme go seka ga dirwa ka di-*directive* go dirwe fela ka tselo e re dirang dilo ka yone dingwaga tsotlhe. Mme ka a le kalo Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke a leboga.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MRS MBAAKANYI):** Ke a go leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mme le nna ke tseye sebaka se go leboga Tona ya Madi le tsa Ditlhabololo ka *budget* e a re e fileng. Mme ke lebogele setlhogo sa yone se se buang ka bonatla, mme e bile se bua ka gore re tswelele re iteke re itshwantshanye le mafatshe a mangwe re seka ra itshwantshanya fela le ba re gautʃ le bone, ka gore Botswana jaanong ga e sa thhole e le lefatshe le le nyennyane *we are in a global village, this is why* go buiwa ka *global competitiveness*. Ke tsaya gore ke setlhogo se se tlaa re rotloetsang rotlhe gongwe le gongwe fa re leng teng gore re iteke. Mme fa ke lebelela *budget* e Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, e supa ka boammaaru ri maikemisetso le maitlamo a *party* ya Domkrag. Selo sa ntlha re a itse rotlhe gore pele ga *budget* e tlaa diriwa re a kopana ko dikgaolong tsa rona le di-*village Development Committee* (VDC),
di-health Committees le Makhanselara re bue gore re batla eng, re tsenye megopolo ya gore re batla go tsenngwa eng mo National Development Plan (NDP). Mme e re go tswana foo megopolo eo e tsewe, e mengwe e ye go dirisiwa ko ditoropong e ngwe e tle jaaka e tlaa bo e diriwa ko dikgaolong. Mme dilo tse tsothle ke tsone tse e leng gore ngwaga le ngwaga Ministry wa Finance and Development Planning o tlaa bo jaanong o bona gore re diragatsa jang maikaelelo a rona a re a tsentseng in the National Development Plan. Mo go supang gore toto-tota puisanyo le ba ba amegang e a diragala. Jaanong ke utlwa ba bangwe ba re ga gona puisanyo mabapi le gore budget e dirwa jang.

Se sengwe gape ke lebile gore fa ke lebelela budget e e itsupegetsa maikaelelo a party ya Domkrag mo go thabololeng Botswana e le lefatshe le go thabolole Batswana ka kakaretso. Fa re lebelela madi a a fiwang Lephata la Thuto ngwaga le ngwaga, jaaka bangwe ba ntse ba bua, ka madi a mantsi thata. Ngwaga ono recurrent e filwe 28.2 per cent, which is P5 billion, mme e bile e le leone madi a a ko godimo mo maphateng otlhe. Fa re tla go lebelela the Development Budget re bona Lephata la Thuto le filwe P584 million, e le leone la borataro mo maphateng a mangwe. Se se re supegetsa gore ka boammaaruri Domkrag e ikale tse gore e tlabolole lefatshe e bo e tlabolole Batswana. Kana Batswana o ka ba tlabolola fela ka go ba ruta, ke se o bonang gompieno re na le Mapalamente ba re nang nabo gompieno jaana, ke one madi a a ntseng a tsenngwa mo Lephateng la Thuto gore rotlhe re tlabolo ge go simolola ko thutong. Mme fa o tla go leba le tsone di-institution mongwe le mongwe wa rona o na le bosupi jwa gore gongwe le gongwe ko a tswang teng go na le sekolo sa primary e bile bontsi jwa metse e e nang le dikolo tsa Community Junior Secondary School (CJSS). Fa re tse ya boipuso dikolo di ne di se dintsi, gompieno re bua ka dikolo tse di 723 tsa primary, re bua ka dikolo tse di 233.
tsa secondary, re bua ka 9 colleges, re bua ka university e bile re ikaelela go aga e nngwe le a medical school. Dilo tse tsothle di supa gore Goromente o ikaletse go tlhabolola Batswana le go tlhabolola lefatshe. Mme e re go ntse go dirwa jalo gape o bo o bona madi a ntshiwa go duelela bana. Mafatshe a a re gakgamalela gore re kgona jang re dira jang gore e bo e le gore bana ba ka duelelwa ke goromente ka tsela e goromente wa Botswana a dirang ka teng.

Mme fa o tla go lebelela di-institution tse tsothle tse o bo o lebelela population ya Botswana which is about 1.7 million, motho yo mongwe o ka nna a re mme di-institution di fetile population ya lona. Se se supa maikaelelo le maikemiseto a Domkrag a re solofelang gore e tshwanetse gore mo diofising, a simolole re bone a diragadiwa. Mme e bile maikaelelo a re bone a tlhalosa Botswana from one of the poorest countries a bo a tlhatloga e bo e nna a middle income country. Mo e leng gore re itse gore ka millennium development goals, Botswana e kgonne go fitlhelela mangwe maikaelelo a yone pele ga nako e e neng e beilwe.

Ke ka tsaya lephata la thuto e le sekai gore before 2015, re setse e bile re na le 10 years of basic education, primary yone ke sa bue ga re a bolo go goroga ko go yone. Mme tse tsothle tse re di bona jaaka Tona ya Finance o ne o bua rra gore maphata a a ko godimo a a re akgola, re bone ba credit rating, ba Moody’s since 2001 le gompieno ka 2006 ba ntse ba re akgola gore lefatshe la Botswana le a iteka. Ba transparency international rra, o buile gore ba supile gore Botswana is one of the least corrupt countries in Africa, mme ke ya bo 37 mo lefatsheng. 37 fa o tsaya gore mafatshe a mantsi jang, ke maiteko a a hakgamatsang. Mme se fa re tla go bua ka transparency go re tsisa mo kgannyeng e re neng re e bua maabane le letsatsi leno gore, ke dinako tse dintsi go buiwa ka corruption.
Monday 12 February 2007

Maloba re ne re sa ntse re le ba thuto gotwe re corrupt, re tsere madi a a seng kana ka sepe. Letsatsi leno re re sa ntse re bua ka gone gotwe bangwe ba corrupt. Mme fa o ka lebelela, Botswana ke lome lefatshe fela le e leng gore motho wa maemo a a kanang ka Tona, e a re go tulwe o corrupt go tlhotlhomisiwe fa dikgato di tsewa, di bo di tsewe. Selo seo ga o se bone mo mafatsheng a mantsi. Tona ga a kgomowe mo mafatsheng a mangwe, se o se go supegetsa ka baammaaruri gore lefatshe la Botswana go na le transparency mo e leng gore le fa o ka bo o le mo maemong a a ntseng jang, ga go pale gore molao o diragadiwe mo go wena. Se re ka bo re ithuta ka sone gore mme re lefatshe le le segofaditsweng. Mme kana go diragetsese jalo ka ketelelo pele e re e bonang ya puso ya ga Domkraga, e re solofelang gore Batswana le bone ba a bona gore tota ga gona e nngwe gape party e e ka ba etelelang pele ko ntle ga e e setseng e ntse e tshwere.

Fa re tla go lebelela dilo tse Botswana e setseng e di kgonne, the world economic reform forum e supile gore Botswana is the third best performer in Sub Sahara after South Africa le Mauritius. O tseye fela gore re ne re tsaya fa kae fa re tsaya boipuso, gore re ne re le ko tlase-tlase go sena le fa e le se re se iphang. Mme ke batla go tsaya sebaka se gape go lebogela Cabinet reshuffle e e neng ya thusa le gore rona ko Ministry of Education, re mme le Assistant Minister wa bobedi ka gore bagaetsho, ministry o o motona o. Le bona gore ke ministry o o tlhokanang le batho ba bantsi tota mo go rayang gore re solofela gore ka go fiwa Tona yo mongwe, tiro ya rona e tlaa nna botoka.

Mme ke lebogela le di ministry dingwe tse di dirilweng jaaka Ministry of Sports, Youth and Culture. Mme ke na le letshwenyego la gore, rona re ne re solofetse gore e tsile gore fa go kgaogangngwa Ministry o wa Labour and Home Affairs, go bo go nna le Ministry of Gender, Youth, Sport and Culture. Jaanong go dirilwe ministry o mosha ga gona fa o
utlwang gender e buiwa teng. Kgantele fa o botsa o utlwa gotwe, nnyaa, e tsentswe golo gongwe temporarily ka fa lepheteng le lengwe. Jaanong re batla go itse gore maikaelelo ke eng? Kana gender ga e bue ka bomme fela jaaka mongwe a ne a bua kgantele. Mme fa o tla go lebelela fa ke ne ke ka tsaya bomme ka ba ntsha mo go borre, ka tsaya bomme as a constituency, bomme ba more than 50 per cent ya population ya Botswana. Mo go rayang gore totatota go tshwanetse go ka bo go na le Ministry of Gender.

Mme ke tsholofelo ya rona gore e tlaa re fa go ntse go kgaoganngwa di-ministry, nako e e tlang go tlaa nna le Ministry of Gender. Mme le gone, le fa e ka bo e le gore o tsentswe fa o tsentsweng teng leina la gender le utlwala, go ka bo go ntse le gone e le sengwe se se botoka. E seng mo e leng gore o a ne o e batla, o e batla o sukunyolola o sa itse gore a o e fitlhela ka fa tlane ga bo Prisons, kana Immigration. Ke selo se se utlwisang bothoko tota gore e bo e rile go kgaoganngwa ra seka ra bona go na le ministry o o amang bomme.

MR MAOTO: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke leboga le Mothusa Tona jaaka fa a mphile sebaka sa gore gongwe ke kope tlhaloso e. Mothusa Tona mokaulengwe fa a bua a re gender ga e reye bomme, mme go tsweng foo o re dipalo tsa bomme tse a reng di feta 50 per cent of the population. Jaanong ke ne ke re o nyalanya jang dilo tse pedi tse, fa e le gore tota se a se buang ga se se se amang bomme ba le nosi.

Ke a leboga.

MRS MBAAKANYI: Ga go tlhokafale gore ke di amanye ka tsela epe, se se bothlokwa re bua ka gore gender, kana bontsi jwa batho fa go buiwa ka gender ba tsaya gore go buiwa ka bomme fela. Mme jaanong kgang yame ke gore le fa gender e tsenya borre le bomme, mme bomme ba bantsi. In population ya Botswana a o bua ka basha bomme ba
ntse ba bantsi, a o bua ka bagolo, a o bua ka batsofe, bomme ba ntse ba bantsi. Jaanong go botlhokwa gore go nne le Ministry of Gender ka gore tota ga e kake ya re e le constituency e e ntseng jalo, e bo e le gore e ka re re tsaya fela gore ke ba go ka paselelwang ka bone.

Ke batla go go leboga Tona wa Finance, o ne o bua ka unemployment e bile o bo o bua gore e fokotsegile from 21.5 to 17.6. Seo se ntse se supa maikaelelo a puso ya ga Domkraga mo go reng a batho ba bone ditiro, a batho ba bone go itshetsa, a batho ba kgone gore ba ipelege ba seka ba ikaega fela ka atlhma ke go jese, ba fiwe ke goromente. Mme re lebogela gore re bo re bona selo seo ka gore phokotsego ya unemployment e supa gore maikaelelo mangwe a teng, jaaka o setse o supile rrna ka gore gompieno go bo go na le fund ya the young farmers e ke bonang gore ke mogopolo o montle thata.

Mme ke solofela gore e tlaa re nako e e tlang, go nne le fund e e leng gore ga e lebelele ba Agriculture fela, go nne le fund e e leng gore e tlaa lebelela basha. Ke a itse gore di teng mme madinyana a teng a nna a le manyennyane, mme re a kopa gore a go nne jalo ka gore re bona gore migration e ntsi e e tlang ko ditoropong. Batho ba ba senang ditiro segolobogolo basha ba tla ko ditoropong, mme dilo tse ba ka di dirang mo ditoropong mo, ga di dintsi jaaka ko magaeng ka gore, ga gona lefatshe le ba ka dirang ditiro tse tsa temo-thuo mo go tsone.

Jaanong re solofela gore mo ke tshimologo mme e tlaa re nako e ntse e tsamaya re bone go ntse go tokafala. Mme maikaelelo a party ya ga Domkraga bagaetsho re a a bona ka go nna ba lekela basha. Ke gantsi o utlwa gotwe Ministry of Education le rutile bana jaanong ke ba ba tsamaya mo strateng, ga ba na meberekho. Mme kana se re tshwanetseng gore re se tlhaloganye bagaetsho ke gore, education e rutela the whole economy. Mongwe le
mongwe wa rona o tshwanetse gore a tseye maikemisetso a gore ngwana yole fa a sena go nna a rutiwa, ke mo tsenya mo tirong efe ke mo sukunyetsa fa kae. A ke private sector, a ke goromente, ke maikemisetso a mongwe le mongwe wa rona. Le rona re le Mapalamente le Makhangelara re tshwanetse gore re bone gore re thusa jang gore bana bale ba ba rutilweng, ba tshwanetse gore ba tsene mo ditirong.

Gompieno jaana ke bua, le fa e le gore totatota responsibility ya Ministry of Education ke go ruta, re dirile di guidelines re bona sone sa gore bontsi jwa bana ga ba kgone gore ba bone mebereko. Re dirile lenaneo la gore bana ba e leng gore ba ka bona mebereko ko ntle ga Botswana, ba kgona gore ba tle ko education ba tle go gololwa gore o ka nna wa tsamaya wa ya go bereka ko lefatsheng le sele, fa e le gore you are in the area e e leng gore gongwe ga e thokiwe mo Botswana. Ke itse gore bana ba bantsi-ntsi ba teng ba ba boneng tiro ko bo South Africa, ba bone ditiro kae; mme se ba se thokang fela ke gore ba tle ko Ministry of Education, ba e ko Student Placement ba tlaa bo ba feta ba gololwa koo ka gore ba kolota goromente. Sa bone fela ke go eta ba re ke bone tiro ko bokete, mme ke tlaa tla ke le duela madi a jaana le jaana, that is all. Ba bo ba tsamaya ba ya go bereka ka gore re itse gore fa ba tsamaya ba ya mafatsheng a mangwe, ba ka tla ka experience e e leng gore lefatsheng le tlaa tla le e sola molemo.

Se sengwe se ke se lebogelang ke ditlhabologo tse re di bonang le di isa ko dikgaolong. Re bona metlakase e isiwa, gompieno metse e le 100 e tlaa bo e bona motlakase. Re bona metsi a isiwa, metse e mentsi e setse e le motobetso. Rona fa re gola e ne e le gore go rwalwa ditanluku gore o tle o kgone go bona metsi le gone o tsamaya mosepele o moleele. Mme re bona ditlhabologo tse di isiwa ko bathong. Nna ke ne ke kopa gore a ditlhabologo tse di seka tsa ya fela ko dikgaolong, a le ditoropo le tsone di nne di nna le
ditlhabologo. Ke buiisiwa jaana ke gore jaaka ke ne ke bua, bontsi jwa batho ba tla ko ditoropong.

Gompieno fa o tsaya toropo e tshwana le Lobatse, ga e sa tlhole e gola, population ya teng e sa ntse e le fa go 30,000. Batho ba a fuduga ba tla ko bo Gaborone mme fa e ne e le gore e a re re ntse re tlhabolola dikgaolo jaaka re ntse re tlhabolola, e bo e le gore tse di ntseng di tlhabologile le tsone re tswelele le tsone re ntse re di tlhabolola. Jaaka mongwe a ne a bua a ntse a re, a e re re tlhabolola metse e mengwe, re seka ra lebala metse e e neng e ntse e tlhabologile go le pele jaaka Mokaulengwe Mooka a ne a bua. Mme nna ke ne ke re a re seka ra lebala le ditoropo ka gore ke gone ko batho ba yang teng ba ya go batla ditiro. Jaanong fa re tlhabolola ntlha e le nngwe fela re bolaya ntlha e nngwe. Mme ke batla go go leboga rra ka budget e o e bang ka gore budget ya teng, e a re thusa gore re seka fela ra lebelela batho ba ba itekanetseng, re tshwanetse gore re kgone go lebelela le bone ba ba nang le bogole ka gore gompieno fa o tla go lebelela budget ya rona, e re e kgona gore re agele batho ba ba nang le bogole di-facility, fa o ya ko Tlokweng gompieno o ya go bona manobonobo a le o a bona gore tota go tsweletswe mo Botswana.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR. NASHA). Ke kopa tlahaloso. Ke ne ke re a Mokaulengwe yo o buang fa morago game fa, a gone o ka netefatsa mo Ntlong e e boitshepo e gore the quality of debate ko Lobatse ke yone e a e dirang e?

MRS MBAAKANYI: Mma o tlhotse o iponetse, ga e tlhokane le gore motha a e bue, le e iponetse gore ke e e ntseng jang.

Ke ne ke sa ntse ke bua ka gore batho ba ba nang le bogole le bone ba tlhokana le thuso ya rona mme ke e bona ka madi fa ba ntse ba fiwa. Ke sa ntse ke bua gore sponsorship for tertiary education, go na le madi fela a a beilweng ka fa thoko. Ke gore bana ba ba nang
le bogole are *sponsored* le bone. Mme mo godimo ga moo go na le a a beetsweng fa thoko gore a re a beela ba e leng gore, ga ba a kgona gore ba ka tsena fela jaaka bana ba bangwe.

Jaanong a re lekeng, re rotloetseng batsadi re le Mapalamente gore a bana ba le bone ba tle ko pele ba rutege ka gore ga go reye gore fa motho a na le bogole, ga a kake a kgona go itirela sepe. Ke sone se re se buang gore e tlaa re ka moso le bone ba bo ba ikemetse ka bonosi. Mme selo se sa gore re bo re tlhokomela batho ba ba nang le bogole, re se bona jaaka e le gore ko di-*primary school* ka di-*region*, go setse go na le dikole tse gotweng tse ke tsa batho ba ba nang le bogole, tse ke tsa batho ba ba nang le bogole jo bo ntseng jang. Go tsweng foo mo *community junior* le gone go dirwa jalo. *Senior secondary*, bo Gaborone Technical College fa o ya teng go na le bana ba e leng gore ba na le bogole.

Jaanong go mo go rona gore a re rotloetseng batsadi gore a bana ba le bone, re ba bone ba tsena mo dikoleng.

Ke batla go tsaya sebaka se gore ke akgole ba Lephata la *Local Government* ka go nna le lephata la Department of Local Government Technical Services. Lephata le le tsile go ba thusa gore ba kgone *to implement* di-*project* tsa bone. Mme nna fa ke lebelela *Minister wa Finance*, ke kopa gore a e re maphata a mangwe le bone segolo-bogolo ba ba tshwanang le bo *Education*, ba e leng gore ba fiwa madi a mantsi gore ba dire diporojeke. A ba dumelelwe gore ba nne le maphata a a tshwanang le lone le le dirilweng ke ba *Local Government* ka gore, fa re na le lone le tlaa re thusa dikago tse e leng gore di makgasa.

Mongwe le mongwe wa lona o a itse gore dikago tsa rona tsa dikole di makgasa, ga re kgone *to maintain them* ka lone lebaka la gore ga gona *capacity* ya go dira jalo. Mme fa re na le lephata le le tshwanang le lone le, le tlaa thusa gore *maintenance* wa dikago tse di
setseng di le teng o diragale. Tse dintsha ka gore ngwaga le ngwaga re fiwa dikago tse
dintsha, gompieno re filwe a second university, re aga di-community junior secondary
school, re aga senior secondary schools, dilo tse tsotlhe tse di batla gore go bo go na le
lephata le le itebagantseng le tiro e e ntseng jalo. Ka gore fa o tla go lebelela gompieno,
Local Government e filwe P999 million mo development estimates, education e filwe
P584 million. Ke madi a mantsi a e leng gore a tlhokana le gore go bo go na le lephata.
Mme re lebogela gore gone go bo go dumetswe gore a boipelego e itebaganye le tiro e.
Mme fa e ka nonotshiwa ke selo se re se lebogelang thata Tona.

MRS MBAAKANYI: …Ke madi a mantsi a e leng gore a tlhokana gore go bo go na le
lephata. Mme re lebogela gore gone go bo go dumetswe gore a boipelego e itebaganye le
tiro e. Mme fa e ka nonotshiwa, ke selo se re se lebogelang thata, Tona, jaaka o setse o
supile.

Ka mafoko a a kalo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ke a leboga e bile ke ema
nokeng budget e, e e nonofileng, e e supang ka boammaaruri gore go na le kwa re yang
teng and we are focussed. Mme e bile le maitlamo a rona a Domkraga a a diragala ka
dinako tsotlhe. Ke a go leboga, mma.

MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR SWARTZ): Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa
Palamente, mma le nna ke go leboge. Mme le nna ke simolola ka go supa fa ke dumalana
le mafoko a ga Motlotlegi Gaolathe. Re dumalana le ene re re kana mme ke gone jaaka a
ne a baya thomo ya ga Domkraga ya administration ya ga Tautona Mogae. Rra, mafoko a
rona o a beile sentle.

Ke batla go simolola ke dumalana le Motlotlegi ka Paragraph 2, gore fa re ka e bala
sentle ra e tlhaloganya, mme Batlotlegi rotlhe ntlheng tsotlhe tsa Ntlo e, molaetsa one o o
tswang fa, kopo e e dirwang fa ra e diragatsa, Batswana re ne re ka bona ba sutelela ba ya
golo gongwe. Kana Motlotlegi fa a re, kgwetlho e tona e re lebaganyeng le yone ke ya
 gore re iteisanye le ba mafatshefatshe ka tse re di dirang *(to be internationally
competitive)*. Ke se se buiwang mo temaneng e ya bobedi e. Bagaetsho, kana e ya re fa
batho ba bua, jaaka maloba bangwe ba ne ba bua e re Motlotlegi Re Merafhe a araba
dingwe tsa dikgang tse, go bo go twee ga a bue sentle, go a gakgamatsa batho ba bua ba re
sengwe se tshwanetse sa dirwa ka gore tse di leng teng tse, ga di re ise gope. Mme
jaanong Motlotlegi Gaolathe e re a ema a re, se re tshwanetseng ra se dira ke gore mo
ditirong tsotlhe tse re di dirang, a re nne *internationally competitive*. Gone moo fela ka
bogone ke sengwe se se ka re isang golo gongwe. Bagaetsho, Rraetsho Motlotlegi
Gaolathe a re, ditiro *(goods and services)* le tsotlhe tse re di dirang, di tshwanetse tsone
ka botsone tsa ipatlela mmaraka. Jaanong, bagaetsho, fa e le gore re tlaa letlelela gore
Batswana e re fa re bona tse re di dirang *standard* sa tsone se le kwa tlase, re bo re sa ba
bolelele gore gongwe se le tshwanetseng la se dira pele ke gore le tsholetse seemo
*(standard)* sa tse re di dirang, mme re bo re tla go supa goromente ka monwana gore gone
le fa o ntsha madi, ngogola o ne o ntshitse P5.8 *billion* gompieno o ya go ntsha P7.6
*billion*. Madi a a ntse a a oketsega mme, bagaetsho, tse re di dirang tsone ga di kgatlhe
ope, le rona tota ga di re kgatlhe. Sengwe se re reng se dirwe se, ke sone se, re tshwanetse
ra bolelela Batswana gore tse re di dirang, a tsone ka botsone di ipatlele mmaraka ka gore
di tlaa kgatlha batho. Tse re di dirang *should have an appeal, and a wider appeal for that
matter*, e seng fela mo Botswana ka gore tsone fa dikgatlha, bagaetsho, di tlaa ipapatsa ka
botsone. Mme sa botlhokwa go di feta tsotlhe le fa ke se buile, ke sone seemo *(the
standard)* bagaetsho. Fa re dira morogo mo Botswana o ya kwa South Africa, o
tshwanetse o fete o lekane le merogo ya gone koo. Sengwe le sengwe se re se dirang se tshwanetse se lekane le se se dirwang go tswa koo kampo se se gaisi. Mme fa re dira jaana, phoso e gape re e dirang ke gore e kete jaanong fa re tla mo go tse re leba bagwebi ba ba tswang kwa ntle gore ke bone ba ba tshwanetseng ba dira dilo tsa seemo se ke buang ka sone se. Batswana bone goromente a ba utlwele bothhoko. Jaanong fa re ka nna le mowa one o, Batswana ba tlaa nna ba le gone foo go ya go ile. Jaanong, nna ke ne ke kopa gore rotlhe Mapalamente ka kwano le ka kwa, re bue ka lentswe le le lengwe fela la gore dilo tse re di dirang a di kgatlhe, di nne mo seemong sa gore di rekiisiwe le kwa ntle. Kgang ya dimmaraka, batho ba bua ba re mebaraka ga e yo, batho fa ba dira ba tlaa ya go rekisa kae. Gape fa go sa dirwa ditsela tse di yang kwa masimong batho ba tlaa rekisa kae. Ditsela ka botsone fela ga se tsone tse di tlaa dirang mebaraka. Se se tlaa dirang gore mebaraka e nne teng ke sone se re se dirang jaaka ke sa tswa go bua. Mme jaanong ke batla go le bontsha gore mebaraka mo Botswana e teng. Maloba fa Motlotlegi Nagafela a bua, ke ne ka mo raya ka re, kana mo Botswana fa re tla mo temong, lefatse le le ka lengwang is around 300,000 hectares. Jaanong, palo e e siameng ke 335,000 hectares. Ke lefatse le le teng le le nang le beng le bone mme le sa dirisiwe. Of this 335,000 hectares, 25,000 hectares ke ya commercial e e kwa Pandamatenga ka gore ke yone e e leng gore we classify it as commercial. Jaanong, 310,000 hectares ke lefatse le le teng le le ka lengwang mme le sa lengwe. Re ka bua ka gore gongwe mabaka ke dipula tse di sa neng, leuba le le mo Botswana le. Mme a re tlhamalale fa e le leuba, re bue ka leuba gore re kgorelediwa ke leuba mme re rotoetsa Batswana. Fa ke ne ke bua ka mebaraka e ke reng e teng mo Botswana, fa o tsaya lethoko la dijo ka ngwaga, dijo tse di tshwanang le mmidi le dinawa, ke gore cereals, our national demand mo ngwageng is 200,133 metric
tonnes. Mme tsone dilo tse, bagaetsho, ke batla go supa gore mmaraka o teng gone mo
gae fa re ne re ka tlhwaafala. Se re kgonang go se dira mo gae mo Botswana mo, mo
nageng yone e ke ntseng ke e bua e ya 335,000 hectares, we only produce 10 per cent ya
se re se tlhokang. Mme go bo go raya gore tse re di rekang kwa ntle ka ngwaga, fa re
tsaya ngwaga wa 2005/2006, tse re neng ra di reka kwa ntle go tla to supplement gore re
se ka ra bolawa ke tlala, dilo tse di ne tsa re lopa re le lefatshe madi a a ka tshwarang
P176 million. Jaanong fa re bua ka mmaraka madi one a a le teng a, a re a dirisang go
reka kwa ntle, kana fa re ne re ka leka ra oketsa 10 per cent gongwe ra mo dira 50 per
cent, re ya go fokotsa P176 million yo ka selekanyo se re se dirileng.
Jaanong, ka gore ke na le dintlhanyana tse di ntsinyana tse ke di dirang, ke kopa gore ke
ko ke tlogelwe ke fetse ke tle ke bue le tse ke batlang go di bua ka gore tse dingwe ke tlaa
tla ke di bodiwa fa ke bua ka Ministry of Agriculture.

MR MOKGWATHI: Ke kopa tlhaloso e khutshwanyane fela. Ke a leboga, Tona wa tsa
Temo-thuo. Ke ne ke re, gongwe o ka re o ntse o tsweletse, ke na le kgatlhego thata mo
go se o se buang, o supe gore are we under-utilising the potential e re nang nayo in
agricultural production?

MR SWARTZ: Rraetsho, I would say yes. Fa ke sa ntse ke bua ke dumela gore ke tlaa
go araba ka botlalo mo dintlheng tse di tlaa tlang morago. Yes, we are under-utilising the
potential.

Fa re bua ka tsa horticulture, mo Botswana our national demand ya horticultural produce
mo ngwageng e setse e sa tswa go feta 70,300 metric tonnes. Mme yone e botoka mo
Botswana ka gore batho ba le bantsi ba eme ka dinao. Yone we are already producing
selekanyo sa 30,700 metric tonnes, which is 44 per cent. Mme jaanong fa godimo ga foo,
to supplement the shortfall gore re reke re se ka ra tlhaelelw ga kgakala, fa o tsaya ngwaga wa 2004/2005 ka gore e rile fa re leba ra fitlhela e le tsone dipalo tse di neng di feleletse sentle, re dirisitse madi a a tshwarang P170 million go reka kwa ntle fa godimo ga se re se dirileng, 44 per cent yo re mo dirang mo Botswana. Fa go ntse go twe mebaraka ga e yo, mebaraka e teng within the country. Mme kana re tshwanetse ra itse gore we strive first to satisfy the local demand and then do exports. Jaanong, mebaraka e teng, bagaetsho. Mma ke le fe e e sa tswang go nna teng e e tlhagogang mo Botswana, tsina ya dinotshe (honey).

Yone ka ngwaga demand mo Botswana ke 39 metric tonnes. Mme, bagaetsho, re dira 7.3 tonnes fela, that is 19 per cent. So, the potential is there. Jaanong, fa re bua ka go dira dinotshe, ga re re o ye go batla lefatse le le ntsintsi o le leme kana o le reng, ra re reka di box o tsenye dinotshe mo teng o di ruele mo jarateng. Mme the shortfall ka 2005 jaana, madi a re a dirisitseng go reka kwa ntle was P5.7 million. So, fa re bua ka mmara ka, bagaetsho, dilo tse di teng gongwe ga re le di neele ka fa re tshwanetseng ra dira ka teng.

Mme gape go supa gore le lona fa le ne le ka ema la batla information e, e teng, gore e tle e re fa le bua, ka ba bangwe fa ba bua ba re le bapise le bolele gore lona le ne le ka dira jang (ka nna legale ga ke bue mafoko ao), dipalo-palo tse ke di buang tse, le bo le na le tsone. Bagaetsho, dilo tse di teng.

Ke tswelela ke bue ka tse dingwe ka gore tse ke di buang tse e ne e le tsa ka fa temong jaanong ke bua ka tsa leruo. Our national demand when it comes to milk, mashi fela a re a a nwang not other bye-products, ke 12 million litres ka ngwaga. Mme rona mo Botswana we produce 50 per cent of the 12 million litres. Madi a re a dirisang go reka ke madi fela a a tsamaelang P8 million ka ngwaga. So, batho ba sa ntse ba ka dira mashi, ba a a rekisa mo Botswana. Ke tlaa le bolelela fa re tla mo go tsa Ministry of Agriculture gore mme re
Monday 12 February 2007

leka go le kae go iphatlalatsa le naga e ya lefatshe go nna le pilot farmers, dairy farmers and so on.

Dikoko kana re le boleletse gore tsone we are self-sufficient, dikoko tsa nama le go di tsadisa. Jaanong selekanyo sa nama ya dikoko e re e jang ka ngwaga, ka gore tsone ke tse re nang le tsone mo gae, re a itse, dipalo tse tsone we are as accurate as we can, 65,000 metric tonnes ya nama ya koko e re e jang ka ngwaga re e produsa 100 per cent mo Botswana. Kgwebo yone e is over P1 billion. Mae, our national demand is 7.4 million dozens. Mme tsone di dozen tse, re di dira locally 100 per cent. Ke kgwebo ya P69 million ka ngwaga.

Jaanong ya bofelo re ka bua ka dikolobe le dilo tse di ntsintsi, ga go tlhokafale, ke tloga ke le diela nako.

This information I will avail to you, Honourable Members. Jaanong ke sone se ke neng ke re bagaetsho, fa e re re bua re bo re re, ka go sena ditsela kwa masimong, dilo tse ga di ka ke tsa kgonagala, nnyaa, a re bueng le Batswana ba eme ka dinao ba dire mo go bonalang. Ke batla go bua go le gonnye ka the Youth Fund, which is on Paragraph 37, Madam Speaker. O itse gore batho; le nkutlwe gore ka reng ga ke re Ma-Front ga ke re Ma-BCP, ka re batho ba ba nang le mokgwa wa kganetso ba a gakgamatsa. I find them very amazing, batho ba ba a kgatlha ka gore, rona maikaelelo a rona re le goromente re dumalana le bone le lona ra re, temo ke selo se se se tswelelang (renewable). Mme my understanding of temo being renewable, ga go reye fela gore fa pula e na ngwaga o o tlang, o lema, dithotse di bo di tswa, o bo o roba. Ga go felele foo, go kgonafala fa le bone batho (the human resource) side le bone go ka tswelela. Jaanong mo bo gompienong matshwenyego a rona re le goromente ke gore, banana ga ba yo mo temong ke bagolo
fela, *an average age* ya bagolo ba ba mo temong ke 56. Ke batho ba e leng gore ba gaufi le go re laela. Ke batho ba ba gaufi le go laela lefatshe le la Botswana. Jaanong fa re bua ka gore temo *is renewable* ga re reye fela tse di mo tshimong, re raya le bone batho. Jaanong mme gape fela jaaka dilo tse dingwe tse tsothle tse, go batla *experience*. Jaanong fa o re batho ba tlogelwe ba ye kwa diofising ka gore ke banana e tle e re fa ba tsofetseng teng ke gone ba bo ba ka ya kwa temo-thuong, ba sena *that experience*. Bagaetsho, gape re itse gore temo-thuo e tlhoka *energy*. Ga e dirwe fela ke motho tota a setse a feletswe ke maatla. Jaanong ke one maikaelelo a ga goromente gore e nne *renewable* ka fa re e batlang ka teng, ka fa re dumelang ka teng mme e se ka ya nna fela kwa dikgomong ka gore di tlaa tsala, kwa masimong re tlaa lema. Bone ba ba dirang gore go diragale le bone ba tshwanetse ba nna teng ga tswelela, bagaetsho. Ke sone se ke neng ke re re le goromente kgang e *we approach it from this angle*.

Jaanong maloba e ne ya re fa ke le kwa kgaalong ke reeditse *radio*, batho ba re, a bagolo ba ye temong ba tswe kwa diofising, banana ba ye kwa diofising. Wa itse ka gakgamala jaaka o utlwa ke re, batho ba ba nang le mowa wa kganetso *I find them very amazing*. O itse gore ba a kgatlha. Ke gore o sala o gakgametse. Jaanong mme bagaetsho, tota se ke one maikaelelo a ga goromente gore temo le yone e tswelele e se ka ya nna le *these breaks* fa gare.

Kgang e ke batlang go leboga gape ka yone ke ya gore *Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) is being reviewed; Paragraph 36*. Ke mogopolo o montle, bagaetsho. Ke mogopolo o montle ka gore fa o tsere *two million* Pula e le kadimo le fa e ka bo e le *at seven per cent* yo go tweng ke *seven per cent* yo re mo fang Botswana, tota fela fa o duela mo dingwageng tse *seven* o ne o simolola go bokete. Jaanong re dumela
gore tsone dilo tse ke tsone tse e leng gore Tona o re bolelela fa a re o ya go di seka-seka. Fa dinako tsone tse di ka okediwa bagaetsho, go ka re thusa fela thata. Mme e bile gongwe kgang e fa e ne e tsile go le pele motion wa ka moso wa ga Motlotlegi Mokgwathi, gongwe le go tlhokafala o ka bo o ne o sa tlhokafale ka gore madi e ne e tlaa bo e le one a re a dirisang gone fa.

Bagaetsho dilo tse dingwe tse ke batlang go bua ka tsone; fa di buiwa re bo re di itlhokomolosa re sa bue ka tsone re le Mapalamante, o fitlhela e kete ke tsa batswakwa fela. Botswana Stock Exchange mo go Paragraph 40, Motlotlegi Gaolathe o re bolelela kafa e golang ka teng. Bagaetsho, a re emeng rotlhe re gakolole Batswana go reka diabe tse. O itse gore fa o ne o ka leba ka gore nna ke a di leba maitseboa le maitseboa mo dikgannyeng ka fa di golang ka teng, go na le ba CIC ba Mmamabula. Two weeks ago e ne e le gore share ya teng ke P50, gompieno di tsamaya kwa go P83; two weeks. Mme ka fa ke bonang ka teng go tlaa nna go ntse go gola fela. Mme tse tsotlhe tse di mo Botswana Stock Exchange fa o di leba le mo dipamping, ga ke itse gore gapedi, gararo ka beke o bona e le tse di golang fela. Jaanong mme fa e le gore o ka reka 100 shares e re o na le madinyana o bo o ya go reka tsa Chobe at P1.30 some three weeks ago, gompieno di tsamaya kwa go three Pula o bona gore go ntse go gola fela. Jaanong bagaetsho, nna ke ne ke re tsone dilo tse, re tshwanetse ra di bolelela Batswana e seng fela gore ba fiwe madi ke goromente. Gore madi a le nang le one le lona bagaetsho, go akanya ka moso, a re direng tsone dilo tse.

Bagaetsho, kgang ya implementation ka gore ke bona e kete nako e ntlogetse, nna le nna e a ntshwenya. Nna ke motho yo ke buang le babereki ba Ministry wa me thata, at least gangwe ka kgwedi. Ke ne ke ba raya ke re kana ga tse go na le selo se go tweng political
**Monday 12 February 2007**

*statement and political will,* jaanong a ko le mpharologanyetseng lona gore *statement* ke fa go le fa kae *will* ke fa go le fa kae. Yo mongwe a re *the statement is when you go to Parliament* Rre Gaolathe *presenting budget* le bo le e dumela, *that is a political statement* gore re ya go ntsha madi. *Political will comes with implementation.* Jaanong ke ba raya ke re mme fa go ntse jaana, *statement* mme *rightly* ka fa re tsamaisang goromente yo wa rona ka teng, se mo go bo mang, *the will* e mo go bomang? Ke bo ke ba tshwere. Ka gore *implementation largely is being there.* Fa e sa le fela foo nako le nako fela fa re tsena mo *meeting* ka re, rona *we have made the statement* bagaetsho re batla *the will.* *Will* re tsamaya fa kae? Jaanong mme gape ke ne ka ba bolelela go le mosong ka gore re tshwara diphuthego tsa rona tse dingwe mo mosong ka ba raya ka re, le itse gore ke eng bagaetsho, phoso e re e dirang re le Batswana ke gore lefatshe le la Botswana *is a good country,* ke lefatshe le le lentle thata. Gongwe le lentle jalo ka gore le sa ntse le eteletswe pele ke Domkrag; ke ba bolelela ke sa tshabe go bua le bone e le badirelapuso. Ke ba raya ke re re le goromente wa ga Domkrag ga re itse ope go dumalana le phathi epe e a e batlang. Fela fa o le modiredi ra re, a go nne mo pelong ya gago. Mme jaanong fa e le gore o hiriile o modireli, e re fa o theogela phakela *give it your best.* Jaanong go na le ba e leng gore ba tla fa; ke gore ba tsere mofago ba emetse tsa bone gore gongwe e tle e re ka nako ngwe di tle di tsene mo pusong. Mme jaanong ke ne ke ba raya ke re fa le dira jalo, le tsietsa Batswana. Ke *corruption, fraud, give it all the names you want to.* Ga le dire sentle ba le dirang jalo. Mme ke a leboga ka gore nna ke bua le bone. Ke dumela gore nna le bone re a utlwana mme e bile ba simolola go dira ba tlhwaaafetse.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Two minutes.
MR SWARTZ: Kgang ya Botswana Meat Commission (BMC). Ke tlaa tlola tse dingwe. Botswana Meat Commission prices di siame. Bangwe ba buile fa maloba ba re 200 kilograms CDM re tsietsa Batswana; no ways. Kwa Namibia le South Africa bone ba eleng gore we benchmark mo go bone, CDM ya bone e tsamaya kwa go bo 260 kilograms. A re tlogele South Africa ka gore ga twe ba a tle ba kente dingwe tse di oketsang dinama, re tseye Namibia kwa e leng gore ga ba dire thata teng. Ba tsamaya kwa go bo 230 kilograms dikgomo tse di tswang mo merakeng. Gone gompieno jaana kwa Gantsi go na le batho ba e leng gore 200 kilograms; tsony tse dinnye at weaner level ba a mo feta. Jaanong ke yone kgang e ke neng ke e bua ke re bagaetsho, a re tlogeleng gore e re fa Batswana ba lela ba re ga re kgone 200 kilograms re bo re lela le bone, a re ba boleleleng gore tokafatsang seebogile. That is what we need to tell Batswana. BMC e na le mananeo a e leng gore fa o na le dikgomo tsony tseo, a di 50 kana di 10, o batla gore o tle o ye go di rekisetsa BMC o buisanya le bone ba go fa madi a gore o reke dijo, feed these cattle for three to four months. Ga ke re ke gone go tokafatsa CDM. Mananeo a, a teng kwa BMC for individuals and feed lotters. It is for us re le Mapalamente go ya go bolelela batho. Ke lebogile, mma.

MINISTER OF MINERALS, ENERGY AND WATER RESOURCES (MR KEDIKILWE): Ke a leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mmaetsho, a ke simolole ka thulaganyo e ncha morago ga tsheka-tsheko ya temo-thuo. Ke lebogele thata goromente yo gore ba ba nthomileng le ba bangwe ba itumeletse thata thulaganyo e ba bona bontlentle ja yone, segolo bogolo ka gore ga ba a bolo go e nyorelwa, thulaganyo ya Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP). Re e lebogela gape le gore mokaulengwe o tsibogetsa gore go na le dingwe tse di ka tokafadiwang. E re le mororo go
tokafaditswe e le thulaganyo e ncha, mme gape o tsiogotse gore go na le dingwe tse di ka tokafadisiwang mo go yone e ncha e. O ntse o di tsere mhago o ntse o di tsaya mhago. Kana mo go Paragraph 53 go buiwa ka yone gore madi a yone ke P135 million, mme ka ngwaga go tlaa bo go dirisiwa P50 million. Go raya gore ngwaga one o re o lebileng wa madi 2007/2008 go tlaa bo go dirisiwa P50 million. E re le mororo e le thulaganyo e ntlentle e re nang le tsholofelo e ntsi mo go yone, kana se se a bong se tshwenya gompieno ke gore maru re rile re a lelala re re nkgo o tshotseng eng, tota go lebega gompieno re tlaa nna mo mathateng a leuba. Mme le gale ka kwa dikgomong, ga re ise re tlhoboge thata ka gore fa marunyana a ka kgwa mathe gongwe di ka nna tsa bona botshelo. Ko re a bong jaanong re bona e kete go tlaa nna mathata ke gone ka ko temong. Mme ka gore seo tota ga go na ope yo o ka dirang sepe ka ga sone, sa rona e ka nna fela mo tsholofelong.

Rona mathata a re a bong re le mo go one le mororo thulaganyo e e le ntlentle, fa re a bo re setse re lemile sengwenyana le mororo re ka bo re se re dirise yone, ditlou di a bo di setse di supuditse. Batho ba bo ba setse ba tsenywe ke boitlhobogo, ke selelo fela le khuranyo ya meno. Mme ke tsaya gore go tlaa nna go lekwa tse di ka lekwang gore re thuse gore nnaare ditlou tse di senyang bontlentle jo bo kana jo bo setseng bo dirilwe, jo bo tsweletseng bo dirwa, tota re ka dirang ka tsone. Tsone tota di a senya thata, di bo di kgobe batho marapo boemong ja gore ba ka bo ba ntse ba nonofela pele, e re dithuso tse di tla jaana e bo e le sengwe se se ka ba sologelang molemo.

Sengwe se ke itseng gore Tona le sone o se etse tlhoko o tlaa se seka-seka ke gore, thulaganyo e ntlentle e fa bone balemisi le bakenti ba sa ka ke ba okediwa, e seng go ba oketsa palo fela, le go ba oketsa kitso ya bone le nonofo ya go thusa batho ka botlalo, tota
tema ya rona ga e ka ke ya nna epe e e kalo-kalo. Se sengwe ke sone se ba ka tsamayang ka sone ka gore ka fa re badileng ka teng, ka fa e rotloetsang ka teng bakenti le balemisi ba tshwanetse gore ba eme ka dinao gore nako yotlhle ba bo ba ntse ba ya go tlhatlhoba masimo ba se ka ba ba diega go ya go tlhatlhoba gore a bone ba ba tsereng dithuso tse a ba di dirisa ka botlalo. Mme fa go sena se ba ka tsamayang ka sone, se ba ka fefogang ka sone ka gore re itse gore maota ga a nnelana, mme go bo go raya gore ke sengwe se ke itseng gore, Rraetsho Tona o ntse o a se seka-seka.

Sengwe se se bokete se se tlaa ketefalelang batho se ba se ba kgoreletsa se ba kgoba marapo, ke tsone dikgomo tsa rona. Dikgomo tsa rona di a senya mo masimo. Fa ke re tsa rona ke raya tsa bone Batswana ba ba lelang. Fa gongwe ba senyediwa ke ba bangwe, fa gongwe ba senyediwa ke tsone tsa matimela. Se se tona fela ke gore tlhokomelo ya dikgomo ga e sa tlhola e ntse jaaka fa e ne e ntse pele, mme go bo go raya gore tsone dithulaganyo tse dintlentle tse, jaanong re tlaa nna le poela morago.

Sengwe se se ketefalelang balemi le fa dithuso tse di le kana-kana e bile di le dintle mo go kana-kana, ga go sa tlhola go sireletsegile kwa masimo, batho ba a boifa ba a tshaba. Bangwe ba ba ba tshabang ke bone ba baagisanyi.

Mme ga ke dumele gore a ke bone fela, ke be ke belaela gore bangwe ba rona mono, le bone ba pota poo ka letshwagole la gore go na le bone baagisanyi, jaanong le bone ba bo ba tsena mo temeng ya go senya.

Mme batho ba a boifa gompieno. E ya re mo maitseboeng ba bo ba tswa ko magoleng ba boela ko gae, go raya gore ba tlogela dijwalo tsa bone, ba tlogela sengwe le sengwe. Go bo go raya gore, bao le bone ba sala ba dira go rata le go bona. Ke re selo se ke dingwe tse
di ya bong di tlaa kgorelets'a. Mme ke solofela gore Rraetsho Tona re nne re mo itsise a bone gore o ka thusa ka sebopego se se ntseng jang.

Nngwe tema e e tsamaelanang le paragraph 53 ke ya bo mmaboipelelo. Kana go na le kgang ya gore fa go twe motho a bo a na le dikgomo tsa palo e e bêilwêng, masone a mabedi, a bo a sa amogele go fêta P20 000 ka ngwaga, go bo go raya gore, go nna le bangwe ba ba tshwanetseng se sekaseka. Mme bakenti le balemisi ga ba ka ke ba dia ba le bosî ka gore, ba tshwanetse gore ba thusiwe ke a solofela, ke bo mmaboipelelo. Bommaboipelelo ba a ba thêlaela fela ka sebopego se se ngomolang pelo. Mme go raya gore dîlo tse tsotlhe, ke tsaya gore bakaulengwe re a di itse, re tlaa leka go di lomaganya gore di seka tsa tloga tsa re senyetsa bontle jo re tshwanetseg go bo dira, bontle jo re bo dirang.

Ke ama paragraph 53 e e buang ka dipalamo. Mmaetsho dipalamo ke selelo le khuranyo ya meno. Gona le batho ba ba filwêng ditsela tse go twêng ba tlaa tsamaya mo go tsone. Bo radibase le bo mmadibase go raya gore, metse e mengwe, segolo bogolo e e fa gare ga ko ba simololang teng, le ko ba emang teng, e mo mathateng ka gore ba a fetwa nako yotlhe. Ka gore bone bo radipalamo le bo mmadipalamo, ko ba tlaa bong ba simolola teng, ba leka go tlhotlhomisa gore ke bao fêla ba ba tlaa bong ba tswa gone fa ba simololang teng, ba bo ba ya go fologa ko ba emang teng.

A ke beye sekai; fa e le gore base e simolola ko Leralo, o leka go tlhomamisa gore e tlae pele ko Leralo, go bo go raya gore, ba ba tlaa bong ba pagama mo tseleg, a ke ba Maunatlala fa ba ya Selibe Phikwe, a ke ba bo Mogapi, kana ke ba bo Sefhophe; bao jaanong ba ya go fetwa foo. Ba tlhola fêla tsatsi lotlhe mo letsatsing ba bo ba tshabela mo go tsone dikoloi tse goromente a rotloetsang gore di seka tsa pagangwa, tsa beng ba tsone
tse o sa itseng gore o tla a le mo seemong se se ntseng jang. Ba bangwe ba nna foo gone mo maemelong a dibase tseo mo letsatsing le le kalokalo, ba nna mo mafifing, go bo go raya gore, ba nna le mathata a gore ba ka nna ba dirwa dilo tse di gakgamatsang.

Sengwe se ke batlang go tsena mo go sone mo **paragraph 71** ke *Self Help Housing Agency* (SHHA). SHHA batho ba a e eletsa, batho ba a e rata, mme ko dikgaolong di tshwana tsa rona, e bokete ka gore ba ba tshwanetseng gore ba e tsamaise, badirela puso, ba tlhaela ka sebopego se se utlwisang botlhoko. Fa modiredi a le esi, mme a lebagantswe le metse e le lesome le bosupa, metse e e sa nnelanang go raya gore, nnyaa, ke go ngaangaa fela, ke go tlolatlola fela. Kgantele go a twe o a palelwa, go bo go raya gore, ka o tlaa bo a palediswa ke one mabaka a a ntseng jalo, thulaganyo e ntle e re ka bong re solofela gore e tlaa thusa batho, jaanong e bo e sa ba thuse. E bo e kete re a tlhoboswa, mme fela tota e le gore, seemo ke sone se se nnang bokete.

Mme le yone dikakanyetso tsa yone di sa ntse di batla go betlwa sentle ka gore, metse e mengwe e ikopantse, e dira se go tweng di-*service center*. Mme ga go setse go tla go lejwa SHHA, boemong jwa gore go iwe ko go yone ka gore dipalo di dintsi jaaka ko bo Maokatuma, jaanong ba lejwa ka sengwe ka sengwe. Sengwe ka sengwe ke raya motse ka bongwe ka bongwe. Go bo go raya gore, thulaganyo ele e ntle ya Khansele, ya ga goromente, e go tweng re ikopanye kana metse e ikopanye, e dire di-*service center* gore ditshenyegelo tsa puso le tsa Khansele di ye ko tlase. Jaanong fa go tla mo dithulaganyong tse di ntseng jalo tsa bo SHAA, jaanong e a hularwa, go bo go raya gore tota ga re itirele sentle.

**Paragraph 72**, e bua ka dithulaganyo tsa *Land Board*. Ke lemoga sentlentle gore, go na le gore go sekasekwe, gone mo **paragraph** eo, gore go seka sekwe melawana yotlhe e e
amanang le tsamaiso ya lefatshe. Ke solofela gore re tlaa leba kgang e e tshwenyang ya go tsaya metlhaba mo dinokeng. Ke solofela gore re tlaa leba gape batho ba ba gwebang ka didiba tse go tulweng di tlaa bo di le mo masimo. Mme go raya gore ba kgoreletsa ba bangwe, e bile ke tsone gape dikgomo tse di gobokilweng di nna mo masimong go ka bo go nna maradu, tse di gobokilweng tsone tseo ke tsone tse gape di oketsang tshenyo mo masimo. Ke tsaya gore molao wa lefatshe, le taolo ya leruo, go balelwa le molao wa Agricultural Resources Act o e leng one o tshwanetseng go laola palo ya leruo mo thotong, tseo tsotlhe di tlaa lejwa go sa lejwe fela o o lebaganyeng le lefatshe. Ka gore one oo, gore leruo la rona le nna bokete jang mo kgaolong, go ama lefatshe, go seka gatwe o o amang temo-thuo. Ke dingwe tsa dilo tse re tshwanetseng gore re di lebelele thata, gore di seka tsa re senyetsa tse dintlentle tse re di dirang.

Paragraph 77 ke ama fela primary schools gore, go na le thulaganyo e ntle ya madi ya gore, go tsile go nna go fokodiwa go salela morago ga dikago tsa go oketsa di-classroom, mantlo a mathichara, le go oketsa di-toilet. Thulaganyo e e ntle e bile e filwe madi. Mathata ke gore mo go seno sebaka, ga re itse gore thulaganyo e e ntse jang? Ke gore e builwe go gobokwa, go raya gore re sale re e utlwalela ko Moiyabana, ke e fa sekai, go tswa foo re itse gore e ntse e tsweletse mme ga re itse gore e tmaya fa kae, e bile go setse go dirilwe bokete jo bo kae.

Tsholofelo ke gore, e tlaa re gone mo fa jaaka go tsilwe go kgaoganngwa madi jaana, Tona a re sedimosetse gore tota e fa kae? Gore e re mo mokwalong o o tlaa bong o dirilwe, re kgone go bala motlhhofo, gore mme, thulaganyo e tmaya jaana e bile re fa. Fa nako e ka bo e letla, ke ka bo ke baya polelo ele ya khudu le phuduhudu, e khudu a kileng ba ithulaganya, phuduhudu ka bo fetshwana a nna a botsa gore, khudu o fa kae,
Monday 12 February 2007

khudu a re ke fano. Ke sone fela se re se batlang, gore mang le mang a itse gore mang o fa kae, gore e nne ka sekgowa se go tweng reader friendly. Mme kgang ya gore dikole ga di tlhokomelwe sentle, bakaulengwe ba e buile, e tlhomola pelo, e utlwisa bothhoko. Ka gore, go a itsypa gore ba go tulweng ke bone ba ba tlaa bong ba sekaseka, kana ba dira ka sekgowa se go tweng inspect, ba tshwanetse gore ba bo bo kolagana le bo radikonteraka.

Ka gore fa e le gore ga go kolaganwe, go tla jang gore e re morago ga beke tse pedi go sena go nna go twe go baakanngwa sekole, kana eng fela, go bo jaanong go setse gape go sasamogilwe. Go itsypa fela gore, ba ba neng ba tshwanetse gore ba tlhokomele, ga ba aka ba tlhokomela. Potso ke gore, ka ba hiretswe go tlhotlhomisa gore tiro e dirilwe ka botlalo, se se dirang gore ba seka ba bo ba tlhokometse mo go neng go ka bo go bonywe ke mang le mang fela, le yo o tlaa bo a sa hirelwa tiro eo, kana a sa rutelwa tiro eo, pelaelo jaanong ke gore ba tshwanetse go be ba itibisa go sele. Ke eng ba itibisa go sele ka lebaka la gore ba fiwa sengwe ke ba go neng go tulwe ba tshware tiro.

Jaanong selo se, ko ntle ga gore se senya madi, go raya gore bana ba rutelwa fa go sa siamang, le mororo go ne go ntse go ntshiwa madi gore dikole di siame sentle.

Se sengwe ke dibuka, kgang e tona gompieno, ke ntse ke le mo go yone paragraph ya bo 77 ke gore, go na le syllabus e ntsha ya standard seven. Mo go ba ba tsileng go kwala Standard VII mo ngwageng ono wa 2007, fa re sa ntse re bua jaana syllabus eo ga e ise e gorge ko dikoleng le guidelines tsa gore go tsile go dirwa jang, le yone ga e ise e gorge ko dikoleng. Go bo go raya gore, bana ba dikole, ka ke ka bua fela ka kgaolo ya Mmadinare ke yone e ke e itseng botoka, mo kgaisanyong ya legwatagwata lone le la gore bana fa dikole jaanong di ema morago ga ditlhatlhobo, go bo go bolelwa gore ba
bokaekae ba gaisitse ba bokaekae, ba ga rona ko dikgaolong ba ba iseng ba bone dikwalo
tse di tlhokafalang tsa sekole, tota gore go twe ba gaisitswe ke ba ba saleng ba bona
dikwalo go le pele, tota ga se go bua boammaaruri. Ba salela ko morago, ba ka fa mosing.
Mme selo se ga se a siamela lefatshe le tsamaiso ya rona. Ke gore ga ba saletse ko
morago ka lebaka la gore ga ba a bona syllabus nako e le teng, ga ba saletse ko morago ka
ntata ya gore guidelines tsono tse di thusang in the syllabus ga ba a di bona, mme rona re
re re bua ka globalisation le global competition, ke gore ba simologa fela re ba ntsha mo
mokgeleng oo.
Jaanong dilo tse re a di lebala, e re ko bofelong ke gone go bo go buiwa ka gore, sekole sa
gore sa gore ga se a dira sentle, re lebala gore, mme dithulaganyetso tsa gore ba ka bo ba
dirile sentle, ga di a dirwa.
Mme go utlwisa botlhoko. Le dikwalo tse di bolelelang bana gore ba amogetswe,
tlhobaelo ya batsadi le kopo ya batsadi ke gore, a tlhe di goroge nako e sale teng, gore
batsadi ba tle ba kgone go baakanyetsa bana nako e sa le teng. Ke dingwe tse di
tlhobaetsang tse re tshwanetseng gore re ka bo re di ela tlhoko thata, gore di seka tsa
utlwisa batsadi botlhoko. Gore ga ba a tsenya letsogo, mo thutong ya bana ba bone,
jaanong re se ka ra ba kgoreletsa go dira tiro eo.

**MR KGATHI:** *On a point of elucidation Madam Speaker.* Ke a leboga, ke ne ke re se
sengwe se se tshwenyang mo tsamaisong ya thuto ke gore, fa dikole di tswalwa, ba ba
fetsang from colleges, officers ba re go iwa malatsing a boitapolo. Barutabana are
posted ka bo February/March go setse go le late, o fitlhele e le gore dikole ga di na
barutabana, mo e leng gore go tshwenya tsamao ya syllabus.
MR KEDIKILWE: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mmaetsho kana ao le one ke ntse ke one mafoko a ke ne ke sa ntse ke tlaa feta ka one. Gore barutabana fa ba sa isiwe ko dikoleng ka nako, go raya gore barutabana ba bangwe ba pataganya di-class di le pedi fa gongwe di bo di nne tharo. Go raya gore ga go na ka fa ba ka dirang tiro ka manontlhotlho ka teng. Moo le gone go bo go kgoreletsma mo go one mokgele o re buang ka one, wa dikgaisanyo tsa mafatshefatshe. Tota go go ntsi mo go kgoreletsang barutabana, mme le gale tse dingwe re a itse gore di ntse di a lekwa jaaka yone backlog e re buang ka yone.

Kgang e nngwe e ke eletsang go bua ka yone ke tlhelo ya melemo, mathata jaaka bakaulemgwe ba ntse ba umaka, mathata fa gongwe e nna fela gore matlho otlhe a soketse ko go HIV/AIDS, e le tshwanelo.

Mme mathata ke gore, ke le mo go paragraph 75, re mo mathateng a bo high blood pressure le bo sukiri le a mangwe. Jaanong gone mo di-health posting, mo dikokelwaneng, tota le mo di-primary hospital, melemo e ga e yo.

Motho o tlaa tswa ko makgakaleng, gongwe a tswa ko Kgagodi a ya ko Palapye, fa a tsena ko Palapye gatwe, nnyaa, ke jaaka o re bona, a bo a feta a ya ko Serowe, fa a tsena ko Serowe gatwe, ke jaaka o re bona.

Ke gore ditshenyegelo tse di kalokalo, botlhoko jo bo kalokalo jwa bolwetse jo motho a tlaa bong a bo lwala, go tlaa bo go mo lopa gore a boele gape ko Kgagodi, a nne a setle tsela, mme a itaya mpipi yo o senang lebadi. Dilo tse di utlwisa botlhoko.

Mme le gale tsholofelo ke gore, Mmaetsho Tona o mo tseleng, o mo thulaganyong ya gore, a sekaseke gone ko moding, ko Central Medical Stores. Gore tota re ka nna ra baakanya jang, ra dira dithulaganyo dife tsa gore melemo e, dipilisi tse, batho ba di bone,
Monday 12 February 2007

ba tle ba kgone go lwantsha matlhoko a mangwe a ko ntle ga dithulaganyo tsa bo
HIV/AIDS.

Mme le yone thulaganyo ya HIV/AIDS e aname. Dithulaganyetso tsa diritibatsi, tsa
dithetsabasego di nne di ye ko metseng e mengwe e e kgakala ka gore, le yone, le fa
motho a ka bo a na le bopelonolo le keletlhoko ya gore a ithatlhobe, a bo a tle a di newe,
mathata ke gore go tswa foo, batho ba bangwe ba tlhaela madi. Ke e fa sekai ka kgaolo ya
me, gore a nne a ya ko bo Palapye kgapetsakgapetsa. Ga a na one matsana a go tlhola a ile
Palapye kgapetsakgapetsa. Go bo go raya gore, ka gone go tlhaelelwa ke madi, kgantele o
a itsapa, a itsapiswa ke gore, ga a na one madi. Fa a itsapa go raya gore jaanong go dira
tiro go nna a tsaya jaaka fa a rulaganyeditswe kana a laetswe kana a laetswe go tswa mo
tseleng.

Jaanong fa a dira jalo go bo go raya gore tsholefelo ya gore ditshetsa basigo di ka mo
thusa fa a sa di tseye ka fa go laetsweng ka teng ga go na ka fa di ka mo tshetsang ka teng.
Ke one mathata a magolo a re a tshwereng kwa dikgaolong, maiteko a le teng re sa a
nyatse re bile re bona gore go tlaa tsewela pele mme Setswana se a re, ‘pitsa ya tlala ga e
butsw.’ A tlhe re leke bojotlhe jo re ka bo kgonang gore mogoga o mo leele o re se ka ra
tlhoboga fela ra re ga o na nama e re kgabagare o nne le nama. Ke a leboga.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF TRADE AND INDUSTRY (MR MOHLOKO): Ke a
leboga, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke ne ke re le nna ke tseye sebaka se go
akgela mo pegong e re e beilweng pele ke Tona wa Madi mme ke simolole ka go akgela
ka Paragraph 34 e e buang ka BMC (Botswana Meat Commission). BMC go lekwa
maiteko a gore e tsosolosiwe e bo e nne mo seemong se e leng gore e ka dira dipoelo ka
go bitsa bangwe gore ba tle go thusa go e tsamaisa. Ke mogopolo o montle mme a e re ba
tsena fa re se ka ra ba kgoroletsa ba dire tiro e ba phuthologile jaaka fela ba ba tsamaisang dikgwebo ba ka dira mo maitekong a bone a go dira *profit*. Mme ke a bo ke tshwenngwa ke gore tota BMC go na le dilo dingwe fela tse e leng gore di tlhamaletse tse e neng e ka di dira, tse di tlhamaletseng fela di sa batle matshwenyego a a kalo-kalo. Tse e leng gore BMC ga e di sale morago gore e fokotse ditshenyegelo gape e bo e kgothatse batho go tlisa dikgomo ka bokete. Sekai sa nthla fela ke gone maloba fa BMC mo ngwageng o o fetileng re bona e rekisa BRS (*Botswana Railway Service*), e e leng gore e ne e thusa go fefosa go isiwa ga dikgomo kwa BMC. Gompieno dikgomo, fa ke e fa sekai kwa kgaolong ya Francistown go ya kwa Boteti kwi dithothwe ka batho ba e leng gore dikoloi tsa bone ga di *reliable* jaaka thulaganyo e e neng e dirilwe ya BMC. Mme gore BMC e bo e ikaelela go dira maduo ka *transport* e e sa ikanyegeng ke a ipotsa gore a mme gone maikaelelo a bone ke go dira *profit*. BMC e tshwanetse gore lekalana la yone le e leng gore ke la *procurement* re solofela gore fa e le - tota ba tlhoafetse ba batla go dirisanya sentle le barui re nne re ba bona kwa dipolaseng le kwa merakeng. Ba tsamae koo ba bolelela barui gore, dikgomo tse ts'a gago tse re a di batla re le ba BMC, re batla go di reka. Ba nne ba kgothatse barui fela jalo le ba e leng gore gongwe ba inneela mo Gaborone mo, diphulo tsone di gola di bo di tla di jewa ke *pasturela*.

Ba nne ba ba gakolole gore o na le dipelesa golo kwa, di rekise kwa BMC re a di batla. Ke tsaya gore lephata le la *Cattle Procurement* le ne le ka dira yone tiro eo BMC ya bo ya tlelwa fela ke maduo ka gore ba tlaa bo ba kgothtagsa barui go tlisa dikgomo, jaanong ga ba dire jalo. Bone jaanong o ka re ke tiro ya ofisi fela e e leng gore go nniwa mo khomputareng, tiro ya teng fela ke gore ba bo ba lelediwa ke barui gore ke nale dikgomo tse nne tse tlhano ke batla go di rekisa, ga se gone go ipapatsa. Go ipapatsa ga BMC e
tshwanetse gore ba nne ba latela bao ba e leng gore ba tshotse di raw materials tse BMC e di tlhokang.

E e tsamaelanang le yone ya BMC ke matlhabelo a a lwaletseng ruri fela a bo ntshe. A a tswalwa a a bulwa kgapetsa kgapetsa, tota one ga re sa tlhola re itse gore gatwe tota gone e rile kwa tshimologong e rile a dirwa go ne go bonwe eng. Ditshekatsheko di ne di reng? Ba ba ruileng bo ntshe ba a ngongorega, ba a lela jaanong. Ke ne ke rakana le yo mongwe maabane wa Molepolole a re jaanong ba na le mathata a gore ba tlaa duela CEDA ka eng ka gore e ya bone BMC e, e e nang e tswalwa e bo e bulwa e tswalwa e bulwa ba na le mathata jaanong.

HONOURABLE MEMBER: O ka re lebati.

MR MOKALAKE: O ka re lebati, ga ba itse gore jaanong ba tlaa reng ka dinonyane tse ka gore... (laughter) ... ee, ba re ba na le mathata one ao gore jaanong ba tsile go palelwa, ba tsile go phutlhma ntswa madirelo a le teng. Mme ke nngwe a mathata a e leng gore re tshwanetse re lebagane le one re sa boele kwa morago gore, dilo tse dingwe re nne re di tlhamalatsa fela sentle... interruption... ke mo mathateng Speaker. O tlaa intshwarela.

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Members, a ko lo mo feng sebaka tlhe.

MR MOKALAKE: Ba nkgakolola kgapekgapetsa ka selo se. Re re tshwanetse gore re tlhoafalele madirelo a rona a leruo a. A mangwe mathata a re nang le one ke a neng a buiwa fa ke Tona wa Temo-thuo gore nnyaa, mo dikokong re siame. Ke dumalana le ene gore re siame kwa dikokong mme e le...

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudible)

MR MOKALAKE: Nnyaa, ke diplomatic ke tlaa go araba sentle. Tota go ya fela gore ke mang who supplies tse di lekaneng Botswana tse? Gompieno bone ba Halaal ba o tlaa
fitlhela e le gore ke dikompone di le nne di le tlhano tse di setseng di tsere madirelo a dikoko mo Batswaneng, tsa Batswana di tswetswe. Tsa Batswana di tswetswe le fa o ka tsamaya naga e yotlhe o tlaa di fitlhela di ntse di tswetswe di le fa gare ga sekgwa di sa bereke. Madirelo a e leng gore ke a Batswana one, ga a sa tlhola a bereka sepe. E bile tota gone ka ALDEP III re ka bo re akanyetsa bone bao ba e leng gore madirelo a bone a phutlhame, a phutlhamesitswe ke gore ba meditswe ke dikompone tse ditonatona tse e leng gore ba ne ba se ka ke ba kgona go lwantshwanya le tsone. Re ne re ka ba thusa gore jaanong e bile fa e le gore re tshaba gore dikoko jaanong di bokete, dijo di a tura e bile dikompone tse ditona tona tse di setse di tsere madirelo otlhe, re ne re divert them…..

MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR SWARTZ): Point of clarification. Ke botsa Motlotlegi gore mo ALDEP III yone e Rre Kedikilwe a ntseng a e bua bontle-ntle e, ga e re a e bala a tla fale fa gotweng batho ba dikoko ba tlaa thusiwa go aga matlhabelo a dikoko mme e bile goromente o ikemeseditse go dirisa madi a a ka tshwarang P4 million fa e le gore ke gakologelwa dipalo sentle. Gore jaanong mme fa a e badile a e tlhalogantse a ga a bone go tlaa thusa?

MR MOKALAKE: Ke pelo telele, fa goromente a thusa go ya go dira matlhabelo a dikoko ke ntse ke ipotsa gore dikoko di fe. A ke tsa one madirelo a matona a. One madirelo a matona a jaanong ke tsone dikoko tse ke buang ka tsone ka gore mo Batswaneng ba ba neng ba rua 100, 200 ba na le mathata. Bao ke bone ba ba nang le mathata ka gore fa o tsamaya le mo Kgatleng mo oa bona madirelo a tswetswe le fa o ka dira matlhabelo ga a ba thuse ka sepe fa ba setse ba se na dikoko. Ke ne ke tswa ka mogopolo wa gore gongwe re ka bo re ba kgothatsa gore ba tsene mo another form of
Monday 12 February 2007

*poultry farming,* gongwe go rua bo dikgaka mo go one madirelo one a ka a setse a le teng. Gore banana fa e le gore ba a rentisa ba a rentise a ntse jalo…

**MR KGATHI:** *Point of clarification.* A Tona Mokalake ka e bile e le *portfolio* ya gagwe ya *Trade - Small Businesses.* O ne a ka se ka a re gakolole gore o ikaelela go tlhabolola *the Small Business* jang.

**MR MOKALAKE:** Ke tsaya gore ya *sectoral* e tlaa tla mme Bopalamente ga go na fa bo tsenang teng. Lona le kgonwa fela ke Mopalamente wa Tonota, ka ke ene yo a tle a ba tsunyetse. Ke ne ke re ke fete foo…

**MR MOLEFHBANGWE:** *Point of procedure.* Mmaetsho, fa gongwe re e ta re tsena mo ketsaetsegong. Fa re bua mo Palamenteng go na le ngongorego e e reng e seka yare fa yo mongwe a bua, e ka tswa gongwe e le se e leng gore ga o se batle mme gongwe se tsamaelana le tiro ya gagwe o bo o lebagana le ene. Re aga re tewa jalo gone mo, fa gongwe o re oa bua Tona a bua o bo o re a ga kere o ne o le Tona o ne oa re, go bo gotwe nnyaa, ga go buiwe jalo. Jaanong ga ke itse Mmaetsho ke tlhoka go kaelwa gore a Mopalamente fa e le gore dintlha dingwe di amana le tiro e a e neetsweng, a go tebang gore e re fa a bua a bo a tewa gotwe nnyaa, tswa mo go eo o re bolelele gore wena wa re oa go dira eng?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Ke dumalana le *Honourable* Molefhabangwe, tota a ko lo feng *Honourable* Mokalake sebaka a debaite. O ne a lo fa sebaka nako e lo neng lo debaita *and* o ne a didimetse ke ne ke mo lebeletse a lo fa sebaka.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** O ne a seyo.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** O ne a le teng, *Honourable Members,* tswelela Rra.
MR MOKALAKE: Batho ba ba a ntshwenya Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ba bo ba ntlhoafoletse. Ke fetela kwa ntlheng ya thuto, Paragraph 68 go ya go tsena kwa go 70. Tota ke re mo thutong re na le mathata fa di primary school, a dibuka. E ka nna tse di kwalelang kgotsa dibuka tse di balwang ke bana mo dikgaolong tse dintsì fela selelo ke sone sa dibuka, ke re seło se a se sekasekwe re bone gore mathata a a tsalwa ke eng? Gore a tendering system e e dirisiwang go reka dibuka tsa primary ga e tsamaye sentle. E bile ka ditshwana fela tsa primary ga di a tshwanela go nna complicated go rekwa, ga di tshwane le fa o le mogokgo wa senior school o order dibuka tse dintsintsí tse di farologanyeng di rekwa ka makgamukgamu a mantsintsí. Jaanong kwa primary o ka re go rekwa di standard books, di tshwana. Jaanong golo fa a re sekasekeng re ko re itse gore tlhaelo e e kana e dirwa ke eng. Maloba ke ne ke bua ke tloafetse ke re mme mongwe wa morutabana o ne a felela e bile a ya go rekela bana ba gagwe di exercise books. E le gore bana ba phaki…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: (Inaudile)

MR MOKALAKE: Nnyaa, o ne a bua kwa kgotleng. Bana ba phakisitswe dibuka; exercise book e le nngwe fela ba kwalela Setswana, Maths, English le sengwe le sengwe mo go yone, within a week e tletse. Jaanong dilo tse re re ga di a siama re batla gore re itse gore matsapa a tsalwa ke eng mo kabong ya dibuka kwa primary school, bogolo jang. Re bo re tshwenngwa gape gone kwa primary ke the poor state sa infrastructure. Seemo sa dikago se e leng gore o ka re fa go ntse go twee go a baakanngwa go thubegela pele fela. Re na le mathata kwa dikgaolong kwa, tse dingwe di classroom jaanong go a re di thubiwe fela go agiwe tse disha fa go kgonega ka gore tota o ka re seemo se maswenyana.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ga se Kweneng fela gompieno o ka re go jwelelela lefatsho lotlhe re tlaa felela re tswala ka matlhaku.

Mme go na le maphata a mangwe a e leng gore tota gone re sa le re ntse re bua re re a fudisiwe fa a leng teng a ko a isiwe kwa a lebaneng. *Primary Education* ke nngwe ya tsone e e leng gore ra re ga re itse gore tota go palang gore e lebagangwe le *Ministry wa Education* fela. Go sa tlhole gotwe jaanong go ntse gotwe di *classroom* di agiwa ke ba, barutabana ba tlisiwa ke ba, go tlisa *confusion* e ntsi mo go maswe. Re buile ka di *library* - *Labour and Home Affairs*. *Library* e tsamaelana jang le maphata a e beilweng kwa go one ao ka ke dilo tsathuto. Le fa o ka tswa o ithuta o se mo ntlwaneng ya borutelo mme fela *library* tsone ke eng di sa ye kwa *Education*. Go a re dilo tse re nne re di sekaseke re fuduse re ise kwa go tshwanetseng gore go ye teng.

Ke bo ke ya kwa ntlheng ya lehuma, go fokotsa lone lehuma. A re simololeng fela *system* ya gore batho ba bangwe ba ba phakisiwang dijo tsa itshetse gore ba se ka ba amiwa ke lehuma. Re leke gore ba bangwe ba ba alogang ba ne ba ntshiwa mme e bile fa go setse jaanong re bone gore go na le di *minimum wages* ba tewe gotwe tiro ke e ya go bereka e seng jalo re go ntsha ka kwa mophakong wa dijo tsa lehuma. Ke re…

**MOTION**

**ADJOURNMENT**

**MINISTER OF STATE PRESIDENT (MR KWELAGOBE):** Madam Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and **agreed to.**

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 7 p.m. until Friday 16th February 2007 at 09:00 a.m.
Friday 16th February 2007

THE ASSEMBLY met at 9.00 a.m.

(The Speaker in the Chair)

PRAYERS

* * * * *

QUESTIONS FOR ORAL ANSWER

VACANCIES IN THE BOTSWANA POLICE SERVICE

MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister for Presidential Affairs and Public Administration to give a detailed breakdown of the vacancies in the Botswana Police Service as at 31st March 2005 and 31st March 2006; and further explain why these vacancies cannot be filled, given the escalating crime in Botswana.

MINISTER FOR PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (MR KWELAGOBE): Madam Speaker, the detailed breakdown of vacancies in the Botswana Police Service as at 31st March 2005 and 31st March 2006 respectively were as follows:

a) As at 31st March 2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Senior Assistant Commissioner</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Commissioner</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senior Superintendent</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Superintendent</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inspectors</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Madam Speaker, all the vacancies as at 31st March 2005, with the exception of those at the rank of Constable were filled through promotions, which took effect from 1st April 2005. The promotions exercise resulted in 207 vacant posts at the rank of Constables. The posts of Constables were then filled at the beginning of 2006 when new recruits were enlisted into the Botswana Police Service.

Regarding vacancies that existed as at 31st March 2006, all supervisory posts, that is, posts from Sergeants and above, were filled through a promotions exercise with effect from 1st June 2006. That promotions exercise resulted in three hundred and ninety-eight (398) vacant Constable posts, which posts have been filled through a recruitment exercise, which commenced in December 2006.
Madam Speaker, the continuously high vacancy situation in the Botswana Police Service is due to a disturbing attrition rate due to resignations, early retirements and dismissals. For example, the Botswana Police Service lost two hundred and thirty-six (236) and two hundred and ten (210) officers during the years 2005 and 2006 respectively, mainly due to resignations, early retirements and dismissals.

It should be noted that the Training of Police recruits takes twelve (12) months, and as such it takes some time to fill vacant posts. The Promotions Board also sits once a year during the month of March to fill vacant posts including those approved for the forthcoming financial year.

Regarding the escalating crime in Botswana, I wish to inform this House that fighting crime is not the sole responsibility of the Police. All persons should be involved, including the Political and Traditional leadership who should be in the forefront of this battle and rally the ordinary citizens. It is only when we are all involved in the fight against crime that strategies such as neighbourhood watch schemes, bo ntebela ke go lebelele, Business Committees against crime and School Clubs will bear fruit. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

MR SALESHANDO: Could the Minister state if there has been any attempt to establish the reasons behind the number of resignations and early retirements; those particular two reasons. Have you managed to establish what the reasons behind those resignations are? Secondly, why should the Promotion Board only meet once, why can it not be more than once in a year?

MR KWELAGOBE: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo, ke tlaa tlhotlhomisa go batlisisa gore ke eng fa Board e kopana gangwe fela mo ngwageng. Mme ka gore ke eng fa Mapodisi a
tlogela tiro; mangwe a mabaka a re a utlwalelang a bone ke gore tota dituelo di kwa tlase. Ka jalo ba bo ba ya go senka mafulo a matalana mme ke tsaya gore ke seemo se e leng gore goromente o ntse o se tshwere oa se seka-seka go bona gore go ka tokafadiwa seemo ka tsela e e ntseng jang. Gone go a tshwenya gore basireletsi ba rona ba bo ba tlogela ka bokete jo bo kalo. Thank you.

MR SEBETELA: Madam Speaker, the Minister is aware of the fact that the private sector in Botswana is expanding and, therefore, private security services are growing and inevitably there will be competition for these skills tsa policing. What is he doing in the area of remuneration and the other benefits to make sure that we remain competitive in this sector?

MR KWELAGOE: Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo, ke ithaya ke re e rile fa ke araba supplementary ya mokaulengwe ka bolela gore mangwe a mabaka ke one a mokaulengwe Honourable Sebetela a a buang. Mme ka ba ka digela ka gore ke tsaya gore goromente o tlaa ba a lebile a seka-seka go bona gore seemo se se ka tsibogelwa ka sebopego se se ntseng jang. Ke bile ka digela ka gore gone goa tlhobaetsa gore basireletsi ba batho e bo e le gore ba tlogela tiro ka bontsi jo bo kana-kana.

SHORTAGE OF HARDCOVER NOTEBOOKS AND EXERCISE BOOKS

MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Local Government whether she is aware of the shortage of hardcover notebooks and exercise books in the Serowe/Palapye Sub District primary schools; if so, will the Minister explain what is causing this shortage and what she is doing to address the problem.
Monday 12 February 2007

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (MR MASALILA): Madam Speaker, I have been made aware of the shortage of stationary at primary schools in the Serowe/Palapye Sub-District. I am informed this shortage was caused by the need to re-tender for stationary as the initial tender floated in August 2006 had to be cancelled due to internal deficiencies.

Notwithstanding all this, the delivery from the second tender started during December 2006 and by the third week of January, some of the stationary were delivered and supplied to schools. Madam Speaker, as a short-term measure, Education Officers went around schools during the first and second week after the schools reopened to identify schools, which had extra stationary for distribution to schools with shortage. This exercise has since alleviated the situation.

Furthermore, 90 per cent of our schools had large supplies of Quads Exercise Books and have been advised to temporarily use this until the rest of the stationary has been delivered. I thank you.

MR SEBETELA: Madam Speaker, since this is a problem that occurs every year, with both textbooks, exercise books, hardcovers, and even pencils and pens. What are we doing about this matter to finally put it to rest? Madam Speaker, it hits worst those members of our communities with no money, who do not have money to go and buy for themselves. What are we doing to really put this thing to rest?

MR MASALILA: Madam Speaker, we have been attending to these matters the two of us; that is the Ministry of Local Government and Ministry of Education through our Inter-Ministerial Committee on Primary Education. I am confident that we will get on top of these problems very soon.
MONDAY 12 FEBRUARY 2007

MR MOATLHODI: Honourable Minister, taking into account the numerous complaints from various schools countrywide, do you not think you are not yet on top?

MR MASALILA: We do not have to visit each and every school. We make decisions, which affect the whole country, and once we make those decisions and we get on top of issues, we are in control.

PROVISION OF TELEPHONES IN MOCHUDI

PLANNING AREA

MR R. J. MODIPANE (KGATLENG WEST): asked the Minister of Communications, Science and Technology if she is aware that a larger part of the Mochudi planning area, particularly Rasesa and other new village extensions, have not been provided with telephones and that there are pending applications for connection, some of which have been outstanding for over five years; if so, what action does she propose to take to correct the situation and when is she going to do so.

MINISTER OF COMMUNICATIONS, SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (MRS VENSON-MOITOI): Madam Speaker, I am aware that parts of Resesa and other village extensions are not covered with fixed line telephone services. However, I am aware that these are fully covered by mobile services. I can confirm that in some areas there is no copper line plant and therefore, it is not possible to connect the customers with fixed line services. For planning purposes, BTC continues to accept applications so that it can accurately measure demand and so far one hundred and fifty (150) applications have been received.

Madam Speaker, current infrastructure used by BTC is based on technology that is restricted line services only. It is expected that with the new licensing regime, BTC will
be able to deploy technology that will enable it to cover these villages in the near future. It is difficult to put a definite date for this development but I will keep the Honourable Member of the constituency informed. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

STATUS OF THE NEWLY CONSTRUCTED LOBATSE MENTAL HOSPITAL

MR N. M. MODUBULE (LOBATSE): asked the Minister of Health what the status of the newly constructed Lobatse Mental Hospital is.

MINISTER OF HEALTH (MRS TLOU): Madam Speaker, the construction of Lobatse Mental Hospital is ongoing, completion is due on 22nd September 2008 and its progress is currently about 50 per cent. I thank you.

TOTAL NUMBER OF REGISTERED DESTITUTES IN BOTSWANA

MR N. M. MODUBULE (LOBATSE): asked the Minister of Local Government what the total number of registered destitutes in Botswana is, and to provide a breakdown of the number of such destitutes on a regional and gender basis.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Madam Speaker, there are 39,662 destitutes in Botswana, out of a population of 1.7 million. Out of these, 12,711 are male while 26,951 are female. For the information of the Honourable Member 3,269 are temporary destitutes and have the potential to graduate from the programme. The number of destitutes per region are as provided in the table which I shall avail to the Honourable Member. I thank you.

The Number of Registered Destitute Persons in Botswana is currently as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>REGION</th>
<th>NUMBER OF BENEFICIARIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FEMALE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East</td>
<td>622</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
MR GABORONE: Could the Honourable Minister tell this House what is a temporary destitute.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): *Temporary* ka Setswana go tewa ka nakwana. Fa jaaka go tle go nne leuba jaana, batho ba bangwe ba tsena mo listeng e ya *destitution* ka gone gore ba tlhasetswe ke leuba. Fa dipula di na ba a graduata.

*That is why* ke ne ke bua ka *graduation*.

**COMMERCIAL BANKS TO ENLIST WITH THE BOTSWANA STOCK EXCHANGE**

MR K. KARIO (SELIBE PHIKWE WEST): asked the Minister of Finance and Development Planning whether it is not time that legislation is put in place to require commercial banks to enlist with the Botswana Stock Exchange so that citizens can also benefit from the consistent good profits realised by these banks in the country.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR MLAZIE): Madam Speaker, government has no intentions to put in place legislation that
would require banks to list with the Botswana Stock Exchange (BSE) since it is a shareholders’ decision to list their company on the Stock Exchange. Therefore, forcing banks to list through legislation might not help as other listed companies on the Botswana Stock Exchange could be offering better share prices which may attract more citizen buyers than those of commercial banks.

However, it should be noted that out of the six (6) commercial banks operating in Botswana, three (3) of them are listed on the Botswana Stock Exchange. Furthermore, four (4) commercial banks have issued corporate bonds, which are also available to the public.

It should be noted that citizens are free to trade in these products. It is therefore my expectation that they are trading in those shares so that they can also benefit from the consistent good profits accruing to these banks. I thank you.

QUESTION FOR WRITTEN ANSWER


MR L. B. SEBETELA (PALAPYE): asked the Minister of Local Government what the value of procurement was at the Department of Tribal Administration for financial years 2003/2004 and 2004/2005, for the following in the form of a table:

8) Office equipment (excluding IT)

9) Office stationery

10) IT equipment

11) Consultancies/professional services

and say how much of these amounts for each financial year and category above was awarded to locally registered suppliers and further say how much went to 100 per cent
citizen-owned and citizen-controlled contractors in pursuit of Government’s efforts to empower its citizens.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Madam Speaker, the value of procurement at the Department of Tribal Administration for the 2003/2004 and 2004/2005 financial years are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office Equipment</td>
<td>P239,334.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
<td>P374,897.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>P614,231.19</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items 2004/2005</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Office Equipment</td>
<td>P552,951.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office Stationery</td>
<td>P410,400.30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT Equipment</td>
<td>P241,104.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>P1,203,455.75</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The department did not engage any consultants neither did they seek professional advice or service from private entities during the 2003/04 and 2004/05 financial years.

The office equipment and office stationery were from Department of Supplies while IT equipment was procured from 100 per cent citizen owned companies. I thank you.

ESTABLISHMENT OF AN AGRICULTURAL DEVELOPMENT BANK

MOTION

MR G. MOKGWATHI (LETHLA KENG EAST): Thank you, Madam Speaker. I wish to present this motion to this Honourable House to request government to establish an Agricultural Development Bank to provide tailor-made financial services to the agricultural sector.
Perhaps to start off I must indicate that the conception of this motion resulted from the kgotla meetings that I have been addressing in the constituency, and also talking to some farmers’ associations. In my attempt at encouraging them to use existing agricultural support schemes, there have been consistent complaints as it were, that the existing agricultural schemes, well intended as they are, fall short of assisting to promote agricultural development, particularly in terms of the financial factor.

I had intended not to present this motion before Parliament, but I was specifically invited to one of the regional agricultural shows in the Gaborone area that was held in Mmamoagi. It is a lands area with very hard working farmers, particularly in arable farming. Gaborone area includes the Southern regions like Ramotswa, Thamaga, Mochudi and others. So, at that meeting there was one particular concern that they raised, and that was the reason, I learnt why they invited me to that show.

The plea was, talk to government to help establish an agricultural development bank that will provide tailor-made financial services to the agricultural sector. Initially, I was reluctant, but then talking to the farmers, which form the basis of the debate today, I ended up also having to do my own research work in terms of at least the theoretical aspects of an agricultural development bank, the principles behind the establishment of the bank, as well as the experiences of other countries, particularly the developing countries that have had the opportunity to experiment with agricultural development banks. After that I got to be convinced that, yes, there is need for an Agricultural Development Bank. However, because the principle is that we should not be taking unnecessarily too long debating, I have tried to up-bridge the debate by just giving a general overview as to the problems that farmers say they have and also what I have
discovered in my research work. Fortunately with the help of some of the Parliamentary staff, I was able to retrieve some of the information on banks in other countries and how they operate. I have to state my appreciation of the assistance that I got from them.

To go on to the issues, initially ordinary farmers when I confronted them with the rationale behind their wanting me to present this motion, the first issue that they raised was, agriculture on its own, particularly in this country, is a very risky undertaking, despite the fact that it helps to sustain the whole country. The rationale for their wanting this bank to be established came as a result of the short falls that they have or the limitations that they experienced with other schemes like CEDA and the National Development Bank.

One main issue is that agriculture, risky as it is requires information and human capital of its own. Traditional commercial banking systems are not enough, they do not even understand how agriculture operates, particularly in a country like Botswana that is prone to drought. An Agricultural Development Bank if established, would help offset the limitations that are found in commercial banks, or even in CEDA. The examples that they gave were particularly the issue of being tailor-made. With CEDA funded schemes in agriculture, yes, there is the grace period, but after the grace period, repayments, just like with the National Development Bank, are expected to come on a monthly basis. However, because of what they at least in theory call core variance of incomes and special diversification of agriculture, it is difficult for farmers to be able to pay on a monthly basis. The first things is, if it is on livestock inter calving period on average to the experts is 283 days, or even more than that. Therefore, because your livestock produce on an annual basis, that is if you practise good agricultural management, you only are able to
sell the offspring after 18 or 20 months and up to 30 months. Therefore, it is not possible to pay on a monthly basis. It is not an undertaking that has a monthly cash flow. As a result…

**MR TSOGWANE:** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. The Honourable Member is emphatic that the repayment has to be on monthly basis. I think it all depends on the arrangement between the farmer and the bank. I have known of some payments, which were annual on the basis of an agricultural project. Therefore, maybe he should clarify on that point because we have known of payments for CEDA and National Development Bank where people have to pay annually. I thank you.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Thank you, Honourable Member. I am going to get a…

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR MLAZIE):** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. I also wanted to confirm that even commercial banks have tailor-made agricultural products whereby you can pay on quarterly basis, half yearly basis or on an annual basis. I thank you.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** I am going to come to those issues later on in the debate as to what limitations those have on farmers, and I am going to keep your questions and comments in mind.

However, in the process, the farmers that we are concerned with, as I am going to be making this submission, is that, it has been proven even in the country that we are concerned with rural micro-finance and poverty alleviation. Many of our farmers are left out because of what I said earlier on about information and human capital of the commercial banks. I am going to try to demonstrate as to whom of these particular farmers they are talking about, who are credit worthy and can be loaned money.
We know fully well that, yes, there are those farmers who have favourable repayment terms. However, it is not the small medium farmer in the rural area, whose credit history is not known, whose repayment abilities can be vouched for by a banker. Therefore, there is need for that information because there is lack of information on potential borrowers. Many of the small borrowers, the majority of whom are most invariably good borrowers and pay very well have been left out.

To give a classical example, the National Development Bank as it originated, it started in 1963 and it is a known fact in this country that, there have been very high default rates. The default rates like in all other countries where agricultural development banks have failed, have not been as a result of the majority small borrowers, but a few large borrowers with enough political influence, who decided not to pay because of that political intrusion, and also the governance of the bank that I am going to be discussing, which has contributed a lot towards failures of such banks, particularly where Government is involved.

Remember I am talking about the state-owned agricultural institution, but the government that I am talking about here is different. Even those farmers that we have we know they are large farmers. Every banker looks at the credit worthiness of the farmer as I indicated, payment history, which is not available to the rural small farmers. It is a known fact that those who had not been paying were not the small farmers. The restructuring of the National Development Bank (NDB) came about as a result of defaults and many of these defaults we know fully well that there have been bailouts. I had interviews and discussions with the NDB and they confirmed that yes, it was not the small borrower who was a problem it was the large…
MINISTER OF MINERALS, ENERGY AND WATER RESOURCES (MR KEDIKILWE): On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. I am rising because I thought so far the Honourable Member was developing his point very clearly and very carefully. But the very point that he makes about the NDB not working properly, I think he is killing his own arguments. This is because if in fact the issue is not necessarily that the bank was not working properly but that the big farmers were defaulting and not the small ones, then the whole argument about a new institution with new overheads kills it. I would have thought he would want to develop something better than simply basing it on the big farmers having been responsible for the fall or defaulting nature of the NDB or CEDA or any other arrangement. I hope the questions relating to the core variance, the special distribution and others, the history of the small farmers, that I am sure could also be handled by an amendment of the NDB Act such that we take into account precisely what he is saying. Because one agrees with him on the tailor making, but please do not kill the motion.

MR MOKGWATHI: Thank you, Honourable Kedikilwe. The intention is not to kill the motion; the intention is to be in a position to give one of those reasons. I am going to come up with other reasons as to why it should not necessarily be with the NDB. I am going to come back to that Honourable member.

The issues that I am raising here are to explain the problems with the banks. One of the major problems as I have indicated is default rates, which have led to many banks being bankrupt; not by small farmers. What I am developing is that they have been left out of this restructuring. They do not have access to the financial services of the existing
financial intermediaries for rural development and for agriculture. That is one aspect that I had to talk about.

If we look at developing countries, to give example, we have very many successful stories. Like in Indonesia, there is a bank that has been very successful and I am going to try to indicate the reasons behind the success of such agricultural development banks. For example, let me start with the Dominican Republic, the Banko Agricolor… (Inaudible)

**MR KGATHI:** *On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker.* Ke ne ke kopa *clarification* mokaulengwe ke re, pele fa o tsena ko go-bo Latin America a ke re o a itse gore CEDA *at the moment* e na le *portion* ya agriculture, NDB e na le di *portion* tse di rileng le dibanka tse di rileng. Fa o ne o ka nthusa *so that I am with you* gore *what are the current inadequacies* tse e leng gore *we need to improve*, re tle re kgone gore re bone gore re ka tswelela pele. Le gone gore a fa re ka baakanya se se teng *in terms of the conditions* mo NDB gore e nne *accessible*, e nne *focused to the farmers, would you still continue to call for a bank?* Ke batla gore ke go tshware sentle.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Let me explain it this way; one of the reasons for this motion is this, that a bank has a Bank Charter. Perhaps to give general history behind the establishment of agricultural development banks Madam Speaker is this, that there was a believe that to develop the rural sector; to develop agriculture for it to contribute towards the economy much more significantly than it does, is to put in more money. The problem of the rural areas was basically lack of access to financial services. International donor agencies and governments started pouring money into the agricultural sector through agricultural development banks but still the history of such interventions has not been a nice one. There have been serious problems still with that much money that are being put
in by government. The problem that exists there is the issue of the Bank Charter. The Bank Charter is one of the issues that have been discovered in the assessment of these agricultural development banks. There had always been the believe that all it needed was finance being pumped into the agricultural sector through the banks, instead of knowing that as a Bank Charter rural agricultural communities also needed a deposit saving facility service. One of the major issues is, in order to be innovative; in order to provide a basic service that the experts and governments had never thought about is that an ordinary rural peasant is willing to save and can convert some of his assets into bank deposits. Many of the successful stories on development banks that have not failed have a deposit facility instead of the supply driven approach towards rural development finance; whereby funds come from international donors and governments instead of deposits from the savers being a major source of finance. Remember we are talking about sustainability, those that have been successful have been those that instead of borrowing from outside or getting money from government and the donors, they generate their own funds and by generating their own funds using the deposits that they have, it helps lower the interest rates. These are some of the issues that result in the need to come up with such banks.

National Development Bank does not provide deposits; CEDA does not have a deposit facility for its borrowers. All what happens is if you have a monthly salary you are more accessible to such a facility or you are likely to be more accessible to it than an ordinary farmer who does not earn on a monthly basis, hence the moving away from ordinary farmers, small farmers that have been left out in order to incorporate those who have monthly salaries. It is easier for someone who has a job to be able to get access to such a facility because they will be able to pay on a monthly basis and this is not what farmers
can afford. That characterises NDB at the moment. However, in a situation whereby we have farmers that do not earn on a monthly basis, a deposit facility is an important source of finance that the banks use for lending out to the farmers. I will demonstrate that with examples from those banks that I wanted to pick up. For example, in Latin America in the Dominican Republic with the name **Banko Agricolor**…

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF EDUCATION (MR SIELE)**: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. The clarification I am seeking Madam Speaker is that maybe the Honourable Member before proceeding to Latin America, because he gave an example of the Indonesian experience and in that regard he did not go in depth to give us how the Indonesian agricultural credit bank is structured, so that we can actually get information on how the Indonesian experience in that regard has been successful. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

**ASSISTANT MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR D. MLAZIE)**: Madam Speaker, further clarity.

**MR MOKGWATHI**: No, *ke tlaa tla ke go fa nako*. Let me explain something. Madam Speaker, can I respond to his question first, perhaps it is going to help his answer in the process. What I indicated earlier on was I am giving lessons from developing countries; Latin America and Asia and I am starting with Latin America I will come to Asia.

**MR MABILETSA**: On a point of procedure, Madam Speaker. Madam Speaker, the point of procedure I am seeking from you is that you previously ruled that when a Member stands on an intervention against a Member holding a floor, the Member holding the floor must answer first and then the subsequent may come in. I am seeing you Madam Speaker, allowing situations where one point of order is being asked before another one
has been fully responded to. I thought Madam Speaker, that according to your previous ruling that is not really the right way to go because it confuses the Member holding the floor, as to what to respond to.

**MADAM SPEAKER:** I did not allow Honourable Minister to speak.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Thank you, Madam Speaker. In response to the concern from the Honourable Member Siele, I indicated that the structured presentation is such a manner that I will be talking about Latin America and Asia, so that was in passing. I am going to be coming to the Indonesian example after I have talked about the Dominican Republic one, so I will come to that Honourable Member. In the Dominican Republic, first there was a change in funding. The history behind this is the bank was not doing well; as it was not doing well it was depending on donors for funding. When they sought external funding the international funding agencies refused to provide the money, so instead they introduced a deposit mobilisation system and with this it created consistencies, which led to prudent lending behaviour of the banks. That is the first one. Then, secondly, because there were no sources of funding coming from outside donors or even from government. The bank managers got more interested in recovering the loans from borrowers, which was not done previously, there was no enough effort. If you know there is another source of fund, there is a conduit that brings in money like a donor or government. It creates the tendency for banks not to recover the monies that they have loaned to the borrowers hence the high default rates. Therefore, this has to improve.

Third, one of the basic underlying principles behind banking is viability. Banks become viable if they have enough deposits, be they commercial or what and the basic reason why we are not innovative and not coming up with viable methods of production is because
there is a constant source of funds coming from some other source instead of the bank making itself profitable and viable.

**MR TSOGWANE:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you, Madam Speaker. I am listening to the member attentively, he is saying that the bank did not get any subventions from government, it did not get money from the donors, so may be he should say who own that bank? How was the bank set up? I thank you.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Government with the help of international donors set up the bank. The Ohio State University came up with a study in order to understand why the bank was facing problems. One of the recommendations was because of the state of the economy and the inability of government to keep on pumping funds on an activity or undertaking that was not profitable, there must be restructuring.

I think Honourable Members will be aware that there have been countries that have been forced by the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (IMF) institutions to come up with structural adjustments. However, in our case fortunately we consider these issues before we are pushed against the world. Therefore, in the particular case it was the incompetence of the banks, non-viability of the undertaking that resulted in the need to restructure and in the recommendations, it was said that no funding from outside until the restructuring. Restructuring was moving from a borrower dominated financial intermediary to a depositor dominated financial intermediary and this resulted in the success of the institution.

We should bear in mind Honourable Members that we are not saying government should stop subsidies that are necessary. All we are saying is that it opens up the opportunities
for more funds being employed in agricultural support services that are necessary for government to carry out, instead of some of the money going direct to financing.

The whole principle is government should provide the necessary infrastructure for the banks to be able to help the poor people because they are willing to borrow and they are willing to pay and they are able to pay.

So, from the point of view of efficiency and prudent financial management it makes sense for releasing of the funds, because providing a depositor dominated set up helps to offset the forgone incomes that could otherwise have been spent on other more important government services.

MR KGATHI: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Mokaulengwe ke kopa gore o nthuse gore ke tle to support you sentle ka o tla ka mogopolo o montle. Mme fa ke sa kgone gore ke nne le wena mo tseleng ke tla ke salela ko morago.

Ke ne ke botsa ke re, a fa puso, Tona wa Finance and Development Planning le ba Agriculture ba ka dira an undertaking for example gore, under Citizen Entrepreneurial development Agency (CEDA), giving an example ya the CEDA Youth Fund, which caters for 18 to 35, le motion wa ga Honourable Mokalake, o o neng o bua gore go okediwe the grace period, le seemo sa gore go tsenngwe ditsetla dingwe tse di ka dirang gore, a puso le yone kadimo ya madi e thuse go epela batho didiba, e sireletse the produce, go dirwe ditsela tse e leng gore farmers di ka kgona go thusiwa go tshwaraganwe le maphata, a seemo se se ka seke se tokafale?

Sa bobedi fa re e fa sekai jaaka the produce ko Talana Farms, gone jaanong they produce onions tse e leng gore they can feed the whole country for close to six months, mme seemo o fitlhela e le gore go bulélwa borders mo e leng gore the farmer producing kwa,
ga a kgone go ka rekisa se e leng sa gagwe. Jaanong ka re, a dilo tse fa di ka fetolwa mo molaong tse e leng gore ke di inadequacies, go nale gore we replicate the things that can come, a o ka tsena mo tseleng e e leng gore o ka dumalana le seemo se?

MR MOKGWATHI: Honourable Member I am going to be also responding to that in the process in the sense that I am going to be giving pre-conditions for success. The initial conditions that have to prevail for such a bank to succeed and some of these include micro economic framework like low inflation rate, no overvalued currency.

I am going to becoming to those issues. I am going to be indicating in the process that to some extent we as a country, we are in a much better position because we are not necessarily in a crisis. We are a middle-income country, some of the preconditions for establishing such a bank is the level of economic development that a country has to be in, like that of Botswana.

I am going to becoming to those issues to say that we do not necessarily have to have NDB and CEDA and come up with a structure that promotes what already exists. I am going to be coming to those preconditions, what is it that it takes for such a bank to succeed and are we as a country in that position to say yes, it is time that we move out?

MR MOATLHODI: On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you very much Madam Speaker. It is the last submission that you uttered more especially when you said it shall not take us anywhere if at all I did get you right my brother. If I did not, I would really pray for forgiveness and pray to be put on the right track.

However, what I am trying to say is, I understood you to be saying it would not take us anywhere to improve what already exist, it would be better to come up with something
new. If ever you said so, *a ga o bone gore le ka Setswana ra re go botoka go tokafatsa se o nang le sone*, the devil you know is better than the devil you do not know?

**MR MOKGWATHI:** The whole issue is that we are trying to improve on the financial services programmes that we have in the country. The underlying reason for this thing is to be able to make agriculture have access to financial services. So, in that case it is an improvement.

However, all I am saying is that with regard to the existing structures, we cannot do better within the existing structures unless we come up with a new institution. That is the crux of my debate, and I am going to be giving what is it that entails and why a new institution hence this motion Honourable Members. I was still on the experience in Latin America, the Dominican Republic but I would like to come to the Asian experience. In the Asian experience Honourable Members, the bank in Indonesia,

**MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR. NASHA):** Ke kopa tlhaloso Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Tota gone kana Mokwena Mokaulengwe ka fale ga a wela. *I think* fa o tsaya *case* o tshwanetse gore o re bolelele. O simolotse sentle o re bolelela gore, e ne ya simologa jaana moo ga seka ga e solegela molemo. O bo o sa wele gore ya bo e tokafadiwa jaana jaanong, e eme ka dinao ka gore , oa bona gore ke raya jang?

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Thanks, perhaps Honourable Member missed out on that one because I indicated that it changing from a borrower dominated institution to a depositor dominated institution it started working very well to the extent that it is making profit. Perhaps the Honourable Member has missed that.
Honourable Members, I said I am looking at the experiences of developing countries. I have broken them into Latin America and Africa. Therefore, I am still in Latin America and Asia, I will be coming to Africa and Southern Africa in particular. I will be coming later much closer home.

One of the success stories that we read about and have obtained information on, is that bank in Indonesia. It is said to be probably one of the most successful public Agricultural Development Banks. The way it operates is that as I indicated earlier on, the issue of information and human capital, standard commercial banks because of the special diversion in agriculture and the problem associated with seasonality and other problems like weather, banks are reluctant to get much more information on smaller farmers in rural remote areas which an Agriculture Development Bank with its staff its human capital, get information on individual borrowers, they know them direct and they know their credit worthiness.

The basic reason is under conversional borrowing, there is something called adverse selection. While the banker is not conversant with all the details about potential borrower, they decide to lend to high-risk people with high interest rates, hence leaving out the small man who he or she does not know. Therefore, that is called adverse selection, because of the risk involved in not having adequate information about the potential borrower.

However, an Agricultural Development Bank staff because they are out in the areas, they know people individually, local conditions, who is more likely to pay and who is not, they are more in a position to lend to small borrowers who are most invariable able to pay. The
other issue that leads to commercial banks take for example the NDB, Honourable Members will bear me out that they complain about …

MR SIELE: *On a point of clarification Madam Speaker.* Madam Speaker, ke ne ke batla go tlhaloganya, ke gore kana Motlotlegi ga a a ka a re feleletsa sentle gore ko bogare jwa America, jaaka a ne a bua ka lefatshe le la bo Dominican Republic, yone banka e tota e ampo dibanka tse di feletse go diregile jang ka tsone kana kose solegetse batho molemo jang. Ka gore, kitso ya me mo mafatsheng a bogare jwa America, a a santseng a tlhabologa, bontsi jwa *institutions* tse Motlotlegi a di buang, di tshwaraganye ampo di ne di tshwaraganye thata le dikoporase. Tsone dibanka tsone tse a buang ka tsone tse they were more linked to corporative credit bank, ke raya ka kitso yame ka fa ke itseng ka teng mo mafatshenyaneng a le mantsi gone ko bogare jwa America, ke gakologelwa gone ko bo Guatemala le bo *Comilla*. Jaanong ga a aka a atolosa go bua ga gagwe, gore re tle re kgone go itseela sentle re tle re kgone go mo sala morago foo, ka gore tota maikaelelo ke gore re tle re mo eme nokeng, mme re mo ema nokeng ka mabaka a a tsepameng a a lolameng sentle.

Ke a leboga.

MR MOKGWATHI: When it gets to cooperatives Honourable Member, that is one aspect that looks at the tailor-made services that you are talking about and I am going to be talking about issues like wholesale, retail, inputs and outputs and the role that such intermediaries play.

With regard to on farm and off farming, one of the issues that have to be talked about is, those banks that have failed due to strictly focussing on agriculture and farmers and not on the input side and the buyers of the products from the agricultural section and such
intermediaries. One example that I am going to be giving about the cooperatives is the Egyptian example which failed because cooperatives there, were simply used as a source of providing fertiliser and collecting the products from the farmers. As privatisation took place, there was no rationale for keeping cooperatives and they went bust.

That is also analogous to a situation in Botswana. Therefore, if cooperatives are included as an intermediary between banks and farmers, in a situation whereby we have relaxed our financial market structures, privatisation being the order of the day, then if the cooperative does not operate efficiently, it is kicked out of the market. So, in our mixed economy system with deregulation, sometimes cooperatives do not make sense, they are overtaken and out-smarted by more competitive systems. That is the Egyptian example, which then I will probably not come to it when I discuss Africa because I have given it as one of the flaws that they had.

I will cite an example of the issue of the Dominican Republic Bank. If I may quote from a study that was done in 1995 by Gonzalesvegar and Douglas Graham, Honourable Speaker, they were from the Department of Agricultural Economist of the Ohio State University. The title of the study report was ‘State Owned Agricultural Development Banks, Lessons and Opportunities for Micro-Finance.’ I quote Madam Speaker, on Page 35 on the Dominican Republic. Besides all these other issues that I am talking about, restructuring and being more deposit dominated than borrower dominated, it says, “Thus, increasingly shifting the funding base from external donor funds to domestic deposits reduced behaviour in compatible with viability by tightening managerial accountability and improving loan evaluation and collection practices. The institution became less borrower dominated in its procedures and practices and substantially improved its
learning performance in the early 1990s. Most importantly, it added a valuable deposit service to its functions for which strong rural demand was revealed.”

The other bank that I had just started talking about which is regarded as possibly the most successful public bank was the Bank Richard in Indonesia, which is spread throughout Indonesia and helps farmers in terms of deposit mobilisation. It focuses on deposit mobilisation.

Secondly, regarding the role of the Performance Based Reward System or remunerative system, it has been proved throughout research work that in a situation whereby the salaries of employees of such banks are not tied to the government, salary structures where reward is based on performance in terms of collection of the loans, the number of deposits that are being generated by the bank manager going out into the countryside encouraging people to deposit; the number of increases in the deposit, the lending rates, recoveries of the payments have been used as the basis for remuneration which has helped improve on the performance of the organisation.

The other issue that relates to that one is where the lending practices and procedures are not necessarily restricted to headquarters, where there is a certain level of borrowing and where branch managers can make decisions. We know that, for example, with the CEDA case, up to about P50,000, managers can take decisions without referring the application to the headquarters.

Thirdly, the other issue that has made this bank successful is that, it is not restricting lending to farm activities but, there is on farm and off farm activities. Off farm activities include suppliers of the inputs in production and also lending to those who would be purchasing from the farmers. Therefore, this is what makes it successful, unlike a
situation whereby banks; let me give a classical example of Botswana, if you want to get into the dairy production, it is clear from CEDA that you can only produce fresh milk for sale to other buyers, but there is no provision for the market. The market is not guaranteed and there is no link between what comes from the farm, who buys it and how it is processed. So, with Indonesia, there is also the issue such as, are there adequate inputs, do we have the market channels? These are funded as well.

In the case of Botswana for example, if I want to rear dairy cows or produce heifers to sell to dairy farmers, it is one issue that is not taken into account. Therefore, you notice the question of on farm and off farm and the supplementary activities that have to be taken in order to ensure proper output. These do not take place. Let us take for example, farming, we buy seeds from Botswana Agricultural Marketing Board (BAMB), but as for the inputs, there is no clear setup whereby, for example Rural Industries Innovation Centre (RIIC), is not in a position to be funded as a deliberate attempt to ensure that farmers have the necessary inputs readily available.

MR TSOGWANE: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. I start to have difficulty in understanding the trend. He is talking about the markets as well as inputs, but I should remind him that in our case, he should not forget the welfare state. He should not forget that we have other programmes, which are not even lending; they just provide freely some of the inputs, institutions like ALDEP. Therefore, I really do not understand whether he says that because we will have developed a farmer’s bank, then those must go away.

There is no adequacy in what he is trying to address. I thank you.

MR MOKGWATHI: Honourable Member, all I am saying is, we should look towards coming up with a setup that makes people have access to credit to financial services. You
and me are aware that in order for us to develop much more than we have developed, there is need to have a situation whereby we reduce the dependence syndrome that our people have developed on government.

There is no evidence to suggest that even small borrowers who have access to ALDEP and other schemes will not be able to pay back if there was such a bank. There is no evidence to that effect. Contrary to that, there is evidence to say that small farmers have always paid and have been able to pay.

**MR MORUTI:** Ke kopa *clarification* Madam Speaker. Kana ke ne ke kgatlhegetse motion o thata, jaanong rraetsho ga ke mo utlwe. E rile fa a bua kgantele a a fa sekai sa Indonesia le mafatshe a mangwe, o ne a supa gore batho ba ne ba felela ba sa duele, mme go bo go dirwa gore jaanong ba banka ba simolole ba batle mo bathong.

Mme kana gompieno ka fa re buang ka teng, fa go na le mananeo one a boALDEP le a mangwe, ke mananeo a e leng gore batho ba teng ga ba kgone le gone go nna le madi a gore ba ka duela dibanka fa ba adimile. *That is why* go na le di-*incentive* tse di ntseng jaana. Jaanong ke utlwa o ka re jaanong gape mo go yone e, o bona e le gore ga go tlhokafale gore fa e le gore banka e teng, di-*incentive* tse di ntseng jalo di ka nna teng.

Se sengwe gape sa bobedi se ke batlang gore a itlhalose mo go sone ke gore, kana gape go boditswe potso kgantele ka *clarification*, ya gore fa e le gore mo CEDA kana mo NDB, tsone tse a di buang tse go ka nna le a *window* ya gore di tseongwe mo teng, a gone ga a bone go ka siama. Mme o ntse ga a e arabe, jaanong go ntsenya mo tsietsegong e tswa e le gore tota motion o, ke ne ke o rata fela thata.

---

*Monday 12 February 2007*
MR MOKGWATHI: First, let me attempt to answer the last one, the issue as to whether it would not be right if we incorporate those suggestions that I am coming up with, within the existing financial institutions.

One of the issues that I have indicated is the question of a bank charter as well as the question of deposit mobilisation, which these organisations do not have. If they are going to be established in a manner that they are going to be able to provide deposit facilities, they can mobilise deposit and reduce dependence on government, there would be no problem. Another issue is the question of those who cannot even afford to have access to financial institutions. I am not necessarily suggesting that for those who cannot afford, there must be an outright blanket decision for everybody to be forced to go to the banks without government coming out with assistance schemes.

Earlier on when I started presenting this motion I said, there would still be some other subsidy schemes that would be continued and carried by government. What I am saying is that, such schemes leave out a certain group of people in between. Those who have access to the commercial banks and those who have access to government schemes, there is a large majority of the people within who do not benefit from either of those. Those are the people I am concerned about and those are the people who are concerned with themselves not having access to government schemes or access to existing financial schemes. Those are the people we setup these institutions for.


*I am sure even in your research you will agree with me when I draw you back home,* fa o lebelela mo Africa dibanka tse di kileng tsa lekwa kwa Niger, Ivory Coast, Togo *all of*
them have closed down. Di tswetswe because of problems as you know in the early 1980s as a result of several reasons among others, they followed what exactly you were saying and a supply driven strategy that neglected the deposit mobilisation. The top down hierarchy control which you are talking about, you cited examples of the loss ya madi through National Development Bank giving an example gore e ne e ntse jaana. Even in West Africa, kwa Ghana le kwa Gambia the banks were not viable. Now ke ne ke sa ntse ke batla gore ke re dikai tse re batlang gore re di dirise re benchmarka mo go tsone a di re fe sengwe se e leng gore re ka bona e le gore we are doing it just for the purpose of benchmarking on things that have collapsed. Re batla go tokafatsa seemo sa farmers tsa rona. Ke emetse constituency ya balemi-barui mme ke batla gore e re fa ke boela kwa ke kgone go ba fa sengwe se se tletseng se ke se tshwereng.

MR MOKGWATHI: Thank you, Madam Speaker. Honourable Member, I am going to be giving examples of Togo, Ivory Coast and the Gambia when I come to Africa. What I am trying to come up with is that we do not necessarily have to benchmark on some other countries that have not succeeded. If I may just indicate the major reason for their lack of success Madam Speaker, those in West Africa there is Anglophone Africa and Francophone Africa. Can I quote from the same document that I read? It says; “Most development banks in Francophone West Africa have been closed (Niger, Ivory Coast and Togo) or repeatedly recapitalised with outside funds to little effect like in Senegal. All these institutions had followed a supply driven strategy that neglected domestic deposit mobilisation in favour of external funding emphasised top down hierarchical control with no decentralisation or staff incentives and heavily concentrated long portfolios in the agricultural sector with poor to non-existent support services for a low
productivity farm clientele.” I go on to West Africa. “Whereas West African countries such as Ghana and Gambia have recorded a similar history but with a difference; whereas these countries followed a supply leading strategy of credit allocation to targeted farm clientele. They also cultivated a more diversified portfolio of rural and urban non-farm enterprises covering a wide spectrum of micro and small business activities and potential loans to salary employees in the public and private sectors. These clients were responsible borrowers. This bank became increasingly unviable not because of these clients who constituted the majority in number, but due to the large volume in default from a small number of large borrowers with sufficiently political influence to engage in rampant range seeking behaviour.” Therefore, those are the reasons for their lack of success. I wish Honourable Members to always when I present such examples to contrast it with the case of Botswana, and as to whether we are in the same problems that they have or are we better off to be in a position to start these banks. Therefore, we should be looking at it Honourable Members from this perspective, contrast these situations where they failed and the reasons why they failed and are we in such a…

MR MOATLHODI: Ke kopa tlhaloso. Ke a leboga Motlotlegi Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke a leboga mokaulengwe wa me. Se ke neng ke re ke se kopele tlhaloso ke gore ke utlwa mokaulengwe a bua ka gore mathata a dikoloto ke one kgotsa a ileng a gogela gore dibanka tse a ntseng a di umaka tse di tswalwe. Jaanong ke re ke mmotse gore a o gakologelwa gore e rile mo dingwageng gongwe tse di eight or nine tse di fetileng puso ya nna le lenaneo le go neng gotwe Small Medium and Micro Enterprise (SMME) e batho ba paletsweng ke go e duela. Gompieno bangwe ba sa ntseng ba emisa ka je le je go batlwa madi a ba neng ba a adimile. E bile a ne a adimilwe bone batho ba re
kobo dikhutshwane. Fa e le gore mokaulengwe o a gakologelwa ke eng se mo nayang bosupi ja gore fa banka e a buang ka yone e ka tlhongwa batho ba tlaa duela?

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Honourable Member, trying to answer you as honestly as possible, the issue of SMME is not necessarily different from some other schemes that were under Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA), Financial Assistance Policy (FAP), SMME and others. We are still trying out with the existing government structure, with the existing information and human capital that does not understand the way the micro-finance and rural enterprises operate. That is the problem that we have. However, if we have a bank that is concerned with the necessary expertise being given to it, then we would not be having the same problems of trying out schemes year in and year out.

**MR KARIO:** Clarification. Ke a leboga Honourable Mokgwathi. Ke ne ke kopa thaloso ka gore re leka go botsa tse dingwe mme ga di arabiwe mo go kgotsofatsang. Ke botse gore fa o ne o ka fiwa *options* tse pedi ya ntlha go bo gotwe *all these concerns* tse o nang le tsone tse e bileng re le bantsi re nang le tsone and restructuring suggestions tse re ka nnang le tsone di bo di tsenngwa mo go *National Development Bank (NDB)* re bo re tlogela leina la yone e ntse e le NDB. Kgotsa re bo re tsenya yone megopoloe e re e neela NDB re bo re fetola re e bitsa re re *National Development and Agricultural Bank*, o tlaa wela mo optioning efe? Re introdusitse *options* tse o di buang mo go yone banka e e leng teng fa *except the change of name*.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** It is not the name per se, that I am concerned with, it is the purpose and functions of such an institution. If NDB was re-structured in a manner that it would provide the necessary finance to those that have been left out and operate in a manner that helps promote agricultural production, there would be no problem. The issue
is people are more concerned with the name. I am not concerned with the name; I am concerned with setting up an institution that would be more productive and attain the necessary objectives that …

MR GUMA: Elucidation, Madam Speaker. Thank you, Honourable Member. Honourable Member, when you started I may have been late. From what I see in the motion that you presented to us if I could come from this premise that this is a business proposal that you are presenting to this Honourable House and you want to convince the Minister of Finance to set aside funds for the benefit of the nation for this particular project. Now, convince us properly and come nicely with facts and say this is what is prevailing on the ground. This is what I want done, these are the statistics and this is where the results will come in. As an economist you know better, but when you start comparing two economies you must work from the same premise. However, you see the way you are putting it, your points are haphazard when the topic is nice. You are not coming out clearly, you are picking up issues from that level to that level but the topic itself is well meaningful. You should come out properly with an overview, the background, come out with the statistical analysis and taking into consideration what is prevailing on the ground, our population, and then how viable this entity will be. How is it going to be funded, is it going to be profit making, all these things should actually come out Mokgwathi. The topic is nice but the way you are presenting it is so vague, you are throwing bits and pieces there and there. I am not able to pick up exactly where you are headed.

MR MOKGWATHI: Honourable Member, if you would appreciate the fact that I am trying to respond to the questions that come as a result of interjections and even come
from my having to answer the issues that would be answered later. That is what creates the problem. I had intended, Madam Speaker, to present it in a manner that I give the background and the problems that other countries …

MADAM SPEAKER: Order! Honourable Members, *mo reetseng*!

MR MOKGWATHI: I had intended to present it in a manner that I give the rationale behind this thing, the background behind existing and failed agricultural development banks. Why they failed and why we in this country cannot fail because we are different from them in what particular way. I had indicated that we would be taking about the pre-conditions for success. What is it that would make it more successful? As for the question on the statistics that you want me to compare with, I remember Honourable Merafhe the other time was saying that we should not necessarily compare ourselves with the handicapped if we are going to go ahead. The reason is that, it has been proven that we do not need the statistics to be able to tell that on average in terms of Africa we are much more advanced. That information is very intuitive to Honourable Members that I did not need to bother them with it. They know about the situation, they know that the country contributes 2.6 or three per cent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP). We contribute 0.01 per cent to government revenue. I expect Honourable Members to know these issues. In this case, all I am trying to talk about is principle behind it and why we need to establish this bank. However, as to the cost and benefits of it, as long as the House accepts the principle, I do not think Honourable Members should be in a position to say I should give the statistics on that.

MR SEBETELA: *Ke kopa tlhaloso*. Madam Speaker, Honourable Kgathi asked a very important question very early in the member’s contribution; and the question was, would
you rather create a new institution or rather merge CEDA and NDB? Motivate or argue for the points that you are raising, for the conditions of financial assistance to farmers to be improved. I think this is a very important question, especially as you are an economist and you have read, I believe, the article for World Bank IMF visits to Botswana, which have indicated that this Republic is creating far too many institutions to be funded by government. With that information as an economist, are you convinced that the root to take is to create a new institution or rather to try to engage the two ministers to find some way of improving lending conditions for the agricultural sector. We agree with what you are saying but I think the approach is what we are at loggerheads with.

**PROCEEDINGS SUSPENDED FOR 25 MINUTES**

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Thank you, Madam Speaker, just before we broke for tea, Honourable Sebetela had wanted to find out if in the event it is proposed that improvements be made on the existing financial institutions like Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) and National Development Bank (NDB), whether this would be acceptable. In response to that, Madam Speaker, I should state that I had indicated earlier on that one of the most important issues as a financial service, as a service to the community, to the rural areas, to agriculture, is lack of a savings facility for them, but NDB does not provide deposit facilities and CEDA does not. If I may quote from the presentation that was given to Members of Parliament by NDB on the 5th of April 2005 at an all party caucus. It indicates that on the phased implementation of the strategic plan that they had, it reads that, “The government advised the bank to hold its strategy of accepting deposits. However, NDB is facing in other aspects of its grand
stand.” Therefore, the fact that there are no deposits in such a bank is not helpful to the ordinary people in the countryside.

The other issue is the issue of phasing the privatisation of NDB. If NDB is to be privatised, because the main problem that we are facing is leaving out a lost clientele, a significant number of borrowers, with the current structure, CEDA also has a lost clientele of borrowers who would be willing to pay, but they have no other source of finance, they do not have other sources of credit. Therefore, the reason for my talking about the establishment of an Agricultural Development Bank is because of this factor. There must be a special dispensation; a review of the existing agricultural finance systems, to make them tailor made to promote the agricultural sector. It was because of the fact that government is to privatise, were it not because of privatisation, I would have requested that there should be a review in order to consolidate all agricultural finance schemes under one roof, but the issue of privatisation does not. There was also the issue of merging Botswana Savings Bank with the NDB. It would have helped, but NDB has indicated in the report, they said that they can still succeed on their own without merging with Botswana Savings Bank, which would be of benefit to the rural community, hence my saying that there must be an agricultural development bank that provides tailor made services, instead of leaving out this lost clientele that could take advantage of any existing financial institution on Agriculture which does not exist at the moment. At CEDA they are not provided for, at NDB they are also not provided for, and they are in the majority hence my saying that there must be that particular bank. If it is agreeable to Government that this could be incorporated...
MR GAOLATHE: Madam Speaker, on a point of clarification. The Honourable Member will recollect that in my speech I indicated that CEDA was going to be comprehensively reviewed, and the Honourable Member will also recollect that this Honourable House did adopt a motion by Honourable Mokalake to improve the conditions of lending to the agricultural sector. Now, as a result of the decision to review the CEDA scheme, terms of reference we drawn up. I just want to read to the Honourable Member a few sections out of the terms of reference, which are very comprehensive, just to indicate that some of the issues that he has been raising in passing will be covered. For example, term of reference No.5 reads: “To undertake a cost effectiveness analysis of running CEDA offices countrywide and assess the possibility of expansion for geographic coverage or otherwise”. Term of reference 7: “To review the coverage of the scheme in terms of the disadvantaged groups such as youth, women, people with disability, etcetera, as well as to consider it exposure to various sectors. IV. “To ascertain the accessibility or financial assistance for all the windows provided under CEDA”. Finally, reporting: “The consultants shall report to the reference group. The reference group shall be composed of representatives drawn from Agriculture, Finance, Trade and Industry, Environment, Wildlife, Local Enterprise Authority, Private Sector, Non-Governmental Organisations etcetera.” To just make sure that no group is not covered. In view of that, would the Honourable Member not have been patient perhaps to defer this thing until that is done?

MR MOKGWATHI: Thank you, Honourable Minister, for elucidating on that because the concern of the people is what is it that is being done to take care of those who have been left. Now that you are telling us that you will provide for those that have been left out, I am in position to accept that, but there is the issue that you have not mentioned, the
issue of the deposit facility and the reliance on Government for assistance without the need for these banks to be financially independent...

**MR GAOLATHE:** On a further point of clarification, Madam Speaker. The issue of...

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** *On a point of procedure, Madam Speaker.* Ke batla gore o re thus, mmaetsho. Golo fa go na le gore gangwe le gape o bua gore fa motto a batla go emelela ka sepe fela kana ke *point of order* kana ke eng, o tshwanetse a emele gore o mmitse, e seng jalo o ka nna wa mo tseela dikgato, *but* ke bona o ka re bangwe gone mo Ntlong e, mongwe wa bone e le Tona ya Madi, bone ba ema pele o bo o re *Honourable* Minister ko morago a setse a ntse a eme, mme ga o kgaleme ka bogale jo e reng bangwe ba ema o sa ba supa o bo dire. A go tlhamaletse, mma?

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Nnyaa o bua sentle, Honourable *Whip.* Gone tota fa gongwe ke go tlhoka go itse. Honourable *Minister,* ke gore o kope o sa ntse o ntse fa fatshe *point clarification or point of elucidation or whatever,* *but* fa gongwe tota ke itse gore e ya bo e le fela gore motto o a bo a sa itse. Ke kgakololo e e siameng.

**MR GAOLATHE:** On a point of further clarification, Madam Speaker. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The Honourable Member has mentioned more than once the need to have a bank that can accept deposits from potential borrowers. I just wanted to point out that in fact as you know, NDB is operating alongside Botswana Savings Bank. Botswana Savings Bank is doing exactly that as cost effectively as possible, because if you are going to have to distribute offices of the proposed bank or any other bank throughout Botswana, they will not be viable, that is why NDB had to close some of them. The reason why BSB is able to do so is because it is working with the Botswana Postal Services. Wherever they have offices then BSB takes advantage of that and they
collect deposits and these deposits can then be invested either by BSB themselves and some of it made available to NDB and the like. Thank you, Madam Speaker.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** The underlying thing, Madam Speaker, is the issue of the credit history and the knowledge by the lenders as to the potential borrower. In order for one to get a loan from NDB or even from CEDA there is need for the credit history, and as it is now, they do not have credit histories of their potential customers. Under the existing situation we know fully that BSB does not provide agricultural credit, and in this case the National Development Bank, as I have indicated commercial banks are reluctant to land to borrowers whom they cannot vouch for their payment history.

**MR MORUTI:** *On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker.* Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, o ka re re dikologa golo go le gongwe fela. Kana rraetsho o boditswe potso gore fa dilo tse a di buang tse *could be incorporated* mo NDB kana mo CEDA a ga a bone go le botlhokwa, o amogetse a re ee go botlhokwa, o ka amogela. Jaanong o ntse o a di boelela gape, kana mme ke sone se Tona a buang gore dilo tse di a di buang tse di ya go sekasekwa.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** All I am saying, Madam Speaker, is that while that is acceptable, it falls short of the other concern by the rural community that they do not have a serving facility, that is directly in agriculture, which helps improve on the information … that the branch managers have about their potential borrowers, that is all I am saying. If that could as well be incorporated in the terms of reference, then I would be happy. Thank you.

Under these circumstances, Madam Speaker, I move that this Honourable House request government to establish an Agricultural Development Bank to provide tailor-made financial services to the Agricultural Sector.
MINISTER OF FINANCE AND DEVELOPMENT PLANNING (MR GAOLATHE): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. We have listened very carefully to the case put before this Honourable House. While I appreciate the good intentions behind the Honourable Member’s motion, I am unable to support the motion. This is because other arrangements exist, other institutions exist, which do provide the services that the Honourable Member would like to be provided at a more cost effective way, and there is room for improvement. As I indicated, the CEDA scheme is under review just now, and all the interested parties will have a say as to how it should be structured in order to serve the interests of all the potential clients.

It should be appreciated that Government attaches greatest importance to agriculture because of its role in improving the welfare of our people and in contributing to the growth and diversification of the economy of Botswana. That is why for instance, the budget for the Ministry of Agriculture has increased over the years. Five years ago it was P470 million, this coming financial year it would have reached P695 million. Similarly, the development budget has been increasing over time.

There have also been schemes, which have been tailor-made to service the agricultural sector. The most important concern I have is the creation of yet another institution with additional overheads, additional superstructure, additional Chief Executive, additional officers when in fact, only recently other schemes were introduced. There has been a call by this Honourable House that for instance, Extension Officers should be made available throughout the country and they should be trained and all that. But before we can do that, we are now been called upon to come up with yet another institution, which will require offices, which will require a superstructure.
Let me point out that these other institutions do actually provide lending to the agricultural sector. To mention, there are three, which are Government institutions; National Development Bank (NDB), CEDA and the Botswana Development Corporation. Just to give examples, the NDB has got about 1,800 accounts. Of these accounts more than half are actually held by clients from the agricultural sector. Over the past five years, the NDB has financed agricultural businesses…

**MR MOKGWATHI:** Point of elucidation. Thank you, Honourable Minister, the information that we have dated 5th April 2005 to the Honourable Speaker, breaks down on Page 5 the split by sector in terms of portfolio and it gives agriculture as 17 per cent. So, could you reconcile with your 50 per cent, more than half that you are talking about please. Thank you.

**MR GAOLATHE:** Madam Speaker, what I was saying is that as at the end of December NDB had 1,862 accounts. Of these accounts, just over 50 per cent; 50.4 per cent were held by clients from the agricultural sector. Over the past five years, they had extended or financed 762 to projects in the sector amounting to P164, 823,000.00. When one looks at the NDB Act as the Honourable Member quoted it, it was promulgated some years back. In that Act, function number one is to extend financing to agricultural undertakings. It will be recalled that in the early days after independence most of the lending of NDB was actually going to agriculture. The other sectors as they grew of course, they extended. One of the reasons why NDB has continued to survive has been because of the profits from the other sectors, which have been ploughed to cross subsidise the agricultural sector. Therefore, what we are saying is that we have an institution, which is operating under the Act of Parliament, which says it must lend to the sector. One is not saying that
NDB is necessarily doing a good job, what we are saying is that the institution is there. If there are shortcomings why do we not come up with the shortcomings and see whether we cannot improve on that.

When it comes to CEDA as one of them, as you know the mandate for CEDA is wide and the agricultural sector is one of the beneficiaries. Over the past years since it was established because it is a new institution, it has extended or assisted 277 agricultural projects to the tune of P141 million. It would be recollected that Government recently decided to have yet another specialised window to promote involvement of young people in agriculture, a special window in CEDA, and this window is just about to begin. But more importantly, as a result of comments by this Honourable House, decisions were taken to have a comprehensive review of the CEDA scheme. I have narrated the terms of reference; I do not need to repeat that.

Perhaps I should point out that this very House adopted a motion by Honourable Mokalake, which reads as follows if I may quote, "That this Honourable House requests Government to consider extending both grace and repayment periods for CEDA agricultural loans in view of the slow rate at which agricultural undertakings generate profits". Therefore, that is being incorporated in this comprehensive review. In other words, the review will be looking at all the potential clients of CEDA in particular those from the agricultural sector.

I mentioned that BDC has a substantial portfolio, it also lends and has lent to the sector. More than 10 per cent of its outstanding lending has been extended to the agricultural sector. In addition to that, it would be recollected that some years back Government introduced an Agricultural Credit Guarantee Scheme, to assist farmers who face drought
from time to time. Which means that when these farmers borrow from NDB and they make some contributions, when the drought comes or floods come the scheme covers them, especially those who borrow on seasonal basis. If I may just indicate the extent to which Government has been assisting the farmers; over the past five years, the Government has paid approximately P45 million as a subsidy to farmers' loans that were affected by drought those years. Incidentally, this scheme is not just open to borrowing from NDB; it is also open to other banks who may be willing to participate provided they also make a contribution as well, alongside the contribution that the farmer may make. In addition to that, taking into account the fact that some of the farmers may not necessarily be credit-worthy, need to be upgraded to a point when they can be credit-worthy. Government has introduced a number of schemes. Let me mention the two that have been under review, the first one being the Arable Land Development Programme commonly known as ALDEP. This particular scheme has been reviewed and the Honourable Members have copies of the guidelines. It is intended to cover every farmer who has ten or less cattle or who earns P20,000 or below. He can go there and that is intended to mainly assist those who are involved in arable agriculture. Alongside that, is what used to be called SLOCA and associated facilities or schemes have been reviewed...

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF LABOUR AND HOME AFFAIRS (MR MATLHABAPHIRI): Point of clarification. Madam Speaker, ke ne ke re gongwe Tona a tlahose. Rona di guideline tse re di tshotse tsa ALDEP, di bua ka dikgomo tse 20 jaanong Tona fa a bua fale a re dikgomo tse some.

MR GAOLATHE: Thank you, very much. I certainly, do recollect what I said which was 20 or less.
MADAM SPEAKER: It was a slip of the tongue; you said 10.

MR GAOLATHE: I was now saying that alongside the ALDEP because it is mainly for those engaged in arable agriculture, is a scheme which used to be called SLOCA and other smaller schemes associated with it, has also been reviewed and reinstated to specifically cover that group of farmers who may have difficulty in borrowing from this institution, so that they can grow and reach a stage when they can be self sustaining. Therefore, that scheme is there to assist those involved in livestock rearing; in livestock sector.

MR SEBETELA: Point of clarification. I hope the Minister is aware that with respect to the livestock management and infrastructure development facility, livestock is strictly defined as cattle. It does not cover goats, sheep, pigs and chickens and I hope it is something Madam Speaker, the Minister can review. Further, Madam Speaker, it does not cover medium to large-scale horticultural farmers. It is only beef farmers.

MR GAOLATHE: Thank you, very much. In fact, under the revised SLOCA as the Honourable Member has stated, it is going to be called Livestock Management Infrastructure Development project. There is a window through which those who do not have small stock at all can actually buy. They can actually be assisted to acquire to buy that. However, having said that, certainly there is no reason why as we are saying schemes like these ones when they are been reviewed, in the next review or whenever some of the concerns raised by the Honourable Member cannot be taken care of. I should mention that of course those who are 35 years and below, already have the other window, which covers everything that the Honourable Member has just mentioned.
Monday 12 February 2007

I was just mentioning that to answer the concern by the Honourable Member that there may be a group of farmers somewhere in the middle who are not deemed by the financial institutions to be credit-worthy and therefore they are left out. All I am saying is that no, no they are not being left out. They are not credit worthy but there are these schemes, which are there to graduate them to a point where they can actually be credit worthy. Now, having said that…

HONOURABLE MEMBER: Clarification.

MR GAOLATHE: Madam Speaker, I do not want to be lengthy on this one.

MR MOKGWATHI: Thank you. I hope the Minister is aware that according to the borehole equipping and borehole drilling and reticulation programme that he is talking about, even those that are assisted with six heads of cattle, if they group themselves they only can be assisted up to 70 per cent. Taking into account the drilling costs, they will still have to go to the banks and others, which are not provided for. Thank you.

MR GAOLATHE: Thank you, very much. Indeed, the assistance is exactly assistance; it is not Government paying everything like what we used to hear that some people want Government to plough for them, weed for them, and harvest, cook for them and they just eat.

These schemes leave a small bit, which can be augmented by self-help and it is not difficult actually to do that. You just go, o ya go epela yo mongwe disana a bo a go duela, o bo o tla o oketsa gone mo kana you just sell a few goats, you do that. So, that is appreciated, and it is not a big deal.

Having said that, actually I do not want to be lengthy on this one. I agree with the Honourable Member that many such banks in Africa and elsewhere has collapsed. We do
not actually have to go too far, because even here we witnessed the establishment and subsequent collapse of the Botswana Cooperatives Bank. This does not mean that the next one will collapse, it means we have to be careful and learn from the mistakes that those who went before made. Therefore, if you come with an institution, it must be a solid one.

But certainly as has been explained by Honourable Sebetela that government has been concerned about proliferation of parastatals, certainly I do not think Madam Speaker that it is advisable to have a bank of this nature when we have others, which will be another parastatal by government, as I said duplicating infrastructure.

One of the reasons why this CEDA Young Farmers Fund was opened within CEDA was to share the infrastructure that exists, rather than have a parallel infrastructure, which will consume the funds instead of the funds getting to the people as soon as possible. Therefore, I do not consider it advisable. Honourable Speaker, this does not mean that government per se or my ministry is against the establishment of an agricultural development bank by the private sector, by cooperatives or by anybody and government seeing how it can assist such effort. We insist we would want to encourage that the farmers like in other countries, get together with others and establish such a bank and government can see how may be in a small way, can assist. The same way government did assist the Botswana Cooperative Bank. As you know, government did provide them with long term capital which government of course lost as a result of the collapse of that particular bank. It should be clear that government has no objection, in fact, would like to encourage the private sector to establish such a bank. Whether it is a cooperative bank or just a farmers’ bank, government will support but not be involved in yet another
parastatal before its own parastatals are improved to a point where we can say they are not providing the service which is supposed to be provided.

With those few interventions I would not support as I said I do not think it is advisable. I appreciate the intentions of my colleague the Honourable Member, and I would hope that from this explanation he can see that is we work together, especially if he were to contribute to the review I mentioned, his concerns would be accommodated. I thank you, Madam Speaker.

**MR GABORONE (SOUTH EAST NORTH):** Thank you, Madam Speaker. I would like to start off by just expressing concern. My concern is, first, it looks like from what the Minister is saying and from his written notes, a decision was already taken that he is going to be opposing the motion.

I do not know whether we are doing ourselves any good as a nation when issues like this which are development oriented are going to be discussed in other fora other than in this Parliament. Where you see there are interventions that are meant even to nip the discussion in the bud, even before we could allow it to flow and hear what we are trying to achieve.

**HONOURABLE MEMBER:** …(Inaudible)…

**MR GABORONE:** *Wena o paro, ga ke itse gore o tlaa itse leng gore o Minister.* Having said so I would like to make a few interventions, one relating to this kind of a motion that globalisation is no longer a prospect, it is a reality. As such, it is bringing into this economy, into this country or into the world, a lot of competition. As such we have to prepare our people for this competition, especially farmers, if they are going to compete
with their counterparts outside the borders of this country. To do that we have to look at the institutions that exist, that are trying to bring that about among our farmers.

One of the things that we have to appreciate is that, farming is a dynamic thing; it is not static. By that I mean, you look at what happens in the crops, in the animals that we rear, they change every time you look at them they do that because there is a lot of research that goes into this sector. Where there are established institutions like in South Africa for instance, where people do a lot of research, there is a bank that looks after that sector. There is the research wing that looks at the cultivar for instance if you want to talk about crops, that can subsist or that can exist in the environment in South Africa. They will look at the kind of livestock that can be suited to exist in certain areas of South Africa. We are lacking in this thing. The kind of research that we are having is the research that is oriented towards academic achievement and it is not applied. A bank as this would definitely have to have a research wing that must look after the welfare of the farmers in that respect.

Honourable Member has talked about the financial side, but I feel we are lacking in this area where we do not take care of the research aspect. As a result, that is why our farmers are going to be subjected to the Genetically Modified Organisms (GMO) coming from the developed world, and we are going to lose out ultimately. We are going to depend entirely on what comes from the developed world. We are going to let our own crops that we know, that are suited for this environment to disappear just because the way we look at Agriculture is just dishing out money and not that aspect which is going to be advising our people as to which crops to really guard jealously, make sure that they do not disappear and give place to the others that are coming in from abroad.
Last year some of us were taken as a group to for instance, experiment on melons. They managed to grow, but there were several problems where you could not continue that kind of melon. One was that, you had to grow them under a certain environment and you have to use bees to do the pollination and when it rained the melons were attacked by what we call *downing mildew*. In order to fight this you have to spray, but you cannot spray when the bees are there because you will kill them.

However, our melons here in Botswana are not susceptible to that kind of condition. We are taking this kind of a bank as if it is just going to give money and forget that there are other aspects of the bank that must be developed. The research, the insurance, the marketing. If people are going feel…

**MR MOATLHODI:** On a point of clarification. The clarification Madam Speaker that I am…

**MADAM SPEAKER:** Honourable Moatlhodi, please take your seat. *O nne pele o mme ke go bitse, le ene a yieldile. O a bona. Jaanong ema ka dinao o botse.*

**MR MOATLHODI:** I am highly indebted to your good Speakership Madam Speaker. The clarification that I am seeking from the Honourable Member for South East North, he is talking about research, do I mean to understand you with all my whatever I am subjected to your good self Sir. Do you mean to tell us that the existing institutions have been put into existence without research?

**MR GABORONE:** I had hoped he was going to tell me that they have such research. I do not want to say they do not have, but if there is, they are not keeping pace with what is happening. They are depending on what is coming from outside.
If you read Farmers Weekly on monthly or on regular basis, you will find what researches have gone into this sector in South Africa for instance. They will be coming out, just for instance they will be looking at what species of goats will subsist in areas like Kgalagadi because they will be looking at areas like Upington in South Africa. However, what we are not doing is, we do not have a bank or an institution that can pride itself on doing such research to help the farmers to be able to cope with the local conditions.

We are looking at the money side of it and forgetting that we can only get benefits out of farmers if they are doing things in a manner that will be profitable to both them and to the bank. The motion as it is requires men and women in this House not to look at it as just a motion to dispense with immediately without applying our minds to it and looking at the good things that may be in it.

We have talked about NDB and CEDA, those are government parastatals and he is talking about a bank. Those are government parastatals working under the rules set by government through the Boards, through the Act. It is saying that, but it is up to us ultimately to decide how we remove the parastatal element out of it. He is just saying let government do it, but that does not mean it must remain a parastatal.

Therefore, if it is a parastatal it is going to go the route all parastatals usually go, where there is no autonomy and government will breathe down upon the Board. Perhaps then we can get into a debate and think about ways of improving on what the Honourable Member has come up with. I thank you.

MINISTER OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT (DR NASHA): Tanki Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mma ke simolole fela ke re ga ke eme mogopolo o nokeng. Tota fela gone nna e rile ke o bala maloba mo Notice paper ka utlwa madi ame a
tsamaelana le one, ka re gongwe golo fa go nale kgang. Jaanong ka tla ka reetsa this morning ka bona gore golo fa tsela e tsena mo sekgweng. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, fa o baya motion fa pele ga ntlo o tshwanetse gore o tsise motion o nne structured gore re go sale morago re bone gore tota wa reng, o ntsha mabaka a a sa sukurweng, a papametse a ropame jaaka Motlotlegi Batsile a a tle a bue, a a tlhalosang gore ke eng fa go tshwanetse go nna jaana. Ke gakologelwa Motlotlegi Kedikilwe fa a mo raya a re jaanong o bolaya motion fa o e tsaya jalo kgang. A nna a tswelela fela a o bolaya mme gompieno re mo phitlhong ya motion, tota ga go sa tlole go nale motion fa. Jaanong ke ne ke re ke tlhamalatse mafoko, kana fa gongwe Batswana ba a reetsa fa ba le kwa. Ke tlhamalatse ko tshimolong gore kgang e e buiwang ke Motlotlegi Gaborone a re o ka re re ipoleletse fela gore re tsile go bolaya motion re ise re reets, this is Parliament. Tsamaiso ya Palamente e ntse jaana, for the benefit of non-parliamentarians; fa Mopalamente jaaka e le Motlotlegi Mokgwathi jaana, a simolola fela a bopa motion o bitsa ba ga gabo, mme ba a kopana gore kana motion ke o ba bo ba dumalane, ba bo ba dumalane le gore ba a go o support jaana le jaana. Go ntse jalo, is not it, jaanong fa le ba bangwe ba ba ka kwano re o bona le rona re a kopana re bo re buisana gore a mme gone fa re ka o dumela go raya eng, tota o raya eng, o tshotseong one, re tla re tshotse dipampiri re leba re bo re bona gore ga se o o ka sapotiwang. It is not a secret, let us face it, re seka ra nna re fora batho jaaka gompieno re ba fora fela gore re palelwa ke Budget ka gore re e neetswe maloba a maabane, selo se re tshwanetse re tle re se tlhalosetse ko pele. Go ntse fela jalo Mopalamente Motlotlegi Gaborone, re a buisanya, re senkile boreaitse, re lebile the pros and cons re bo re dumalana ka kwano gore mme go raya gore o na le mathata.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ga se sephiri, mma re papamatse jalo Rra go tswa ko tshimologong, e a bo e tlaa nna e kete re fitlhile dilo dingwe, ga re a fitlha sepe.

**MR KARIO:** Ke kopa tlhaloso Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke ne ke kopa gore mokaulengwe Motlotlegi Mma Nasha gore a tlhalose a ntse a le mo kgannyeng yone e, gore a one moono le yone tsamaiso e o e buang e ke yone e dirileng gore re kgone go dumalana le *motion* wa maloba wa *Professional Bodies Act* wa ga Motlotlegi Gaborone, ra dumalana le *motion* mongwe wa maloba o o neng o batla *to review Value Added Tax* (VAT), ra dumalana le *motion* wa maloba o o neng o batla *review CEDA*, ra gana e mengwe fela jalo, gore a ke yone tsamaiso e o lekang go e tlhalosa e *Honourable Minister*. Ke a leboga.

**DR NASHA:** O a bona go nna le banana go a thusa, *exactly* ke raya gone moo. Palamente e e nale *history* ya gore di-*motion* tse di ntsi tse di neng di tswa mo Kganetsong re di amogela ka mashetla le gone re sa di amogele fela re re nnyaa *we support*. Re di amogela ka mashetla re ntsha menangwana ya ka fa re di emang nokeng ka teng. Jaanong se nne e re fa le bona o ka re jaanong ga di dumalane e bo e kete le tlhabiwa ke mmitlwa, go ntse fela jalo. Mabaka a ga Mopalamente Motlotlegi mong wa leso ga a a nona. *In fact* ke sale ke belaela gore a tlaa bopama ko tshimologong e re fela a simolola a bo a re e rile ke le ko kgaolong batho ba nthaya ba re tsamaya o ye gore. Ke gone ka bo ke simolola ke ya go dira *research* fa morago e le yone e bopamang. Jaanong ka bona gore *it is for wrong reasons*, ga a a ka a *research* a bona gore tota kgang e o ka e ala ka bophara ya re solegela molemo go le kae Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Mma ke riana ke re fa o bona ke sa dumalane le mogopolo o jaana ke gore ga ke a utlwa gore gatwe ke eng re tshwanetse re dumalane le one. Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa...
Palamente, fa o bula banka fela *is a business concern*, Motlotlegi Maswabi o a itse. *First and foremost*, fa o sa itse ke gore jaanong o toutetswe ke letsapa jaanong o lebetse. Ke kgwebo *and* ka fa le Motlotlegi Mokgwathi a e buang ka teng ke kgwebo tota. Ka gore fa re tshwenetse go baya madi mo teng mo re lebile gore go tlaa nna le merokotso. Ga gona kgwebo e o ka e bulang fela o sa leba gore a botshelo bo tlaa tswelela jwa kgwebo eo. Ga a a ka a re neela mabaka a a nonneng a gore golo mo as a *business concern* e tlaa tsamaya jaana le jaana e bo e dira merokotso jaana le jaana e nna botshelo jo bo telele, ga a a re neela mabaka ao. Ke ka moo e leng gore nna ke na le mathata ka gore se re tlaa bong re se dira fela ke sone se re tlholang re se omanyediwa fa se ka Sekgoa gotweng *proliferation*. Motho maloba e rile a bua fa a re fa dijo di se monate se thube pitsa e thatswe. Jaanong fa e le gore dipitsa tse re apeileng ka tsone gompieno di lebega o ka re ya re fa o tsentse dikgong tsa motswere di seke di kgakgathisi sentle go raya gore re senke dikgong tsa mononono di tle di kgakgathie sentle fela. Jaanong ke sone se o utlwang bakaualengwe ba ntse ba botsa dipotso, le Motlotlegi Moruti tota yo o sekeng a tsena ope ganong a botsa potso gore thalosa. Mme thaloso e le jaaka re bua jaana bakaualengwe ga re a e utlwa. Ga re kake ra dumela fela ka gore mokaulengwe a rialo, nnyaa! Mabaka a gore ke eng re tshwanetse go dira bentlele e ya banka ya *agriculture* jaaka mokaulengwe a simolotse fela a bua gore *agriculture* ka boyone, temo le leruo, *is a risky business*. Re dumalana le ene, *it is very risky*, o tlaa tshela peo mo leupeng o bo o lelala legodimo, pula ga e ne ka gore lefatsho leno la rona le tshela ka *rain-fed agriculture* fa re bua ka temo. Le lone leruo tota kana fa pula e sana bojang ga boyo dikgomo di a bopama. Ke sone se o bona di-*dairy*, le fa e le ko Thamaga ka fa fela di nale mathata ka gore ga go na bojang. Jaanong fa e le *risky* jaana sengwe sa dilo tse mokaulengwe a ka bong a di tsisitse fa ke gore *how do you*
make it less risky gore e tle e kgone e nne le botshelo e nne le malatsi a a tlang e tshela; make it viable, make it reduce the risk, so to speak. Nnyaa Motlotlegi Moruti, ba seka ba go fora, ke ne ke sa go sebe mokaulengwe.

Jaanong o ne a re a simolola a bo a re kana ba bangwe ba bo CEDA le ba bangwe jaaka a ne a ba bua a re ba batla gore go duelwe ka kgwedi. It has been explained here, go tlhalositswe mo ntlong e ke ba ba itseng balemi-barui mo ntlong e gore le fa e le yone banka ya Barclays le Standard tota ba na le mo go tweng structured loans, tse di diretsweng mhama le motho yo o adimang. Fa o adima terekere go a twe re tlaa go neela nako e e kana gore e tle e re o sena go jwala.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Minister. Taking into account the riskness of agriculture and it being an important aspect of the economy that promotes development and is necessary for agriculture to be maintained, its riskness do not you think that, therefore, it suggests that it should be the responsibility of Government to ensure it provides the necessary funding?

**DR NASHA:** Kana nna ga ke ise ke ko ke gane gore fa go ne go ka dirwa banka eo Goromente ga a kake a tsenya sengwe mo teng. Se mokaulengwe Tona fa a se buang ke gore in fact he has confirmed gore Goromente o ka tsenya sengwe mo teng go e dira gore e tlhatlose madirelo. Mme se a neng a se bua ke gore ke eng re tshwenetse go nna le leina le leska ka re nale maina already, e bile o tlhalositse gore o setse a ntse a le mo temeng ya gore go seka-sekwe maina a a leng teng gore a ka tlhabololwa jang. Ke sone se re neng re re tota e ka bo e rile morago ga tlhaloso e mokaulengwe to withdraw motion ka gore o ne a bona gore ga gona bokamoso. Le ene tota le rona re le Mapolotiki re ntse jaana fa study se se tswa re na le gone gore re ka ya go tlhatlhelela ba ba tlaa bong ba dira tiro e. Re ba
tphatlhelele re ba bolelele gore tota se ba tshwanetseng go konotelela mo go sone ke eng jang le jang e seng go dira another institution e e tsileng go ja madi. Gape nna ke gore ke palelwa ke gore, a ke gore lona le tsaya gore fa Goromente a ntshitse madi a a tshela mo teng ga selo seo o tlaa bo a tsaya a tshela fela a bo a hulara a tsamaya a ya morakeng? Nnyaa, ga o kake wa re o tsentse dikoko mo hokong o bo o di tlogela, di sala di e swa, o tshwanetse gore ka gore o tsentse seabe mo teng o bone gore a mme di a tsala. Go ntse fela jalo.

Jaanong ke ne ke re ke tswelele ke re fa re ntse re tsweletse ka kgang ke utlwile Motlotlegi Mokgwathi a re, tota ene ba a ba buelelang ga se bo small farmer ke ba e leng gore ba fa gare, ke gore middle, I suppose fa e le gore go na le balemi go na le ba middle income farmers. Ke bone ba a buang ka bone bao ka gore ba ba nnye ba ba tlaa nna ba bona dithuso tsa ga Goromente e bong tsa bo Services to Livestock Owners in Communal Areas (SLOCA) le bo Arable Land Development Programme (ALDEP) ba a neng a ba dira maabane. Jaanong ke re fa a ne a kile for instance gone foo a re tlela ka statistics tse di supang gore kana here is a range of farmers. Re a itse gore ba ba ko godimodimo bale bangwe ba bone ba ba mo Ntlong e, ba ba ko godimo-dimo bale is a pyramid e ya kwa, they are fewer, go bo e tla jaana. A bo a re bolelela gore mme jaanong middle of this pyramid yone re bua ka batho ba le kae gore re nne sure gore is it a viable thing, how many people are we talking about, gongwe re raya 40 people fela. Ka gore ke itse gore mo Botswana mo balemi-barui are in the majority, ke bone ba a reng ene ga a ba buelele. Ke bone ba a sa ba bueleleng bao, bontsintsi jo bo senang palo jwa balemi-barui ke ba ba ko tlase bale. Ba le fa e le yone banka e fa e ka tsena ga ba kake ba lala ba ile go bona
Monday 12 February 2007

sepe mo go yone. Ke gone mo e leng gore go tlaa mpalela Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

**MR MOKGWATHI:** On a point of clarification Madam Speaker. Thank you Honourable Minister. You make an assertion that you know that the majority of those that are being assisted are small farmers and you are accusing me of not coming up with the statistics, would you be in a position to provide the statistics to justify your statement? The other thing is when it gets to the breakdown as to the categories of the farmers, it is a known fact that in Botswana we have people farmers, progressive farmers and master farmers, and there is a breakdown that is known. Thank you very much.

**DR NASHA:** Ga e kake ya re o feditse dibeke tse tharo o baakanya *motion* o paletswe ke go tla ka dipalo o bo o re nna ke ka bo ke tsile ka tsone gompieno gore ke tle ke go *support*, no! Ka re *majority*, go nale Tona wa *Agriculture* fa o tlaa re fa a na le dipalo tseo ka ke tiro ya gagwe nna ke bereka Namola Leuba, o tlaa tla a go bolelela gore ba kae. Ke bua selo se le wena o se itseng gore ko kgaolong ya gago kwa le dikgaolo tse tsotlhe fela tsa dikgaolo *the majority of the farmers in this country are small farmers.*

**MR SIELE:** Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente le Motlotlegi go neela sebaka. Ke re kana fa re bua ka *people farmer scheme, progressive farmer scheme* le bo-master farmer re bua ka *category* kana ka ditsela tse di neng di dirisiwa fa go ne go simololwa *the extension service as far back as* 1953.

Ke tsone tse e leng gore balemisi ba ne ba tsaya batho ka go ba rutuntsha go ba baya fa gare, morago ga diteko. Le go tla go ba baya mo seemong sa bo *master farmer* jaaka fa re itse gore ditso tsa *Agriculture*, di supa fa *master farmer* wa ntlha mo lefatsheng le e le Tautona wa pele, wa bobedi e ne e le Rre Mekgwenyane ko Mogobane kwa ga Malete.
Monday 12 February 2007

**DR. NASHA:** Ee, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ga ke kake ka itapisa ka go bua dipalopalo tse mong wa leso a sa tlang ka tsone.

Ke ne ke re ke tswelele ke re tota ga ke batle go bua go nna goleele golo fa ka gore, ke eletsa gore gongwe re bue re tle re fetse re tseye tshwetso. Ke re ka jaana e bile tota ke utlwile motlhala ko go Tona wa tsa Madi gore fa e le gore re mo tseleng ya *review*, a re yeng ko go yone re bone gore re ka thusa jang dibanka tse di leng teng go thusa batho.

Gape nna, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, se tota se ntshwentseng ke gore e re re le fa re botsa gore Mokaulengwe Mopalamente yo o tlotlegang, a re bolelele gore o di bonye ka dibanka tse di tsweletseng, mme e rile di tlaa tswelela tsa bo di tsweletse jang.

A bo a re bolelela gore ke eng fa di ne tsa swa pele tsa tloga tsa tsoga mo baswing ka goreng, mme a bo a sa wele.

Nna e a tle e re re bua mo Ntlong e gotwe e seka ya re fa o ipapisa wa ipapisa le bo semangmang, o ipapise le ba ba rileng. *The examples* tse Mokaulengwe wa rona a di buileng ka maina ka gore e rile a sena go di bua ka maina a seka a di nontsha, e re re tlaa re re le mo Southern Africa mo, a bo a pherelela ke yole a pheremetsega a ya Indonesia. A ya South America, bo Dominican Republic, ga re itse gore o tshaba eng mo SADC. Bogolo o ka bo a rile a tswa Cuba a tla fano mo Africa bogolo jang Africa e e borwa. A tla go re bolelela gore lebang ka fa Zimbabwe ka fa, go na le banka ya gore ya gore e tsamaile jaana le jaana e fa, a le rona re dire jalo.

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** *On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker.* Ke ne ke re ke botse Tona Mme Mma-Nasha yo motona ka go na le Mme Mma-Nasha yo monyennyane gore, molato wa go pheremetsega le go herelela o ya ko bo Indonesia ke eng.
Monday 12 February 2007

Ka gore ene Tona ene yo gompieno kgang e lebaganeng le ene, o tlhola a pheremetsega a herelela a sasankega a bua ka bo Malaysia. A pheremetsega a ya go bua ka bo China, a herelela ke yole a pheremetsega a ya go bua ka bo Jeremane. Mme go se molato, a sa pheremetsegele fa South Africa fa, tota go pheremetsega le go sasankegela koo ka Mokaulengwe a go kopile mo go ene Tona yo o tlholang a ntse a re kaela fa, molato wa gone ke eng?

DR NASHA: Aah Rre! Pharologanyo ke gore we have peculiar weather and climatic conditions in this country. Ga di tshwane le tsa Indonesia, ko bo tsunami ko merwalela e sa feleng teng kwa le dipula tse di matsorotsoro, nnyaa, kwano re mo sekakeng, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Ke sone se ke reng a re bapiseng dilo tse di bapileng. Pheremetsego ya gore o e ko merwaleleng le di tsunami, ke e kgala fa. Re bua ka temo-thuo. Fa re ne re bua ka tse dingwe tsa go kopa ditsamaiso tsa puso, go kopa gore re ka fokotsa jang corruption e e feletseng e re tsentse lesuka-suka, nnyaa moo o ka go kopa gongwe le gongwe kana it is a question of go bapala kitso. Mme fa o e bapalela mo leubeng o tswa ko Indonesia nnyaa, ga o a bapala le fa e le sepe, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente.

Ka fa nna ke e bonang ka teng, o a bo o pheremetsegile ka gore o a bo o latlhegile. Mmang ke le bolelele ke tsena mo pointeng ya bofelo. Lebaka le letona le nna ke le utlwalelang ka ga ke molemi-morui, lona balemi-barui le tlaa nkganetsa, le le a tleng le dire gore dibanka tse di itebagantseng le temo-thuo di none di gole di e kwa, ke the questions of ownership. Ke gore ke tsa bomang dibanka tseo? Ke tsa bo mang, le Vista o a itse. Dibanka tse di nonneng ke tse e leng gore balemi ga mmogo le boradikgwebo ba ba nang le madi ba tla mmogo ba bo ba bopa banka e, that is why ke ne ke bua gore business
concern go bo go nna le that ownership gore banka e ke ya rona, re tshwanetse go bona gore re a e tsweledisa. Ke sone se o bonang dingwenyana di tswelela mo Southern Africa. Kana le fa re ne re ka ipapisa le South Africa, bagaetsho pula e e kakwa ga e tshwane le e e ka kwano le leuba le le kakwa ga le tshwane le la rona. Gompieno re a bo re ngaangaa fela, bone ka kwa pula e a na jaaka re bua jaana. Re tlhola re ya teng kwa re bona e gosomana. Jaanong ba ipopile ba bo ba itirela banka, puso e ka ema ka dinao ya re nnyaa, we will inject so much mo bankeng e re thusa gore banka e e tle e tswelele pele. Eo, ke yone e nna ke itseng gore mo ditsong tsa dibanka tsa temo-thuo le Agriculture in general, ke tsone tse di nonang. Ga go buiwe fela gotwe government must establish a bank, re e latlhile gone foo Mokaulengwe.

MR MOKGWATHI: On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker. Thank you Madam Speaker. Actually, the Honourable House will be aware that I talked about governance as one of the underlying corner stones for the success of an Agricultural Development Bank, which by an Act of Parliament is established by Parliament. An example is of the South African Agriculture and Land Bank which does not get financial support from government but was established by an Act of Parliament, which reports to Parliament through the Minister of Agriculture and Land Affairs. Thank you.

DR. NASHA: Sone se se go kganelang gore e re fa go dirwa review yone e, o e go tsenya megopolo eo gore a re lebeng governance ya banka e e teng re e fetole jaana le jaana ke eng, ga se eng? Kana rona re fa tota; le ka bo le setse le bone gore moono wa rona o fa go reng ga re bone gore banka e e tlaa tsisa sepe fela ka gore leina la yone le tla a bo le le lesha. Ke eng re sa tlhatswe dipitsa tse di nne sekono, re apeye ka tsone re tswelele pele,
re di tlhabolole ka gore fa e le gore ke tsamaiso ya gore di tsamaisiwa jaana, re e ntshe mo bo parastataleng re reng, re reng. Nnyaa foo, re ka bo re bua puo e e utlwang. Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, go Labotlhano ditopo di a goroga kwa re tshwanetse re e go di gorosa.

ASSISTANT MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (MR MFA): Ke a leboga Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente. Mogopolo o jaaka Rre Gaolathe a ne a bua, o montle o ka tswa o tswa mo mothong yo mompe mme one o montle.

Fa o simologa ke ne ke o ikutlwa fela thata, ke ikutlwa go o ema nokeng, ke ise ke utlwe sentle gore o tlaa tla a bua dilo tse a di buang tse, tse jaanong di ntlhabisang ditlhom. Ke ne ke solofetse go le gontsi mo go ene ka jaana ke motho yo o a tleng a bue fa e le mothro yo o dirang ditlhotlhomiso e le moitsaanape wa dilo.

Mme mma ke go bolelele Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mafoko a a buiwang ke Tona wa Madi Rre Gaolathe, ke one a ke dumalanaang le one. Kana ke gore ke a ipotsa gore gone mme fa re dira banka ya balemire na le bo National Development Bank (NDB) le Citizen Entrepreneurial Development Agency (CEDA) motho o ka ipotsa gore re ya go felela kae? Fa re tsamaya re tsweletse re dira dibanka, ka moso re leba mo ka go sele re fuduga re ya go dira banka e ngwe. Ke gore go tshwana fela le gore o aga ntlo e bo e le gore fa pula e simolola go na, o bo o fuduga o ya go tlhoma e ngwe go na le gore o rulele e e leng teng kana o e baakanye. E bo e le gore jaanong wa re nnyaa, ke a go e fetola. Banka ya NDB, se re tshwanetseng gore re se dire jaaka Rre Gaolathe a bua, ke gore nna ke ne ke solofetse gore Mopalamente o tlaa bo a ngongoregela gore go lebega e kete ga re tseye taolo ra dira dilo tse di lebaganeng. Ra dirisa dibanka tse di leng teng tsa bo NDB le bo CEDA, go itebaganya le mathata a balemire kana a baruakgomo. Ke sone se
ke neng ke se solofetse go na le gore re ete re aga dibanka re fuduga, re aga dibanka re fuduga.

Mathata a Batswana ga ke dumele go le kalo-kalo gore tota ba batla banka e e kwadilweng gotwe *Farmers Bank.* NDB, fa e ka itebaganya le di *interest* tsa yone tse di ko godimo-dimo le tse di batliwang fa motha a batla madi gotwe o na le eng, o tshwanetse wa tsisa matlo, o tshwanetse wa tsisa dikgwebo tsu gago tsothle-tsothle tse o senang natso. Ya re o sa ntse o ise o di tsise o bo o gapelwa sengwe le sengwe fa gongwe fa o sena se o ka se gapelwang, gongwe go tsewa mosadi le bana o bo o sala o le motha fela. Ke gore ke ne ke ithaya ke re ke one mathata a Batswana ba lebaganeng le one - gore di *interest rates* di ko godimo, ga di tsamaelane le batho ba re ba emetseng ko dikgaolong.

Batho ba rona ba sa ntse ba tlhaela, tse di batliwang mo go bone ga se tse ba di kgonang. Ke sone se ke dumelang gore ke one mathata a Batswana ba lebaganeng le one.

Gompieno jaana, fa o bua ka balemi o tsenya botlhe le ba ba batlang go simolola. Rre Gaolathe o tlhalositse maikaelelo a gagwe. Ke kopa gore Rre Gaolathe o tswelele fela jalo, o itshware fela jalo mme e re fa o dira jalo rra, leitlho la gago le gole le lebe balemi-barui ba ba senang le fa e le se ba nang naso, mo gotweng *security* se ba ka tlang ba se supa gore ba kgone go bona madi. Matlho a gago a lebe segolo-bogolo balemi ko dikgaolong, ko e leng gore Batswana ba bantsi ba koo. Batswana ba re ba emetseng ba ko dikgaolong ba tshela ka temo-thuo. A e re rra o seka-seka kgang e o ba lebe, ke bone ba ba dirang gore go bo go na le goromente yo o bidiwang Domkraga.

Sa bofelo, Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, ka tota golo fa ga gona kgang, nna ke ne ke ithaya ke re e tlaa re jaaka borre ba ntse ba botsa dipotso gore a ga o batle go ka
tokafadiwa se se leng teng? A bo a emelela a re ee bagaetsho ke boela mogopolo ko morago ke ipona molato ke dumalana le lona. Ke ne ke ithaya ke re ka ke motho yo o bothhale o tlaa bo, …

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** On a point of clarification, Madam Speaker.

**MR MFA:** Kana ke a clarifaya, o clarifaya eng ne Rraetsho?

**MR MOLEFHABANGWE:** Nnyaa nna fa fatshe nnaka ke go thuse. Ke ne ke re Tona ke botse gore a Mokaulengwe Motlotlegi Mupalamente wa Letlhakeng East, o dirile molato fela o e leng gore o feta o motho a ka o dirang a jetswe podi mo e leng gore o tshwanetse gore a ipone molato mo Ntlong e e *for having come up with a motion, comrade* Mfa.?

**MR MFA:** O itse gore ke eng, ga ke tlhaloganye gore fa gongwe tlhaloganyo ya gago e bereka jang. Kana nna ke a tle ke tseye gore mmele o mosesane ga o reye gore le tlhaloganyo e tshesane, ke tsaya gore go na le pharologanyo, mme mo go wena go tshwana fela.

Motsamaisa Dipuisanyo tsa Palamente, mogopolo o wa ga Rre Gaolathe, rotlhe a re o rotloetseng gore o tswelele, a bo a boelele Palamente gore fa a fetsa, a tle go re rerisa gore o tsamaya fa kae. Ka mabaka a a ntseng jalo, ke ne ke kopa gore, bagaetsho, mogopolo wa ga Rre Mokgwathi, fa a ka se ka a o baakanya go tsamaalana le se Tona a se batlang se, nnyaa, le o gane. Fa a dumalana le se Rre Gaolathe a se batlang, re o dumele. *Let the question be put.*

Question put and **agreed to.**
Question put and negatived.

SETTING UP AN ORGAN BANK FOR BATSWANA

MOTION

MR MASISI (FRANCISTOWN EAST): Thank you very much, Madam Speaker. The 8th March 2007 will be the World Kidney Day. Therefore, I would like the Minister of Health to particularly consider that and make a statement on that particular day.

With those few remarks, Madam Speaker, concerning the motion, I have been requested to make further consultation with the stakeholders and the State as well, so that we can be in a position to take the right position and stand on this important motion. Therefore, I defer the motion but with the understanding that immediately after discussions and the caucus, then the motion will be re-instated. Thank you very much, Madam Speaker.

MOTION DEFERRED

MOTION

ADJOURNMENT

MINISTER OF PRESIDENTIAL AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION

(MR KWELAGOBE): Madam Speaker, I move that this House do now adjourn.

Question put and agreed to.

The Assembly accordingly adjourned at 12.25 p.m. until Monday 19th February 2007 at 2.30 p.m.