THE REPORT OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL
ON
THE MAINTENANCE OF ROADS
BY
GABORONE CITY COUNCIL

PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT NO. 6, 2008
AUDITING FOR BOTSWANA GOVERNMENT

The Auditor General is the Head of the Office of the Auditor General, appointed under the Constitution. The Auditor General carries out his duties under the Finance and Audit Act 1997. He thereof, undertakes Performance Audits on the public sector bodies and submits reports, to the National Assembly. The aim of these audits is to improve the public sector administration and accountability. The Auditor General’s reports are available from the Office and may be viewed in the Government website: www.gov.bw.

For further information please contact:

The Public Relations Officer
Office of the Auditor General
Private Bag 0010
Gaborone
Botswana

Tel: 3617100
Fax: 3188145/3908582

AUDITORS: MR. KEGADIME LENAMILE
AND
MS. TUDUETSO SENAI
Honourable Chairman and Councillors
Gaborone City Council
Private Bag 0089
Gaborone

20 May 2008

Dear Honourable Chairman and Councillors,

**Performance Audit Report on Maintenance of Roads by Gaborone City Council**

The Office of the Auditor General has undertaken a Performance Audit on the Maintenance of Roads by Gaborone City Council in pursuant to section 29 of Finance and Audit Act 1997. The objective of performance auditing is to strengthen the accountability process in the country through the provision of an objective and independent feedback to the stakeholders on the performance of public entities. The audit, tries to assist management in streamlining their work by identifying operational gaps and suggesting the steps to be taken that could improve the efficiency and effectiveness of delivery of services by the respective organisations. I therefore, submit the Performance Audit Report No 6, 2008 on the audit of Maintenance of Roads by Gaborone City Council and you are required to table the report before the Council.

Yours Faithfully

........................
R. B. Sebopeng
Acting AUDITOR GENERAL
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABBREVIATIONS</td>
<td>i</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0 BACKGROUND</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 PROJECT MOTIVATION</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0 AUDIT DESIGN</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 AUDIT SCOPE</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 AUDIT OBJECTIVE</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE AUDIT AREA</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 COUNCIL VISION, MISSION AND VALUE STATEMENTS</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 STAFFING</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 FUNDING</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0 SYSTEMS AND PROCESS DESCRIPTION</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 ROUTINE MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 PERIODIC MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 EMERGENCY MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 COUNCIL TENDER PROCEDURES</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5 OUTSOURCED MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6 EMERGENCY MAINTENANCE</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7 MONITORING PROCEDURE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0 FINDINGS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 MAINTENANCE POLICY</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 PLANNING</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 MAINTENANCE ASPECTS</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 RESOURCES</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 ROAD MAINTENANCE DATABASE</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 RECORDS MANAGEMENT</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 MONITORING AND REPORTING</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8 REGISTRATION AND ATTENDANCE OF PUBLIC COMPLAINTS</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.9 PUBLIC SURVEY RESULTS</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVERALL CONCLUSION</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abbreviation</td>
<td>Full Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OAG</td>
<td>Office of the Auditor General</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GCC</td>
<td>Gaborone City Council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPADB</td>
<td>Public Procurement and Asset Disposal Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHHA</td>
<td>Self Help Housing Agency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
0. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Gaborone City Council (GCC) is one of the 28 Local Authorities established by the Botswana Government. Gaborone City Council was established under the Township Act Cap 40.02. Its mandate is the provision, operation and maintenance of all basic services (including roads) and infrastructure within their areas of jurisdiction. The responsibility of road maintenance falls under the Roads Department.

The motivation of OAG to conduct the audit on the maintenance of City roads emerged from several factors like high increase of potholes in roads around the City, worn-out road signs, faded road markings and poor drainage of water which is usually found around circles. There has also been an outcry from the media of poor road conditions.

0.1 FINDINGS

The following findings came to light as a result of the audit:

- Gaborone City Council had not developed a maintenance policy, which could act as a guiding instrument for all maintenance works. (Paragraph 5.1)

  Management Comment:
  Management stated that, GCC, followed Botswana Road Design Manual to undertake all road works, and that Botswana Road Maintenance Manual was still being prepared at the time of audit.

- Gaborone City Council had not developed a Strategic Plan which would assist in planning for and addressing maintenance issues. (Paragraph 5.2)

  Management Comment:
While development of a Strategic Plan for maintenance of roads and an up-to-date data base would certainly boost the road maintenance in an organized manner, this alone would not solve the problem till a very specific attention is given towards provision of required funding in a phased manner to improve status of roads in Gaborone.

- The Department had a maintenance backlog of 80 outsourced projects which had accumulated during the 3 financial years under review. This rendered them more costly in the long run. (Paragraph 5.3.2)

Management Comment:
Management stated that, the issue of potholes and major roads repairs became very hot every year during rainy season. They prepared the reports for submission to the higher Authorities for specific funding, but such reports were not given the attention they deserved. Moreover, Management indicated that funding approved was hardly a fraction of the required amount.

- The OAG observed that the Roads Department had not developed a Road Database that will entail all the necessary information about a road. (Paragraph 5.5)

- The quality of record keeping was found to be inadequate in that data and information were not filed accordingly. This compromised the principle of retrieval and accessibility, hence accountability. (Paragraph 5.6)

- The Roads Department had no consolidated reports from different Divisions for accountability and informed decisions. (Paragraph 5.7.1)

- The Roads Department was not proactive in responding to complaints from the public. (Paragraph 5.8)

0.2 RECOMMENDATIONS

- It is recommended that the Roads Department Management should encourage maintenance personnel to implement the Road Maintenance Manual after its completion.
• OAG recommends that the Management of Roads Department should draw plans which will stipulate maintenance schedules for routine and periodic maintenance.

• It is recommended that Management should strive to maintain all roads to ensure that their value is not eroded as they may deteriorate over time due to the effects of their usage.

• It is recommended that the Council should prepare and maintain a comprehensive Road Database for all Gaborone City Roads. The Database should indicate all the roads for ease of reference of maintenance works

• The OAG recommends that GCC’s Roads Department should establish a systematic record keeping which will enable easy filing and timely access to information.

• The OAG recommends that Roads Department Management should encourage their staff to submit monthly reports not only as a means of informing them on monthly activities but also as a tool of informing them in order to monitor their objectives and make informed decisions.

0.3 OVERALL CONCLUSION

Despite the deficiencies as stated in the report including above, OAG recognizes that financial resources are beyond GCC’s (Roads Department) control as they depend entirely on Central Government. Nevertheless, OAG is of the view that, where funds are available the Roads Department needs to be proactive in maintenance works.
CHAPTER 1

1.0 BACKGROUND

The Gaborone City Council is one of the 28 Local Authorities established by the Botswana Government. Gaborone City Council was established under the Township Act Cap 40.02. The Council is headed by the City Clerk, assisted by the Deputy Clerk. Its mandate is the provision, operation and maintenance of all basic services and infrastructure within their areas of jurisdiction.

Much of the civil infrastructure especially in the older parts of Gaborone was developed some thirty years ago, immediately after independence. The planning for Gaborone at that time envisaged a small town eventually catering for a population not exceeding 40,000 people. The unprecedented growth of the City which now caters for more than 200,000 people living within the city boundaries and more than 120,000 in the peri-urban areas has placed a considerable strain on the existing city infrastructure.

The Gaborone Urban Development Plan I (1997-2003) was initiated as the first ever Social/Economic Development Plan prepared for Gaborone City in order to meet its increasing demands. Later came the initiation of the Urban Development Plan II (2003-2009) which offers the basis for the realization of vision 2016. Its goals and objectives included among others, provision and upgrading infrastructural services within Gaborone through the provision of essential services such as drainage, roads, sewers, electricity, and water supply to improve transport system and ensure its safety, efficiency, convenience and affordability. The objectives also envisaged to provide commercial centres and encourage the establishment of various industries in order to meet employment needs.
Gaborone City Council is composed of 10 departments which are responsible for the day-to-day operations of the Council as stipulated in the Township Act.

- Secretariat
- Treasury
- SHHA
- Arch and building
- Roads Department
- Waste Water
- Fire
- Environmental health
- Clinics
- Social and Community Development
- Education

1.1 Project Motivation
Gaborone City Council is faced with challenges relating to the maintenance of roads under her responsibilities. There has been public outcry due to incidences of an increase in potholes, poor storm water drainage system on the roads, which had not been maintained and which at times took too long to be repaired. During the preliminary study, it also emerged that there indeed could be a problem, in that most of Gaborone City Council’s roads had many potholes, faded road markings, road signs and traffic lights which took long to be repaired. It is from the above that OAG considered it necessary to carry out an audit on maintenance of Gaborone City Council roads.

The OAG was therefore, motivated to conduct the audit on the Council, in order to determine the reason behind the poor road conditions.
CHAPTER 2

2.0-AUDIT DESIGN

2.1 AUDIT SCOPE
The audit focused on the Maintenance of City Council roads for the period covering financial years 2004/05, 2005/06 and 2006/07.

2.2 AUDIT OBJECTIVE
The overall objective of the audit was to ascertain whether GCC carried out its road's maintenance economically, efficiently and effectively. The specific objectives of the audit were to:

- determine whether the City Council had adequate policy instrument for maintenance of roads
- ascertain whether necessary organizational structures were in place and operational for maintenance of roads
- verify whether resources were adequate to undertake maintenance of roads

2.3 METHODS OF DATA COLLECTION

2.3.1 Interviews
The following officers were interviewed:
- Principal Roads Engineer I
- Principal Roads Engineer II (Deputy)
- Principal Roads Engineer II (Drainage)
- Senior Traffic Engineer (Transport and Traffic)
- Senior Roads Engineer (Design and Civil Engineer)
- Chief Technical Officer
- Senior Technical Officer(3)
- Senior Technical Assistant (4)
- Senior Administration Assistant
- Technical Assistants (2)
- Supplies officer
2.3.2 Documents Review

The following documents were reviewed:

- Roads Design Manual
- Consolidated Establishment Register for Botswana local Authorities 2006/07
- City Traffic Planning and Management, Draft Final Report, Volume 2, December 1995
- Road Maintenance Study, Final Report, Volume 1, April 1993
- City and Town Councils Recurrent Budget, 2004/05 Financial Year
- Botswana Roads Department, Standard Specifications for Roads and Bridge works, Volume III
- Gaborone City Storm water Drainage Master Plan, Final Report, Volume I
- Consultancy for Upgrading of Infrastructure in Central Gaborone, Detailed Design Report, December 2001
- Reports to the City Clerk

2.3.3 Physical observations/Site visits

Field visits were undertaken for almost all City roads included in the sample between 23\textsuperscript{rd} July, 26\textsuperscript{th} July and 1\textsuperscript{st} August 2007. A list of the roads visited is represented below:

- Independence Avenue
- Phase II, Pukiro road
- Phase II, Kangaripane way
- New Naledi, Mokotedi way (SHHA)
- Bontleng, Phokoje Road
- Extension 14, Willoughby way (SHHA)
- Extension 14, Allison road
- Partial, Lethalerwa road
- Partial, Phage road
• Partial, Nyerere road
• Broadhurst Industrial, Legolo road
• Broadhurst Industrial, Noko/ Lejara road
• Broadhurst Industrial, Lejara/Kubu Junction
• Broadhurst industrial, Kubu Road, (Railway line crossing)
• Gaborone west, Mosekangwetsi/ Lebatane junction
• Gaborone west Industrial, Molosiwa/ Haile Silasia Junction
• Gaborone west industrial, Kamoshongo road
• Gaborone west, Phase I, Mogotlhwang road
• Gaborone west, Phase I, Motlhatswa road
• Phase 4, Mankgwedi Road
• Ledumang, Sikile road
• Ledumang, Limpopo/Makgwaphe junction
• Ledumang, Nica/Lekgarapa Junction
• Mabuto road, UB circle
• Bontleng, Kaunda road
• Bontleng, Sechele road
• Bontleng, Kukama road (SHHA)
• Bontleng, Kwalata road (SHHA)
CHAPTER 3

3.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE AUDIT AREA

Gaborone City Council is composed of 10 departments including the Roads Department, which are responsible for the day-to-day operations of the Council as stipulated in the Township Act.

The Roads Department comprises of sub-divisions namely; the Drainage Unit which is mainly responsible for vegetation control, culvert cleaning, repair and replacement, and associated drainage protection works. There is also the Design Division which is responsible for reconstruction and resealing of roads, which are mostly to private companies. There is also the Traffic Management Unit which is solely responsible for all issues related to road safety including upgrading of roads junctions, removal of illegal sign boards, replacement of worn-out signs and street names, and road markings. The section also recommends appropriate designs of various road crossing and junctions according to traffic requirements. The Operations Unit on the other hand is responsible for pothole patching, sweeping of streets, re-gravelling and grading.

The network of roads in Gaborone comprises of roads for Central Government which are Primary roads or Highways and those belonging to Local Government which are Primary, Secondary, Tertiary or Access roads. Roads for Central Government are those constructed and maintained by the Department of Roads and those under the Local Government are constructed and maintained by Gaborone City Council. Primary roads are the ones that connect destinations either from the City to Villages or Villages to the City and form part of the Urban Classification. For example Kudumatse Drive, Motsepe, Molepolole road, Old Lobatse, Kgobaseretse, Nelson Mandela Drive, Machel Drive and Sir Seretse Khama Airport. Secondary roads whether surfaced or un-surfaced are within the City. Tertiary roads on the other hand are roads which are internal to villages and urban areas and those which do not form part of the Public Highway Network. These include among others; Phage road, Kubu road, Legolo road, Peloyakgama roads, Segodi roads etc. Maintenance
for these roads can either be contracted out or carried out by City Council in-house teams.

3.1 COUNCIL VISION, MISSION AND VALUE STATEMENTS
The Council did not have a Strategic Plan at the time of audit and thus the following vision, mission and value statements were obtained from their draft Strategic plan.

**Vision**
To be a model of excellence in provision of quality and sustainable social and infrastructural Services.

**Mission**
We exist to efficiently provide effective social services and infrastructure through
- Stakeholder consultation
- Skilled and motivated staff
- Use of appropriate technology
- To improve the quality of life of the Community.

**Values**
- Transparency
- Diligence
- Integrity
- Timemously
- Honesty
- Accountable
- Compassion
- Botho
- Commitment

Even though this was the case with City Council, the Roads Department had set itself some objectives to meet, and they are illustrated below:
3.2 OBJECTIVES

- To undertake painting of 200km of tarred roads by in-house
- To undertake pothole patching by contractors and in-house and barricading by in house
- To undertake cleaning of 20km of storm water drains and 200 culverts
- To construct 1500m length of drains
- Attend to all staff matters in relation to welfare, discipline and training
- Purchasing of all necessary tools and materials required for the smooth operation of the Division.
- Undertake grading of 450km of gravel and earth roads in the City.
- To undertake grading of 450km of gravel and earth roads in the City.
- To undertake sweeping of city roads to keep them clean all year out

3.3 STAFFING
During 2006/07 (as of 31 March 2007) the position of staff at the GCC Roads Department dealing with maintenance issues was 215. This was made up of the following:

- Professional posts  5
- Technicians       6
- Artisans          9
- Unskilled         195

The vacancy position stood at 4 for Permanent and Pensionable and 45 for Industrial Class employees.
### 3.4 FUNDING

The Ministry of Local Government provides GCC with subventions including maintenance funds, for major and minor roads maintenance, as illustrated below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Years</th>
<th>Type of Maintenance (Pula)</th>
<th>Funds Requested (Pula)</th>
<th>Subventions Provided (Pula)</th>
<th>Total Expenditure (Pula)</th>
<th>Unspent Balance (Pula)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2004/05-2006/07</td>
<td>In-house (Vote B14) Recurrent funds</td>
<td>11 145 110.00</td>
<td>9 426 169.44</td>
<td>9 311 500.39</td>
<td>114 669.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004/05</td>
<td>Outsourced projects (Capital funds)</td>
<td>108 000.00</td>
<td>No Funds allocated</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006/07</td>
<td>Outsourced project</td>
<td>9 984 464.60</td>
<td>7 914 901.82</td>
<td>7 368 249.52</td>
<td>546 652.30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 4

4.0 SYSTEMS AND PROCESS DESCRIPTION

There are three types of maintenance works normally carried out by the Gaborone City Council’s Road Department namely: Routine Maintenance, Periodic and Emergency Maintenance. These are further explained below:

4.1 ROUTINE MAINTENANCE

These are normally small-scale operations done by the in-house teams with limited resources requirements, usually done at least twice a year on a section of a road. In house maintenance activities could be summarized as follows:

- Pothole patching
- Street sweeping
- Desilting of drains
- Devegetation of drains
- Cutting of overgrown vegetation from road reserves
- Minor maintenance of drains
- Minor Construction of drains
- Removal of illegal signboards
- Replacement of worn-out signs and street names
- Road markings
- Barricading
- Grading and Re-grading of roads
- Gravelling of roads
- Assistance to flood prone areas
- Minor repairs to pedestrian walkways
- Repairs/replacement of worn out Bus shelters
- Repairs/replacement of minor pedestrian crossing over storm water drainage systems
- Minor traffic safety measures as and when and where needed
4.2 PERIODIC MAINTENANCE
Periodic maintenance is carried out on a road or section of a road, after a number of years and requires extra resources. At the GCC periodic maintenance involves the reconstruction, resurfacing, rehabilitation of roads/road section and resealing of both roads and drains. These maintenance activities can come early depending on the conditions of the road.

- Inspections done
- Priority list compiled
- Maintenance analysis
- Planning and coordination of projects

4.3 EMERGENCY MAINTENANCE
Emergency maintenance of roads/storms water systems may be required due to any of the following reasons;

- Roads Accidents' (Overturning of fuel tankers and leakage/spilling of petroleum products on road surface, vehicle on fire on road carriage way, etc)
- Excessive and continuous flooding on roads due to continuous inclement weather (heavy rain storms)
- Flooding of houses, shops and other properties
- Any other natural disaster (flooding, sand storms covering road with sand, etc)
- Serious damage to other utility services within road reserves due to any reason resulting in road cuts, holes in roads (water pipe burst, electrical cable fault, etc)

Immediately after a complaint has been reported at GCC, an inspection and assessment of maintenance requirement is done. The Unit later carries out the maintenance on affected Council roads when resources permit.

4.4 COUNCIL TENDER PROCEDURES FOR PURCHASE OF ROAD MAINTENANCE MATERIALS
The in-house maintenance is involved with routine maintenance. The Roads Department establishes all materials needed for maintenance for the whole financial
year, and makes unit cost estimates for those needed materials. Open tenders are invited from Botswana registered Suppliers/manufacturers for road building/maintenance materials for supply during the whole financial year. Tenders are published in Government Gazette. Interested suppliers submit their tenders to Town Clerk’s office as directed in the tender notice. Tenders are opened by Finance and General Purpose Committee Chairman or other councilors appointed by him on scheduled date and time as stated in the tender notice. These tenders are adjudicated and evaluated by Roads Department officials. Report is then presented to Head of Department for discussions and appropriate recommendations.

This report is then presented to Tender Panel (Sub Committee of COMT consisting of several Heads of Departments and chaired by Deputy Town Clerk). Tender Panel considers the recommendation and endorses or amends the report as the case may be for onward presentation to Finance and General Purpose Committee for approval.

After approval from Finance and General Purpose Committee, Head of Department shall draft the letter of award for Town Clerks signature. Specific local purchase order would be issued for specific material of specified quantity to an approved supplier. Supplier would be paid accordingly for specific supply.

4.5 OUTSOURCED MAINTENANCE
Maintenance activities which are generally outsourced depending on availability of recurrent funds are as follows:
1. Debushing of roads reserves
2. Desilting and devegetation of storms water drains
3. Supply and erection of street names and roads signs
4. Minor road repairs (Pothole patching)
5. Gravelling of roads
6. Minor construction works for storm water drainage
7. Resealing of roads

First two activities (debushing/desilting) are carried out in two following manners:

1. By employment of casual workers through Department of Labour for a specific period of time or a specific task
2. By Employment of people at Ward level through Ward development committees under Labour Intensive Public Works Programme for a specifically allocated budget for a ward (Capital funding)

For all other activities (3 to 7) either quotations or tenders are invited depending upon value of work as per standard tender procedures laid sown in Township Act (Cap 40.02).

Supervision of selected contractors is done by specific Technicians and/or professionals as the case may be.

For small works LPO (Local Purchasing Orders) are issued and for large works specific contracts are made.

4.5.1 TENDERING PROCEDURES FOR CONTRACTING OUT

PLANNING FOR TENDERING

Immediately after the selection of the most affected roads to be either reconstructed, resealed or any drain to be upgraded the Department then, collect data about the roads. They later compile a priority list. Information on roads is collected by officers from the Roads Department to provide details and quality requirements for the work
to be tendered for. They then make their own estimates and then discuss with the Head of Department (Principal Roads Engineer I).

TENDER INVITATION
Gaborone City Council then invites companies registered with PPADB under Civil Engineering Code 03 in different grades, namely Grade A, B, C, D and E as unlimited to tender for “Reconstruction and Major Maintenance Repairs”. The Code is further divided into Sub code 01 for Roads and Sub code 02 for Drainage as an example.

TENDER ADVERTISEMENT
The tender is later advertised in the Government Gazette, it is advertised twice. The publication is open for 28 days before closing date. Tender closing is done in the morning at 12:00 am and opens in the afternoon at 14:00 hrs. Tenders are submitted at the office of the City Clerk into a sealed box which is always locked. Tenders submitted must include in their submissions certified copies of valid Tax Clearance Certificate or exemption thereof, Certification of Registration with PPADB certified by PPADB and Value Added Tax letter.

It is done by Finance and General Purpose Committee Chairman or any other Council or Councilors selected by him for a particular tender opening. Finance and General Purpose Committee Chairman is assisted by Treasurer, Deputy Town Clerk or other senior officer delegated by Town Clerk and concerned Head of Department or concerned officers whose Department tenders are to be opened on a scheduled date.

ADJUDICATION AND EVALUATION
Assessment of road works to be outsourced is done by the Roads Department depending on availability of funds. Open tenders are invited from suitable PPADB registered companies of different categories according to volume of work. All tender procedures remain same as stated on paragraph 4.4.
4.5.2 AWARD OF CONTRACTS AND SIGNING OF CONTRACTS
Letter for “Award of Contract” is signed by Town Clerk only and signing on contracts is done jointly by Mayor and Town Clerk. Head of Departments only sign the contract agreements as witness to Town Clerk/Mayor.

4.6 EMERGENCY MAINTENANCE
Another procedure followed when a particular problem has occurred and needs maintenance to be done is that, that particular individual who has a problem or was affected by that problem will report it at Gaborone City Council.

4.6.1 REPORTING OF COMPLAINTS
The Council receives several complaints from the public and companies through phone calls and saving-grams and these reports are put in a complaints register entailing the name of the reporting person, plot number, date and what the complaint seeks to address.

The maintenance request book (register) also has a section, on which the officer responsible states the action intended to be done regarding the complaint brought forth, commencing date of maintenance and completion date and also remarks.

4.6.2 ROAD ASSESSMENT OF MAINTENANCE
The assessment of maintenance requirements is carried out in order to identify the work that has to be done on roads. The objectives are to:

- assess the condition of each road
- review maintenance carried out since the previous inspection
- determine routine maintenance activities for each road
- determine periodic maintenance activity for the next period
4.6.3 SELECTION OF MAINTENANCE ACTIVITIES
After the inspection of roads either as part of their daily activity or after a complaint has been registered, the Roads management later compiles a priority list of roads that need attention. This later leads to the selection of those to be actioned on. Selection is solely based on severity of the damage on the road, drainage problem caused and also most importantly availability of funds to cover maintenance costs. After prioritisation of roads to be maintained, the Roads Department then divides the selected roads into In-house maintenance (mainly done on tertiary roads) and Contracting Out (primary and secondary roads).

4.7 MONITORING PROCEDURE
The Monitoring and evaluation is a process used to ensure a smooth implementation and management of the planned activities. Monitoring is carried out to control physical and financial progress during plan implementation. It also helps to identify bottlenecks and corrective measures.

The monthly and quarterly progress reports are prepared to report progress and identify any constraints during plan implementation to all interested parties. Annual progress review on the other hand will enable the organization to review implementation status of programmes and projects for each financial year. Mid-term review emphasizes that, half way through the plan, the plan should be reviewed. This progress assesses the extent of which goals and objectives have been achieved.
CHAPTER 5

5.0 FINDINGS
The chapter presents the findings of the audit on maintenance of roads by Gaborone City Council (Roads Department). Credibility of the findings was developed on a series of interviews conducted, documents reviewed and observations made during site visits. The findings highlight the significant issues that the auditors identified during the audit that could hamper the performance and delivery of service by the GCC’s Roads Department. The findings are presented as follows;

5.1 MAINTENANCE POLICY
Gaborone City Council at the time of audit did not have a maintenance policy, which could act as a guiding instrument for all maintenance activities. Existence of a maintenance policy could provide a guiding channel for maintenance activities of the Roads Department. It could also have stipulated the length of time within which each maintenance activity had to be done.

OAG is of the view that the absence of a properly documented overall framework and detailed maintenance procedure at GCC would pose a serious risk to the management, as it will lead to lack of guidance and coordination of maintenance activities. The lack of a clearly formulated and articulated policy may further advance inadequacies in addressing issues relating to maintenance. In addition, the lack of policy constituted absence of proactive mechanisms for undertaking maintenance. The development of a policy would have distinctively specified the required activities for an economic and efficient maintenance of City roads. In addition, the guidelines would have provided a strategic focus and direction to the maintenance staff and enable them to accomplish set objectives.

Furthermore, with the absence of maintenance guidelines in place, there could be lack of a standardized way of carrying out maintenance at the various divisions of the Roads Department. Lack of guidelines made it difficult for officers to effectively and efficiently carry out their maintenance work as they ended up relying on personal
experiences, and the skills and knowledge acquired during tertiary days, which more often than not was limited. This may have resulted in maintenance not being done accordingly.

At the time of audit, it was appreciated that there were indicators that the City Council in conjunction with the Roads Department were in the process of developing the Road Maintenance Manual that will be of great assistance to the Council with regard to road maintenance and Standard Specifications for road and bridge works.

**Recommendation**

It is recommended that Management should ensure that maintenance personnel comply with the provisions of Road Maintenance Manual when in use. This will assist them in undertaking their maintenance in an efficient and effective manner.

**Management’s Response:**

Management stated that, GCC like other Local Authorities, followed Botswana Road Design Manual to undertake all road works, and Botswana Road Maintenance Manual was being prepared at the time of audit. Moreover, they stated that Botswana Road Maintenance Study (done by Roads Department, Ministry of Works and Transport) had specific recommendations about maintenance of Roads inclusive of roads falling under the jurisdiction of Local Authorities. These recommendations were specific about procedures, budgets, manpower requirements etc, but it was unfortunate that, that particular study did not receive much attention it deserved especially within Local Authorities. As a result, the liabilities of Roads Department increased over the years in Local Authorities (Including Gaborone City Council), as there were no special provisions made either for required budget or for manpower over the years. Consequently, this had a very negative impact on overall maintenance of roads in GCC.
5.2 PLANNING

5.2.1 PLANNING FOR MAINTENANCE WORKS
Strategic Planning is a management tool used for the purpose of helping an organization to do a better job by focusing its energy and ensuring that members of the organization are working towards common goals, assess and adjust the organization’s direction in response to a changing environment. Therefore, GCC Strategic Plan needed to have been developed to include periodic maintenance plans.

During the period under review, OAG observed that GCC had not developed a Strategic Plan which would have taken into consideration maintenance issues, particularly periodic maintenance. Therefore, the Roads Department was not able to forecast when each road would require maintenance, more so that, the Department did not have a specific period on which to undertake periodic maintenance for its roads. Moreover, in absence of this plan, there was no standard way of measuring the department’s performance with regard to goals and objectives stated for maintenance. According to Management, the reason for not having the Strategic Plan was that City Council had not implemented Performance Management System.

However, OAG appreciates that there were indications that the Council was in the process of developing the Strategic Plan for the Council. The availability of a Strategic Plan could have helped the department to define the overall goals and performance levels required for maintenance as well, as time frames within which such targets were to be met. This could allow for reviews to be carried out to assess the strength, weaknesses, opportunities and threats, and where possible amend or invent new maintenance strategies. The Strategic Plan could have assisted the Department, in coming up with long term plans to address issues of backlog in maintenance of roads. It would have also indicated how many roads would be maintained during the plan period. Roads Department could not determine their achievements and shortfalls as there was no feedback mechanism to measure performance.
5.2.2 ANNUAL MAINTENANCE PLANS

If the Strategic Plan was developed it would have cascaded to the Council’s Departments including the Roads Department. The Roads Department would have developed the Annual Operational Plans which would have indicated the works standards and the time frame for the work of their divisions. Therefore, there was a need that each Division had a plan that is, compatibly in line with the overall Strategic Plan. The annual plans would have acted as a standard for performance and promote accountability and efficient utilization of resources. These plans could have provided GCC management with feedback and assisted them to make informed decisions.

However, OAG observed that some divisions had not developed the Annual Plans. With regard to plans drawn, not all activities were reflected in the plans but they were reflected on some of the progress reports made. For instance, the Drainage Division had no Annual plans particularly for 2004/05. The available plan for 2005/06 only included drain building activities. The plan had not indicated routine maintenance activities such as vegetation control and de-silting of drains.

Operations Division had not developed plans. Management stated that, activities for these Divisions were done as need arose, such as sweeping of roads, pothole patching, and barricading of roads sides. The only activity that they planned for was the grading of SHHA roads and it was for the financial year 2006/07.

The absence of the plans led to uncoordinated work in so far as maintenance was concerned. Planning of maintenance activities needed to have been based on time frames that indicated activities to be completed and to ensure that assignments and responsibilities relating to maintenance had been successfully carried out. Due to lack of these properly stipulated and outlined plans, it was not possible for OAG to assess whether Gaborone City Council was achieving targets.
OAG is of the view that, if maintenance of City roads is not properly planned for and roads not accordingly maintained it may result in dilapidation of these roads and the result may depress the quality of life and contribute in some way to the increase of road accidents. This will further hamper the growth of the economy of the country as there will be need to focus on improving them rather than looking into some other sectors of development.

**Recommendation**

OAG recommends that Roads Department Management should draw plans which will stipulate maintenance schedules for routine and periodic maintenance. The plans will allow Management to measure whether the activities therein are achieved. They will assist Management to develop accurate forecasts of maintenance and budget for it.

**Management’s Response:**

While development of a Strategic Plan for maintenance of roads and an up-to-date data base would certainly boost the road maintenance in an organized manner, this alone would not solve the problem till a very specific attention is given towards provision of required funding in a phased manner to improve status of roads in Gaborone. Attention is also needed towards required qualified manpower (Technical and Artisan Level) to match the level of responsibility towards road maintenance and development at Gaborone City Council.

Most old roads/streets were constructed without adequate provision of storm water drainage system along these roads (15-20 years ago). A specific study on flooding in various areas and roads in Gaborone was done in 2002. City’s Storm Water Drainage Master Plan had specific recommendations to alleviate this situation. All new roads built after 2000 have specific provisions of Storm Water Drainage Systems. The situation worsens in SHHA areas where as per “Old Policy” of level of infrastructure in SHHA areas, only gravels or earth road exist in most areas (around 160 km of such roads in the City). Only recently in year
2007 a policy decision was taken to provide bituminous roads in SHHA areas as well. Specific funding is required to upgrade all such roads in SHHA areas. Gravel Road maintenance is a very challenging issue in SHHA areas since there are no gravel sources within the City limits. Importing gravel from outside City limit is very expensive and funding constraints do not permit us to do so.

5.3 MAINTENANCE ASPECTS

During the years under review, the Roads Department had accumulated maintenance backlog for outsourced and in-house, which had overwhelmed the Department and overstretched some of their resources. Gaborone City Council’s Roads Department needed to strive to minimize the maintenance backlog they had, with the limited resources available.

5.3.1 In-House
Management indicated that for the 3 financial years under review, there was gravelling backlog which accumulated to 726.67 km. Management stated that gravelling backlog had been constituted by the fact that they had no borrow-pit where to get gravel. Their borrow pit license which was for the financial year 2005/06, expired in December 2006. They further stated that, they applied for a new one the very month it had expired. At the time of audit, management indicated that they were still waiting for Kweneng Land Board to allow them to continue to dig gravel from the previous licensed borrow-pit. Furthermore, management indicated that there had never been backlog on pothole patching and sweeping for the 3 years under review, because there had never been any schedule which they could use to measure the backlog. However, the sample of roads visited including among others; Phage road in Middle Star, Legolo road, Kubu road in Broadhurst Industrial, Independence Avenue, Katere road in Phase I, Willoughby way/ Pitse road in Bontleng had potholes and were not swept as can be seen below;
FIG 1 Nyerere drive

FIG 2 Phage road

FIG 3 Katere Road

FIG 4 Legolo Road
Moreover the list provided for unlined drains was as follows;
• Primary drains   10kms (Main collector drains)
• Secondary drains  50kms (Intermediate collectors)
• Tertiary drains     500kms (Along roads sides)

All these drains needed lining but had not been lined at the time of audit. This is corroborated by figure 8 below:

**FIG 8 Drain along Mokotedi Road**

**Recommendation**

The OAG recommends that Roads Department should minimize their maintenance backlog by efficiently utilizing the available resources. It is further recommended that management should maintain all roads to ensure that their value is not eroded as they may deteriorate over time due to the effects of their usage.

5.3.2 Outsourced projects

At the time of audit, the Department had reported a maintenance backlog of capital projects which had accumulated for the past unspecified years. The 80 projects as at year 2005/06 included projects such as reconstruction of roads with double seal and asphalt overlay, resealing of roads, and reconstruction of road shoulders, drain re-
construction, rehabilitation of walkways and replacement of cover slabs. Of all the 80 projects reported, only 8 thus representing 10% were done and 72 representing 90% remained untouched due to unavailability of funds. The remaining 72 projects were estimated to cost P12,806,970.00.

Moreover, during the 2006/07 the total number of maintenance backlog was 87 for roads and junctions. The Roads Department prioritized to maintain 24 roads and junctions. This represented 27.6% of the backlog. According to management these roads/junctions needed immediate attention because they carried heavy traffic and were prone to potholes due to structural base course failure, storm water drainage problems and the surface was due for overlay.

Management further stated that the remaining 135 (72+63) backlog for the 2005/06 and 2006/07, which needed attention, could not be done due to unavailability of funds.

Furthermore, the maintenance backlog list for capital projects availed, for 2005/06 and 2006/07, indicated some information gaps concerning identified maintenance activities. The 2005/06 list reflected the name of the project, location and estimated cost while the list for 2006/07 showed the location, road/street name, length, width and area to be covered. Comparing the two lists, one could clearly identify the above mentioned inconsistency. This inconsistency, therefore, led to management being unable to plan and budget for their maintenance activities which aggravated to maintenance backlog.

OAG is of the view that Roads Department should strive to meet its maintenance requirements with available resources within reasonable time before they overwhelm them and become major maintenance works which are more costly. This thus will reduce the number of projects which will require to be contracted out/outsourced.
Management’s Response:
Management stated that, the issue of potholes and major roads repairs became very hot every year during rainy season. They prepared the reports for submission to the higher Authorities for specific funding, but such reports were not given the attention they deserved. Moreover, Management indicated that funding approved was hardly a fraction of the required amount. In addition Management stated that, the backlog did not occur because of negligence or lack of plans, but it occurred due to non availability of adequate resources within annual recurrent budgets of the GCC.

According to Management, the issue became prominent that Government had to create a specific backlog maintenance vote in a Capital Budget in NDP-8, although it was particularly, towards building maintenance than road maintenance.

5.4 RESOURCES
The following factors were said to be impediments that impacted negatively in the smooth and efficient execution of maintenance:

5.4.1 HUMAN RESOURCES
The opportunity for Gaborone City Council’s Roads Department to achieve maintenance objectives and improve client services is for them to have staff with capacity, in terms of number and appropriate skills to undertake maintenance accordingly.

It came to light during the time of audit that, the Roads Department did not have the requisite manpower strength. This was corroborated by documents reviewed which revealed that the Roads Department had 215 maintenance personnel both professionals and Industrial Class Employees (semi-skilled and unskilled). The analysis of data indicated that the proportion of professional officers to that of the Industrial Class Employees during the years under review was 11:204. A further analysis of data reviewed, revealed that the Industrial Class Employees were 204. Of
this caliber of personnel, 195 employees were unskilled, which represented 90.7% of the total maintenance personnel.

In addition, Management indicated that when officers retired or died their replacements took a long time or ended up not replaced at all. This assertion could not be substantiated due to absence of documentary evidence. Furthermore, the Establishment register for the 3 financial years under review showed that there were 22 posts but 4 had not been filled.

OAG is of the view that, the absence of the technical expertise could reduce the supervisory capabilities of the maintenance personnel. It could also lead to the utilization of the unskilled personnel in instances where higher skills would have been more appropriate. This situation might result in substandard maintenance works, which in the long run, would prove costly to the Council by way of it having to maintain City roads in a short period of time.

**Recommendation**

Gaborone City Council should ensure that all Roads Department’s Divisions are represented in terms of number, and that there are adequate skilled personnel to enhance decision making. The Department should also strengthen its staff capacity and improve the human technical capacity and capability to ensure quality service delivery.

**5.4.2 EQUIPMENT/MACHINERY AND MATERIALS**

**5.4.2.1 Equipment and Machinery**

Equipment and machinery are essential for in-house maintenance by Gaborone City Council. However OAG noticed that equipment and machinery had been susceptible to breakdown and had been kept in their workshops for reparation for a period ranging from 2 months to 3 years due to financial constraints. According to documents reviewed “some vehicles took long in the garage because LPOs took long to be signed by management”. This contention could not be verified due to lack of information about the length of period taken for the LPO to be signed. This situation contributed to the backlog, since the equipment and machinery during the
time they were at the workshop, did not become available for use in maintenance works.

**Recommendation**
The OAG recommends that the GCC Management should ensure that Roads Department develops a monitoring mechanism to enhance speedy repairs for equipment and machinery at workshops.

### 5.4.2.2 Procurement of Material
Efficient maintenance of City roads requires timely procurement of materials. Nevertheless, Management stated that maintenance materials took long to be purchased and delivered. This was partly aggravated by the laxity on the part of some GCC’s Supplies officers in not handing in the LPOs to the relevant supplying companies. The officers cited this shortcoming to the lack of awareness of selected companies’ business premises, so that they could at least drop LPOs accordingly. This assertion could not be substantiated due to lack of supporting documents.

Moreover, there were instances, where supplying companies would collect the LPOs but still delivered materials late, after continuous persuasion and follow up. Review of 2005/06 documents revealed that some supplying companies cited the devaluation of the Pula as their primary reason for not honouring their obligation to GCC.

**Recommendation**
The OAG recommends that Roads Department should come up with a strategy and mechanism which will enhance quick procurement of materials.

### 5.5 ROAD MAINTENANCE DATABASE
The Road Database needs to be prepared in order to list and describe important features of each road. This data forms the basic reference for all subsequent inspections and plans. However, OAG observed that the GCC’s Roads Department had not developed a comprehensive Road Database.
The auditors observed that, there were no records which showed when a road was constructed, no information on life span of the road and no schedules for maintenance consideration. The Road Database availed for audit, had no date on which it was prepared. It only had the name of the road, location, road surface type and measurements. It did not have important features like date of construction, how many times the road had been maintained, which type of maintenance had been done on it (routine, periodic or emergency) and when it would be due for a reconstruction or resealing.

The Database will also show among others the following;

- Road class
- Surface type( bitumen, gravel)
- Gradient (flat, hilly)
- Average width
- Traffic flow
- Date last maintained
- Number of culverts lined
- Date Inventory last updated

The absence of a database made it difficult to accurately calculate the lifespan of a road and therefore, determine whether it was worth maintaining. It also made the selection of roads difficult, and areas which could have been addressed before they were worse, and at a lesser cost, ended up becoming bigger maintenance issues and sometimes the need for reconstruction.

It is important to keep a comprehensive, detailed and up to date Road Database, since it would entail all the necessary information of a road together with its background. It would also be of great assistance to the Management to make informed decisions concerning maintenance planning and proper distribution of the budget.
Recommendation

It is recommended that the Council should prepare and maintain a comprehensive Road Database for all Gaborone City Roads. The Database should indicate all the roads for ease of reference of maintenance works.

5.6 RECORD MANAGEMENT

The audit revealed that, the quality of record keeping was found to be inadequate in that data and information were not filed accordingly. There were supposed to be records for weekly maintenance activities, monthly reports, quarterly and annual records, but not all the information was there for the years under review. Failure to provide auditors with accurate and timely information was a clear indication that records were not kept properly. This compromised the principle of retrieval and accessibility, hence accountability. Moreover, this inefficient record keeping could hamper Management’s decision making concerning planning and budgeting for road maintenance activities.

Recommendation

The OAG recommends that GCC’s Roads Department should establish a systematic record keeping which will enable easy filing and timely access to information. This will further help the Management to review its progress and make prompt decisions and improvements in performing their maintenance operations.

5.7 MONITORING AND REPORTING

5.7.1 REPORTING

The Roads Department had a practice of preparing monthly reports to the City Engineer and City Clerk. The OAG appreciates that every Division within the Roads Department produced their own reports, but they were found to be inadequate. Their inadequacy lies in the fact that the Divisions were expected to produce monthly reports for briefing the City Engineer and City Clerk, but this was not done on a regular basis. In addition, reports produced were mostly incomplete, as there were some blank spaces on portions such as action taken and remarks on maintenance activities. The audit further revealed that there was no consolidated
report for the Roads Department which was supposed to entail all information from all Department Divisions for informed decision and accountability.

**Recommendation**

The OAG recommends that Roads Department Management should encourage their staff to submit monthly reports not only as a means of informing them on monthly activities but also as a tool of informing them in order to monitor their objectives and make informed decisions.

**5.7.2 INSPECTION OF GABORONE CITY ROADS**

Inspection of roads forms the major basis for road maintenance activities. As a prerequisite prior to coming up with a plan and budget, a survey has to be carried out in all City roads to enable management to come up with a schedule and priorities regarding maintenance operations. Moreover, inspections have to be conducted on on-going maintenance activities for both in-house and capital projects to identify abnormalities if any and come up with corrective measures.

However, OAG observed that they were no standard format for recording inspections for in-house maintenance. For instance, it surfaced from the interviews that inspections were done on a daily basis, but the problem was that after inspection, officers would either write down in their diaries or not document anywhere. These therefore meant that, officers would report verbally to the relevant people for actions to be taken. With regard to ongoing maintenance activities, especially capital project, the OAG appreciates that the Council had taken the initiative to conduct inspection of ongoing activities. Right from the commencement of outsourced projects- both the maintenance and development project- the Technical Staff from the Council got involved in project inspections. Every phase of the project had to be inspected to ascertain whether it had been done properly and according to specifications, before the project could move to the next phase.

According to the documents reviewed, it was apparent that these inspections were done, even though only a few reports were availed.
The absence of a standard format for inspections may lead to lack of uniformity and inconsistency in carrying out the maintenance works efficiently, thus, not enabling management to make informed decisions.

5.8 REGISTRATION AND ATTENDANCE OF PUBLIC COMPLAINTS
Gaborone City Council’s Roads Department maintains roads classified as urban network which include selected primary, secondary and tertiary roads around the City. It is imperative for the Roads Department to keep and maintain a comprehensive registration form of complaints for all roads. This form would ensure an efficient and smooth process of inspection and registration of public complaints, preparation of maintenance estimates and consequent implementation of maintenance plans for City roads, in order to prolong their usefulness and lifespan.

OAG’s review of documents disclosed that, the Department did not keep a comprehensive and up to date complaints form and moreover the process of reporting was long. Once a complaint was lodged with the Council then it had to follow a long procedural step that could delay the action. The complaint form availed for audit had complaints registered as far back as 2000, but had not been attended to. At the time of audit, 74 complaints were registered during the 3 financial years under review; but only 24 thus representing 32% of the registered complaints/scenes were visited. Out of the visited scenes, only 3, thus representing 12.5% complaints were attended to. (See Appendix III)

Several factors that had been identified as being the contributing elements for the delay in attending to complaints, included inter-alia:

- The officer responsible for the complaints unit was away for further studies during the 3 financial years under review, and was not replaced for the sake of continuity.
- Shortage of transport for the officers to inspect the scene.
- Inadequate and /or lack of maintenance funds to attend to the reported problems.
In addition to the above mentioned factors, information pertaining to reports and complaints registered were usually incomplete. The complaint form had blank spaces under the received by, visited, findings, category, (which was to categorize if the complaint was urgent, important or necessary) and action plan. This had the effect on the Council, of being besieged by its maintenance activities, hence the prevalence of consequent dissatisfaction of the public.

It is important to have a comprehensive and up to date complaints form as it could assist Council Management to make informed decisions concerning maintenance and budgetary planning.

5.9 PUBLIC SURVEY RESULTS
OAG conducted a survey to gauge the response of the customers in respect to road maintenance issues in Gaborone City Council. The auditors distributed 10 questionnaires per area around Gaborone. The areas were; Bontleng (SHHA), Phase 1 (SHHA), Phase 4, Maruapula, Block 9. Broadhurst (Tshweneng), Block 6 (SHHA), Phase 2, Block 5, Old Naledi (SHHA), New Canada and Extension 12. The results as per copy of questionnaire at Appendix IV are as follows;

- 92% of the people surveyed responded that the conditions of GCC roads were in bad condition, whereas 8% felt that roads were in good condition.
- 63% of the people surveyed responded that maintenance of roads was very poor, 32% rated it as average, whereas 5% said roads were in good condition.
- When asked how often they saw any routine maintenance activity done in their area, 43% responded that they saw the activities done once a year, 13% twice in a year, 17% stated that it was done when there was need and 27% never saw any maintenance done.
- The survey disclosed that potholes and poor drainage system were the most prevalent road maintenance problems in Gaborone.
• Out of the total people surveyed, 30% responded that they reported their maintenance complaints, whereas 70% did not report. The reasons for not reporting included the following:
  o There was no clear channel of reporting
  o When complaints were reported, no action was taken

• 62% felt that GCC should plan all their activities monthly as compared to the 38% who felt that GCC should be privatized.

In conclusion, the statistics depicted an overall dissatisfaction of public over performance of GCC in area of road maintenance, as most of the maintenance activities were done once in year. This thus showed that the Roads Department was not achieving its set objectives efficiently. There was so much to be desired on the part of the Department to address the issue of response time towards the prevalent problems. (See copy of the Questionnaire attached as Appendix IV)
OVERALL CONCLUSION

Road maintenance is the technological principle to rehabilitate and prolong road life with a view to enabling it greater regularity, punctuality and safety of road transport services. However, OAG concludes that the GCC had not applied this principle accordingly, to avoid roads dilapidation and deterioration. The principal reason was budgetary constraints that had forced available resources to be overstretched, hence backlog. There was also lack of maintenance policy which constituted absence of proactive mechanisms for undertaking maintenance. The database that would have assisted in calculating the lifespan of each road and determining whether it was worth maintaining had not been developed. Furthermore, the GCC did not employ its expertise to be able to respond to customers' complaints effectively.

As regards the survey that was conducted to assess the extent to which customers were satisfied with the GCC's performance regarding roads maintenance, the OAG concludes that maintenance was not given the seriousness it deserved.

However, despite the deficiencies as stated in the report including above, OAG appreciates that financial resources are beyond GCC's (Roads Department) control, as they depend entirely on Central Government. But OAG is of the view that, where funds are available the Roads Department is advised to be proactive in maintenance works.